Developing a both-ways management education pedagogy
from the key motivations of Aboriginal Australians

A thesis submitted by
Daniel Henry Guilfoyle, BA. (Usyd), M. Psych. (WSU)
Student Number: 11400712
In fulfilment of the award of Doctor of Philosophy,
Faculty of Business, Charles Sturt University
January, 2016
ABSTRACT

This thesis investigates the key motivations of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians in an attempt to identify factors that need to be taken into consideration in designing a pedagogical framework for management education for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander students.

The choice of topic was influenced by the Aboriginal Employment Strategy’s successes in assisting Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander job searchers, foreshadowing increasing numbers of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander employees reaching supervisory and management levels in the Australian workforce. At the same time, concerns had been raised about the significant number of withdrawals by Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander students from traditional management courses on the basis of their perceived irrelevance. The Journal of Management Education in 2011 dedicated an issue exclusively to this topic, suggesting it needed urgent attention.

A qualitative research approach was chosen, utilising Dialogic Exchange, the only Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australian model available, coupled with its nearest fit in Western terms, the case study method. The analysis of results relied on ideas from critical theory, narrative analysis and discourse analysis. The focus was placed on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander motivations in order to understand both positive and negative influences on the level of academic course completions.
The findings supported the literature that identified the key motivations characterizing Aboriginal societies. They include attitudes and beliefs about field dependence and context, holism, the role of dualities, balance and spirituality, the significance of place, collectivism in decision making, reflexivity and identity. The findings identified the need for a bi-cultural approach to management education, confirming the suitability of the “both-ways” approach previously adopted by some institutions. Further, the findings showed that the theoretical frameworks of psychodynamics and social systems underpinning the literature on the topic were able to provide key concepts for the research.

The research suggests that while approaches to teaching and learning in management education need to be designed to accommodate the motivations of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander students, there would be substantial benefits if other Australian students gained an understanding of how the cultural values and beliefs of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians underpin their approaches to management. In the longer term, this could have relevance for the theory and practice of management for Australia as a whole.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

As an educational experience, I found this PhD research to be second to none. Working with such dedicated mentors as my supervisors, Adjunct Professor Geoffrey Bamberry and Dr Pamela Lockhart, allowed me to pursue my goals with consistent enthusiasm and the necessary encouragement to deal with any setbacks I encountered.

The combination of Charles Sturt University Library and Australia Post produced a standard of service that could be a benchmark for speed and reliability in backing up distance education candidates.

Seminar meetings at Wagga Wagga and Bathurst were well managed and enabled broader contact with post-graduate colleagues and university staff. During my visits to the Bathurst campus I was additionally fortunate to receive support and inspiration from Dr Peter and Sandra Lynch of Kelso. Closer to home, I was made welcome almost daily by Patrick and Alice, franchisees of Donut King, Marrickville Metro, who provided facilities for reading, writing and engagement with Aboriginal customers.

My research enabled me to spend many hours yarning with the Aboriginal participants enabling my study to be undertaken. This was the experience of a lifetime, as I was privileged to listen and learn about Aboriginal perceptions of the impacts of Australian majority culture on Aboriginal lives and motivations in suburban Sydney. This work is limited to management education, but it is clear that knowledge and understanding of Australian aboriginality needs the attention of many disciplines and the unqualified good will of all Australians.
## Table of Contents

Glossary of main terms ............................................................................................................. 2

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................ 21
1.2 The key research question .................................................................................................................. 23
1.3 Background to the research ................................................................................................................ 23
1.4 Justification for the research ................................................................................................................25
1.5 Methodology .......................................................................................................................................... 32
1.6 Chapters structure and outlines ...........................................................................................................37
1.7 Delimitations of scope and key assumptions ..................................................................................... 46
1.8 Conclusion ............................................................................................................................................. 48

Chapter 2 Literature review

2.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................................................ 51
   2.1.1 Research aim and dimensions ....................................................................................................... 52
   2.1.2 Locating the research area in its antecedent disciplines ................................................................. 54
   2.1.3 Theoretical and research environments which give rise to perceived lack of relevance ............. 57
   2.1.4 Why social systems, psychodynamic, and systems psychodynamic theories? ...................... 60

2.2 The origins of motivations and culture in neuroscience ............................................................... 66
   2.2.1 Impacts of Western, left hemisphere dominance on management education ............................. 66
   2.2.2 Neural effects of field and emotions on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ................................................. 70
   2.2.3 Cultural history and geography as attributive to current misunderstandings ......................... 72
   2.2.4 Connecting Aboriginal motivations and pedagogy ................................................................. 75

2.3 Motivational elements in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ....................... 76
   2.3.1 Motivations as key theoretical underpinnings to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ......................................................... 77
   2.3.2 Convergence of disciplines and theories - social, personal, natural sciences and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander ontology ......................................... 82
   2.3.3 How field-dependence and context influence motivations, cultural values and management styles .............................................................................................................. 85
   2.3.4 Holism as a primary motivator of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management students .......................................................................................................................... 89
   2.3.5 Prominence of dualities in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management motivation ............................................................ 93
   2.3.6 Balance as a fundamental element of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management motivation ........................................................................................................... 95
   2.3.7 Spirituality - an all-encompassing motivation of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander
4.2.23 Culturally driven motivations in Emily's evidence ................................................................. 265
  4.2.23.1 Evidence of holism in Emily's evidence ....................................................................... 265
  4.2.23.2 Evidence of duality in Emily's evidence ..................................................................... 265
  4.2.23.3 Evidence of balance in Emily's evidence .................................................................... 265
  4.2.23.4 Narrative influences in Emily's evidence ............................................................ 265
  4.2.23.5 Collectivist and power influences in Emily's motivations ........................................ 265

4.2.24 Summary of Emily's three research phases ................................................................. 266
  4.2.24.1 Experiential evidence in Emily's discourse ............................................................ 266
  4.2.24.2 Meaning of Emily's life experiences .......................................................................... 266
  4.2.24.3 Analysis of findings about Emily's motivations ..................................................... 266

4.2.16 Personal motivations of participant Steven ........................................................................ 267
  4.2.16.1 Evidence of holism in Steven's evidence .................................................................... 267
  4.2.16.2 Evidence of duality in Steven's attitudes and motivations ........................................ 267
  4.2.16.3 Evidence of balance in Steven's attitudes and motivations ...................................... 267
  4.2.16.4 Identity as a factor in Steven's motivations ............................................................. 267
  4.2.16.5 Individual and power factors in Steven's motivations ............................................. 267

4.2.17 Culturally driven motivations in Steven's evidence ........................................................ 270
  4.2.17.1 Motivational indicators of place in Steven's evidence ............................................. 270
  4.2.17.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Steven's life ................................................ 270
  4.2.17.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Steven's motivations ............................ 270
  4.2.17.4 Narrative influences in Steven's motivations .......................................................... 270
  4.2.17.5 Collectivist and power influences in Steven's motivations ...................................... 270

4.2.18 Summary of Steven's three research phases ................................................................. 271
  4.2.18.1 Experiential evidence in Steven's discourse ............................................................ 271
  4.2.18.2 Meaning of Steven's life experiences ....................................................................... 271
  4.2.18.3 Analysis of findings about Steven's motivations ................................................... 271

4.2.19 Personal motivations of participant Natalie ................................................................. 273
  4.2.19.1 Evidence of holism in Natalie's evidence ................................................................ 273
  4.2.19.2 Evidence of duality in Natalie's attitudes and motivations ..................................... 273
  4.2.19.3 Evidence of balance in Natalie's attitudes and motivations .................................... 273
  4.2.19.4 Identity as a factor in Natalie's motivations ............................................................ 273
  4.2.19.5 Individual and power factors in Natalie's motivations ......................................... 273

4.2.20 Culturally driven motivations in Natalie's evidence .................................................. 277
  4.2.20.1 Motivational indicators of place in Natalie's evidence ............................................ 277
  4.2.20.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Natalie's life ................................................ 277
  4.2.20.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Natalie's motivations ............................ 277
  4.2.20.4 Narrative influences in Natalie's motivations .......................................................... 277
  4.2.20.5 Collectivist and power influences in Natalie's motivations ...................................... 277

4.2.21 Summary of Natalie's three research phases .......................................................... 280
  4.2.21.1 Experiential evidence in Natalie's discourse .......................................................... 280
  4.2.21.2 Meaning of Natalie's life experiences ...................................................................... 280
  4.2.21.3 Analysis of findings about Natalie's motivations .................................................... 280

4.2.22 Personal motivations of participant Emily ................................................................. 283
  4.2.22.1 Evidence of holism in Emily's outlook and motivations .......................................... 283
  4.2.22.2 Evidence of duality in Emily's attitudes and motivations ....................................... 283
  4.2.22.3 Evidence of balance in Emily's attitudes and motivations ...................................... 283
  4.2.22.4 Identity as a factor in Emily's motivations ............................................................... 283
  4.2.22.5 Individual and power factors in Emily's motivations ............................................. 283

4.2.23 Culturally driven motivations in Emily's evidence .................................................... 287
  4.2.23.1 Motivational indicators of place in Emily's evidence ............................................. 287
  4.2.23.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Emily's life ................................................ 287
  4.2.23.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Emily's motivations ............................ 287
  4.2.23.4 Narrative influences in Emily's motivations .......................................................... 287
  4.2.23.5 Collectivist and power influences in Emily's motivations ...................................... 287

4.2.24 Summary of Emily's three research phases ........................................................... 289
  4.2.24.1 Experiential evidence in Emily's discourse ............................................................ 289
4.2.24.2 Meaning of Emily’s life experiences ............................................................... 290
4.2.24.3 Analysis of findings about Emily’s motivations ............................................ 291

4.3 Findings arising from thematic participant responses ........................................... 292

4.4 Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 296

Chapter 5 Findings and implications

5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................................. 299

5.2 Findings about hypotheses and research questions ................................................. 302

5.2.1 Findings about key motivations to seek naturalism, dualities, balance and identity, over the long term ................................................................. 302

5.2.1.1 Naturalism and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence ............ 302
5.2.1.2 Duality and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence ................. 304
5.2.1.3 Balance and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence ............... 306
5.2.1.4 Identity and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence ............... 307

5.2.2 Findings arising from thematic participant responses ........................................ 309

5.2.2.1 Holistic and positive themes ................................................................. 310
5.2.2.2 Holistic and negative themes ................................................................. 310
5.2.2.3 Dualistic and positive themes ................................................................. 311
5.2.2.4 Dualistic and negative themes ................................................................. 312
5.2.2.5 Positive themes of balance and identity .................................................. 312
5.2.2.6 Negative themes of balance and identity .................................................. 313
5.2.2.7 Positive themes of individual and collective power .................................... 313
5.2.2.8 Negative themes of individual and collective power .................................. 314

5.2.3 Summary statement of positive and negative research themes ......................... 315

5.2.3.1 Personal power, reflexivity and identity .................................................... 315
5.2.3.2 Findings about the demotivational affects of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander pedagogy marginalization and post-trauma ........................................ 318
5.2.3.3 Prejudice, stereotyping and faulty attribution ......................................... 319
5.2.3.4 Impacts of poverty on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy ................................................................. 321
5.2.3.5 Addressing assumptions about knowledge deficit ..................................... 322

5.3 Appropriateness of social systems, psychodynamic, and other theories for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ........................................ 324

5.3.1 Characteristics of theories recommended for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ................................................................. 326

5.3.2 Integrating social systems and psychodynamic theories with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ........................................ 329

5.3.2.1 Relating Aboriginal management education with social systems theory .......... 330
5.3.2.2 Contribution of social systems theory to Aboriginal management education .... 332
5.3.2.3 Contribution of systems theories to managing Aboriginal demotivation .......... 335
5.3.2.4 Implications of psychodynamic theories for Aboriginal motivation and pedagogy 336
5.3.3 Ecology and bi-culturality affecting Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander pedagogy..............339
  5.3.3.1 Findings about ecological world-views framing Aboriginal societies ..................339
  5.3.3.2 Adding value to career development through the acquisition of bi-culturality ........340

5.3.4 Findings relating Aboriginal management concepts to innovations in digital corporations.....341

5.3.5 Towards a theory of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education.........345
  5.3.5.1 Locating Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education within current management education theories ................................................................. 347
  5.3.5.2 Identifying appropriate media for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ................................................................. 348
  5.3.5.3 Implications for dualities in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education ................................................................. 350
  5.3.5.4 Status of Aboriginal & Torres Strait Islander management education pedagogy.... 351

5.4 Implications for policy and practice ................................................................. 352
  5.4.1 Reducing respect gap between Western and Aboriginal management education..........353
  5.4.2 The place of non-discrete dualities and their symbolism .......................................354
  5.4.3 The sophistication of invisibilizing power and authority ........................................355
  5.4.4 Fluid frame shifting between Aboriginal and majority cultures...............................355
  5.4.5 Spirituality and place in management education for the 21st century .......................355
  5.4.6 Avoiding lost motivation to be educated by ensuring culturally apposite pedagogy.......355

5.5 Conclusion............................................................................................................. 359
Diagrams

Figure 1  AA motif from North America ................................................................. 35
Figure 2  Modified Perry diagram of chapters ....................................................... 38
Figure 3  Limits of current and proposed research ............................................. 53
Figure 4  Adams’ radial view of the psyche .......................................................... 55
Figure 5  Locus of research .................................................................................. 56
Figure 6  Chapter 2 format .................................................................................. 57
Figure 7  Kapululangu course in cultural studies ............................................... 65
Figure 8  Ganma image ....................................................................................... 81
Figure 9  Ying-Yang ............................................................................................. 82
Figure 10  Field-dependence (high context) and field-independence (low context) .................................................................................. 86
Figure 11  Nature of holistic concepts .................................................................. 90
Figure 12  Flags of Japan and Australia .............................................................. 98
Figure 13  Medicine Wheel ................................................................................ 112
Figure 14  Comparing Western and trilogies .................................................... 116
Figure 15  Holy Spirit (anonymous artist) ............................................................ 118
Figure 16  Modified Peirce trilogy ..................................................................... 120
Figure 17  Nature and Right-angle .................................................................... 142
Figure 18  Fractal of terrain developed from noise sources. C. Wellons.(2007) .................................................................................. 164
Figure 19  Dwelling construction solution for Arctic circle - Inuit online education .................................................................................. 166
Figure 20  Kawagley’s schematic of world-view.................................................. 169
Figure 21  Maluli-Meyer trilogy ......................................................................... 170
Figure 22  Linear approach to pedagogy, Kort & Reilly .................................... 180
Figure 23  Holistic diagram of pedagogy, Kort & Reilly .................................. 181
Figure 24  Personal, individual and functional motivations research .................. 203
Figure 25  Environmental motivational impacts of cultural, collective and societal origins ........................................................................ 204
Figure 26  Participant outcome summaries of three research phases Research themes .......................................................... 207
Figure 27  Building theory from case study Western theories supporting management styles .......................................................... 215
Figure 28 Circle management - borrowers from the Grameen Bank .................................................. 235
Figure 29 Research themes .................................................................................................................. 295
Figure 30 Western theories supporting and Torres Strait Islander management styles ............. 301
Figure 31 Social synergy of bi-culturality ........................................................................................... 341
Figure 32 Innovative and conventional organization designs of six IT corporates .....................344

Tables

Table 1 Field-dependence and Field-independence ...........................................................................87

Table 2 Western Dualities ....................................................................................................................151
CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person nor material which to a substantial extent has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma of a university or other institution of higher learning, except where due acknowledgment is made in the acknowledgements.

Signed: ..................................................
(Daniel Guilfoyle)

Date: .....................................................
HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE APPROVAL

26 October 2011

Mr Daniel Guilfoyle
IC, 89A Livingstone Road
MARRICKVILLE NSW 2204

Dear Mr Guilfoyle,

Thank you for the additional information forwarded in response to a request from the Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC). The CSU HREC reviews projects in accordance with the National Health and Medical Research Council’s National Statement on Ethical Conduct in Research Involving Humans.

I am pleased to advise that your project entitled “Identifying the factors influencing approaches To Management Education” meets the requirements of the National Statement; and ethical approval for this research is granted for a twelve month period from 26/10/11. The protocol number issued with respect to this project is 2011/126. Please be sure to quote this number when responding to any request made by the Committee. Please note the following conditions of approval:

- All Consent Forms and Information Sheets are to be printed on Charles Sturt University letterhead. Students should liaise with their Supervisor to arrange to have these documents printed.
- You must notify the Committee immediately in writing should your research differ in any way from that proposed. Forms are available at [www.csu.edu.au/research/forms/ehrc_annrep.doc](http://www.csu.edu.au/research/forms/ehrc_annrep.doc); You must notify the Committee immediately if any serious and or unexpected adverse events or outcomes occur associated with your research, that might affect the participants and therefore ethical acceptability of the project. An Adverse Incident form is available from the website: as above; Amendments to the research design must be reviewed and approved by the Human Research Ethics Committee before commencement.
- Forms are available at the website above; If an extension of the approval period is required, a request must be submitted to the Human Research Ethics Committee. Forms are available at the website above; You are required to complete a Progress Report form, which can be downloaded as above, by 26/10/12 if your research has not been completed by that date; You are required to submit a final report, the form is available from the website above. You are reminded that an approval letter from the CSU HREC constitutes ethical approval only.
- If your research involves the use of radiation, biological materials, chemicals or animals a separate approval is required from the appropriate University Committee. The Committee wishes you well in your research and please do not hesitate to contact the Executive Officer on telephone [02) 6338 4628](tel:02) 6338 4628 or email ethics@csu.edu.au if you have any enquiries.

Yours sincerely

Julie Hicks, Executive Officer

Human Research Ethics Committee
Glossary of main terms

Aboriginal: The original Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people of Australia, derived from the Latin ab origine, or from the beginning.

Archetype: An unconscious disposition to act in a certain way when exposed to stimulating imagery that accesses the self below the level of consciousness, as a person, place or thing. The Aboriginal rainbow serpent spoken about in stories or seen in art or landform can be construed as an archetypal figure. Alternatively, an archetype can take human form, such as “wise man” or “earth mother”.

Aunty: In culture, covers both aunts of family bloodlines and honorific titles of respect for female Elders, either tribal or female community members.

Autological: Words that express properties of themselves; for example, short is a short word.

Autopoiesis: Systems that reproduce all of the elementary components out of which they arise by means of a network of these elements themselves and in this way distinguish themselves from an environment - whether this takes the form of life, consciousness or (in the case of social systems) communication. Autopoiesis is the mode of reproduction of these systems (Luhmann, 1989).

Balance: A systemic motivation to equalize attention to social imbalances, and to take action in order to restore community harmony, by reducing the tensions of inequality. Its
closest synonym is homeostasis, a broader term describing a tendency to equalize imbalances in both natural and social sciences.

Balanda: The non-Aboriginal resident of Northern Australia, especially as related to the dominant white culture. Etymological roots found in the term 'belanda', a word for describing Dutch colonists, used by native Macassans.

Bi-cultural: Pertaining to two cultures, usually in relation to the ability of some to shift behavioural patterns from one cultural style to another.

Both-ways: Respect, tolerance and diversity, jointly within Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and Australian pedagogy and educational modalities. It recognizes as equals, Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander traditions of knowledge, and Western academic disciplinary traditions within cultural context.

Cadigal: An aboriginal tribal group of the Sydney area.

Cartesian: Relating to the theories of French philosopher, Renee Descartes.

Case study: A research strategy that focuses on understanding the dynamics present within single settings. It provides descriptions, tests theory and generates theory (Eisenhardt, 1989).

Collectivism: The social preference for the interests of the social group over the individual person.
Context: See high context / low context and their equivalents, field-dependence / field-independence.

Continuous improvement: The fifth of J. Edwards Deming’s ten points for quality management is to improve constantly and forever the system of production and service (Walton, 1986). This idea has taken hold in learning organizations and other management contexts. It states the opposite to the commonsense notion of solving problems, as in putting fires out, and adopts a systems approach to ensure system stability. It reduces variation by proactively managing to prevent the need to solve unforeseen and emergent problems.

Credentialism: The preference for written qualifications of Western institutes of learning over the experience of candidates regarded as unqualified, or uncertificated, such as Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people with deep cultural knowledge.

Critical discourse analysis: A technique derived from linguistics in which discourse is analysed in three dimensions: language texts, discourse practice, and discursive events. For this research, the works of Wodak and Meyer (2009) have been preferred.

Cross-cultural: The observation of differences between and amongst cultures.

Cultural relativism: Tendency to filter observations through the understandings of one’s own culture. It arose in response to anthropologists’ awareness in mid-20th century of their own ethno-centrism.
Culture: Sum total of a way of life, including such things as expected behaviours, beliefs, values, languages, and living practices shared by members of a society.

Curriculum: A Latin word meaning a running course or career. This research covers only the antecedents of curriculum for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander education in management, especially its pedagogy and motivational constituency.

Cybernetics: Norbert Wiener (1894-1964) first conceived cybernetics as control and communication in the animal and machine, setting its course as inter-disciplinary. Its etymology has Greek origins, meaning the art of steering; hence its connections to self-reference and autopoiesis. Anthony Stafford Beer (1926-2002), the first scientist to apply cybernetics to management, called it the science of effective organization. His inter-connections between cybernetics, management and spirituality relate closely to the themes of this research.

Dialectics: The concepts derived from dialectics important to this research are that everything is composed of opposing forces and more importantly that the opposing forces can be depicted in triangular form: A thesis is asserted, then opposed by an antithesis, and produces the energy to generate a resultant third entity, called a synthesis.

Dialogue: A conversation between two or more people.

Discourse analysis: (See critical discourse analysis, above).
Dreaming or Dreamtime: The philosophical basis for the conceptual thinking of Aboriginal peoples in Australia.

Dualism: Collection of principles and behaviours involved in the notion of duality in the social sciences.

Duality: A state of dichotomy, or division into two parts, not necessarily equal.

Ecology: The inter-disciplinary science of living systems. In Aboriginal terms, ecology and eco-systems would include the relationality of both animate and inanimate (non-biological) entities, in the broadest sense of the natural world.

Ecopsychology: Regards the mind as a construct, not just of our social world, but also of a wider, natural world, from which all evolved. Ecopsychologists recommend comforting connections with nature, including other species and ecosystems, in order to realise well-balanced and well-adjusted individual lifestyles.

Education: Traditional Western definitions of bringing out from within the person that which would otherwise remain only potential are shared to a large extent by Eastern educators. The differences between the hemispheres are to be found in Western considerations of individuals competing, contrasting with Eastern concerns about social priorities. Aboriginal educators have long resisted colonialist assumptions about what constitutes knowledge. They insist on the importance of having their own cultural knowledge included in ideas of what it means to be educated.
Elder: Describes Australian Aboriginals who are regarded as providers of wise counsel on matters of Aboriginal personal and band behaviour. Elder does not necessarily include those of older age groups, but rather those who are highly respected.

Emic: Harris (2001, 2007) classified the constraints of cultural relativism in terms of emic and etic. To Harris (2001, 32), emic is when “operations have, as their hallmark, elevation of the native informant to the status of ultimate judge of the observer’s descriptions and analyses”.

Empiricism: View that experience, especially of the senses, is the only source of knowledge. Empiricism refers to findings derived from experiment or observation rather than from theory or personal belief.

Epidemiology: The study of the relationships of various factors determining the frequency and distribution of diseases in a human community.

Espoused theory: Argyris & Schon (1996) distinguished between espoused theory (what we say) and theory-in-use (what we do), in relation to examining the implications of double-loop learning (Argyris, 2008). This has been given special attention in this research because of the importance accorded to reflexivity by Martin (2003) in respect of Aboriginal ways of knowing (See also theory-in-use).

Essentialism: A belief that essences are real and accessible. In this research, regarded as one of the irreconcilable differences between Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and non-Aboriginal philosophies, as it implies a Western and ordinal arrangement of
constituents, in which one is distilled and ranked first.

Ethics: Moral arm of philosophy, informing decisions about right human conduct and behaviour.

Etic: Etic is characterized as “the elevation of observers to the status of ultimate judges” (Harris, 2001, 32).

Epistemology: This branch of philosophy studies the nature of knowledge, its presuppositions and foundations, its extent and validity.

Field-dependence: The field-dependent (high context) student establishes a warm and personal learning environment and is motivated by personal aspects of the educational experience. As the field-dependent student is less energized by the teacher than by the group, the fit with management education is likely to be better than for the field-independent (low context) student.

Field-independence: The field-independent (low context) student can more easily break the field down into its constituent parts and typically is not influenced by the existing structure. In other words, field-independence enables the making of choices independently of perceptual field.

Function systems: In social systems theory, identified by Luhmann (Moeller, 2006) as law, economy, politics, art, education, science, religion, and the mass media. Borch (2011, 70) adds that how many function systems exist is an empirical question.
Ganma: Commenting on the place of ganma as an Aboriginal metaphor, Hughes (2000) maintains that the theory holds (in part), that the forces of salt and fresh water streams combine, and lead to deeper understanding and truth. The interactivity of two streams mixing turbulently results, not in negative outcomes, but in counter-intuitive "deeper understanding". A ganma image is at Figure 8 (p.81).

Geodesic: Architect Fuller's coinage, defined as the most economical relationship between any two events (Edmondson, 2007) and depicted as a triangle. The icosahedron, or fundamental geodesic pattern, can be drawn as a star polygon for use as management tool (Girard, 2009, 120).

Grameen Bank: A bank for the financing of clients without capital, founded in 1983 by Muhammad Yunus. Its main function is micro-finance, and it was designed to begin a credit delivery system to provide banking services for the rural poor of Asia.

Hierarchy: A power structure, organized in ranks, in which the higher rank has power and authority over its immediate lower rank.

High context: See Field-dependence.

History Wars: A term used to describe an ongoing dispute between conservative and progressive Australians. The main issue is the degree of damage done to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians since the continent was colonized, conservatives claiming that the impacts were mainly benign, and that the debate has been captured by
elite commentators who prefer a “black armband” view of history; in other words they believe that the extent of sympathy for the misfortunes of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians has been excessive. The black armband view was introduced by Geoffrey Blainey in his 1993 Latham address. Blainey’s view included the duality of black armband in contest with a “three cheers” attitude (1993).

Holism: Conceptualizing as whole systems, instead of reducing to a sum of an entity's parts. In an Aboriginal example, its society should be viewed as a whole, not as a sum of its parts, which would reproduce the error of Descartes rejected by Waters (2004) as reductionist and non-Aboriginal.

Icosahedron: (See geodesic) A polyhedron having twenty faces.

Identification: In this research, this term is used in a technical sense, as a construct of psycho-dynamic theory. That is, adopting unconsciously the self-image of initial primary caregivers. In identifications at later life stages than infancy, the phenomenon may be of less deep significance, but still profoundly affective. In psychoanalytic theory, identification touches on very nearly all aspects of personality development and organization. It is a central mechanism in the process of ego and identity formation and is directly and primarily involved in superego formation. It is also one of the most important developmental mechanisms in the formation of character (Meissner, 1970).

Identity: The distinctive characteristics of behaviour and appearance that distinguish an individual as part of a larger group. Conserving its unique identity is a characteristic of Australian Aboriginality.
Indigenist: The term was coined by Niezen (2003) and subsequently used by the United Nations Organization to describe collectively the identity of all peoples. The general characteristics of Aboriginality were disseminated world-wide in the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Peoples (2007), so that individual nation-states could be informed of their obligations to ensure the preservation of the rights of peoples within their borders.

Indigenous: Originating where found, a broader term than Aboriginal, both words being used synonymously, where appropriate, in this research.

Intentionality: An important part of Husserl's (1999) phenomenological project was to show that all conscious acts are directed at or about objective content. In general terms, intentionality means directed towards some goal or thing.

Invisibilize: In Luhmann's (1995) terminology, the human tendency to solve paradox by contingency, involving overlooking or hiding the rejected alternative, in order to create a false sense of certainty, thereby moving on to the next decision and maintaining the viability of a social system.

IT (Information technology): In this research, the term IT refers to applied computer science as practised within corporate settings in the form of IT divisions, that is functional groups servicing other corporate divisions, such as Finance, Marketing and Operations.

Kamilaroi: An Aboriginal tribal group of the plains area in north-western NSW.
Knowledge deficit: This concept is considered to be part of a wider perception of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australia as a "deficit culture" (Park, 2005). In this sense it is a discursive demarcation, an act of power, that demarcates the centre from the periphery, the normal from the deviant, the same from the different, the self from the Other.

Learning organizations: Organizations where people continually expand their capacity to create the results they truly desire, where new and expansive patterns of thinking are nurtured, where collective aspiration is set free, and where people are continually learning how to learn together (Senge 1990, 2005).

Low context: See Field-independence.

Management: Management could be regarded as a Western notion, as it connotes control and command, whereas management carries the collectivist construction of guidance and mutual respect. Nisbett (2004) illustrates this difference in perception in terms of Western (low context) definitions of the business company as a system performing tasks efficiently. Eastern (high context) definitions stress a group of people working together (2004, 83-84). In this research, the definition of management is not limited to work involving formal control of staff. Peter Drucker (2001) defined the term as “a multi-purpose organ that manages a business and manages managers and manages workers and work. It is an organ of society specifically charged with making resources productive, that is, with the responsibilities for organized economic advance”.

Mary Magdalene: A Christian saint, presented paradoxically as on the one hand, a saint,
and on the other hand, a sinner. Included in this glossary, in response to her appearance in the evidence of two participants in the research. Observed from the feminine perspective, Mary is perceived in terms of a paradox - a true saint in one sense, but in another, as the eternal victim of male patriarchy, her heroic life wilfully falsified in Church narratives, by distancing her from Christ, to deny women power and equality.

Materialism: The motivation to acquire wealth and privilege whilst ignoring the spirituality in human life.

Methodology: System of methods and principles referring to the theory and analysis of factors within a field of knowledge. In this research referring to the field of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education, accessed by methods such as case study and discourse analysis. Methodology can properly refer to the theoretical analysis of the methods appropriate to a field of study or to the body of methods and principles particular to a branch of knowledge.

Motivation: In this research, motivation is regarded as generated from physiological causes that are instinctive, rather than purposive (Maze, 2009). Purposive definitions are viewed as presenting effects as causes, and as concealing the complexity of movements or behaviours that occur between the impulse to act and the achievement for which the behaviour is named. The assumptions of the psychodynamic account of motivation used in this research are:

- Instinctual drives, like hunger and thirst, become organized into the duality of id (wants) and superego (conscience), which compete and externalize in the world as ego (self) and associated socialized behaviour.
In the Aboriginal case, some of these processes find the approval of elders within culture. They are taught and reinforced as values and law.

Antecedent motivational variables of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians are identified in the literature review and research interviews, in a discourse about perceptions of many non-discrete dualities and tensions of opposites.

The tensions meriting investigation include such experiences as assertive place-based land occupancy, re-construction of Aboriginal identities, and confirmation of the spiritualities of elders and ancestors.

These motivational processes, including relief of the tensions formed from the contradictions of non-Aboriginal world views and attitudes, are likely to be transferable as essential components of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander pedagogies.

Narrative: Composed of a plot, language and cognitive reflection, and all other components of a story. The choice of story as synonym for narrative, gives it more cogency with Aboriginal writers, such as Williams (2007), who adopts the term "storying" to describe a preferred approach in communicating with Aboriginal research participants.

Narrative analysis: In Heather Richmond's (2002) description for students engaged in adult education, the genre of most management education, narrative analysis has four components: orientation, incidents, complicating action, and resolution.

Nation: Used in the broader sense, in the context of Australia, wherein a multitude of Aboriginal bands or nations were incorporated in the Australian state, whilst never giving
up or acquiescently losing their individual pre-invasion nationhood.

Natural: A disputed term in Australian conversation. However, in conversations between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australians, opposing definitions contrast greatly, as Aboriginal peoples regard the collective as natural and non-Aboriginal Australians regard focus on the individual as natural.

Non-discrete: The descriptor used by Aboriginal philosopher, Waters (2004) to explain those dualities that are consistent with Aboriginal ontology. They are different in kind to the dualities of Descartes (2008), which Waters (2004) associates with logical opposites, and regards as devoid of dialectical value.

Numinous: An entity which arouses spirituality or divinity. This may include places and ceremonies for Aboriginal peoples, or formal religious practices for the non-Aboriginal.

Ontology: The philosophical study of the nature of being. It deals also with existence and with what can correctly be said to exist; among other problems, ontology deals with the distinction between reality and appearance, and with the sense in which numbers or other abstract entities can be said to exist.

Oral society: A society which prefers oral accounts, such as stories or narratives, to transmit its culture and history, rather than written script.

Paradox: A statement contrary to received opinion, perceived as a contradiction in terms.
In the context of this research, paradox can be discrete (logical), e.g. white vs non-white or non-discrete, e.g. individual vs collective.

Pedagogy or paedagogy: The art or science of being a teacher. The term generally refers to strategies of instruction, or styles of instruction. Pedagogy is sometimes viewed as the correct use of teaching strategies. For example, Freire’s pedagogy for teaching adults is referred to as critical pedagogy (Freire 2000, 2004, 2005).

Personhood: The realisation of the person-in-culture, which may differ substantially between individuals who come from low context or high context societies. The latter would realise personhood via the collective and the former by the rights of the individual.

Place: Given an enhanced meaning in this research, as a principal motivator of Aboriginal peoples. This means its definition is distinctly relational and should include the spirituality of a place, and its relationship to the culture of the people who identify with it.

Psycho-dynamic theories: Dynamic or depth accounts of motivation, behaviour and personality, such as those of Freud, Jung, Hillman, Adler and neo-Freudians.

Psyche: The human mind, especially in relation to spirituality or soul.

Psychology: The study of human behaviour and its associated mental processes.

Psychotic: A diagnosis of serious mental ill-health, such as paranoia or schizophrenia.
Radial: The adjective of radius, or half the diameter of a circle. In this research, radials inform Adams' non-discrete opposites, by positing that they can be overlaid by other dualities, such as positive / negative, or conscious / unconscious.

Reflexivity: The magic ingredient by which persons are created as self-conscious, self-controlling and autobiographically aware beings (Archer, 2000).

Reductionism: The belief that complexity can be reduced by de-construction into constituents that are less complex.

Religion: A system of beliefs in the form of commonly held propositions about knowledge and behaviours, that its memberships regard as sacred, and worthy of ritual practices.

Self-actualization (Self-realisation): Maslow's self-actualization is described by Hall and Lindzey as the specific end towards which people strive; more specifically as “an active will toward health, an impulse towards growth, or towards the actualization of human potentialities” (Hall & Lindzey, 1978, 268).


Society: An organization of the communications of people associated for some common interest, such as decisions about education, or finance, which are made in their own functional sub-systems. This definition accords with Teubner’s (2012) observations of
Luhmann's view, that society excludes those without the codes of entry, for example those living in poverty. It also assumes exclusion of phenomena of great complexity, like spirituality, which are assigned to an external environment.

Sociology: The observational study of groups, institutions and societies.

Spirituality: Attainment of meaning through values (Frankl, 2004). The opposite of materialism, spirituality is an inner sense of connectedness to all things; and is the polar opposite of Nietzsche’s atomism. Its related Aboriginal duality is spiritual / temporal.

Stolen generations: A process by which children, especially those of mixed race, were removed from Aboriginal families and raised in non-Aboriginal homes. The harmful circumstances of these removals are still denied by right-wing Australian media commentators and historians (Manne, 2001), notwithstanding the findings of the Australian report (Bringing them Home) of a Commission of Inquiry into the separation of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander children from their families (Dodson, M. & Wilson. R., 1997), and the Apology to the Stolen Generations speech by Prime Minister Rudd in 2008.

Synergy: The behaviour of whole systems, unpredicted by the behaviour of their parts, taken separately (Fuller, in Edmondson, 2007).

Synthesis: The opposite of analysis, and product of a thesis opposed by an antithesis (Hegel, 2005). In Capra's (1983b) view, “reductionism and holism, analysis and synthesis are complementary approaches that, used in proper balance, help us obtain a deeper knowledge of life”.
System: An arrangement of related parts, with a boundary between itself and its environment. All systems are holistic (see Holism).

Terrapsychology: Coined by Chalquist (2008), it describes the deep study of the presence, soul, or "voice" of places and things: what the ancients knew as their resident genius loci or indwelling spirit.

Theory-in-use: Argyris and Schon (1996) distinguished between espoused theory (what we say) and theory-in-use (what we do), in relation to examining the implications of double-loop learning. This has been given special attention in this research because of the importance accorded to reflexivity by Martin (2003) in respect of Aboriginal ways of knowing.

Transference: Tendency of clients of therapy or students to treat the therapist or teacher as a parent archetype or other archetypal figure beyond conscious reach.

Transformation: The phenomenon that lifts the learner or teacher to a new level and an upward re-integration of self. It is the self-realisation of an incremental gain in personal development which becomes a new platform for future experiences of further transformational learning.

Uncle: In Aboriginal culture, covers both Uncles of family bloodlines and honorific titles of respect for male elders, either tribal or other deeply respected male community members.
Uluru: Both Aboriginal (Anangu) sacred site and World Heritage site, Uluru is situated in central Australia and was formerly known as Ayer's Rock.

Virtual: A metaphorical idea implying not factual but "in effect". Commonly used in personal computing, for example "virtual memory", or computer gaming, such as the concept of "avatar" as a generic game identity.

Wiradjuri: The largest of the Aboriginal tribal groups of NSW, their territory is bounded by three rivers, Lachlan, Murrumbidgee, and Murray.

Wisdom: Understanding of life’s experiences, assisting the individual to greater mastery of social environments and spirituality. It is associated with wholeness of system and longer time horizons. It is respectful of differences, self-referential and self-actualizing.

World-view: A framework of ideas for perceptions of the world and related to the German term weltanschauung. It is a pivotal concept in this research because of the vastly different world-views between Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and majority Australia.
Chapter 1   Introduction

1.1 Introduction

The issues exposed in the literature on which this research is based were, at first glance, cultural. That is, Aboriginal students of management education appeared to react differently from Western students to the tertiary courses offering throughout the post-colonial world. A familiar response of Aboriginal students was simply to withdraw from the educational program, but this was seen to mask a deeper objection, that management courses were perceived as irrelevant to the needs of Aboriginal students. Evaluations of cause of withdrawal sometimes made reference to a sense of heavier obligation to return to a tribal cultural base. Another way of interpreting a decision to withdraw from an academic program would be to view it as a loss of motivation. The latent question could be expressed as "what reduced the considerable motivation to begin the course to the extent that suffering the trials of giving up became preferable". Another possibility was a tacit rejection of the course content on the grounds of its lack of authenticity - that what was offered was neither management, nor management education.

The question of why motivation was lost, raised the broader subject of what motivation is, and how it energizes Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and other students differently, in the context of management education. Consequently, the literature was analyzed closely for motivational themes, beginning with research evidence of relevant studies of Aboriginal societies, and how they externalized motivational behaviours in the contexts of Aboriginal management styles, leadership and world-views. Finding Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander motivations and how they were expressed in Aboriginal occupations offered the
possibility of revealing a more authentic Aboriginal management style, and the ways in which it could inform a management pedagogy. Motivations and pedagogy are closely related, and therefore this research confines itself to strategies and styles of teaching, that is to pedagogy, rather than curriculum, or examining courses on offer at any particular management school.

The existing philosophy of Stephen Harris’ (Harris, 1990) both-ways education was preferred, as it is at face value even-handed, and it has bi-cultural acceptance in Australia, with a proven record of support of major academic research during the past two decades (Herbert, 2009, Ober, 2009, Hughes, 2000, Wilson, 2008). Both-ways research was perceived as consistent with the evidence obtained from three major studies of motivations (Chapman et al. 1991; Bryant, 1996, 2004; Sveiby & Skuthorpe, 2006 and 2011). Four primary drivers were distilled: holism, balance, dualism and place. Both-ways philosophy was then applied to the task of identifying holistic theorists of best fit. These holistic researchers were characterized also as systemic, spanning both personal and social domains, with expansive credibility, regardless of world-view. Jung (personal and social) and Luhmann (social) jointly form a foundation of “grand” theory, together with Hofstede (personal and social) and D'Iribarne (personal and social). Additionally, the antecedents of motivation were considered in the field of neuroscience, with particular emphasis given to the work of McGilchrist (2010). The broader canvass of world-views and management styles relied on the contributions of Hall (1990, 2002) on high context / low context and the complementary work of Nisbett (2004) on field-dependence (high context). theorists, Arabena (2006, 2008), Battiste et al. (2005), Begay (1991), Foley (2000, 2003, 2008, 2010), Green and Baldry (2008), Martin (2003, 2008a, 2008b, 2008c), Nakata (2004, 2007, 2008), Reyes and Perrault (2000), Smith (2006), Williams (2007), Wilson
(2008) and others, collectively enabled the gathering of evidence about ways of knowing and being motivated.

1.2 The key research question

The main question proposed for this research is:

How can a both-ways management education pedagogy be developed from the key motivations of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians?

This thesis research is by a non-Aboriginal Australian. Furthermore, one of its limitations is that the sample of participants included in the survey was limited to participants from the Wiradjuri, Kamilaroi and Anaiwan nations. It finds that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander motivations can be understood via neuroscientific, psychodynamic, field and social systems theories, which jointly explain both sides of Aboriginal and Western holism biculturally, satisfying the requirement that Baldry, Green, and Thorpe (2006, 366) term “the desperate need for services to take a holistic approach”. The findings may serve as groundwork for an innovative pedagogy of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education.

1.3 Background to the research

The Employment Strategy (The AES) in 1997 began a movement towards the better understanding of the reciprocal values of Aboriginal Australians as employees and other Australians as employers. Among the recommendations of the Aboriginal 1991 Royal Commission into Black Deaths in Custody, was the establishment nationwide of a group of
committees to promote employment. This initiative led Dick Estens (AO) to launch the first AES unit in Moree, NSW. AES has since assisted over 16,000 with their careers and is now a recruitment consultancy of national presence. Agreement of Mr D. Lester, CEO of AES was received to consult with the professional staff of the agency regarding motivations, and as a recruitment gateway for the eight interviewees for this project. Mr Lester (2012, 1) highlights the need for more focus to be placed on “increasing Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander representation in management roles, and within medium to high level occupations”. This provided evidence of a convergence of objectives between the agency and the proposed outcomes of this research. The initiatives of the AES have been succeeded by other philanthropic ventures, such as Bill Moss’ Gunya Australia arts and tourism initiative, to address unemployment rates of 60-100% at Titjikala, near Alice Springs in 2007, and Andrew Forrest's Generation One in 2011, begun as a joint venture with Aboriginal principals in Western Australia to vastly increase Aboriginal employment, especially in the minerals mining industry.

North American initiatives such as the Executive MBA program of Canada’s Simon Fraser University (Beedle School of Business) for Aboriginal Canadians and Idaho State University's MBA for Native North Americans have set new directions for the education of Aboriginal professional managers worldwide. In Australia, undergraduate degrees are underway at Curtin and Charles Sturt universities. Such promising movements have drawn attention to the need to prepare the way for increasing numbers of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians taking up management positions, and the prospect of offering management education with a suitable pedagogy. The extent of unmet needs has engaged the attention of Fitzgibbons and Humphries (2011), and the Journal of Management Education, who propose a world-wide effort to amplify the Principles of
Responsible Management and the needs of Aboriginal peoples seeking management education, by raising the understanding of the legitimacy of their management style preferences.

However, a pedagogy that meets these expectations will need to mesh with the current standard for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians, both-ways education. For this reason, there is a requirement for an Aboriginal framework that can resist the pressures to concede too much to a North American (Western) template by clearly stating a suitable Aboriginal theoretical standpoint. This research is directed towards providing a pedagogical basis for an Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander framework, by drawing from the research of appropriate Western social and natural scientists on the one hand, and from respected Aboriginal researchers on the other.

1.4 Justification for the research

The impetus generated in the Journal of Management Education by Fitzgibbons and Humphries arises from the same observations that presaged this research, that little has been done in the way of follow-up studies of Chapman et al. (1991) and Bryant (1996; 2004), except for Sveiby & Skuthorpe's (2009; 2011) work in Australia, notwithstanding the strong growth in the interim of Aboriginal employment within both Australian and North American workforces. In particular, looking behind culture into the deeper zone of motivations has not yet been attempted. The findings of the research, informed by the studies of Nisbett (1980, 2004) and Hall (1990) are confronting, as they expose the divergent world-views of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and majority Australia as a field-dependent (high context) sub-culture, located within a field-independent (low context)
majority culture. Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians derive their view of the
world from a field-dependent (high context) cultural perspective, while non-Aboriginal
Australians derive theirs from a field-independent (low context) lineage. These differences
are vast (Sheth & Mittal, 2004), and in many ways irreconcilable. Hence there is wisdom in
both-ways education, which offers respect to all who share its eclectic philosophy.

Using her Aboriginal-Insider’s perception of lifestyle differences between Native America
and its colonising majority culture, Spencer (1990) describes Western faith in the mastery
of discrete disciplines as anathema. Taking the example of a Western physicist, she
identified a paradox, which is at the heart of Aboriginal knowledge within a colonial culture,
namely "that which enables, disables also" (1990, 5). In the world of education for career
success, this means that the Aboriginal student of physics, striving to know only part of the
whole, can succeed in physics only by forsaking the unending Aboriginal and Torres Strait
Islander search for wholeness outside of the field of physics. This observation gives rise to
the question of whether there could be a conflict of motivations when Aboriginal and Torres
Strait Islander students are attracted, in the spirit of both-ways education, to disciplines
which demand the setting aside, at least for a time, of their cultural pride in their capacity
to multi-task, and to embrace Western sciences, which from a superficial perspective, may
be seen as reductionist.

Both-ways theorists can also be found in the natural sciences. For this reason, recourse to
both-ways theorists of natural and social sciences has been preferred for this research, as
they satisfy the conditions of both-ways education. These scientists demonstrate a
concurrent grasp of their original specialist field, and the social sciences within a holistic
world-view. Scholars such as Bateson (1987; 2003) (biology and cybernetics), Fuller
(1983) (architecture), Edmondson (2002; 2007) (engineering), Picard (1997; 2000) and Kort & Reilly (2002; 2008) (cybernetics), Deming (1986) (statistics), Capra (1983a; 1983b; 1996; 2000) (physics), Prigogine (1990; 2003) (chemistry) and Savory (1999) (agriculture) have all transcended their early specialties, and have used their learning to inform a more holistic reality that has credibility both-ways. That is, they are able to switch fluently between specialist and holistic styles of knowing, and to extend knowledge derived from natural sciences into the social sciences.

Spencer (1990), Nakata (2008, 2009), Pearson (2009, 2010), Wilson (2008), and other Aboriginal-Insider researchers, recognize the value in educating both-ways. However, other Australian researchers of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australia have raised difficulties facing those who insist that Australians must embrace both-ways education. For Folds (2001), cultural loss is of concern; for Sutton (2009), it is the internal contradiction of preserving traditional culture within an industrialized Western nation. Hunter (1999) and Jargowsky (1997) identified enduring poverty as a formidable difficulty. This research will consider all such known impediments to the success of Aboriginal management education, so that the demotivations that may compromise successful outcomes are exposed.

However, the evidence of this research indicates that there would be substantial benefits if all Australian students of all disciplines, and especially of management, understand that knowing Aboriginality for majority Australia is of equal importance to knowing Western culture for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians. In other words, the process direction needs reversing. The full development of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management skills will depend equally on increasing Australian knowledge of how holistic and field-dependent (high context) societies manage. In turn, for
the delivery of product by the Australian management academy, within an Asian hinterland, this shift would offer benefits, both cultural and commercial, for all Australians.

Fuller & Dil (1983) identified a fundamental difference between architectural forms and structures they deemed "natural", and those they deemed "unnatural". The main offenders against structural integrity were the ubiquitous right-angular buildings of the modern Western world. Circular, conical, domal, or triangular forms, typified by Aboriginal structures, on the other hand, are empirically stronger and "natural", according to Fuller. The medicine wheel (Figure 13, p.112) and Bryant's (1996, 2004) Aboriginal clan circles (Figures 7, p.65 and 28, p.235) would both merit Fuller's commendation of "natural" formation, but in a social context. It will be shown in this research that there is a marked compatibility between the findings of many holistic Western natural and social scientists, and the predilections of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australian students. Luhmann & Schorrs' (2000) social systems theory is conceptually triangular, and its binary tendencies are constantly impelled towards the balance of a third central tendency, as indicated by Mandawuy Yunupingu (1994) and Arabena (2006, 2008).

Jung's personal motivational theory of tension between what Waters (2004) has termed non-discrete opposites, such as feeling and thinking, features a derivative "higher third" state of mind, which resolves tension and generates an increment of personal development, analogous to Maslow's (1954) self-actualization. The result as a whole is greater than the sum of its parts. This gain is well illustrated in Fuller's analogy of a composite metal alloy, which is stronger than its two constituent metals. His well-known coinage of the descriptor synergy, for this gain in tensile strength, now serves the social sciences to express equivalent dialectical gains. Similarly by engaging the tension of
opposites, Luhmann's (1995) theory assumes a grander scale of major sub-systems of the social environment, such as law, politics, and education. In Luhmann's view, selection is key to the generation of energy in the social system of education, and pass / fail decisions form the fundamental binary choice. However, the binary nature of the process is not the familiar mathematical on / off, which is symmetrical, but the possibility of on vs the possibility of off. This tension of difference permits the asymmetry that exercises social energy, within a process which seeks balance and equalization. Luhmann's theory is holistic, energized by search for balance, and can be expressed systemically, only by Fuller & Dil's (1983) most preferred "natural" formation for buildings, the triangle.

The theories of Fuller & Dil (1983), Jung (1961a; 1961b; 1968; 1969a; 1969b; 1974; 1989; 1990) and Luhmann (1979; 1985; 1986; 1989; 1990; 1995; 2000a; 2000b) have a distinct relational consistency in terms of their reliance on dualistic tension, balance-seeking as driver, and trilogy. In addition, they connect credibly with evidence, gathered during the course of this research, of knowledge trilogies based on dualism and balance, especially in the findings of Hughes (2000), Waters (2004), Pearson (2009), Arabena (2006, 2008), Bryant et al. (1996, 2004) and Chapman et al. (1991). Of these researchers, Aboriginal-Insider, Waters (2004), emphatically rejects mixing Cartesian logical opposites, such as white and non-white, as drivers of Aboriginal dualities. She regards these as fundamental Western errors of understanding Native American ontology. In her terminology, non-discrete duality describes reality (2004, 97-99) and its dual constructs as complementary, with one remaining itself, but also part of the other.

All holistic researchers are systemic, but not all accommodate the second order or self referencing observation implicit in Luhmann's (1979; 1985; 1986; 1989; 1990; 1995;
2000a; 2000b) theories, which he called the observation of observation. Argyris (2008), Bateson (1987), Senge (1990), Wheatley (1992), and others do, however, and their findings have been preferred for their inter-relationality with Luhmann on this issue, as they jointly extend to a pedagogical template unique to Aboriginal learning. This pedagogy, described metaphorically as the circle of learning (Figures 7, p.60 and 28, p.227), by Bryant (1996) and Williams (2007), is essentially self-referencing, and directed, not by a teacher on the outside, but by experts on the inside. This forms a learning system that characterizes management education in the West at its highest level, a learning group that is, by nature, a closed system, relatively leaderless and self-directing.

Prejudicial attitudes have often stereotyped Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians as not fitting into a benevolent and wiser Western paradigm. This does not have to be the case in management education, if critical consciousness is applied both-ways. How management decisions are made in Australian Aboriginal society needs more research and understanding. However, Luhmann (2000) would argue that Western management decision making also remains enigmatic. He pointed out that every management decision carries its own uncertainty, as the decision could always have been made another way. Furthermore, only decisions that are undecidable require decision making, and there could always have been a better alternative. This invisible paradox is hidden by the heroic silence of the decision maker. Nor is Western hierarchy what it seems. In Luhmann's view it was introduced historically to prevent the less effective application of force in working groups. And it is fundamentally uni-directional, from top to base.

Deming's (1986) radical solution for the Japanese field-dependent (high context) society
was to upend the hierarchy, and to re-create top management as assisting all levels down to the lowest shop floor operatives. In Mintzberg's (1981) adhocracy, hierarchies are set aside, and expertise is the superior driver over authority, just as it is in Aboriginal clan circles. Google's Brin and Page (Auletta, 2009) also are anti-hierarchical, and employ instances of massive spans of control, exceeding 100 staff (Gitman & McDaniel, 2009,188). Luhmann (2008) would agree with Google's reality, as he pointed out that decision making is key, and the modern tendency to flat organizations supports this view. Google's creators, Brin and Page (Auletta, 2009, 227) insisted on both top-down and bottom-up balance in communication within the Google Corporation. For in-company networking, Brin and Page guide their staff by imaging the star polygon, which they conceptualized as a sociogram. It can be seen that the representation of Fuller's (Edmondson, 2007) over-arching goal, to find nature's coordinate system, and Google's goal, to conceptualize a sociogram of the whole of the corporation's staff communications, differ mainly in nomenclature. Google's sociogram could be described as the simplest way of representing the most effective communication system amongst all its employees.

Fuller & Dil's dualities (1983) for the physical world parallel Aboriginal dualities in the social world. For Fuller, the vectors are angle and length, magnitude and direction, tension and integrity (Edmondson, 2007). For Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians the central dualities are individualism and collectivism, spiritual and temporal, place (spiritually connected) and displace. To ensure the validity of both-ways pedagogy, the Aboriginal way of managing needs to be critically and carefully examined, but with open-mindedness and respect. This is especially important in management education, as it is so enmeshed with culture and because, like Aboriginal languages (Harkins, 1994, Kearins 2000), it is no less sophisticated than its Western equivalent. Furthermore, the impact of original thinkers,
such as Deming (1986) in Japanese management, and Brin and Page (in Auletta, 2009, Girard, 2009) on Google management, resulted in profound challenges to the status quo. These theorists also demonstrated the motivational power of energising paradox, which often leads on to transformed thinking and ways of operating in the world of management.

The question sometimes arises as to whether Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management style could be too different to fit credibly into the relationships of corporate hierarchical power within the broader system of mainstream management education. The answer is to some extent provided by those traditional and respected Western theorists, like Jung (1961a; 1961b; 1968; 1969a; 1969b; 1974; 1989; 1990) and Luhmann, (1979; 1985; 1986; 1989; 1990; 1995; 2000a; 2000b) and practitioners of management, like Brin and Page (Auletta, 2009), who have, without particular mention of Aboriginal management, strongly endorsed ideas that validate Aboriginal management styles. This research proposes ways in which the challenge of differences may be met by the mutual understanding of how management education can be approached, through examining motivations from both cultural templates, without compromising the philosophy of both-ways education.

1.5 Methodology

For this research, a qualitative approach has been preferred, utilizing the only Aboriginal Australian model available as a template. Its nearest fit in Western terms is the case study method. Analysis of results has utilized ideas drawn from critical theory, narrative analysis (Reissman, 2008), (Richmond, 2002) and discourse analysis (Herbert, 2005), (Wodak &
Meyer, 2009) owing to the political nature of non-Aboriginal Australian relationships. However, account needs to be taken of the historical disposition of some colonial teaching initiatives to approach Aboriginal education on the basis of assuming knowledge deficit, and imposing national standards from the top, or from centre to periphery (Herbert, 2004). The research architecture has therefore been designed bottom-up, by beginning with world-views and practices. This required firstly analysing the literature, including writings and appropriate Western management texts. Aboriginal world-views, identified as motivational forces within their cultures, were then collated with the views expressed by research respondents, to ensure that the authentic Aboriginal voice was heard and documented.

Many negative cultural dispositions on the side of majority Australians still affect the cause of Aboriginal education to the present day. Using a dynamic model of the notion of duality, may serve to frame broadly the reason for utilising a novel, and Aboriginal, methodology. In dualistic terms, the present state of Aboriginal management education could be presented as (i) the non-Aboriginal side's assumption that they have nothing to learn from Aboriginal Australia, but on the other hand, Aboriginal Australia has everything to learn. This can be contrasted with (ii) the Aboriginal side's belief that it has much to learn from non-Aboriginal Australians, who proportionately have much to learn from the Aboriginal side. Both-ways education, as a consequence, was conceived as compromise, the reality that survival of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander culture depends on adequate learning of the majority Australian culture, and more recently, of global culture. How this compromise is worked out, can be exemplified by Aboriginal / Western approaches to managing a global problem, profoundly injurious to both sides - alcohol addiction.
In the West, the co-founder of Alcoholics Anonymous, William Wilson, sought the advice of Carl Jung to introduce a spiritual strategy into the neophyte collectives of early meetings, utilising the following condensed but popular version of the Serenity Prayer, usually attributed to Reinhold Niebuhr. The prayer is:

*God, grant me the serenity to accept the things I cannot change,*

*Courage to change the things I can,*

*And wisdom to know the difference.*

Analysing the prayer from a dualistic Aboriginal perspective, or indeed a Jungian view, the prayer takes the form of a trilogy. The recovering alcoholic member of AA reviews life, utilising a preferred Aboriginal management process of reflexivity (Martin, 2008b). The prayer is revealed to the recovering member as a means of recovery, but the sufferer must decide to cease alcoholic behaviour or continue it, not just for the present, but for a lifetime. Salvation offers in the form of a dedicated collective, a nurturing membership of those who are still alcoholics, and thrive without alcohol, but only within the embrace of the collective. To paraphrase Jung's (1961b) letter to Wilson, spirituality or wholeness means walking a path to a higher understanding, beyond rationalism, with the help of a protective wall of human community. The formidable iterating process of deciding wisely many thousands of times requires the "higher third" energy of a God-factor, the synergistic gain that may be construed alternatively as a deity, the collective, identity, unity, wholeness, redemption, serenity, or recovery. Aboriginal bands in North America have symbolized the AA prayer with relevant imagery in Figure 1, p.35. In this example, deciding wisely is presented as service to the collective. That is, a wise decision is a "natural" preference for
a way that excludes alcohol, an alien and anti-Aboriginal substance. Every successful decision to resist alcohol is a service of fellowship with the unity of the clan.

The value of this example is to be found in its symbolism; it is an illustration of the underlying importance of choosing a methodology, consistent with existing Aboriginal world-views. This methodology requires the exclusion of the unattainable certainty of discreteness, and the inclusion of the available, non-discrete, but uncertain accessibility of the "real" or "natural" world. It is supported by a world-view that includes wholeness (holism), dualities, like service / unity, and higher third product entities, like recovery (Figure 1).

**Figure 1**  AA motif from North America

![AA motif from North America](source: 21st Annual National/International Native American Indian Alcoholics Convention, Las Vegas, NV.)

Methodologies for researching Aboriginal issues therefore require approaches that differ markedly from studies of the broader culture as, like pedagogies, they have to work both-
ways. Australia's Aboriginal culture is at a special locus of disadvantage, as it has to negotiate as a culture within its colonising culture (D'Iribarne, 2009). A further burden is added by the needs for Government funding, competing with the needs of the growing Australian multi-culture, but at the same time remaining separate and unique. It is the intention of this research to respond to this imbalance by complementing the broadly based work of Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996), and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006) with the more specific framing of Aboriginal management education, and its motivational constituents, within an Australian context that is understandable both-ways. However, the both-ways perspective needs to be weighed against the possible merits and demerits of observing the problem. Luhmann's (1979; 1985; 1986; 1989; 1990; 1995; 2000a; 2000b) social systems theory would proffer the point of view of the outsider, as a complementary vantage point for observing the Aboriginal management education system, and different in kind from the observations available to Aboriginal actors from within the relatively closed management education system. Put simply, from inside the system, the observer cannot see beyond the social membrane of Aboriginal management education, as the observer's view from within is obscured by the dissonance of the intervening perspective of self-as-observer. On the other hand, the non-Aboriginal outsider is able to bring to bear a different perspective from that of the Aboriginal-Insider by observing "as a whole" from the environment of the observed system. In other words, both insider and outsider observation positions are important, as by complementing one another, they jointly increase the potential depth of analysis of the data (Eisenstadt, 1989).

Perceptions of the irrelevance of management education by its Aboriginal student consumers cannot be overcome unless the tools chosen for research projects are perceived as appropriate and relevant by both sides. With these circumstances in mind,
choices for the methodological approaches for this research were made favouring qualitative techniques, and specifically Dialogic Exchange, which is a comprehensive social research methodology designed by an Australian Aboriginal-Insider, for application within the Australian Aboriginal culture. As Dialogic Exchange (Williams, 2007) operates from the perspective of the Aboriginal-Insider, its participant oriented approach is realised through rigorous attention to the behavioural expectations of Aboriginal culture, including research ownership and nuanced methods of communication, which fully appreciate worldview differences. However, the values and styles of dialogic exchange translate readily to non-Aboriginal methodologies. The key differences relate primarily to a tendency on the side to equalize the status of all participants contributing to the research, as co-owners, and to channel this fundamental of Aboriginal management style, requiring the inclusion of and respect for all Aboriginal contributors, a cultural universal of circle management (Figures 7, p.65 and 28, p.235).

1.6 Chapters structure and outlines

The structure of chapters is illustrated at Figure 2.
Figure 2 Modified Perry diagram of chapters

(Source: Perry, C., 1998, 65)

Chapter 1 Introduction

This research originated in response to the Aboriginal Employment Strategy's policy of seeking to increase Aboriginal participation in the Australian workforce, exposing the need for a foundation theory of Aboriginal management education in Australia. Justification for the research was confirmed in 2011 when the Journal of Management Education raised the same issue in a world context, and research on Australian Aboriginal leadership was published by Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006). Previous world and Australian studies had shown that perceived irrelevance of the mode of pedagogy practised in management and science education was the key demotivator of students, focussing attention on motivation as the key factor for this research.
Chapter 2 Literature Review

Previous research of this field has been restricted to four spheres, illustrated at Figure 3, (p.53). This research extends into motivation and neuroscience. The individual student is conceived as both beginning and end contexts, within a unified whole of life perspective. The physiological background to motivations relies mainly on McGilchrist's (2010; 2011) historical approach to the biases in Western thinking, especially towards left brain dominance and individualism in the modern era. He argues that this has resulted in a skewing of Western perceptions and exacerbating hemispheric differences in world-view. This led to an investigation of the implications of these views for the associated fields of motivation and culture; including the influence of holism and non-discrete dualities.

The primary Native American research evidence drawn from Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996; 2004), and Sveiby & Skuthorpe's (2006, 2009, 2011) work in Australia, provided empirical findings on Aboriginal motivations and theoretical constructs. Holistic motivations were identified as duality, balance, place and spirituality, with duality identified as within the context of collective - individual theory.

Western keys to Australian Aboriginal culture include the following:

- comparisons with communitarian, collective, and other values;
- formation of holistic and systemic Aboriginal values via relevant dualities and trilogies;
- non-discrete dualities as keys to past misunderstandings and a way forward to inform both cultures mutually;
- semiotics as a means of comprehending, signing, or symbolising culture;
- seeing features of Aboriginal culture as collective, consensual, decentralized,
immanent (spiritual) and non-interfering;

- alternative ways of perceiving time; and
- respecting the wisdom of age.

Western leadership style is top-down, with authority underwritten by tacit obligation to obey; Aboriginal style works in the opposite direction, with the group endowing authority on the basis of expertise. Signing and language issues were examined, together with space and shape, and place as an important correlate of style, conceived as socioterritorial. The concept of natural is a feature of Aboriginal life and management style. Other features include convergence of natural science with Aboriginal management style, values and identity; association of relationships, connectedness, and humour; low power-distance and lack of hierarchy. Hofstede's (1997; 1999; 2001) conceptualization of long-termism also emerges as a feature of styles.

Principles of Aboriginal management education were collated with those of social systems theory, depth psychology and natural science. Aboriginal management educational theory is seen as systemic and unifying, rather than alternative. Consistency is observed in the archetypal origins of both Aboriginal and Western motivations. Modern systems theory, such as Talcott Parsons' (1971), is a successor to critical theory, holistic and congruent with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education. Re-evaluation of Western management theories and practices reveals flawed assumptions and failure to observe valuable features of management models. Field (context), together with style and metaphor, can be viewed as instruments of understanding Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management. Identifying the themes of Aboriginal management education helps in examining the constituents of its theory. These holistic constituents are
non-discrete, overlapping and inseparable.

Ways are examined in which management styles and Aboriginal management education inter-relate with pedagogy. These include how holism, spirituality and place can explain Indigeneity. This assists Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and Western researchers in communicating their world-views to one another. Aboriginal management pedagogy needs to incorporate the preferences of Aboriginal motivation and culture, as identified by authors. Critical pedagogy is viewed as congruent with systems pedagogy. Connections are made with contemporary Asian post-colonial world-views, offering a culture-relevant template for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management students, and co-incidentally benefiting all Australian students of management, especially those of migrant, field-dependent (high context) backgrounds. However, demotivational elements affect students of management adversely. These include post-traumatic attitudes, received prejudices, faulty attributions and impacts of poverty. A possible solution is examined in the form of MIT’s holistic alternative pedagogy for Aboriginal peoples, developed by Kort and Reilly (2002; 2008).

Chapter 3 Methodology

With the development and availability of Williams' (2007) methodology, specially designed for researching with Aboriginal Australian participants, this option of the choices available tends to be self-selecting. Martin's (2003; 2008a; 2008b; 2008c) work on reflexivity and ways of approach similarly arose from a reliable Australian source, offering value in addressing itself to Aboriginal Australian and Torres Strait Islander participants. Aboriginal authors, such as Smith (2006), Kenny (2004) and Langton (1996; 2006), tend to associate
qualitative research exclusively with Aboriginal methodology, and the biographical nature of the discourse needed for the research makes the case study method an obvious choice. One of the preparatory steps needing attention for the non-Aboriginal outsider is the careful consideration of acceptable approaches in manner and choice of words. Martin’s cautionary advice to build respect slowly, and Williams care about discourse regarding deceased persons, are examples of the need to know basic steps to avoid offence, but ensuring that the participant-researcher discourse traversed all of the motivations arising from the literature. In addition to clearly defined motivations, such as duality and balance, it was necessary to include evidence for the less specifically motivational and more cognitive areas of reflexivity, theories-in-use and issues associated with left-brain dominance.

Figures 21 (p.162), 22 (p.171), and 23 (p.173), illustrate how participants’ motivations were conceptualized. They were seen as a primary duality of Individual and Collective forces. Individual drives were holism, duality, balance, identity, and personal power. Collective drives were place, spirituality, relationality, narrative and collective power. Reflexivity, theories-in-use and left-brain dominance were examined as cognitive constructs of importance to the full understanding of holism and its impacts on management styles. Participant outcomes were considered in the cycle of experience and meaning, with a concluding analysis of each participant, which contained the duality of both positive and negative impacts, following Adams’ (1997) advice. Eisenhardt's (1989) guidance on theory building from case studies was applied in a collective review of discourse results overall.

**Chapter 4 Analysis of collected data**

For the non-Aboriginal outsider, approaching the research requires a constant referencing
of the research transcriptions both-ways. Each side of the cultural divide can be accessed by looking for non-discrete opposites, for example relationality can be viewed as an opponent of essences, as the more diffused conceptual separations become, the more difficult it is to distil essences. Place has to be seen rather as part of a narrative (Aboriginal) than something definable (Western). There is also a greater intensity of closeness amongst places, kin and spiritual influences, all impacting on behaviour, and influencing choices constantly. Historical misunderstandings have tended to compound difficulties, rather than ease them. More than two centuries of co-habitation within Australia has taught Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians much about its majority culture, but post-colonial prejudice and ignorance still disable the majority culture from understanding the societal differences.

Analysis of the discourses was therefore constructed around the duality of individual and collective, with the radial overlay of positive and negative. Holistic and positive themes included long term views of life and careers, within a motivational framework of re-balancing societal differences by consciousness of the imperative of cultural survival of Aboriginality. Negative holism produced the insight that the early deaths of Aboriginal Australians not only carries with it all of the pain of loss of kin of closer connectedness, not experienced to the same degree by the majority of Australians, but also a sense of lost knowledge and deprivation of descendants, denied rightful association with the deceased, as a wise elder. The re-instatement of the Murray River estuary proved an ideal metaphor for the dualistic and positive themes encountered, and its connection with seaboard and land moieties. On the other hand, living in two worlds was problematic for those participants who were distinctly monocultural in attitude to the majority Australian alternative culture.
The close associates, balance and identity, proved to be central motivational drivers, as they ensure the long term success and survivability of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander society in Australia. Indications arose also that, although loss of identity was likely to cause confusion and developmental delay, educational preparedness in the form of dedicated institutions may provide full restoration of identity. Perceptions of individual power are compromised by the many social and economic disadvantages still affecting urban Aboriginal society profoundly. But some improvements were evident to all, notably those attributable to education at the tertiary level. However, short term governmental initiatives and failure to consult are continuing stumbling blocks.

Overall, there was a strong awareness of the connectedness of all of the functions, of education, health, and other social inclusions needed for Aboriginal peoples to restore the many imbalances inhibiting full Aboriginal management participation in the economy. This was partially offset by the evidence of many social improvement initiatives arising independently from within the inner-city community of Sydney.

Chapter 5 Findings and implications

This chapter deals with answers to the key research question, and the specific sub-questions arising from the review of the literature. It also covers the validity of the assumptions underlying the theories used to explain the motivations emerging from the literature and interviews, that is their consonance with holism, systems theories, spirituality, and other dynamics driving societies.
In evaluating these questions and assumptions, the relevance of motivations and ways of managing in the contemporary world are considered with reference to the most successful world corporations, those associated with digital technologies, like Google and Apple. Many of the symbols, insights, organization patterns, and communications practices of IT corporates are identified as replicating the management styles of Aboriginal ways of organizing, satisfying group needs for inclusion, and respect of expertise.

The proposed eclectic approach to psychodynamic and social systems theories begs the question as to why systems psychodynamic theory, which amalgamates both traditions, was not seen as a convenient choice, satisfying Aboriginal world-views. Archetypal influences were strongly indicated in Aboriginal lives, both in figures from the nuclear family and the extended family, including Aunties and Uncles perceived as role models. The consistency of dualities, with a synergistic third output, a triangular symbiosis, was found to be a useful way of examining how Aboriginal motivations could be presented and understood.

The duality of natural and unnatural was a common theme in the discourse of the research participants, who regarded Aboriginal ways of knowing as more in touch with nature, and therefore more natural. When dualities were applied to identity, they revealed a close connection with Aboriginal needs to preserve it by balancing the natural and the unnatural, by refreshing a sense of self, and by visiting homelands and kin. Participants expended much energy helping their communities bridge the gaps between Aboriginal and majority societies.

In keeping with the instrument of duality in use throughout the research, it was deemed
important to look at demotivations affecting Aboriginal Australians, just as intensively as positive motivations. Such forces as societal exclusion, poverty and the prejudice of knowledge deficit were seen to be especially detrimental. Furthermore, at the philosophical level, Aboriginal theorists have identified two of the most harmful aspects of Western thought to be avoided, namely discrete dualities, and unreflexivity. Theories-in-use in this research could be broadly described as neuroscientific, field, psychodynamic (depth), systems theories, or combinations of each. These approaches were considered in terms of their motivational implications for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education theory.

The bi-cultural accomplishment of fluid frame shifting between Aboriginal and majority Australian modalities was found in some research participants. Recent research has identified the ability to code-shift between cultures as an attribute of unrecognized value to corporates with multi-cultural staff and clients. However, the philosophical way forward for cultures may be found in the post-Luhmann social systems theories of his successors. These are consistent with all of the foundation studies used in this research, namely those of Chapman et al. 1991; Bryant, 1996, 2004; Sveiby & Skuthorpe, 2006 and 2011. Social systems theory builds on the strong affinity shown already by Aboriginal students with the Internet, realising Luhmann’s vision of a world society enabled by media and digital technology.

1.7 Delimitations of scope and key assumptions

The building blocks for this research were not found to be recent or numerous. However, this did not prevent finding sufficient sources on which to base credible assumptions or
theories. The dearth of research evidence during the past two decades appears to be a factor of the variability over time in the attitude and attention of broader Australia towards causes, noted by Pearson (2009, 15) and Fullagar (2009, 41).

The identity of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians as managers cannot be more than embryonic, as their entry into the management class is likely to be compromised by prejudiced assumptions about their promotability and their lower socio-economic status. Foley and Hunter (2008, 12) argue that "one cannot discount the importance of discrimination being an explanation of the vastly different employment prospects of Aboriginal and other Australians". This may mean that the variety of their management experiences across all sectors of majority Australian employment has been reduced. Owing to the dearth in Australia of Aboriginal management courses at tertiary level, the range of this inquiry does not include curriculum, but is restricted to pedagogy, and its antecedents - motivations and neuroscience.

Another prominent limitation is present in the inevitable difficulty posed by the impossibility of perceiving with "the Aboriginal eye" (Williams, 2007, 15-17). Native American, Kawagley (Harrison, 2005) also "sees with the mind's eye" (tangrualuku), which "transcends what we see with our endosomic sense makers" (Harrison, 2005, 50). Similarly, Wilson's (2008, 80-96) term "relationality", includes all of the interconnectedness of life, people, land and ideas, which enrich native ontology, but necessarily exclude its Western observers. These differences appear to be far more profound than implied by Harris' emic and etic (2001, 32), which suffer from the paradox of outsider describing, among other things, the insider's view of difference between outsider and insider. The degree of difficulty is emphasized by Barnhart and Kawagley (2005,13) as "the
complexities that come into play, when two fundamentally different world-views converge, present a formidable challenge”. This is not to say that Barnhart and Kawagley and Wilson (2008), writing as Aboriginal-Insiders, do not hold positive views of Western research, but they are sustained by an apparent "paradigm shift" that they believe is now under way, in which Aboriginal knowledge and ways of knowing are being recognized as complex knowledge systems, with an adaptive integrity of their own.

1.8 Conclusion

The quite different "grand" theories, respectively of Jung (1989) and Luhmann (1995), which form the building blocks of this research, can be differentiated broadly as both personal and social (Jung) and decisively social (Luhmann). However, whilst Jung (1974) and Luhmann (2000b) have left impressive works on Education, there is no student presence in Luhmann's explanations, either as individuals or as groups. Hence Jung provides complementary value to Aboriginal archetypal and metaphorical motivators, at the personal level. Common ground between these two meta-theories is to be found within particular constructs, which explain how educational processes are energized by means of dualities, and produce trilogies synergistically. The trilogies of Jung and Luhmann are, in principle, identical. They link seamlessly with the non-discrete binaries of Aboriginal trilogies, that are seen to be essential to Native American identity and ontology by Waters (2004). The dualities of D'Iribarne (2009) and Hofstede (1997, 2001), drawn from multi-cultures of both field-dependent (high context) and field-independent (low context) origins, extend the societal reach of dualities and trilogies into working groups as diverse as those of France and China (D'Iribarne & Herrault, 2009). Furthermore, theorists like Jung, Luhmann, Hofstede, D'Iribarne and Waters are holistic, systemic, non-hierarchical, and respectful of departure from Western orthodoxy, with its tendency to privilege its own
traditions over more collectivist management styles, either Asian or Aboriginal.

There is something more than theoretical co-incidence in the implicit support for the way, offered by the many scientists who found transformation in mid-career by embracing social sciences from holistic positions, principally Fuller (1983), Bateson (1987), Capra (1983a, 1996, 2000), and Prigogine (1990, 2003). As the term implies, natural science, as practised by these and other scientists, directs itself first to the nature of things, and sequentially to the nature of human nature, enabling Fuller’s preferencing of the triangle over the rectangle for the human built environment. Similarly, one of Jung’s core determinants of mental health was balance, a principle held with equal strength in societies (Mandawuy Yunupingu, 1994), and in Asia, but not in the West.

Luhmann (1990, 1995, 2000c) has cast doubt on the mystique of management, its semantics and semiotics, as orderly in appearance and posture, but somewhat of a trickster in fact. Mintzberg’s (1981) adhocracy could be seen as supporting Aboriginal clan circle management (Figures 7, p.60 and 28, p.227). In a situation of management emergency, Mintzberg conceptualized an autological outcome elevating expertise over reliance on line authority. Mintzberg, Luhmann, Apple Corporation’s Jobs (Elliot & Simon, 2011), Facebook’s Zukerberg, Google’s Brin and Page (Auletta, 2009), all appear to embrace the paradoxical, non-linear, elevation of spontaneous functional expertise, that is, an Aboriginal way. This research therefore placed balance at fulcrum centre, and suggests that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management ideology needs to be given equal opportunity to evolve. With that opportunity, it is possible that the paradoxes and challenges generated by an Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management educational pedagogy could underpin a critical re-appraisal of all Australian management
The aspirational note, identified by Barnhardt and Kawagley (2005; 2008) as a paradigm shift, originates within the recent development in most sciences, natural and social, of a trajectory of convergence. The evidence gathered in this research shows clear connections between Aboriginal knowledge and motivations on the one hand, and on the other, trends in neurophysiology, cybernetics, biology, physics, management, and education. Some of these trends affirm a growing respectability of Aboriginal management styles and techniques, by re-presenting holism and its components as central to Aboriginal management education and its nexus with global commerce.
Chapter 2 Literature Review

2.1 Introduction

The observations that began this research into Australian and Torres Strait Islander management education in Australia were that there had been an absence of significant activity in the field for two decades, and there was no evidence that an attempt had been made to differentiate between educational methods, such as curricula and pedagogies on the one hand, and Aboriginal motivations on the other. The foundation studies by Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996, 2004) and Sveiby & Skuthorpe's (2009), discussed in this research, derive their conclusions from field studies observing native North Americans and Aboriginal Australians at the level of culture. However, inter-cultural misunderstandings continue in Australia and North America, which depict management education at the cultural level as irrelevant to Aboriginal students. As dedicated Aboriginal management education is still at an early stage in Australia, this research does not cover curriculum, but examines directions for a pedagogy and its motivational and neuroscientific antecedents.

At the level of culture, it is difficult to make sympathetic connections between Aboriginal and Western management styles. It is therefore proposed to provide evidence for the need to examine the meanings of behaviour at two levels beyond culture, namely the deeper spheres of motivation as the primary source, and neuroscience as a background influence. These two domains are characterized as the same for both Aboriginal and Western cultures. Incorporating them into the development of Aboriginal management educational pedagogies is proposed as a fundamental step in clarifying the issues to do with relevance
and increasing the retention rates of students. At the same time, moving beyond culture may extend perceptions of Aboriginal culture and its majority Australian counterpart from oppositional, to complementary.

### 2.1.1 Research aim and dimensions

The aim of this research is to examine what motivates Aboriginal Australians and how motivations can inform ways of educating the art of Aboriginal management. In the process of inquiry, an attempt is made to find the best ideas of managing in the Aboriginal way and how these ideas might inform management education Australia-wide. Australia has adopted a pedagogy of both-ways education. Educating both-ways is different from majority Australia's position, which has traditionally privileged its own culturalist philosophy of education (McConaghy, 2000, 43). Whilst Begay (1991), Spencer (1990), and others have offered much in raising the issue of holding power over Aboriginal management and science students, researchers have not yet investigated the nature of motivational differences between Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and other management students. Common to the available findings is the term irrelevance, the negative attribution applied by many exiting Aboriginal students. This research will assist in understanding that, when the curtain of irrelevance is lifted, it will evidence motivations as of primary importance, mediated by culture as secondary. The broader dimensions of the research are illustrated in Figure 3 (p.53).
Available research suggests that motivational forces can be found within universal Aboriginal field-dependent (high context) world-views of holism, duality and balance. Prominent also are the motivations associated with spirituality and place. Layered over all of these is the motivational meta-duality of collectivism / individualism. These phenomena of potential energy can be engaged in holistic and other ways of perceiving and knowing. The motivational power of Aboriginal concepts and symbols can be differentiated and organized to flow thematically through both curricula and pedagogical constructs to form a natural sequencing of motivations addressing management tasks, which together impinge on the nature of the wisest pedagogies to be adopted by management educators.

Source: Ben Schneiderman (2002)
2.1.2 Locating the research area in its antecedent disciplines

Aboriginal holism does not include defining information, knowledge or epistemology, learning or concepts generally, as mutually exclusive entities (Charlesworth, 2005, 202). However, overlapping definitions of key concepts used by researcher and participant need exposure to consider their Aboriginal meanings. This area of inquiry is challenging, and Charlesworth (2005) has demonstrated that Aboriginal understanding of Western terminology may embed additional dimensions of meaning, such as kinship and place, as parts of society or personhood.

Martin (2003, 11) uses Aileen Moreton Robinson's definition of the Aboriginal self, a term close in meaning to identity: "One experiences the self as part of others and that others are part of the self; this is learnt through reciprocity, obligation, shared experiences, coexistence, co-operation and social memory". With these words, Martin is postulating an archetype of the self that is collectivist and reflexive rather than individualist. This is a reminder that the research discourse with participants needs examination, to form a view of the Aboriginal self as manager, without compromising the maintenance of Aboriginal identity. Searching for archetypal metaphor of leader, hero or admired kinsperson in terms of Morgan's (1996) groupings may begin the process. Adams' (1997, 47) radial view of the psyche offers the possibility of a matrix approach to this task for both male and female participants, which may increase the quality of dialogue and response richness. Adams points out that archetypes cannot be accurately understood unless they are collated with stereotypes. In adding this further important dimension, Adams moves the representation of the psyche from axial to radial, as illustrated in Figure 4.
Among the many antecedent disciplines of the expansive topic of Aboriginal management education are the social sciences of anthropology, history, education, management, linguistics, psychology, philosophy, and sociology. There are also the natural sciences of engineering, biology, cybernetics, neuroscience, architecture and agriculture. For this study, the extent to which these disciplines and their researchers share holistic principles is the significant connection. Figure 5 (p.56) illustrates the positioning of the area of enquiry within its wider Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander and Western contexts.

Previous research of this field has been contained within four spheres, illustrated at Figure.
3 (p.53) as culture, management styles, Aboriginal management education and Aboriginal pedagogies. This research extends further into motivation and neuroscience. There is, of course, a further context beyond pedagogy, the context of the individual student, which can be conceived as both beginning and end contexts, as the student is also the context beyond neuroscience. The student needs to be seen as an entire human being, possessing all of the biological data of the inner person and the sociological data of the outer person, from a unified whole of life perspective.

**Figure 5  Locus of research**

![Diagram showing the locus of research](source: Royalty-free stock photos from Google Images)

The illustration at Figure 6 outlines the structure of the review of the literature.
2.1.3 Theoretical and research environments which give rise to perceived lack of relevance

The major studies of the characteristics of management by Chapman (1991), Bryant (1996, 2004) and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2009), on which this research is based, describe societies that offer different versions of the world to the Western societies in which they
struggle for identity. Broadly, the difference is one of context (Hall, 1990), or how the world is perceived. Aboriginal societies focus on whole of field and Western societies on the figures within the field. Centuries of co-habitation between these two distinctly different cultural attitudes have passed without significant growth in awareness of this difference as the central cause of mutual misunderstanding. It will be argued that understanding the differences will not be found at the interface of the divergent cultural dispositions, but by looking behind the scenes at the motivations which appear in the literature of Chapman, Bryant, Sveiby & Skuthorpe, and Australian researchers in this field. It will be contended that motivations are innate and closely associated with the neurology of the brain, the design and functioning of which provides a rationale for the formation of motivations and their expression in the world in the guise of two broad tendencies, Asian and Western. Furthermore, both versions of the world are needed in a balanced way in the inner world of each individual, and in the culture of the outer world in which the individual is required to function.

Williams (2007), Lowell and Devlin (1998), and Biermann and Townsend-Cross (2008) report Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander students suffering personal or social trauma from uncaring attitudes or cultural misunderstandings, the outcome of which is the reverse of synergy; in other words, enduring psychological harm. In Adams' (1997) radial view of the psyche (Figure 4, p.55), this could take the form of the dissociative effects of trauma, carried by the overlay of an added conscious / unconscious duality, expressed in the classroom as a form of a learning inhibition, or abandonment of studies. Avoiding the pitfalls of the past will require adherence to the methodologies of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander researchers, such as Smith (2006), Nakata (2007a-b), Williams (2007), Waters (2004), Martin (2003; 2008a-c), and Arabena (2006, 2008), and the application of

With the benefit of hindsight, Jackson & Carter (2007), Hoopes (2003), Luhmann (1985), and Mintzberg (1981) have taken issue with many theories of management adopted in the West, which they regard as narrowly framed, obscure or invalid. However, theories-in-use in recent decades particularly in the newer fast-growing corporations of the digital age, have been counter-cultural and holistic, and evidence a re-consideration of work methodology, which Aboriginal managers would find consistent with whole of band approaches. At the same time, many natural scientists have extended their theoretical approach to embrace social theories and holism, consistent with aboriginal world-views. If a critical management approach is applied to the certainties of Western management, and it is recognized that the strengths of Aboriginal holistic approaches are implicit in recent Western narratives of success, it may be understood that management styles are more situational than doctrinal, and that cultural differences offer opportunities for the gains of synergy. The works of authors Begay (1991), Spencer (1990), Ibarra (2001), McClisky & Day (2004), and O'Brien (2008) have identified a perceived lack of relevance as the reason for failure of Aboriginal student retention for tertiary studies in management and science.

Many educationalists in Indigenous teaching, including Heiss (2003), Hickling-Hudson (2003), Jull (2002), Partington (1997; 2002; 2005) and Malatest (2004), have documented resistance to learning when the issue of lacking of relevance emerges. Relevance, in the mind of the student, is defined by the extent to which the pedagogy respects values and prior learning. However, Aboriginal students of management are likely to be dealing with
attitudes developed over a lifetime of socio-economic grievances, which are external to the learning experience itself, but which have significant potential for learning inhibition. This is seen as an Aboriginal complaint that some courses are designed without regard to context, or balance. A management pedagogy for all tertiary Aboriginal management education is therefore needed, one which is even-handedly contextualized, and accessible to both hemispheres of the brain and all world cultures.

2.1.4 Why social systems, psychodynamic, and systems psychodynamic theories?


Amongst the dualities of special importance to both Aboriginal cultures and Luhmann's (1995) theory of society is inclusion / exclusion. This dichotomy is foundational, as it operates in decisions about who is to be included in society and who isn't. Luhmann's (2002) function systems assume access to the society of the majority, and observe that entry is denied to some; for example, those who live in poverty (Hunter, 1999, 12), even within otherwise wealthy societies. However, the duality of inclusion / exclusion forced upon the poorer and more remotely located Aboriginal people does assist in understanding the importance of addressing the access to function systems of all Aboriginal Australians. This applies particularly to those who live in poverty or in remote areas, with reduced
facility to enter the digital age via the internet or mobile electronic devices. In his contribution to the journal Quarterly Essay, Pearson (2009, 16) posed the questions that must be asked about poverty in these difficult circumstances, whether educational disadvantage can be reduced without overcoming broader socio-economic disadvantage. In other words, will there be educational disadvantage for as long as there is broader social and economic inequality?

In Luhmann's (1995) functional systems, exclusions from society multiply without the codes to enter it. The code for the financial function is money, and therefore, per capita, Australians are disproportionally excluded. For Aboriginal leaders, who possess the codes of inclusion in all function systems, there may still be major issues of identity to deal with. Luhmann argues that within the functional systems, observers can distinguish within their own system or sub-system, say Aboriginal education, but cannot distinguish beyond the membrane of its operational closure. Hence, shared experiences of struggle for identity may be available within the sub-culture, but inaccessible to those outside it, like majority Australians, who can experience only their own cultural identity, or confusion about what it really is.

Another area of potential incompatibility with Aboriginal ontology is that Luhmann clearly breaks from the traditional role of spirituality, established by German philosopher, Hegel (2005), but only insofar as it relates to sociology. Luhmann offered no objection to spirituality being properly included in philosophy (Moeller, 2012, 39). In Art as a Social System (2000, 90), Luhmann observed that spirit has replaced God in the modern world, indicating that spirituality is not only evident, but in the ascendant.
Furthermore, although psychic systems are necessarily involved in bringing about communication, the communication cannot be understood as the product of any particular psychic system. This would suggest that spirituality as a psychic system could not by itself produce communication in Luhmann's (1995) social system model, and would operate outside of the function systems, such as law, economy and politics, as a consequence.

Australian Aboriginal spirituality, as described by Aboriginal poet, Mudrooroo (Colin Johnson), is “a oneness and interconnectedness with all that lives and breathes, even with all that does not live or breathe ... it is a feeling of oneness, of belonging, a connectedness with deep innermost feelings” (Giblett, 2011, 233). Much of Luhmann's (1995) model of society is taken up with the place of semantics, and its history (Arnoldi, 2001, 1-2).

Mudrooroo's words suggest two synonyms of spirituality, namely relationality and connectedness. Given that Bechmann and Stehr (2003, 8) accord to relationality an important status in Luhmann's theory, it becomes clear that, whilst the word spirituality has no emphasis in his works, its close associate, relationality, is one of its main structural features.

Moeller (2006, 50-52) views Luhmann's (1995) position on the semantics of social systems theory as an attempt to catch up the losses of the outmoded terminology of traditional research of society. This could also account for his preference for breaking decisively from Hegel (2005) and treating spirituality as external to function systems, but at the same time admitting relationality. It is consistent with Luhmann's general criticism of traditional research, that it carries the complexities of hierarchy and the wishful thinking of the Enlightenment that things will get better. This is itself a hierarchical ideal, as any prioritising, like good and better, establishes ordinality, a first step to hierarchy. In the societal systems of both Aboriginal Australians and Luhmann, all parts of the system are inter-dependently vital, and therefore prioritising is irrelevant.
Whether Luhmann's is a collectivist ideology, like Aboriginal societies, has been the subject of debate. Poe Yu-ze Wan (2011) points to the difficulty of asserting this claim as a generality. Luhmann's is not the typical holistic collectivist theory, emphasizing the whole system exclusively to the detriment of its parts (Poe Yu-ze Wan, 2011, 87). Brunczel (2010), in dealing with this issue, places it in similar status to spirituality; that is, collectivism does not form part of Luhmann's (1995) functional systems. This is because its opposite, individualism, has no place in functional systems, which exclude humans and include only communications (Brunczel, 2010, 199). Luhmann, however, treats politics as one of society's vital functional systems, as he conceives it as the means through which the functioning of society can chiefly be influenced. This is surely an important marker of a theory geared, co-incidentally, to Aboriginal need.

The methodology of social systems theory includes asking which problem is this a solution to? (Knudsen, 2010, 7). Knudsen associates his approach with Gadamer's position that to know something is to know it as the answer to a question. Aboriginal problems, and the failure of the welfare state's systems to address them, are to a large extent problems of dissociation of problem from solution. In contrast to the example of Steve Jobs' Mac Team (Elliot & Simon, 2011), the "solution" is often conceived narrowly and unsystemically. For example, the Intervention, and the prospect of a decision to continue it, before analysis of the cause or effects of the first one have been explored thoroughly. The failure to observe all function systems as of equal status, and inter-dependent, is evidence of the Western tendency to address only part of a problem. This is compounded by invisibilizing the need to treat Health, Education, Law and other functional systems as inter-connected and non-hierarchical, and to sleight their claims for consistent and equal attention. Borch (2011, 17) has pointed out that there is hardly any systematic empirical analysis in Luhmann.
However, in recent years there has been a growth in the number of empirical studies based on Luhmann's theories, and Borch refers particularly to the studies of Andersen (2008) and Hojlund (2009).

Psychodynamic theorists, like Jung (1974), and Klein (1998), provide a framework of extensive overlap with epistemology of the Aboriginal world and other field-dependent (high context) societies, such as those described by Bouée (2010 about China, and Chakraborty (1999), Malik (2000) and Sinha (2004), who offer alternative but related models from India. In their accounts of these societies and their reliance on symbolic content, archetypal and spiritual material, their compatibility with and acceptance by societies, psychodynamic theorists offer a bridging zone from which Western knowledge and Aboriginal knowledge can be more easily inter-related. Theories arising within the systems psychodynamic movement, utilized both systems approaches stemming from Parsons (1971) and psychodynamic theories developed by Klein (1998), in a blended but compatible template, which favoured open systems theory, rather than Luhmann's (1995) autopoetic and relatively closed systems theory, which in this research is regarded as closer in kind to Aboriginal circle management, illustrated in Figure 7 (p.65). The question of why the systems psychodynamic approach has not been adopted as an integrated theory is answered more comprehensively in Chapter 5.
Nakata (2007), Galarrwuy Yunupingu (2007), Williams (2007), and others present complementary research from an Aboriginal perspective. Together, these contributors make the goal of an Aboriginal theory possible, using holistic concepts, such as balance, dualism, field and place, in a framework of humanism, spirituality and collectivism.

In summary, dialogic exchange, reflexivity and relationality are three of the many ways of knowing and researching Australian aboriginality. They are limited by their Western semantics and the status of the Western researcher as outsider. Luhmann (1998) maintains that empirical research and theoretical embedding of interpretations are mutual derivatives of one another. Furthermore, methodology and theory are difficult to separate. From this position, the actions of investigation, research, and theory development, are close co-ordinates, and whilst Aboriginal-Insider status is clearly desirable, this research provides opportunities for both-ways learning for the non-Aboriginal-outsider, as it attempts...
to employ Aboriginal ideas and to enter the field of enquiry from the side of field-dependence (high context), rather than from field-independence (low context). In doing so, the foundation of a theory of Aboriginal management education may be assembled.

2.2 The origins of motivations and culture in neuroscience

2.2.1 Impacts of Western, left hemisphere dominance on management education

McGilchrist's (2010) neuroscience presents the functionality of the brain as inclined to historical shifts of bias to the left or right hemispheres. In the modern Western world he finds a severe, asymmetrical inclination to the left brain. This is producing, in Western thought processes, disengagement from the right brain's holistic role and its under-utilization. In default, the attention of thinkers is captured by the left brain, which customarily is preoccupied with de-contextualized issues requiring attention to detail. The functioning of the Western brain, currently transiting a cycle of left-hemisphere dominance, is consequently skewing the perceptions of all. McGilchrist characterizes the effect of left brain dominance as a tendency to reductionistic thinking. The deleterious result is that "the big picture" functioning of the right brain is often inaccessible to Western thinkers, leading to abandonment of holistic perceptions by thinkers who are consistently deluded by the short-sighted certainties of left hemisphere dominance. McGilchrist does not observe any negative change in the functioning of Asian or Aboriginal holistic thinking.

McGilchrist's position is that the excessively neo-liberal trend of Western society during the past three decades repeats sequences in world history when right-wing (left-brain) forces
predominate for substantial periods. It is McGilchrist's view that it is the West that has moved, not Asian societies, which have remained constantly collectivist. McGilchrist is not stating that Asian societies or Aboriginal peoples are neurologically inclined to a particular collectivist mindset. This would contradict the works of McGilchrist's predecessors, Pinker (2002), Doidge (2007), Rutter (2006), and Richards & Hawley (2005). These authors attest to the human brain, unaffected by particular racial antecedents, but not unaffected by the personal trauma experienced by parents or even grandparents. The works of these researchers affirm collectivism as learned, not inherited, and the brain alterable by environmental influences, via neuroplasticity. Steven Pinker's observations regarding the plight of Tasmanian Aboriginal society is relevant in this regard. Pinker refuted the colonialist view of Aboriginal Tasmanians as without mainland tools and therefore “extremely primitive”, later compounded by biased social scientists attributing race as cause. In Pinker's view they “failed to accomplish the very goal that brought them into being: explaining the different fortunes of human societies without invoking race” (2002, 68-69).

If McGilchrist were to consider the issue of Aboriginal Australians seeking the understanding by majority Australians of their cultural needs, he would see the timing as problematic. The historical eclipsing of right brain thinking means that it would take more than a change of heart by majority Australia. It would also need the re-balancing of its Western mindset closer to the symmetry it once possessed. McManus (2003,188), and Eagleman (2011,124) also contend that both hemispheres of the brain co-operate in
complex ways that are not attributable to only one side. On the contrary, the brain requires elements within both sides to effect even simple physical tasks. The findings of these neuroscientists are analogous to the primary model of all holistic theories, contending that the brain and its components form a system in balance, whose divisions are complementary, inter-dependent and outward-looking, towards the whole person and the whole of society.

Re-gaining momentum seems assured in McGilchrist's observation that the current world malaise of asymmetry in thinking is particularly Western and not permanent. He sees no such social pathology in the workings of contemporary Asian thinking. McGilchrist's ideal would be to see the left-brain bias of the West, including that of majority Australia, repositioning itself towards Australia's non-European minorities, rather than the more common Australian demand for Aboriginal Australians to yield culture for equality. The difference in approach by Western students comprehending oppositional viewpoints, according to McGilchrist (2010, 455), is that the Western student's tendency is to reject the non-preferred competing view of "the big picture", whereas the East Asian student will tend to synthesize and to compromise opposing positions.

Furthermore, one of the Western ways of developing the manager, through positive self-talk, that is by using such cognitive techniques as those of Ellis (2001) and Seligman (1992), would be unlikely to gain acceptance, when the East Asian way is socialization through a sense of belonging to one's social group, and good citizenship (McGilchrist, 2010, 456). The esteem of kinship above self in Aboriginal societies, not just belonging to the band, but also to the land, would suggest that relevance in the mind of the student is unlikely to be achieved by learning self-esteem or positive thinking, but by learning how to
assist in raising the status of kin and colleagues.

In his emphatic refutation of the Western tendency to raise the profile of any constituent part of the brain, McGilchrist also offers some direct criticism of management educators who misunderstand that no specific behaviour is attributable to any one region of the brain exclusively. Kinsbourne (1979) coined the term *dichotomania* to deride the fallacy of ascribing any particular given function entirely to one hemisphere or the other. He concluded that it could be demonstrated that there was clearly a complementary specialization of the two hemispheres. McGilchrist's observation regarding dichotomania, that an erroneous oversimplification had been popularized in management training and is still commonly taught, is to alert us to a more cautionary approach to popular but unexamined Western management education presumptions, and to suggest that the harvesting of new approaches may prove richer in cultures of higher context. Some of the collateral losses of left hemisphere bias in current Western thought processes, according to McGilchrist, include reduced capacity to think metaphorically and habitual loss of consciousness of what we do not know (2010, 405). Kinsbourne (1979) underlined the reciprocity amongst neural flows in the brain as consistently bi-directional, casting the forebrain as overwhelmingly an arena of resounding reciprocal influence. In McGilchrist's terms, this reciprocity and *betweenness* go to the core of our being (2010, 194).

Given the historical misunderstandings between Aboriginal and colonial cultures, it is proposed in this research to move 'behind the scenes' of cultural differences and contrasting world-views on the assumption that the origins of patterns of behaviour, especially styles of management, need to be traced to their sources. In other words, to move from how different styles are perceived, to what their drivers are, and how they are
sustained in personal exertion. The theory holds also that habits of culture are not the only
drivers, and that the resolution of misunderstandings requires that motivational similarities
between cultures merit greater attention.

2.2.2 Neural effects of field and emotions on Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander
management education

Motivation will therefore be presented as having the same biology and neuroscience
(McGilchrist, 2010) for all humankind, although the tendency to prefer some behaviours to
others can be attributed to personality differences between individuals. It is said that
humans are born without culture, but with a readiness to respond to sensory stimuli in the
context of growth and development, via instinctive tendencies like archetypes, personality
differences, and the timely imparting of knowledge by parents and teachers. In turn,
human brain functions are affected by culture. McGilchrist explains that those of
Aboriginal world-view, which is culturally constructed, make better balanced use of their
brains’ hemispheres than Aboriginal Westerners, whose brain functions are skewed
towards the left hemisphere. It follows that management education initiatives should
attempt re-balancing interventions to maximize Western performance. This would aid the
reinforcement of the views of Christie (2009) and Kearins (1986) that Western experience
of the Aboriginal way is an unrealised opportunity.

McGilchrist's findings about brain activity are congruent with the findings of Hall (1990) and
Nisbett (2004), who observed that cultures fall into two broad categories of high context /
low context (Hall), or field-dependence / field-independence (Nisbett). Hall and Nisbett
(2004) confirmed that motivational differences between Westerners and Asians are
influenced by context or field-dependence, Nisbett concluded: “We anticipated that the Asians would be more field-dependent, and indeed they were” (2004, 96). These synonymic constructs separate humankind into two social hemispheres, field-dependence / field-independence (or high context / low context).

There can be no homeostasis in the absence of consideration of the whole system. In the Western world, parents and teachers tend to articulate differentiations of figures or objects from backgrounds in the belief that they can teach how to control an objects' behaviour. Parents and teachers in Aboriginal and Asian contexts more often emphasize harmonious relationships amongst people and environments. Nisbett recounts a Chinese apocryphal tale of a man, whose response to both positive and negative events in his life is always “who knows what is bad or good” (2004,12), indicating that values and motivations are less positivist in high context (field-dependent) societies. Thus, for field-dependent (high context) Asian and Aboriginal societies, prioritizing affect, inclusion and non-discrete concepts offer pathways to the removal of marginalization, post-trauma, and the excessive positivism of the Western world.

Ever since the speculations of James (2007, 242-247, 255-259), the relationships of feeling and emotion to knowledge and learning have been contentious. In his chosen explanatory analogy of a boy seeing a bear and running from it, James concluded that the emotion of fear followed cognition of danger. Unlike James, Damasio (2006) is convinced that emotional responses, such as the startled reflex of an infant, can be primary, and involve the brain's limbic region. However, a summary of the subsequent research to date presented by Shell et al. (2010, 76), and re-iterated by Kinsbourne (1979) and McGilchrist (2010), holds that emotions have multiple roles in cognition. Furthermore, emotions are
intimately connected with knowledge, and may be favourable, by motivating the acquisition of knowledge or, in other circumstances, unfavourable, by inhibiting learning. It has been emphasized that McGilchrist observed no recent historic change in the functioning of Asian brains. However, in following sections it will be shown that unwittingly the West's embrace of Descartes' erroneous dualities has had an adverse impact on Aboriginal societies.

2.2.3 Cultural history and geography as attributable to current misunderstandings

Aboriginal researcher, Waters (2004) attributes the disastrous effects of Western colonization on Aboriginal cultures mainly to distortions of Descartes' (2008) body and mind duality. She claims that Westerners mistakenly utilized logical, discrete, binary dualities in faulty perceptions such as white and non-white, to justify separation over inclusion. However, the historical record demonstrates that the Western tendency to jumble trilogies is traceable for centuries in the colonial cultures of the West, but that Russian culture may mark the boundary line of change to Asian high context (Chamberlain, 2007).

Just prior to Descartes' (2008) philosophical writings, the metaphysical poet, John Donne (James Hall, 165), whose works are noted for situations of paradox, wrote to the Countess of Bedford:

*Reason is our soul's left hand, Faith her right,*  
*By these we reach divinity, that's you.*

The implied trilogy of reason, faith and "higher third" divinity, and asymmetrical paradox of left (inferior), right (superior), producing an angelic but human other, forms a confused trilogy. Reason and faith could be described as mutually exclusive, and the "higher third", 

72
divinity, unrelated to either. Donne’s artful style contrasts with the non-discrete, entropic
dualities of both Aboriginal researcher, Waters (2004) and Western sociologist, Luhmann
(1995). McGilchrist (2010, 2011) and Waters (2004) have observed that the impact of
Descartes (2008) was a radical challenge, that still impacts Western society adversely.
McManus provides a further example of historical pre-Cartesian confusion about Western
trinities composed of careless associations in terms of Socrates' trinity of beauty,
symmetry and truth. In McManus' opinion, "symmetry as truth and beauty is a fiction that
has misled many in love, war and science" (McManus, 2003, 368-369). In Russia, located
at the fault-line of Asian / Western contexts, Chamberlain (2007) found a much weaker
impact of the Cartesian error, as the Russian philosophical heritage is Plato-Pascal
(Jordan, 2006), rather than Socrates (Descartes, 2008), and the prudent medium of
philosophy in dictatorial societies is poetry, not the writings of academic philosophers.

In his work, Emotional Intelligence, Goleman (1995, 78) explains unfavourable emotional
effects in these words: “The extent to which emotional upsets can interfere with mental life
is no news to teachers. Students who are anxious, angry, or depressed don't learn; people
who are caught in these states do not take in information efficiently or deal with it well.”

Assuming that the group disposition of Aboriginal management education students is
typically post-traumatic (Atkinson and Nelson, 2013, 137), (Farrell, K., 1998, 216) and that
they are likely to have issues with the relevance of management subject matter and its
pedagogy, the findings of Shell, et al. (2010, 77) are especially significant:

Negative emotions could produce avoidance goals that might include dropping out
of school. Conversely, positive episodic emotions associated with school could provide
additional motivation for learning tasks. That is why caring teachers and peer friendships
are so crucial to the success of students in school, especially for those who struggle. These
positive emotions can make struggling students resilient and therefore more likely to persist
and succeed.
The findings of Goleman (1995) and Shell et al. (2010) suggest that special and personal attention would need to be dedicated to Aboriginal students who may otherwise be troubled by affective learning inhibitors, like perceived irrelevance. In this research, the positive ideas and values of scientists of both Aboriginal and Western traditions are presented. The synergy of Jung (1989) and Fuller & Dil (1983) that produces human growth in educational interventions has, in its antecedents, assumptions of teaching excellence. It could be assumed that the negative aspects of any behaviour examined within a holistic system of balance of opposites depend on the extent to which the system is asymmetrical or out of balance.

Bringing together Plato and Pascal, Socrates and Descartes, Luhmann, McGilchrist, Waters, Chamberlain, Goleman and Shell, in a discourse about how to approach Aboriginal management education in modern Australia, illustrates the complexity of the determining issues. Among other things, we are traversing the ancient and modern, physiological and social, Aboriginal and Western - all crucial axes in contemporary pedagogies, when opposing world-views form part of the problem. However, the association of these writers allows the visibility of a solution in the connecting ribbon of duality. In this respect, cultural differences represent symptoms as distinct from causes. Causes are to be found in motivation, which includes the neural network for binary preferences (McGilchrist, 2010). The student makes sense of choices presented by parents / teachers within the ambit of cultural learning. Cultural preferences may produce different management styles from other Australians and misunderstandings between Aboriginal and fellow workers about how management decisions are made. D'Iribarne (2009) and Hofstede (1997, 2001) rely for their theories on similar dualities to those of Aboriginal societies. Their evidence is drawn from multi-cultures of both field-dependent
(high context) and field-independent (low context) origins. They extend the societal reach of dualities and trilogies into working groups as diverse as those of France and China (D'Iribarne & Herrault, 2009). Jung (1989), Luhmann (1995) and Waters (2004) are holistic, systemic, non-hierarchical, and encompass Aboriginal motivations comfortably. Whilst the observed cultural differences of field-dependence and context are disseminated by society, their common source can be found in holistic motivations and the functioning of the human brain.

### 2.2.4 Connecting Aboriginal motivations and pedagogies

A successful pedagogy strongly depends first on the motivation of the teacher and secondly on the motivation of the student (Pew, 2007). Each is sensitive to the presence or absence of motivation in the other. However, the teacher carries a double responsibility, motivating the self and motivating the student. This research explores the possibility that factors may exist within the Aboriginal management student, the knowledge of which enables the teacher to create the pedagogical conditions necessary for educational success (Chen, 2001). From the literature emerges a sense of over-arching holism consistent with all collectivist cultures. In particular, balance, identity, place, dualities and others are notable. Without knowledge of the issues constituting the positive and negative elements of all these operant motivations, there can be no pedagogical foundation. This connection is made clearly in the contributions of Ellis (2001) and Walker (2004).

Ellis (2001, p.68), in his *The role of motivation and pedagogy on the generalization of cognitive strategy training* observes the close pedagogical connection between motivation and attribution, noting the possibility that the pleasure of a student in a successful classroom learning outcome may be attributed to a related motivation. This raises

In his journal article, *Middle school student motivation - implications for curriculum, pedagogy and assessment*, Walker (2004, 22) addresses the transitional school years from childhood to adolescence, considering the appropriateness of the awarding of gold stars for achievement. He argues the case for the alternative of intrinsic motivations on the grounds of their potential longer-lasting success. A successful pedagogy would need to take account of Aboriginal students’ sensitivity to public distinctions like gold stars (Kearins, 2000). Aboriginal students may experience humiliation if the teacher’s acclaim over-emphasises the achievements of one student other students in the class.

A focus on holism and its components, duality and other drivers, allows for a closer and deeper examination of the effects of motivation, and its relationship to pedagogy. This also allows the cultural context to be widened to include both its nearest overlay, motivation, the wider context of neuroscience, and the whole person. In the following sections, it will be shown that the most important spheres for the purposes of this research are motivation and pedagogy, rather than the more investigated but contentious sphere of culture.

2.3 Motivational elements in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education
The most vexing duality for modern Aboriginal management students, presents as relevance / irrelevance. The evidence suggests that both in Australia and overseas it is not possible for Aboriginal students to motivate themselves fully unless they perceive their management education as relevant. Following Luhmann's (1995) theme of experiences signed with culture, it becomes clear that educational experiences will be motivating when they carry sufficient cultural signage, such as congruent management styles, drawn from ideas expressing beliefs that inform Aboriginal cultures universally. Influences on the choice of researchers therefore included preference for those who are Aboriginal, such as Pearson (2009), Langton (1996, 2006) and Nakata (2007b). The next level of preference was for Western authors who are consistently holistic, and who present as depth, systemic, humanist, naturalist, or critical, or composites of same, such as Jung (1989), Luhmann (1995), Maslow (1999) and Wheatley (1992).

2.3.1 Motivations as key theoretical underpinnings to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

Motivations can be deduced from researchers seeing frequent associations between key drivers, like Pearson's dualities, but only when they agree with the findings of other credible Aboriginal writers, like Waters, who extends the significance by suggesting that dualities cannot be logical (Cartesian), but must be non-discrete. The depth psychology of Jung (1974), Maze (1983) and Mayes (2005), explains why motivations and their subsidiary components of differing personalities are common to all humankind, and innate. This research will postulate that motivation is holistic and over-arching, and culture is a learned social construct. It will be argued that cultures differ, but primary motivations are the same for all. Motivation will be presented as central to the ontology and meaning of life.
of all cultures. In this regard, culture will be seen in its broader context, as the expression of motivation in the world by individuals and groups, whether externalized in management or any other human endeavour. Relational connections between Aboriginal and Western management styles are elusive at the cultural level. However, at the deeper level of motivation, a more comprehensive appreciation can be offered. According to Maze (1983, 6), motivation addresses the question of why we do what we do. All drives originate within humans (Maslow, 1999, 34), and personality is also located in the brain (Hall & Lindzey, 1978, 212). As Maze (1983) states: “Everything that is gracious and generous in social life, as well as everything that is violent, comes from our genetic dispositions, because there is no other source” (1983, 176). However, Furedy and Riley (1983, p.7) assert that Maze’s statement ignores the enormous contribution of learning to human behaviour, whilst conceding that learning in turn depends on genetic factors.

The source of human energy is said to arise from the desire to relieve drives. At a primary level, human needs include hunger, thirst and sex. Secondary drives predominate when primary drives have been satisfied; Maslow maintains that important secondary drives include a peak need for self-actualization (Maslow, 1998, 22), a spiritual concept. For Aboriginal motivation, this need equates to realising balance by asserting identity, Aboriginal wisdom, and meaning within an appropriate place and spiritual context, thereby reaching optimal self-development.

Motivations provide the impulses or drives to survive. The way in which they are given effect in the world is through the filters of culture. The theories of Hall (1990) and Nisbett (2004) hold that the cultures of the world can be grouped into two large world-views, or life styles, Western and non-Western. These two groupings are complementary, but
oppositional. The Western way is more individualistic and the Aboriginal way more collective. Hall uses the term context to frame the differences, whereas Nisbett prefers the term field. The evidence of Chapman (1991), Bryant (1996, 2004) and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2009), suggests that motivational forces in Aboriginal communities contain elements of holism, duality, balance, place, and spirituality. There is an overarching tendency to prefer group or collective interests, contrasting markedly with the Western tendency to elevate the interests of the individual.

Researchers external to Aboriginal culture cannot easily translate its world-view. However, Nisbett (2004) emphasizes that all humans have similar cognitive processes. Jung (1989) would add that all humans have similar motivational processes. Both would elevate differences in exposure to the world and the things taught to us as the fields where cultural contradictions develop. Both would rate the resultant differences in world-view as profound. Sheth and Mittal (2004) from India, where the trails of European-Asian marketing tensions of world-view are well trodden, describe the differences between East and West as enormous in attitudes, traits and values, including spirituality (2004, 186). The challenge to understand and state the extent of the divide between opposing contexts is emphasized by Barnhart and Kawagley (2005, 7) as "the complexities that come into play, when two fundamentally different world-views converge, present a formidable challenge". However, Barnhart & Kawagley (2005), and Wilson (2008), writing as Aboriginal-Insiders, still hold positive views of Western research. They are sustained by an apparent "paradigm shift" that they believe is now under way, in which Aboriginal knowledge and ways of knowing are being recognized as complex knowledge systems, with an adaptive integrity of their own (Barnhart & Kawagley, 2005, 7).
The optimism of Barnhart & Kawagley (2005) and Wilson (2008) rely on assumptions more evident to the Aboriginal field-dependent (high context) researchers than their Western field-independent (low context) colleagues. This is because the field-dependent (high context) person generally take a holistic overview of their historical struggles against Western privileging of the individualist side of the human equation. To Aboriginal researcher Waters (2004), the essence of these struggles is the Western misunderstanding of how philosophical dualities function. There are many indications that if the paradigm shift anticipated by Barnhart & Kawagley and Wilson is nurtured, and appropriate management educational experiences are enabled, benefits may flow from developing an understanding of the motivations of Australian Aboriginal and Asian minorities. In turn, this may lead to a critical re-appraisal of Australian management's own concepts and assumptions, together with a broader comprehension of how pedagogical misunderstandings may be reduced.

Nisbett's (2004) field and context findings, about East Asian societies, locate high context networks of social obligations originating in communities living on great plains. The Aboriginal priority of reading the land fits naturally with human connectedness and inter-dependence. On the plains and plateaus of Australia, an Aboriginal preference was set for co-operation, sense of duty and responsibility, within a culture of field-dependence (high context). Widely practised, the choices for dependence on others, or independence from others, produced established attitudes and coherent, though vastly different, world-views. Besides strongly indicating the meta-motivation of holism as inclusive driver of Aboriginal motivation, the research evidence suggests that duality and balance are also strongly signified as drivers. There are many phenomena in ganma imaging, but two are especially important, in the context of motivation. The first is
contradiction or paradox: salt water opposed to fresh water, for example. Secondly, as Hughes (2000) has recorded, the interactivity of two streams mixing results, not in negative outcomes, but in counter-intuitive "deeper understanding". In this study, the mix is visualized as analyzable into two parts that flow in counterpoint. On the one hand, they are dialectical entities, such as dualities and triangles, and on the other hand, theoretical constituents, like psychodynamic and social systems theories. The strength of this research is that it shows that both Aboriginal and other Australians can navigate fluidly both ways, utilizing knowledge accessible and acceptable to either side. A ganma image is represented by the work of an Aboriginal artist at Figure 8.

Figure 8  Ganma image

Source: Ganma moiety - Painter: Yalmay Yunupingu, 1989

The theoretical pathway towards this deeper understanding, set originally by Jung's (1993, 156) concept of “higher third” or synergy (Fuller & Dil, 1983), depends on paradox, rather than simply difference. Support for this position has been strong from Wheatley (1994, 21), in her studies of order and disorder in the theory of chaos, Senge's (1990, 185) systems thinking, Argyris' (2008, 3) double loop learning, the social systems theory of Luhmann (1986, 1989, 1995, 2000b), and the blend of psychodynamic and systems theory, known as systems psychodynamics (James, Connolly, Dunning & Elliott, 2006). An account of the theoretical integration of psychodynamic and social systems theory was first published in
the Tavistock Institute’s 1992 - 1993 Review (Dowd, 2007). The blending of these views can be imagined within the diagram at Figure 9 of separated ying-yang segments: Dialectical energy is released in the experiential clash of high and low context world-views, the learning gap is filled with new knowledge, and the synergistic gains of learning.

![Figure 9 Ying-Yang](Source: Royalty-free stock photos from Google Images)

Precedents for ensuring relevance and dissolving resistance have already begun to permeate research. Ganma (Figure 8, p.81) is an image used to represent the two ways flow of ideas, between Australian Aboriginal culture and the broader community. It can convey the concept of both-ways education, a widely supported image within both the Aboriginal and wider community. Consideration of the position of theorists, who refute the feasibility of both-ways education, notably Folds (2001), are regarded with respect, but it can be argued that, on balance, two-ways methodology is eclectic, respectful of each side, and proven sufficiently to warrant further exploration and extension, with some confidence, into the field of management education.

### 2.3.2 Convergence of disciplines and theories - social, personal, natural sciences and Aboriginal ontology
Blainey (1983), Unaipon (in Muecke & Shoemaker, 2001) and others point to Asia as the source of migration to the Australian mainland. The continuous occupancy of the continent for tens of thousands of years is consistent with the findings of Nisbett (2004), who maintains that the shelf life of world-views is measured in thousands of years, and that world-views are heavily influenced by the place and environment in which they form. Another familiar characteristic is that they evolve in their field-dependent (high context) populace dynamic notions of balance, identity, kinship and other concepts, which have considerable overlap (Figure 11, p.90), and therefore form an important part of the scaffolding of Aboriginal styles of behaviour, including management styles.

Both management and education derive their psychologies from common research streams, within which rival theories compete for attention. However, as Capra (1983b, 1996, 2000) points out, none of these is wrong, but each focuses on part of the whole system, and attempts to generalize to the full spectrum of the psyche. Systems theories are holistic, and begin with the knowledge that the earth is a living system (Lovelock, 2000), and that all other systems, whether natural or human, are part of a broader whole. Bateson (1987) believed that relationships are paramount, and that all definitions should be expressed in terms of relationships to other things. Nisbett (2004, 59) explained that Japanese (field-dependent and high context) mothers educate their infant children to perceive feelings and relationships as first priority, and objects as secondary. This contrasts with Western mothers, whose priorities favour objects over relationships. Some of the more immediate issues in the field of Aboriginal management education are to be found in the place of motivation, its genesis in dualities, and the related Western tendency to conceptual errors of approach. Historical cross-cultural errors, however, potentially disable the balance and synergy intrinsic to Aboriginal management education. The legacy
of Descartes (2008) and its impact on field and tendency to reductionism, combine in the West to ensure a focus on one field to the detriment of another. It is certainly important to view culture as crucial, but not without the impacts on it of motivation or neuroscience, as they are part of a whole system, and cannot exist independently. Full understanding of dualities, therefore, also involves connections with its cognitive, motivational and physiological associations.

It would not be consistent with the inclusiveness of the holistic view of the world to dismiss reductionism as oppositional and therefore unacceptable. As Capra (1983b, 1996, 2000) argues, the reductionist description of organisms can be useful, and in some cases, necessary. Reductionism, claims Capra in the Turning Point (1983b, 288), is dangerous only when it is taken as a complete explanation. "Reductionism and holism, analysis and synthesis are complementary approaches that, used in proper balance, help us obtain a deeper knowledge of life". Moreover, modern physics and scientific thinking can show the other sciences that holistic and ecological views are scientifically sound (Capra, 1983b, 32).

Holism’s components of duality and balance are signified as drivers in their own right by Jung (1969a) and Hughes (2000). The common ground of holism found in Chapman et al. 1991; Bryant, 1996; 2004; and Sveiby & Skuthorpe, 2006; 2011, was also found in the Australian research of Aboriginal educators, Martin (2003, 2008a, 2008b, 2008c), Williams (2007), Baldry, Green and Thorpe (2006), and West (2000). In short, the motivational drivers recognized by these and other Aboriginal theorists mainly stressed holism and its components, duality, balance, spirituality and place. The question that followed was, given such radically different world-views as those of Aboriginal Australian and Western
societies, whether holistic approaches could inform better comprehensions of Australian Aboriginal motivations and management styles, and how these might differ from the motivations and management styles of majority Australians. A beginning to the answers was found in Combs & Snygg's (1959) enhancement of the phenomenal self, which linked to Nisbett's (2004) notions of field and to Jung's higher third, and also to the equivalent of higher third in Maslow & Lowry's (1974) self-actualization, with its higher order goal of personal development. However, in this research, the journey is from observed behaviour to the physiology and psychology of its causes. In this case, we move from Aboriginal styles to culture, motivations and neuroscience, and unsurprisingly find many connections and common origins, some centuries old. Given Luhmann's (2000b) exposition of the importance of mass media in the formation of contemporary world-views, the rapid expansion of social media, and Aboriginal affinity with uptake of the Internet, described by Christie (2009), the paradigm shift forecast by Barnhardt and Kawagley (2005; 2008) may be realisable within Luhmann's perspective of an inter-connected world society, unlimited by national boundaries.

2.3.3 How field-dependence and context influence motivations, cultural values and management styles

Understanding the influence on socialization of high context (preference for field-dependence) requires the appreciation of a fundamental difference between the developing perceptions of the world. For example, field-dependent (high context) viewers of the scene at Figure 10 (p.86) are more inclined to perceive it relationally; that is with the horses fitting in seamlessly into the landscape. On the other hand, field-independent, or low context majority Australian viewers are more likely to be attracted to the horses and to
emphasize their importance.

**Figure 10** Field-dependence (high context) and field-independence (low context)

![Image](image.png)

*Source: Royalty-free stock photos from Google Images*

There is no more important element in understanding management education than the duality of field-dependence / field-independence. It is the source of dialectical energy, preferred behaviour, and pedagogy. At the same time, it contains the educational system as a whole. Simply stated by Combs (1989), field preference is the learner's subjective reality. Combs supports the position that management theories may be constructed from the world-views of their authors. Furthermore, the holding of an oppositional world-view may influence the attribution process of explaining behaviour. The challenge implied for management education is therefore to take account of the potential for misunderstanding when a dominant field-independent (low context) and hegemonic culture has responsibility for facilitating the management education of a field-dependent (high context) and sceptical minority sub-culture. Whilst the preference for field-dependence (high context) is a minority position nationally, it is paradoxically within an Asian world majority, usefully placed to comprehend the nature of the management styles likely to dominate this century.
However, some general distinctions around field and context issues need consideration.

The field-independent (low context) student can more easily break the field down into its constituent parts, and typically is not influenced by the existing structure. In other words, field-independency (low context) enables the making of choices independently of perceptual field. The field-dependent (high context) student establishes a warm and personal learning environment, and is motivated more by personal aspects of the educational experience, and less by the teacher. The fit with the group processes of management education is likely to be better than for the field-independent student. Guild and Garger (1998, 83) provide in Table 1 comparisons between student styles of the field-dependent Asian and Aboriginal educational groups and their field-independent Western counterparts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Field-dependence</strong></th>
<th><strong>Field-independence</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Perceive globally</td>
<td>Perceive analytically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience in a global fashion</td>
<td>Experience in articulated fashion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adhere to structure as given</td>
<td>Impose structure or restrictions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make broad general distinctions among concepts, see relationships</td>
<td>Make specific concept distinctions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Have a social orientation to world</td>
<td>Have impersonal relation to world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learn social content best</td>
<td>Learn social material as intentional task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attend best to material relevant to own experience</td>
<td>Interested in new concepts for own sake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seek externally defined goals and reinforcements</td>
<td>Have self-defined goals and reinforcements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Want organization to be provided</td>
<td>Can self-structure situations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More affected by criticism</td>
<td>Less affected by criticism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Use spectator approach to concept attainment

Use hypothesis approach to attain concepts.

(Source: Guild and Garger, 1998, 83)

Nisbett's (2004, 123) approach is not to engage in the unholistic labelling of calling maladaptive behaviour “prejudiced” or “stereotyped”, but to offer a more systemic explanation, for which he uses the term fundamental attribution error – the tendency to assume that the behaviour of another person has been produced by personality traits or abilities, and to slight important situational factors. An example of the difference in thought process may be that a member of a field-independent (low context) society could perceive an event as “the violence of the offender was caused by membership of a violent race”. The same event may be perceived by a field-dependent (high context) individual in a broader causal set of alternatives, such as “the violence of the offender was affected by fear of incarceration and language difficulties”.

It is clear to Nisbett (2004) that there will be circumstances in management when the human element needs to be set aside in favour of the completion of a task. He concedes that many modern businesses often require people to focus on a narrow set of goals and to pursue them independently. In these cases, he acknowledges that performance may be better if other people are largely ignored rather than attended to closely. However, these exceptions do not alter his contentions when it comes to organizations with large numbers of staff, nor in the formation and holding power of world-views. Nisbett's (2004) assumptions are that the process begins with human occupation of a system of ecology for economic reasons, and with vastly different landscapes, in the case of ancient Greece and China (and Australia). The mountainous nature of Greece hindered the visibility of plains and vast human populations. In the mountains, travel was difficult and this inhibited social
contacts, weakening the cause of co-operative behaviours. The tendency to prejudice was exacerbated when individualist societies of the mountainous regions world-view perceived the co-operative behaviours of the alternative plains and flat lands Aboriginal world-view as inappropriate, or even alien.

2.3.4 Holism as a primary motivator of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management students

Holism is the container of all of the motivational forces within the human psyche. It is frequently used as descriptor in the research and practice of Aboriginal health initiatives. This is particularly appropriate as the word holism has its etymological roots in the word *health*. Lock (2007,11) advises researchers into Aboriginal health to record the linkage between holism and health in all investigations. Holism is also commonly used as a close synonym for system, associating systems theories like those of Bateson (1987) and Luhmann (1998) within an inclusive epistemology encompassing the holistic theories underpinning the research of Aboriginal writers Mooney and Houston (2008).

Duality, balance and all other motivational concepts can be depicted as dynamic and overlapping. Figure 11 illustrates how holistic frameworks could be constructed.
Penrith (1996) regards the Dreaming as the container of folklore and stories, mythical tales and heroes. It includes an obligation to respect and to nurture, and for custodianship of the land. It is without greed, and there is no sense of exploitation of resources. Relationships with trees and animals are important, as they often invoke the memories and spirits of ancestors and living kin. Just as the Dreaming images have the respect of Australians, for relevance and diffusion of resistance, respect has to flow both ways. Both-ways education (Herbert, 2007, 9) has successfully reinforced the pathway taken by the Batchelor Institute near Darwin, a dedicated Australian Aboriginal tertiary institution.

The Dreaming could be regarded as the conceptual container of most significance to Australians. However, viewed through the prism of Christian exceptionalism and historical prejudice, the Dreaming is easily derided as a fairy tale. It may be argued that God’s creating the world in six days and resting on the Sabbath is a far more convincing story
than the arrival on earth of a Rainbow Serpent gifted with the miracle of creation. The modern astronomer would no doubt react with affront at both these explanations, advocating the now well accepted story of the Big Bang. In this version, life began with an invisible, sub-atomic particle of matter exploding millions of years ago with unimaginable force. In the process, stars and planets including earth were created. Life evolved, the universe expanded and will continue expanding at increasing speed, before slowing and reversing direction. More recently, there is considerable agreement with Stephen Hawking’s (1993) theory that black holes are portals to parallel universes.

It is beyond the scope of this research to canvas the epistemological merits of these three versions of creation. Nevertheless, it is not difficult to understand why the tendency for each group to continue to cling to its own meta-narrative is steadfast, as each requires an act of faith, and none offers more credibility for the uninitiated than the other two. For the development of a theory of Aboriginal Management Education, there is no lesser case to be made for a theory of Aboriginal numinous origin than for any alternative Western or Asian theory, typified by the current progress towards Indian indigenist theories of psychology, education and management (Bourai, 1993, Chakraborty, 1999, Malik, 2000, Misra & Mohanty, 2002, Sharma, 2004, and Vohra, 2004).

Holistic theorists argue that Aboriginal cultures are motivated by systems of energy that activate interests and search for meaning. These systems are bounded by holistic ideas. One is the tendency to return to a steady state of homeostasis. This can be the result of disturbances to other holistic sub-systems, such as duality (ying-yang) and balance. The closest Western equivalents of Aboriginal psychologies are found in psychodynamic or depth psychologies, especially as articulated by Jung (1989). These include primary drives for food and sex, but also include other drivers within the global perimeters of holism, such
as balance and spirituality that reside within the unconscious mind as primordial archetypes. Psychodynamic theorists regard these proto-images, such as mother and father, sun and moon, wise man and trickster, as very influential in determining the behaviour of modern humankind.

It would be less difficult to argue that human societies were originally holistic than that they were individualistic, as the evidence points to early humankind grouped socially in clans or tribes. A Western approach would be to pose the question of whether the holistic way is "better" than the individualistic. Both the literature and interviewee evidence in this research suggest that it is desirable to favour the commonsense view that each has value. One difficulty is that the Western side rarely glimpses the reality of the other side of the contextual divide. However, opportunity for partial understanding may exist in the popular television program, *Who do you think you are?* (Graham, 2008-2014). This program transports the celebrity guest to ancestral houses and relatives, re-visiting historical narratives, both written and oral, and in the process involving guests in the lives of those, without whose suffering and survival, the celebrity would not exist. In effect, these exposures immerse the guest in emotional experiences that are analogues for many constants in the lives of Aboriginal Australians, including those who reside in city locations.

The excursion of the soul afforded by this TV series for one hour weekly for majority Australia can be compared to the continuous lived experience of those eight Aboriginal people interviewed for this research, all of the time. *Who do you think you are?* (Graham, 2008-2014) is rich in the affects of place, spirituality and relationality, as it fleshes out family narratives long forgotten in the vagaries of migrant dislocations from places and kin. Those Australians who find this TV program engaging and of deep emotional consequence
for its celebrity guests, and vicariously for the viewer, may be drawn closer to the likelihood that this could be a both-ways template for understanding Aboriginal education. *Who do you think you are?* (Graham, 2008-2014) could be seen as equally applicable to non-Australians who wish to apply all of the components of holism, place and spirituality to their motivational practices in the discipline of management described in Chapters 1-3. Similarly, it may become more apparent that the construction of the methodology, discussed in this and other chapters, must embrace a design of the closest affinity to the ontology of Aboriginal Australians in order to be fully accepted both-ways. Equally, a window may be opened on the validity of the approach for the critical examination of the management styles of all Australians.

### 2.3.5 Prominence of dualities in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management motivation

The dynamics of duality involve confronting a notion with its opposite. Huskinson (2004, 35) summarizes Jung’s (1970) explanation of the phenomenon in terms of the conflict and tension initiated by antithetical forces, creating the energy needed by the psyche to generate its momentum and dynamism. Bayne (2004) maintains that the most important dualities for Jung are intuiting / sensing, and thinking / feeling. This creates a third entity, which both Jung (1993) and Fuller & Dil (1983) deemed "natural", but of a higher order. In the process of resolution of the tension and restoration of balance, new knowledge of the other occurs and the individual develops (individuates). Jung (1974) pointed out that there is no word in the West for the higher third, which is the developmental increment attributable to the interaction of the two opposites, although this idea is central to Chinese individual development, and integrated into Western philosophy by Nietzsche (1956).
Knowledge and wisdom are further outcomes of this internal dialectical struggle. Jung expressed this semiotically in the universal Eastern symbol of ying-yang. In Australian societies, duality is also central and is visualized in dichotomies like Ganma's fresh and salt waters, Eagle and Crow divisions of kinship in New South Wales, Yirritja or Dua in Arnhem Land, and white and black power differences. It is in the latter duality of racial inequality that Hofstede's (1997; 1999; 2001) cross-cultural studies had their origins. The growth of the civil rights movement and release of black and other minorities' energy to redress power differences validated the rise of more inclusive management theories with international outreach.

D'Iribarne's (2009) depiction of the duality of the workers of France, on the one hand to resist, and on the other not to acquiesce, draws on another template, that of metier, or professional portfolio, a notion that meeting professional standards can be expected and will be freely given. The tension of opposites between resistance and acquiescence is familiar to Australians, and an example of Waters' (2004) non-discrete opposites. However, D'Iribarne's (2009) preference for a unifying concept like metier is Western. It is tempting to suggest that there may be one Aboriginal Australian concept, such as Identity, that is the equivalent of metier, but Aboriginal concepts are all partly co-extensive with others, such as kin and place. The conclusion of Mooney & Houston (2008) that Aboriginal Australia is communitarian has similarly Western origins, and ignores the duality and overlap that characterize Aboriginal ideas. Duality as an essential part of comprehending the world and the motivations of its human inhabitants is not a majority view in the West. Given its exotic character as witnessed in Australia, this question is raised:

To what extent are Aboriginal Australians likely to attribute reasons for management
outcomes differently from other Australians?

To researcher Waters (2004), the essence of the continuing struggles of Aboriginal peoples is the Western confusion about how dualities function beneficially or destructively within Aboriginal cultures. She has undertaken a sweeping historical review of Native American suffering since the first colonial occupations, concluding that Descartes' (2008) body / mind duality had many negative consequences. Westerners mistakenly utilized logical, discrete, binary dualities, such as white and non-white. This appears to be part of the same core theory as Jung (1993, 123-126) and Luhmann (1990, 188): the opposition of dualities that are different in degree, rather than in kind. For example, Jung's duality of thinking and feeling, and Luhmann's duality of government and opposition. To Waters (2004), the hostility of white colonialists to people of colour arises mainly from a cultural disposition to see black and white as Cartesian opposites, rather than as shades of grey. There is common ground in the dualities found by Waters (2004), and Pearson (2010) on the Aboriginal side, and dualistic Western theorists, on the other. Maslow is the best known of Western theorists whose motivational constructs reach to the highest order of human satisfaction and spiritual well-being. Taking the satisfaction of Aboriginal societies with non-discrete dualities, balance, place and spirituality, as of equally high order, it is the construct spirituality that seems motivational (if ineffable) to most societies, even though it appears in many guises and contexts. Its opposition to materialism is regarded as problematic in Western society in which spirituality is fading. However, the answer must lie in examining the dynamics of balance.

2.3.6 Balance as a fundamental element of Aboriginal management motivation
In the human world, with non-discrete opposites as theory-in-use, balance is perceived as desirable, motivational, but probably unreachable. Western law is symbolized in the scales held aloft in the hand of the iconic figure of the Greek goddess, Themis.

![Image of Themis](https://source.google.com/images)

*Source: Royalty-free stock photos from Google Images*

However the ideal is presented that societal differences, such as the gap between Aboriginal and majority cultures, will bias the scale. Hence, for the Aboriginal Australian, the stability of homeostasis is attained rarely. This would mean that the full human potential assumed in Maslow's (1998, 1999) self-actualization remains elusive.

Homeostasis is a state of balance or equilibrium, that requires energy to be found and maintained. But the Aboriginal Australians' relative poverty requires much more investment of time and energy to achieve the minimum of fairness, and has less hope for just outcomes under the law.

The need for identity seems universal, and closely connected to balance. For Western society, Combs and Snygg (1959, 45) place the closely associated search for self as paramount: "From birth to death, the maintenance of the phenomenal self is the most pressing, the most crucial, if not the only task of existence". It is known that positive personal experiences, such as those of parenting and education, develop a person's concept of self. In a lifetime of growth, both physical and psychological, some may self-
actualize, but the journey may be harder for Aboriginal Australians than for the majority.

Within Australian Aboriginal society, balance and its restoration can be witnessed most clearly in the assertive and energetic quest of its people to raise the standard of their own identity, long suppressed by colonialist attitudes. Aboriginal social, cultural and political values provide constancy in Aboriginal identity. Further, Aboriginal education needs the informing strength of Aboriginal values (Williams, 2007, 6). Without re-balancing through identity formation in any educational venture, reconciliation can be compromised.

Mandawuy Yunupingu (1994,1-3) attempted to raise the level of understanding of balance for Australian Aboriginal individuals by telling his audience about balance and duality. "In our band Yothu Yindi, we have a balance between Yirritja and Dhuwa. But we also have another balance, one between black and white, or Yolngu and Balanda. Amongst the Yirritja members of our band, there are both black and white, and among the Dhuwa members of our band, there are both black and white". Later (2007, 5) Galarrwuy Yunupingu re-iterated the message of balance, by remarking that “Captain Phillip, and those that followed him, failed to understand this. They failed to establish a proper order or balance, and this has been tearing away at the heart of the nation ever since”. Like duality, balance is prominent in depth psychologies, especially Jung’s.

Transformation of instinctive energy is, in depth psychologies, canalized by the symbol as an analogue of the object of instinct. The balancing effect of holism as positive energy is also involved. Thomas’ Aboriginal flag design is a symbol grounded in the natural, a complete universe in balance. In contrast, the flag of Imperial Japan, also with sun at centre, traditionally has no other feature. The sun is “rising”, the symbol unbalanced,
unsetting, a challenge to nature (Figure 12).

Figure 12  Flags of Japan and Australia

Source: Royalty-free stock photos from Google Images

2.3.7 Spirituality - an all-encompassing motivation of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

Many Western management educators, such as Robert Greenleaf (1977), derive their spirituality from Christian ethical standpoints and express it confidently in their theorising. Similarly in India, Gandhi’s theory, relying on the Mahatma’s belief that education can never be divorced from work, is a widely held and respected approach throughout the nation (Bourai, 1993, 134). The myths of Greek philosophy and gods are still present in many management texts and metaphors; for example, The Icarus Paradox, Miller (1991), and Charles Handy’s Gods of Management (1995). Aboriginal mythology has "gods" with dramatis personae akin to Greek mythology; for example, where the trickster, Prometheus, is the alter ego of Barn-Barn Barlala (the bellbird). Jung maintained that generic archetypes, such as trickster, mother and hero are pan-cultural, and that they generate projected images of significant human connections in the real world; for example, Mum
Shirl (mother) and Kathy Freeman (hero). Investigating the connectedness of Aboriginal managers to their influential Dreaming archetypes and how they influence real world management decisions, is central to the issues of this research.

The provenance of trilogies as behavioural constructs is well documented. Mayes (2005, 70) attests that Jung saw the recurrence of trinities in religions from ancient Egypt to modern Christianity as a reflection of the archetype of the third. However, whilst there is a remarkable resemblance between Luhmann's trilogies and Jung's, a question remains about whether Luhmann's social systems world-view offers a perspective that, like Jung's, would accord with the depth of commitment of Aboriginal societies to spirituality. This may be explained in Luhmann's Art as a Social System (2000a, 10), in which he makes clear that spirituality is synonymous with "the mystery of communication", a phrase that has similar status and conviction to Jung's (1970) "mysterium coniunctonis", or "mystery of conjunction". That is, Luhmann regards this special mystery as a centrepiece of his theory. He extends this metaphor (2000a, 90), by observing that Spirit is the replacement for the erosion of God in the world.

Williams (2007) has underlined the importance of spirituality to the identity of the Australian. In Williams' words "I cannot overstate how focal our spirituality is to us; it is our life guide" (2007, 3). Accordingly, Williams sets a direction towards an Aboriginal management pedagogy that accesses Aboriginal spiritual themes and entities. Whilst spirituality can be central to all Aboriginal life, including education, balance and harmony can be compromised by the reductionist separation of values from place, past from present, or by the separation of identity from country. Mayes (2005) and Ibarra (2001) perceive a spiritual element in both education itself and all of its disciplines. Ibarra (2001,
230) maintains that multi-contextual concepts reach beyond the curriculum and into the academic culture of mathematics as a discipline. For Mayes, the physical sciences offer opportunities to engage in spiritually creative education. It is known that Aboriginal nomadic societies of low population did not need or develop the study of mathematics and science in the same way as the West (Harris, 1987, 35). However, both-ways education accords the same opportunities to Aboriginal students as it does to other Australians, and expects the same levels of achievement. Ibarra's (2001) observations suggest that field sensitive pedagogies, combined with computer technologies, can harvest more students of mathematics. Reflecting these Aboriginal mathematics and science pedagogies appropriately would require congruency of cultural signage.

Modern management research also supports the rising priority of spirituality in the work of major Western theorists. Wheatley, in Finding our way: management for an uncertain time (2005, 30) explains:

I find it delightful to note that two great management thinkers, J Edwards Deming, the great voice for quality in organizations, and Robert Greenleaf, the prophet of servant leadership, both focused on human spirit in their final writings. Following different paths, they arrived at the same centering place. We can create the lives and organizations we desire only by understanding the enlivening spirit in us that always is seeking to express itself.

Whilst spirituality is pan-cultural, other more distinctly Western entities, such as archetypes are viewed by some researchers as difficult to integrate into Aboriginal cultures. Described critically by Sunderland (2007) as a universalist solution to cultural fragmentation, David Tacey's (1998) book, The Edge of the Sacred, was reviewed by Rolls (1998) as positing alien archetypal structures on Aboriginal culture. Tacey's defence for connecting depth concepts to world-views is simply that his Jungian position is universalising, and not necessarily Eurocentric. Whilst Rolls would argue that an archetype is part of a Western psychodrama, Tacey's position is that all cultures have archetypes, notwithstanding that
the idea of archetype may be locally ineffable. The extended debate between Tacey and
Rolls distils an inescapable paradox for cross-cultural researchers. All present with
culturally developed world-views, disclaiming bias, but frequently unconvincingly,
according to Rolls, who is especially critical of endowing any Aboriginal culture with
“confected nobility”. For some, “white man got no dreaming” (Rothenberg, 1983, 202) is
more than a simplified lament about bi-cultural ignorance. It summarizes a fear that, in the
case of Aboriginal and other Australians, the differences may be insurmountable. However,
this view has to be moderated by the reality of the necessarily coterminous survival of both
cultures. Mandawuy Yunupingu’s (1994, 1-3) consistent declarations of “balance” and
Nakata’s (2007, 1-6) belief that educators need to work in the contested intellectual
spaces of the cultural interface, suggest that depth ideas have bi-cultural relevance, and
that mutual engagement is a prerequisite for social and educational advancement.

The conflict between Tacey and Rolls provides an insight into the possible cultural losses
that confront Australians who embrace higher education in any discipline, which could be
expressed as presentation of knowledge in the symbols of another culture, may prove to
be a barrier to learning, or irrelevant. As discussed by Brannen and Doz (2010), Brannen,
Thomas and Hong (2010), and Benet-Martinez, Leu & Lee (2002), it could be expected
that parallels with the dispute between Tacey and Rolls may be reflected in the bi-cultural
experiences of participants engaging in this research, raising the question of whether there
are advantages in acquiring bi-culturality, or only disadvantages.

The model for comparing Australian Aboriginal management education may be available in
modern India, where Hindu (Vedic) spirituality informs many new approaches to Indian
management education (Vohra, 2004). Both India and Aboriginal Australia still carry the
memories of the excesses of colonialism. Both are hugely diverse in languages and sub-cultures. Only exceptional management educators in the Western world, like Block (1996) and Greenleaf (1977), display an integrated spirituality, whereas the spirituality of Vohra (2004) Malik (2000), Bourai (1993) and others is woven more openly and widely into Indian management texts, just as it is in the Aboriginal research of Wilson (2008), Begay (1991), Battiste (2005) and Reyes and Perrault (2000). Whatever the author's origins, however, the language that will carry the spiritual message to Australians is most likely to be English.

### 2.3.8 The status of place as a foundation of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander motivation

The evidence suggests that Aboriginal societies tend to disregard the importance of essences, and to embrace relational ideas. Smith & Ward (2000), refer to the work of Merlan (1998) amongst Australian Aboriginal peoples in these terms. They report that Merlan distinguished between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal representations of the significance of place in terms of a narrative (Aboriginal) or definitive (non-Aboriginal) character. The former, they assert, is concerned with what happened at a place, while the focus of the latter is the essence of what the place is. Merlan interprets this lack of definitiveness as part of an Aboriginal tradition, in which the meanings associated with a place are subject to ongoing negotiation and reforming, as Aboriginal people continue to visit and interact with that place.

A primary dynamic in the Aboriginal domain of motivation can be found in the elevation of place as an abundant source of drive and energy. In her research in North America, Kenny
(2004) recorded that “holistic” is interpreted in specific ways, depending on the location and context of each Nation, tribe or band. In other words, place is an integral part of the whole of life of the peoples. For Australian researchers, Memmott & Long (2002, 2) “A place can be partly or wholly created by enacting special types of behaviour at a particular piece of environment”. Special behaviours lead to associations with places made by people populating them, whose growth of emotional attachment may include a willingness to defend them. Affection, nostalgia and dislike are other emotions that may relate to a special place. Knowledge properties such as concepts, past events, legends, names, ideals, or memories may be involved. Like ways of knowing or style of cognition arising from field orientation, properties of place are transmitted socially, and thus may stay constant through generations and cultural periods. Bonds between individuals or groups and places constitute part of the personal identity of those individuals or groups. People can be dependent upon the concept of place for their self-identity and social-identity, just as places are dependent upon people for their identity, illustrating the mutual interaction process of people-environment relations. Continental Australia was once an entire Aboriginal cultural landscape in the classical geography; all of the continent was known, and much of it was named (Langton, 1996). To some extent Aboriginal Australia can still be considered as one cultural landscape or as comprising numerous cultural landscapes, corresponding with different Aboriginal societies or clans. Interrelationships promote exchanges between cultural landscape of one group and another. Memmott & Long (2002) explain that exchanges occur through:

- the actions of ancestral beings,
- travel and exchange relationships,
- shared contact histories, and hence,
- shared experiences at, and knowledge of place.
These perspectives involving the socialization of the land are in contrast to those of non-aboriginal explorers, geographers and tourism entrepreneurs who describe the more Aboriginal remote parts of Australia as desert or wasteland, virgin or barren. Types of place-specific knowledge include:

- seasonal harvest indicators and associated climatic knowledge,
- identification of local native plants and animals, and
- their distribution, procurement and usage.

There are complex models of traditional ownership of places and territories, associated roles and responsibilities, as well as access restrictions to various places and the need for certain forms of approach behaviour. Rich cultural repertoires exist of symbolic elements derived from cosmological belief systems, especially invisible beings, entities and energies. The belief that ancestral beings gifted with supernatural powers endowed pre-historic generations with land and marine systems constitutes a powerful influence on the relative importance of place to clan members. Places and traditional ownership impose respectful behaviours on Aboriginal peoples that have no parallel in the West. Just as earth and mother are profoundly connected by Australians in respectful Aboriginal parity, places connected with Aboriginal self-identity require a level of reverence and privacy reserved in the West only for important human authorities. Memmott & Long (2002-3) recognize that “a contemporary aspect is the tension when (an Aboriginal witness) is asked to reveal knowledge in court settings such as public inquiries or land claims”.

The strength of the Aboriginal motivation of place can be appreciated in the report, The management of Indigenous pastoral lands (2014), and the concept of social
**embeddedness**, the term used by Gill (2005, 703) to differentiate non-Aboriginal pastoralists from their Aboriginal counterparts. Gill argues that Aboriginal peoples are often motivated by place-based logic in their participation in pastoral enterprises. In the case of the Aboriginal Australian, there may be the satisfaction of stewardship of the land under Aboriginal management operating more strongly than simply the profitability of business success.

As Gill describes it:

> For the Aboriginal pastoralists in this study pastoralism is secondary to regaining and controlling country and fulfilling one's obligations to country and kin. ……pastoralists ranked the individual and social benefits of pastoralism above other perceived benefits ……pastoralism having a role in the maintenance of culture (2005, 705).

Knowledge specific to place obligates Aboriginal Australians to pass on to each generation the rituals, access rights and customs arising from custodianship of particular places. However, the over-arching belief that Aboriginal places were created by spiritual entities stands in stark contrast to Western scientific explanations of the genesis of places. Natural causes, such as explained by the science of geomorphology lack spiritual substance and ignore human influences. Places are totemic, as Aboriginal Australians identify with special energies said to be contained in places that belong to or are derived from certain animal and plant species. Identity is strengthened by Aboriginal people knowing that they contain some place energy, and that special places contain a part of their own energies, in other words a sharing of being. This ontology leads to strong emotional attachments to places, which affect collective and spiritual clan identities. The radial overlay of place and spirit (Adams, 1997) is extended by a further duality of good spirit / bad spirit in the NPY Lands volume (Ngaanyatjarra, Pitjantjatjara, Yankunytjatjara, Women's Council, 2013, 191). Hence, lack of balance can spiritually place (good) or displace (bad) and may need the intervention of an ngangkari (spiritual healer) to reassign
good spirit to the right (anatomical) place and to restore propitious spiritual energy flows for an Aboriginal client to be fully healed.

2.3.9 Poverty – an all-encompassing demotivation in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander education

For this research, which emphasizes the importance of opposites, getting the right theories for Aboriginal management pedagogy has to be balanced with avoiding the wrong theories and the demotivational perceptions of irrelevance they often present to Aboriginal tertiary students. In this respect, there is no more influential duality than poverty / wealth as its propensity to promote imbalance and demotivation is profound.

The literature discussed in this chapter about demotivation can be summarized first as the demotivational effects of poverty, which require constant monitoring to avoid exclusion of Aboriginal management students, not just from education, but from society in general, and secondly, to advocate the common-sense approach to poverty of Pearson (2009, 16), which is to address it, but to introduce educational solutions concurrently with its reduction. Underpinning all demotivational issues within Aboriginal education is the development of a pedagogy that envisions outcomes through the lens of field dependence (low context), taking into account the findings of Ibarra (2001), about ways this can be achieved in reforming pedagogical approaches with creative, field-dependent (high context) content and matching high context teaching technology. Like spirituality, human poverty is part of the environment in Luhmann’s (1995) description of society. However, its place is found in the complex and negative elements of society, like racism. Poverty is especially complexifying, according to Luhmann (1995), because it can totally exclude people from
Human poverty, according to the UN Human Development Report (2000, 130), brings together, in one composite index, deprivation in four dimensions of human life. These are, a long and healthy life, knowledge, economic provisioning and social inclusion. The evidence of poverty in world-wide Australian cultures is overwhelming. In Aboriginal Australia, whilst there are the beginnings of an Aboriginal middle class, the Aboriginal population is conspicuously ranked at the lowest level. In Hunter's (1999, 12) assessment: “The metaphor that Australia contains three ‘Nations’, the rich, the poor non-Aboriginal Australians and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians is easily justified. Aboriginal people’s living standards are both qualitatively and quantitatively different to that of other poor and rich Australians”. Furthermore, the Australian Senate (2004, 301) reported that: “Aboriginal Australians remain the most disadvantaged and marginalized group in Australia. On all the standard indicators of poverty and disadvantage, Aboriginal people emerge as the most socially and economically deprived”.

The social impediments of poverty include lack of information, social recognition, education, health care, income and political power. As Nancy Krieger (2002), a Harvard epidemiologist, describes it, poverty always has a social context, which may express itself in human biology as “social epidemiology”, or what fellow epidemiologists, Marmot & Wilkinson (2006, 25) and others term a “social gradient”, for example, the lower the social class, the lower the life expectancy. Paul Jargowsky (1997) found that Native American poverty in USA is also the worst of all minorities.

Krieger (2002) points out that, within individual lifetimes, there occur insults to the
individual at sensitive or critical stages of development, which have lasting or lifelong significance. For Aboriginal Australians, these may be both physical, such as the adverse effects of poor dietary regimes, such as the junk food that led to participant Frank’s collapse, or psychological, such as social exclusion. Michaels (2007) argues that, whilst Americans celebrate the diversity of their multi-culture, the nation’s social and economic divide is being inexorably attenuated. In effect, as the rich increase in number and personal fortunes, more poor citizens fall below the poverty line. Stressful social circumstances associated with poverty can affect adults, in the view of Fink (2000, 218). In the process, family dynamics change in extreme ways, leading to abuse and neglect of children. Fink adds that there is suggestive evidence that such abuse may be associated with mental problems when these children become adults. The research of Michaels (2007), Krieger (2002), Marmot & Wilkinson (2004) and Fink (2000) is by no means aimed exclusively at Aboriginal peoples. Their findings apply to all groups that fall into the lowest socio-economic category. Historical coincidences of neglect and misunderstanding have relegated Aboriginal minorities to a position, which at present appears to be last place as a permanent condition. Understanding the deeper reasons for this neglect remains contested, but Pearson et al. (2009,15) have observed that in education, there is a systemic chain of events that now describe a cycle of despair:

The education achievement gap is a history of failure that has defied reform attempts for three decades now. There is a predictable cycle of public revelation and consternation about failure followed by a new policy review, a new policy framework and a new commitment. This Ground-hog Day seems to occur every three to five years (2009, 15).

For Aboriginal Australians, the situation is worse than for Native Americans in prospect, as Australians alone are positioned a distant last in Australian poverty rankings. Moreover, a trend of greater riches for the rich and greater poverty for the poor has been confirmed for
the Australian condition by the socio-economic research of Eckersley (2004, 117), Saunders (2005, 128), and Gregory (1999, 115). Peel (2003, 172-173) attributes the trend, in part, to media preference for exposure of welfare fraud, concealing its rarity, and demonizing the jobless. Collectively, these researchers capture an Australian overview of a poverty cycle of despair similar to Pearson's (2009) for Aboriginal Australians. That is, a surfeit of good statistics, plus good intentions, but an absence of tangible improvement.

This tendency of greater proportions of the student population moving into poverty predestines social programs such as No Child Left Behind in America and Practical Reconciliation in Australia to shortfall and unmet objectives. The mythical hand-up of the powerful to the powerless cannot be realised unless the helping hands reach into all components of poverty: employment and income, health, infrastructure, investment dollars, and educating the non-Aboriginal majority about the totality of Aboriginal identity and other bi-cultural realities. However, the vital need to improve educational achievement cannot happen without a concurrent and unrelenting effort to relieve the negative impacts of poverty.

The psychological effects of poverty are experienced as diminutions of choice and capacity to initiate. The inability to control one's life, despite persistent effort, can precipitate severe stress. Unrelieved, this can lead to depression. In Fink's (2000) Encyclopaedia of Stress, the consequences of poverty-caused stress make grim reading. "Parental poverty starts a chain of social risk . . . Poor social and economic circumstances present the greatest threat to a child's growth and launch the child on a low social and educational trajectory" (2000, 318).

The effects of poverty and its concomitant social and economic exclusions mean that management and other education cannot progress without the holism of addressing all
positive and negative influences concurrently.

2.4 The inter-relationship of Australian and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander cultures in management education

The modern usage of culture as a synonym for society began about the time of the arrival of the First Fleet in 1788 (Luhmann & Rasch, 2002, 89). The early equality of treatment and inter-cultural respect did not survive Arthur Phillip's Government of the colony, with the first use of the force of arms in an act of reprisal. These early events presaged a gradual ascendancy of British culture, succeeded by its Australian counterpart, and the relegation of Aboriginal culture to the status of sub-culture.

In its entity as a sub-system within the main system of Australian society, the culture could be described in the same way as any modern society finding meaning in an increasingly complex world. In Luhmann's terms, this involves simplifying the complexity in terms of functions, of which the legal system, the educational system, the political system, and the health system are possibly the most relevant to society. Within the educational system, its management educational sub-system is at issue in this research. One of the tasks for Aboriginal management education will be to ensure its healthy growth and survivability, by keeping its positive profile in the mass media, and not being "dealt out" by a forgetful public (Pearson, Denigan and Gotesson, 2009).

Nakata (2007, 8) considers the concept of Aboriginal culture as a term abused historically by some Australian educators, in their glib explanations for perceptions of failure of Australians to advance in the majority education system. The rationalization of
culture as problematic substitutes inadequately for pedagogical investigation of student difficulty. If Argyris’ double-loop reflection were applied, it would probably expose an Aboriginal perception of the irrelevance of teaching styles of a majority culture in a self-privileged and patronising mode.

To the extent that they do not use Aboriginal cultural signage, language, customs, traditions, and credible Aboriginal management styles, it could be argued that Western cultures are regarded by Aboriginal Australians as lacking relevance. It is not simply that majority Australians tend to materialism and may prefer things to people, but that there is also an Aboriginal need to respect both, and to prefer a connection amongst all elements, including places and spirits. In the Aboriginal world-view, nothing is really inanimate, and all elements are in a state of continuous relationship.

Chapman et al. (1991, 335) explain that Aboriginal symbolic content illustrates that Aboriginal organizations act very differently to the majority of organizations in Canada, as they integrate practices and traditions into their functioning to produce a collective organizational culture, that is profoundly affected by relations between people. Both Aboriginal Canadians and Aboriginal Australians share the impression that collectivism is the popular opposite of individualism, and that the social contract implicit in collectivism is that some of the rights of the individual are sacrificed for the support of the group, whose members share generously if the obligations of group membership are observed. In the view of Chapman et al. (1991), the Medicine Wheel at Figure 13, is an Aboriginal symbol of organizational holism and interconnectedness of a collectivist society, with its sharing and sense of obligation to the clan.
Consensus is positioned prominently in Chapman's (1991) findings regarding North American Aboriginal culture. This raises the importance of Sutton's (2009, 17) conclusion, that the “emergent consensus of the early 1970s has now come undone, and many of its hopes remain unrealised”. Cultures that hold consensus in high esteem in their own social management are likely to value continuity of consensus between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal societies. Mayes (2005, 89) regards individualism and collectivism as a dynamic duality in motivational and learning systems. Mayes' conclusion is that, through the synergy of the individual and the collective, we can make each other concurrently more human and more divine. Mayes believes that the resulting energy of Jung's (1993, 156) “higher third”, could be engaged with other collectives, like governments and corporates. Whilst they are not mentioned specifically by Mayes, it would not be unreasonable to add education and management to his list of affected collectives.
2.4.1 Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities as collectivist / communitarian

It is evident that groups and individuals have many values and motivations similar to those of citizens within the broader Australian society, such as holism and desire for respect. Arising from this observation is the possibility that there may be Western philosophies or social movements that have affinities with Aboriginal philosophies. Health professionals, Mooney and Houston (2008, 4) declare that "the essence of (Australian) Aboriginal society is communitarian". In the authors' view, this categorization is appropriate, particularly for Aboriginal Australian and Scandinavian cultures. The ground on which Mooney and Houston's theory is based is the belief that communitarianism acknowledges and values the bonds that unite communities, and further, that communitarianism includes the notion that community has intrinsic value. The authors also acknowledge that Aboriginal Australians have been repeatedly betrayed or disappointed, not just as persons, but as a people.

Mooney and Houston (2008) propose initiatives to raise the level of institutional trust between skeptical Aboriginal clients and Australian health agencies. However, elevating trust carries the unholistic impediment of high-profiling one Western essence or value above all others. The level of trust in Australian corporations is considered poor by Littler and Dawkins (2001). If trust were to be established, it would need to be firstly channelled via Aboriginal health professionals, and rebuilt from the bottom up by actions rather than by the elevation of Western values. Raising the level of trust of citizens towards Western government and non-government agencies is likely to be less difficult to visualize in
majority Australia than within its constituent Aboriginal communities. A philosophy arising from competitive Western field-independent (low context) ideas, characterized by the fairly recent emergence of communitarian ideology from perceived social deficits within American culture, may not be easily translatable into an Aboriginal initiative, as cognitive dissonance may render the exercise irrelevant, in the same way as some Aboriginal students perceive Western education as irrelevant (Partington, 1997, 2002, 2005).

The difficulty of translating Western ideologies credibly to Aboriginal societies is exposed in Waltzer's (1990) essay critiquing liberalism from a communitarian perspective. Whilst both liberalism and communitarianism emphasize toleration and equality, they do so from a focus on the rights of the individual to be free from the coercive forces of elites. In their human-centredness and intellectualizing of values and essences, they are markedly dissimilar in beliefs from Aboriginal societies, which subordinate humankind to natural and spiritual environments. In Aboriginal societies human survival and success demand co-operation first, and elegant ideals and concepts rank low or as unimportant.

2.4.2 Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander cultural values

In his essay Radical Hope, Noel Pearson (2009, 75) flags dualities as important to the world-views of both Aboriginal Australian and non-Aboriginal peoples. In his words, dualities "in philosophy, politics and economics are ubiquitous across societies and cultures: from the Ying-Yang of ancient Chinese tradition to the dhuwa-yirritja moieties of the Yolngu of East Arnhem Land, and the wandaar-ngurraar moieties of the Guugu Yimithirr of south-eastern Cape York Peninsula". Pearson poses questions about the sources, dialectics and bifurcation of Aboriginal and other dualities, and makes it clear that
answers are needed. The literature of this research suggests that the answers may be found at the motivational level. There is a dialectical element, as Pearson has observed, and it is dialectical energy that is released when non-discrete opposites interact. Another of Pearson’s explanations, the possibility of a spiritual element, appears to be accurate, particularly in the interaction of spirituality and temporality. His other hypothesis, that the natural is involved, also seems valid, and would be supported by Fuller & Dil (1983), Capra (1983a-b;1996), Wheatley (1992) and Edmondson (2007). Whilst Pearson (2009) does not raise the issues regarding Descartes’ (2008) discrete dualities and their negative impacts, as previously discussed, he is clearly signposting dualities as an important field of future research.

However, if it is accepted that the foremost role of dualities is in motivations, it is important to examine the reasons for their ubiquity in all cultures, and to consider that dualities have their own overlay of authenticity. It is proposed in Figure 14 that the Western examples are unauthentic, and that the Aboriginal example is authentic, in the sense that it contains the holistic and systemic features set for non-discrete dualities by Waters (2004), Luhmann (1995), D'Iribarne (2009) and others.
Now embodied in the French Constitution, liberty, equality and fraternity have a history of dispute over the relative importance of each of the three ideas, and whether they can credibly be associated as a unified trilogy. Equality is closer in meaning to fraternity than either is to liberty, which implies individual freedom. To the field-dependent (high context) person, these terms are, like justice, highly conceptual and difficult to attain in the real world. The field-dependent alternative would be to re-visit D'Iribarne's (2009) more moderate suggestion for the French worker, the duality of assertiveness and acquiescence, which though oppositional, can provide a national identity with which the worker can maintain a sense of self and satisfaction.

Source: Edrawsoft.com
Similar levels of incompatibility can be found in the Christian trilogy of faith, hope and charity, with faith / hope being alike and jointly aspirational. Charity is distinctly relational, and a social virtue. Faith / hope, taken together, are oppositional to despair. Charity, which is regarded in the Bible as a superior virtue to either faith or hope, is oppositional to meanness. In pedagogical terms, teaching charity cannot be really effective without teaching meanness. Nor can any Western concept be fully understood, without considering its opposite.

An example of an Aboriginal response to the familiar trilogy of Father, Son and Holy Spirit can be found in the Aboriginal painting at Figure 15. In the Christian original, Father and Son, closely related in human form and gender specific, contrast strongly with the spiritual form represented by a dove. The depiction is gender neutral, and connects the God archetype markedly with humankind. However, the Holy Spirit is totally contained within the earth, which dominates the sky. As a pedagogical guide, Figure 15 raises again the issue of perceived relevance, and the advisability of re-conceptualizing from the bottom up, if the difficulties of teaching science confronted by McClisky and Day (2004) are to be avoided, by employing triangular conceptualizations such as those of Kawagley (Figure 20, p.169) or Arabena (Figure 21, p.170). If metaphor makes meaning, as Morgan (2006, pp.417-418) maintains, the image at Figure 15 projects a very different meaning of God, in the form of a totally re-constructed deity, whose nearness to earth and humankind, contained within the triangular symmetry of the familiar and natural mountain top, is not simply a change, but an epiphany.
To the extent that Aboriginal management research utilizes traditional Western methodology, the Australian management academy may experience the same difficulty as science and technology, in the teaching Aboriginal students. This is illustrated by the University of Sydney's McClisky and Day (2004), in the researchers' words about their students:

Over half our interviewees perceive Science and Technology as irrelevant, ... it is not seen to be useful, not visible and not interesting, ... it does not seem to explain or address the problems facing the Aboriginal community, and because it is perceived to be something white people do, inside white institutions, sometimes even with black people as their subjects (2004, 26).

### 2.4.3 Using semiotics as an educational bridge to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander culture

Many Australian bands use sophisticated sign languages, which have been
well documented (Wright, 1980). These utilize hand movements to form messages symbolically by gesture and mime. However, as sign languages differ from band to band, only those para-tribal symbols painted in the form of artwork on rocks, caves and portable objects will be considered. Male rites, according to Elkin (1964), involved the revelation of secret and sacred symbols to males undergoing rites of passage to adulthood. The meanings of these symbols, and their role in cultural cohesion, are important in explaining the ontology of Australians, in the same way as Western fine arts and humanistic disciplines serve to mediate educational ideas within broader Aboriginal Australia. Together with spoken words, and more recently phonetically recorded scripts of remaining Aboriginal languages, symbolic ways of communicating educational concepts need to be examined in respect of their place in Aboriginal management education.

The wide success of Thomas' Aboriginal flag as symbol (Figure 12, p.98), in contrast to other international examples, introduces semiotics, the study of signs and their necessary features (Houser & Klosel 1992). This field is growing in educational value, especially in the field of languages, but now influencing other disciplines, including management (Jackson & Carter, 2007). The illustration at Figure 16 is a an enhanced version of semiotics originator, Peirce's original diagram, with the concept of sign, at the top of the drawing, represented as an iteration of the whole process of semiosis. This captures the emphasis in Aboriginal Australian education offered by Martin (2003, 2008a) as reflexive, or in Argyris' choice of term, "double-loop" (2008, 3). Peirce (in Hoopes, 1991,12) describes thought processes as relational, and human life as a duality of freedom and constraint. In Hoopes' view, Peirce was securely anchored to the natural world. These are co-incidentally features of holism, and consistent with the world-view.
Figure 16 Modified Peirce Trilogy

Source: James Hoopes, 1991

Trilogy and reflexivity are common to both semiotics and ontology. However, semiotics trilogies represent differently to trilogies discussed previously in this research. Furthermore, they do not offer a holistic system of motivation. In semiotics, the self is a product of social relations generated from the tension between becoming part of the other human, and ensuring separateness from all other selves (Jackson and Carter, 2007, 187). Our inability to become the other is said to leave a lack, which we strive to redress. Attempts to fill the lack constitute motivation. Whilst Jackson and Carter admit the role of the unconscious, their concept of motivation is not anchored to neuroscience, and relies on the interaction of signs and related constructs. However, the tension of opposites in the semiotic system offers further support to Waters' (2004) explanations of the dynamics of non-discrete opposites.

Like Luhmann, Jackson and Carter (2007, 270) also provide a challenging post-structuralist critique of Western management education. For example, they regard decision making by managers as cloaked in the uncertainty identified by Luhmann (2000c). They
maintain that each significant decision is itself a product of infinite numbers of prior and minor decisions, some of which may be irrational. Furthermore, Seidl and Becker (2005b, 39) take a further step in unifying this process, stating "It is not that decisions are first made and then communicated; decisions are communications". It is assumed, say Jackson and Carter (2007, 35), that managers can define a satisfying job, but in the real world of management, satisfaction can only be experienced by the performer of the job. Communications, meanings and techniques of management are portrayed as hostage to language and symbolic practices. Semiotic approaches to Aboriginal management education offer another example of a critical theory, which gains momentum as modern sciences struggle with the exponential growth of knowledge, and concurrently self-knowledge of its own fallibilities, and their implications for global business.

For Aboriginal management education, which needs to develop a culture-friendly research base, the affinity shown by Peirce and the semiotic structural support to organizational behaviour offered by Jackson and Carter, add substantially to the contributions of Luhmann, Fuller, Brin and Page, discussed in previous paragraphs. For Williams (2007, 3), spirituality sets a direction towards an Aboriginal management praxis that accesses spiritual themes and entities. Whilst spirituality is central to all Aboriginal life, including education, balance and harmony can be compromised by the reductionist separation of values from place, past from present, or by the separation of identity from country.

### 2.4.4 Implications of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander cultural characteristics

**Identified by Chapman, Bryant, Sveiby and Skuthorpe**

Utilising structured interviews of managers in the Ontario region, Chapman et al. (1991)
identified five features of Aboriginal management and North American Aboriginal management schemes as group orientation, consensus, group duties, holistic employee development and elder involvement. Bryant's (1996, 14 and 2004, 216-227) study of a mixed group of Native Americans from six Great Plains tribes, six leadership styles were identified. These were: decentralization, immanent value of all things, non-interference, self-deflecting image projection, time, and collectivist decision making. Sveiby & Skuthorpe observed that leadership had invisibilized leadership styles, and consequently had invisibilized power, leading to perceptions of settlers that Aboriginals exhibited a knowledge deficit regarding authority and organization (Sveiby & Skuthorpe, 2006). Sveiby and Skuthorpe's works, however, explain that the vehicle for clear advice on how to manage is in the 'storying' of each band. From the Nhunggabarra story of the Black Swan, Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2011) gleaned twelve principles of Aboriginal leadership, paraphrased as follows:

1. Always place the needs of your people above your own need for power (service above self).
2. Never use fear to gain power.
3. Never use superior knowledge to gain power - always persuade people by educating them.
4. Do not manipulate the ignorant and the vulnerable - conversely, never follow a leader blindly.
5. Reveal the true purpose of your plan or objective.
6. Manage risks by considering the consequences of your actions on all involved.
7. Do not blame others when things go wrong.
8. Take responsibility for your mistakes.
9. Never desert your team when things go wrong.
10. Do not assume power, or make decisions, that could lead to dire consequences, and break the law.

11. Learn from your mistakes.

12. Act for the common good, at the right time - do not procrastinate.

(Sveiby & Skuthorpe, 2011, 389-390).

Although there were no contradictions of Chapman et al. findings in Bryant's or Sveiby & Skuthorpe's research, Bryant added time, and extended the detail of some important management style characteristics. Sveiby & Skuthorpe stressed openness and accountability. The relevant studies of these three researchers can be summarized into two broad divisions of group characteristics and personal and organizational implications.

2.4.4.1 Group characteristics found in the studies of Bryant, Chapman, Sveiby and Skuthorpe

Sharing possessions is an important part of the formation of the communal element of group identity for Aboriginal Australians. A shared sense of place has a special function in delineating the self of the clan within a broader Aboriginal identity. “Woundings” of place may occur in thoughtless activities undertaken in mining and development, disturbing group cohesion. A group orientation is shared by communitarians and many non-European leaders, including Mandela and Gandhi. Service to the group is a preference of many influential leaders of modern thought, such as Drucker (2002), Deming (1986), Greenleaf (1977) and Senge (1990), and all who value “non-charismatic” style.

As the recent “history wars” (Reynolds, 1982; Clendinnen, 2005) have demonstrated, the narrative of aboriginality in Australia has exposed tensions and polarities within the
broader community (Windschuttle, 2009; Manne, 2001). The Apology to the Stolen Generation has been symbolic of the shift towards a more sympathetic treatment of the issue. Put simply, members of consensually orientated cultures suffer more from perceived social exclusion.

Without a consensus dynamic, Canadian research finds that Aboriginal progress will be compromised. Aboriginal narratives have told much about the experience of loss. Lives, places, power, respect, kinship and many other issues of loss, are still close to the surface, and part of narrative of self. Despite the misgivings of Folds (2001) and the magnitude of the problem emphasized by Sutton (2009), the future will depend on a consensus formed jointly with the other Australia. It must include a sense of re-balancing the loss, and ensuring that the momentum of reconciliation with the whole of Australian society continues.

Multi-tasking has been the traditional Aboriginal way. The reductionist specialization of the 20th century production line is inconsistent with the inclinations of the Aboriginal worker. Team work and group processes are preferred strongly over working in isolation. Delegation has been widely practised. It is coincidental, but encouraging, that some mainstream Western management theorists, such as Wheatley (2005) Senge (1990), Greenleaf (1977), Palumbo-Liu (1999), have recognized some of the benefits of practices in the field of group working.

Holism in Aboriginal culture means that all of a society’s members are included and respected. It would not be accurate to equate the notion of elder in an Aboriginal society with the “senior citizen” of the Western world, as life experiences and perceptions are so
different. Nor would it be true that no Western senior has the status of the wise man or
woman in a community. However, there is a Western sense in which advancing age alone
diminishes chances of respected contribution to the community. This is a loss to the
broader Australian society in economic terms, and individual self-realisations of the
underutilized. Additionally, it is one of many comparisons with Aboriginal world-view from
which Western management education may benefit.

Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996, 2004) and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2009) are
complementary in their findings and are supported in much of the work of Hofstede (1997,
1999, 2001), Argyris (2008), and D'Iribarne (2009). Sveiby and Skuthorpe's seventh
leadership rule (2011, 389-390) about not blaming others is identical to Argyris' main
censure against blaming subordinates. In D'Iribarne's terms, Australian culture should be
perceived as a national culture, negotiating its way within another national culture, that of
broader Australia. Nevertheless, culture is remarkably less pluralist than its majority
alternative. To use Niezen's (2003, 4) coinage, Aboriginal culture is indigenist. That is, it is
part of the international movement that aspires to promote and respect the rights of the
world's Aboriginal nations, with which it shares many features, principally holism and
collectivism. For Hofstede and D'Iribarne, however, Australian culture may be
categorized particularly by Hofstede's notion of "long-termism" (Hofstede, 1997, 2001).

2.4.4.2 Personal and organizational implications of the works of Bryant, Chapman, Sveiby
and Skuthorpe

Bryant (1996, 15) points out that Western management's use of a centralist model dates
as early as the Bible story of Moses and Jethro organizing followers in groups of tens,
hundreds and thousands, with Moses as the one source of decision-making power. In contrast, the Aboriginal members of a working group self-assign to tasks according to best fit of skills. All are self-assigned and none is regarded as more or less important. Work discussions continue until all are in agreement. There is no expectation that one member of a group will be dressed or behave conspicuously to distinguish leadership, nor to project a superior demeanour. Decision-making groups form in circles (Figures 7, p.60 and 28, p.227), apparently to equalize individuals and to project unity. Bryant's natural world metaphor of the Native American working group is the triangular flock of geese, flying as a unit and changing leaders fluidly. Whilst not linking the flock and the Aboriginal groupings as similarly natural, Bryant is clearly describing Aboriginal organizational preference as favouring the collective, decentralized and self-organizing.

In the context of Bryant's (1996) study, immanent refers to an Aboriginal spiritual belief that all things in nature have spiritual value and that the spirit or value is inherent in every person, animal, plant or rock. There is also a sense of mutual belonging, whereby every item in nature plays a part in the lives and spirits of all other entities, and that all items are of equal status and importance. The philosophy of immanent value, in Bryant's view (1996, 16) is captured by the Lakota expression “mitakuye oyas’i’n” (“for all my relatives”). It includes all things known and unknown and every place. A Native American leader, according to Bryant's understanding, is not recruited or self-appointed, but grows into the role, has a knowledge of how things work, and possesses the wisdom of a student forever, whose development occurs over the whole life cycle. Learning is voluntary, and by virtue of your own learning, others learn.

One of the recurring observations of Bryant's (1996; 2004) research is that a fundamental
difference between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal education is in the area of responsibility for others. In the West “the buck stops here” implies hierarchy and accountability for the performance of subordinates. In turn, the manager or teacher is charged with the responsibility of delivering knowledge to the subordinate or student. Staff development, in this sense, means that the acquisition of management training and skills happens, to some extent, coercively. This was an area of some tension in Bryant's study. A Dakota woman explained to the research team that Native Americans believed in what she termed “non-interference”. In practice this meant for her that even though a teacher may believe that a particular student worker needs staff development, no action would be taken without the permission of the worker needing help. The Dakota leader would not assume responsibility for others in the Western sense. Bryant (1996, 20) finds a solution in Hofstede's first (1980) edition of Culture’s Consequences that the members of collectivist cultures control others, not through internal pressure, but through external societal constraints or norms. Bryant concluded that “pressure to conform and to change in acceptable ways comes not from an individual, but from the culture around the individual” (1996, 21). He further notes that this finding has strong implications for Aboriginal organizational cultures.

The feature of management style to disown credit for achievement is a painstaking and reflexive denial of leadership contribution. In its denial, it deflects credit to all other group members, in order to maximize the worth of their donation of effort. Not only does the habitual self-deflection maximize the worth of others, it is sometimes used to maximize the worth of all things. Bryant (1996, 22) reports an incident in which a rain dancer denied the worth of his dance, pointing instead to a nearby tree as the more deserving recipient of the admirer's praise. No member of the six tribal groups would countenance speaking for any other group member on matters of leadership. This posed a problem for the researchers.
who observed that speaking for others is at the heart of qualitative research, and this exposes a contradiction in the act of researching or even writing up the research.

The contribution of a tribal member is always judged on the basis of the cycle of whole of life-time. As Bryant (1996, 15) expresses it: “Each person's role is important to the whole. No other person can make the exact same contribution. The total contribution is an organic whole that can only be understood over life cycles”. This attitude underlines the well-known distinction between preference for “deep connection with the present” observed by Bryant (1996, 23), in contrast to the concentration by Western management on planning for the future and accounting for time. Drucker (2001) puts this emphatically, deriding managers who argue that staff “have to finish what they are doing now, before I can put them to work tomorrow – this manager simply admits that he or she does not have a plan” (2001, 123).

For the Native American, Bryant points out that many activities are determined by the environment, for example, eating food soon after hunting and killing, to avoid spoilage, and observing rituals seasonally. However, there was no sense of using one’s hours efficiently to make the most of them (1996, 23). It is not difficult to connect these differences in the effects of time consciousness on management styles to world-view formations in nomadic societies, and to the life-style contrast with sedentary farming communities. However, contemporary international practices in food security reduce the opportunities for Aboriginal societies to live hunter-gatherer life styles, without the safety net of assured food supply. As a consequence, Western management planning practices seem destined to become the preferred model.
2.4.4.3 Significance of the studies of Bryant, Chapman, Sveiby and Skuthorpe

The Native American participants in Bryant's (1996) study were committed to the practice of talking out each management task until there was unanimous agreement to a course of action. Similarly, time could be “lost” in the Western sense by waiting until all in a group were ready to move on. Nevertheless, these customs honour equality and individual worth, but are difficult to associate with Western management practice, in which “billable hours” still underpin work reporting systems in many firms. Such discrepancies between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal management styles, point the direction towards a middle-way, a search for management style that satisfies both Aboriginal and Western essentials. Just as the common elements comprising the positive side of Aboriginal management style can be clearly reported, as illustrated in Bryant's work, some major pitfalls arise from the impacts of Western prejudice about minorities, including those of Aboriginal nations, and these have been covered well in Nisbett's Geography of Thought (2004).

The findings of Chapman et al. (1991) and Bryant (1996; 2004), and Sveiby & Skuthorpe's (2009; 2011) raise many developmental advantages for Aboriginal management practices. Bryant found that six principles of management were well understood by all participants in the study. In other words, this Native American cohort had internalized all of the constructs of leadership and management identified by Bryant's team. Given the absence of Western management theories and idiom within the cohort, it could be argued that the need for management education had been satisfied simply by working together in groups. Secondly, the importance of personal contributions made to management tasks by Bryant's participants did not present as group uniformity extinguishing individual self-esteem, but elevating it.
If Australian culture were to be imagined without its Aboriginal constituency, it could be perceived as already contaminated by dispute, with the word culture itself being used to privilege some, and to distinguish themselves from those regarded as uncultured. Whilst still multi-cultural in espoused theory, the majority Australian high culture tends to relegate the cultures of its migrant minorities as ethnographic, and seems indifferent to the unique position of Aboriginal culture. Of Aboriginal culture, about which lack of knowledge is equally as problematic as lack of respect, Evelyn Scott's (1998) advice has special relevance: “The cause of reconciliation would be done fearful damage if it was ever to be seen as just another multicultural issue”.

In this chapter, Aboriginal culture has been presented as communal, but not communitarian, dialectical but not without a strong spirituality. Access to its cognition and learning processes can be gained through understanding holistic trilogies, which form non-discrete dualities, to use Waters' (2004) words. Houser & Klosel (The Essential Peirce, 1992) regard Peirce's semiotics as having the familiar form of Waters' trilogies, which is consistent with Argyris' and Senge's (1990) systems of learning. Some of the losses inherent in the absence of Aboriginal script may be redressed by Aboriginal semiotics as a management educational tool, in the same way as Christie (2009) has utilized the internet as a pedagogical approach to Aboriginal learning, and Hodge (2009) has used semiotics in the Aboriginal exposition at the Australian Museum.

A fundamental proposition espoused by Luhmann in Reality of the Mass Media (2000b, 86). is that experiences become culture by being offered as the signs of culture. In other words, to the student, unless management education is offered in a way that looks
like Aboriginal culture, it will collide with experience, look and feel uncultured, and therefore irrelevant. In this research, culture is viewed as both contested zone and opportunity for conciliation. However, the vantage point from which to observe and resolve the conflicts may be upon the common ground of the relatively culture-free zones of neuroscience, motivation and systems theory.

2.5 Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management styles.

Style gives shape, order and meaning to beliefs formed by enculturation. Humankind is encultured when motivations are filtered by field dependence (context) into two broad lifestyles: Western (individualist) and Asian (collectivist). Related subsets of these two styles of life are proportionately differentiated styles of management. The concern of this research is with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander managers, whose management styles are influenced more by Asian or collectivist cultures, characterized by high context / field-dependence. Management styles are observable by perceptions of preferred behaviour, via sight, sound and communication. They may include the expression of preferences for places, built or natural environments, responses to art or signage. Architectural styles and styles of management are necessarily inter-related. Just as management style can be triangulated as a tension between collective and individualistic pressures producing the “higher third” of “management style”, domal structures like gunyah (a combination of circle and triangle) and igloo are more naturally robust (Fuller & Dill, 1983). The gunyah and tipi, whose bases are circular, the shape for Aboriginal circle management, avoid the unnatural right angle of the domal and commercial monoliths of most Western influenced cities, offering soft targets for defence. Language use too is built into styles, with accent, tone, sense of humour, and use of silences for forbearance,
Describing all management styles as natural, Bouée (2010, 148) is offering a different approach, that when a manager's style is natural, it feels natural to use. However, Bouée, like McGilchrist (2010), views management historically, and finds that styles have changed considerably and are constantly changing, as exemplified by the returning Harvard MBA to China, who gradually sloughs off Western management styles until comfortable with what feels right in Chinese practice. However, as there will always be a residual tendency to draw down from the Harvard style knowledge bank, the correct term, according to Bouée, may be "naturalized".

The management styles described by Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996, 2004) and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2009) can be summarized as motivational groupings derived from consensus and holism. However, holism is, by definition, an inclusive concept that contains both group and consensual segments. When traditional Western management texts (Stoner et al. 1985, 1994), describe management (or leadership) styles, they generally fall into categories such as autocratic / paternalistic on the one hand and democratic / laissez-faire on the other. Or, in dualistic terms, autocratic or permissive. Stoner (1985, 576-577), for example, cites Tannenbaum and Schmidt's theories to explain leadership style in a gradient between boss-centred and subordinate-centred styles. However, at its most permissive, the scale still envisages "manager permits subordinates to operate within limits defined by superior" (1985, 577). In other words, Western leadership is essentially top-down, with authority underwritten by a tacit contractual obligation to obey. Aboriginal leadership works in the opposite direction with the group endowing authority on the criterion of expertise, an arrangement similar to Mintzberg's
(1981) adhocracy. This difference will translate to a profound degree into management style. In the West, the subordinate may be talked down to. In Aboriginal work groups, the expert will be looked up to. In addition, how management decisions are made in Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander society is neither well understood, nor well researched (Jones, 2002).

2.5.1 Importance of relevant Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander languages and hybrids and the need for English

The very existence of and continuing usage by Australian and Torres Strait Islander students of three languages, such as standard English, English and say, Arrende, prove that each language enables cultural concepts to be expressed efficiently. Language varieties all do what their speakers or writers make them do. Powerful groups always think their own language is better than others. Harkins (1994) advises that linguists should remind the arrogantly powerful that their view is incorrect. For the educator, the three tiers of English, Aboriginal English, and Aboriginal dialect, may enrich rather than confuse or deprive students. For management education, however, standard English needs special attention, simply because it is the language of the powerful and increasingly of the world of international business. However, all three language tiers can be seen as of equal prestige, making up a holistic system of natural complementarity.

Press coverage often presents the emergence of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander English as yet another difficulty for the broader Australian community. However, what is “a difficulty” for majority Australia, is often a catastrophe for the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander community. On the interrelated nature of language to other elements of Aboriginal
society and their vitality as a system, rather than as individual drivers, Aboriginal Australian, Max Box, explained:

Ceremony is the cradle to grave, a delivery place for education for people. If you do not have ceremony and you do not have language, then your kinship breaks down. Then law breaks down and the whole thing falls apart (Box, in Neumann, 2012).

Given the clarity of these comments, it is hard to understand the folly of previous positions taken by Australian Governments, in attempting to impose English as the first and only approach to Aboriginal language education. Even at international level, Australia’s initial vote was against the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Aboriginal Peoples (2007), which sought to guarantee Aboriginal rights, amongst other things, to use their own languages and names, in the following words:

Article 13
1. Aboriginal peoples have the right to revitalize, use, develop and transmit to future generations their histories, languages, oral traditions, philosophies, writing systems and literatures, and to designate and retain their own names for communities, places and persons.

The difficulty of advancing the interests of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians became clear the year after the Declaration was signed, when the Northern Territory Government ceased bi-lingual education in Territory schools. McConvell, Simpson, & Caffery (2009, 13) argue that Australian policy-makers are now choosing to ignore the positive features of school-based Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander language programs and return to a strict ‘English-only’ policy, reminiscent of the assimilationist era decades ago. Following the less superficial perceptions of Harkins and Kearins, it would be inadvisable for the management educator to hear pidgin as “broken English”. However, the threats to recognition of the educational and cultural value of Aboriginal language
preservation are more likely to be found within the traditional battle-zones of asymmetrical power, and prejudice.

Harkins' (1994) thoughtful advice on the usefulness and value of Aboriginal language usage is similar to Kearins' (2000) findings on different approaches between Aboriginal and other Australian child-rearing practices. Powerful groups think their language usage is better, and they also think their child rearing practices are better. Kearins locates the origin of the differences with Aboriginal child raising in survival mechanisms of a nomadic clan, contrasting them with survival mechanisms of a settled farming community. Farming required hierarchy, specialization and planning. Hunting and gathering required the skills of the all-rounder, working alone without verbal instruction, and the required egalitarianism produced a laissez-faire attitude to children.

O'Brien (2008) links language issues within the sphere of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander tertiary education in Australia to the wastage rates of Aboriginal students: “While the intake of Aboriginal students continues to rise, the completion rates are less successful” (2008, 59). Language is a unique marker of culture, as Evans (2009, 2010) has pointed out. For Aboriginal people it is a passport: “It tells you where you belong, where your roots are, and it enables you to travel and go to ceremonies … so, if you don't have your own distinctive song, your own distinctive languages, then you don't have anything to bring” (2009, 2). Evans adds that Aboriginal languages have “a name for every riffle in the creek” (2010, 112), and have given rise to tens of thousands of Aboriginal Australian place names. Clearly, this is evidence of the greater importance of place for Aboriginal Australians than for other Australians. Accordingly, place names form an important component of Aboriginal languages as a whole. In this regard, we are reminded
by Goddard (2011) that Australian Aboriginal languages share some characteristics with their Asian counterpart, modern Chinese. Two common features are that they are more intimately associated with the places in which they are spoken, and that they possess no specific word for language. Neither of these field-dependent (high context) cultures shares the majority Australian perspective that there is a concept of "a particular kind of people who occupy the land, on the one hand and who speak the language on the other" (Goddard, 2011, 44). In the context of management education therefore, Aboriginal language preservation issues draw in problems of translation that can lead to ideological errors of land "ownership", strength of attachment to place, and even the idea of language as a social reality.

Co-developer of the Sapir-Whorf Hypothesis, Edward Sapir (1921), stated that the real world is to a large extent unconsciously built upon the language habits of the group. No two languages are ever sufficiently similar to be considered as representing the same social reality. The worlds in which different societies live are distinct worlds, not merely the same worlds with different labels attached (Whorf, in Carroll, 1964). Nisbett's research testing Sapir-Whorf concluded that “English subserves a different way of representing the world than Chinese” (2004, 161), which raises the question of the additional challenges facing Aboriginal bi-lingual managers who often have the further complication of having to translate via Aboriginal English, as a third language, to be fully understood.

Harkins (1994, 71) found that “Aboriginal speakers use English forms in ways consistent with Aboriginal conceptual categories, but also adopt useful distinctions from the English system. This is far more complex than mere first language interference”. Harkins draws attention to the relative complexities of learning inhibitions confronting
speakers of a foreign language, typically Australian immigrants, whose training in English as a second language occurs with minimal learning inhibition arising from their original language. For the Aboriginal learner of English, however, there may be many forms of English to be learned. For example, formal English, school English, and various pidgin varieties, depending on clan origin of each parent.

Speaking context is further complicating. Harkins (1994) recounts the difficulty of video capture of an individual Aboriginal speaker in an English class. This is seen as a desirable learning experience in non-Aboriginal classes, but inhibiting to Aboriginal students, who speak confidently only when the video picture includes the speaker in a whole of class context. Moreover, the context has to be adjusted frequently, depending on the observed status of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander or Australian listeners. Harkins (1994) found that Western low context colonialist societies tend to over-value their own preferences, as 'right', and under-value Aboriginal ways as 'wrong', paraphrased by Foley (2003, 45) as 'rightness of whiteness'. It is quite likely that this prestiging of majority style means that majority Australians would also classify Aboriginal management style as wrong or inappropriate, unless the wider issues of motivation and its neural antecedents are known.

For field-dependent societies, silences also need to be understood in context. Harkins (1994) points out that silences are often those of polite and respectful assumptions by aboriginal speakers about prior knowledge of the listener, in contrast to the broader Australian context of assuming very little and making every statement verbal and explicit (1994, 138). She explains also that there are many varieties of English pidgins, depending on locality. For the educator, it should not be assumed, therefore, that there is a movement towards the option of a universal English, but rather towards local hybrids.
between English and particular Aboriginal languages. Despite her exposure of these
difficulties, Harkins' conclusions are not discouraging. She believes that, for education, no
language is better or worse than any other. For example, the pronoun systems for
languages are more comprehensive than for standard English. On the other hand,
standard English has a more comprehensive prepositional system.

Language and place are closely connected. They cluster alongside kin and clan in the
polarity of the collective. Juxtaposition with its opposite, individuality, forms the basic
Aboriginal duality, collectivism / individualism. And yet, even as the importance, and
perhaps urgency in cases of imminent Aboriginal language extinction, of non-Aboriginal
learning of native languages becomes clear, the learning environment for this appears to
be at an historically low point. McLaren's (2011) report for the Asian Studies Association of
Australia found that the study of Indonesian has dropped to a perilously low point in
Australian universities and that the modest gains of Chinese Departments depend on
overseas students, not Australian citizens. California and Arizona, both with large Native
American populations, have adopted an English only education policy, according to

Furthermore, in a world of converging technology and globalization, the cause of English
as a first or second language advances constantly. These trends, in Australia and North
America, illustrate the difficulty of assuring the future of any minority language, and a loss
of sight of the responsibility of ensuring the survival of native languages, in spite of the
exhortation of the United Nations Organization. For cultures with English as a first
language, the resulting prestige of English tends to overshadow equitable attention to all
other languages, including Aboriginal languages. For the management educator, this could
become an opportunity to begin to redress the balance by advocating both-ways learning of Aboriginal language by Western students as strongly as promoting quality business English for Aboriginal Australians.

Asian and Aboriginal managers are more likely to use holism fluently, as their values have been shaped by more holistic teachings. Consequently, the prestige of holism may be more fruitfully developed by Western students learning the ways of Aboriginal knowing, rather than vice versa, as students in dominant cultures are inclined to overlook their own minorities, whereas their minorities must learn the ways of the majority culture to survive within it. Any extinction of an Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander language has no less a negative impact on world cultural bounty than the extinction of native flora or fauna on the diversity of the biosphere. The works of Harkins and Kearins remind majority Australia that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander languages have equality in sophistication to the English language, and as a means of communication. The importance to the further development of bi-cultural appreciation and Australian management education points the way to the advisability of both Aboriginal and other Australians continuing to study, use and appreciate the languages of each side of the national culture.

Reducing Aboriginal perceptions of inappropriateness of language or pedagogical irrelevance needs to rest on a theoretical bulwark that vindicates Aboriginal management styles as consistent with best contemporary management practices world-wide. This means finding and utilizing theories and practices that are valid both-ways, without compromising the epistemological positions of either Aboriginal Australians or their majority counterparts. The theories also should extend the knowledge of each side about how the other side manages, and why differences in style are valid, and positioned
relatively on one or other side of the principal duality, Individualist / Collectivist, enabling non-Aboriginal staff working with Aboriginal colleagues to “know how to work with Koori people” (Baldry, Green and Thorpe, 2006, 368).

Additionally, theories need to be bi-culturally appropriate, depending on the management task offering. Consequently, this chapter presents a theoretical framework for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education, that is culturally acceptable both-ways, and can demonstrate, as Harkins (1994) and Kearins (2000) have done for Aboriginal languages, that existing Aboriginal knowledge is equally as robust and valid as its majority Australian counterpart.

2.5.2 Inter-relationship of space, shape, place and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander preference for the natural

In this section, literature will be reviewed that argues that Aboriginal management style is externalized through language, silence, preference for place, shape, and what is viewed as the Aboriginal natural. The term natural is presented as a boundary area between the perceptual styles of Aboriginal and other Australians. To the latter, the pejorative 
\textit{wilderness} or eulogism \textit{pristine} can be used to describe a place that for Aboriginal Australians may be an area of non-discrete description, in other words, in undifferentiated harmony with nature, but at the same time connected in broad thoroughfares of kinship, ancestral spirituality, or language.

In Fuller & Dil's (1983) architectural world-view, space has shape, and to explain the world as a meaningful whole, Fuller concluded that nature has only one department, one
comprehensive co-ordinating system. His former personal engineer and now a Professor of Management at Harvard University, Edmondson (2007), explains Fuller's position as one of belief that human thought processes can be malformed by education in mathematics as well as by culture, if our early mathematics training encourages us to isolate and consider parts separately, rather than as components of a larger system. Our habitual inclination throughout life would be to view problems myopically. Furthermore, we have been blinded to a whole family of natural order by a initial 90 degree wrong turn - itself a result of humanity's early perception of an upside-down platform, which humankind calls earth. (Edmondson, 2007, 178). Consequently, Fuller's legacy of the geodesic dome relies for its structural integrity on mainly natural angles and spaces, rather than the unnatural right-angle. His architectural world-view has evident implications for Aboriginal designs of dwellings and community architecture, as original Aboriginal dwelling designs were also without right-angles.

Viewed clockwise from the left in Figure 17, the Native American ti-pi is conical and triangular in silhouette, the igloo is close in shape to the geodesic dome, and the right-angular block of modern flats gainsays the multi-triangular Fuller house and domal gunyah of the Aboriginal Australian. Fuller emphatically rejects the "cigar box" shape of modern buildings, and prefers the domal Aboriginal style structures and the simpler more basic shape of the triangle as natural and stronger than right-angular alternatives.
A further aspect of the significance of place for Aboriginal societies has been identified as the need for knowledge of a sustainable way of partnership with the land, its flora and fauna, and passing on this knowledge to the next generation. Respect for land and all things required a reciprocal humility of humankind. Descriptions of land management did not include notions of ownership, in any personal sense of Aboriginal possession, but rather of “taking care of” (Notzke, 1994,149). Resource management had both empirical and supernatural features, with moral overtones, in the requirement of spiritual balance between humans and all others (Notzke, 1994,151). Good human relationships were important for ensuring this spiritual balance and the co-operation of neighbours in land
care. Moral responsibility extended to obligations to defend land and sea under care. Personal styles arising from these antecedents suggest humble, systematic, spiritual, co-operative, responsible character traits, together with care and diligence in the avoidance of overuse of resources, and a respect for nature.

The Aboriginal "natural" is conceived in the widest sense of inter-connectedness with all things, animate and inanimate, spaces as well as places. The tendency to reductionism can be seen as "natural" for the Westerner, and the tendency to holism can be seen as "natural" for Aboriginal peoples. Because it is the same for both Aboriginal and Australian majority cultures, the motivation may be comprehended by both groups as common ground, and may help acculturate a broader and more complete picture of the way Australians manage. Further, it could re-frame the antecedents of culture, identifying the constructs of motivation and neuroscience as its causal drivers. Fuller's (1983) explorations of synergy offer parallel findings from the natural sciences, using examples of natural base metals, producing a stronger third alloy, similar to the superior level of knowledge exemplified in the Ganma metaphor. Manduwuy Yunupingu (1994) explains synergy in terms of the musical offerings of Aboriginal band, Yothu Yindi, as a fusion of lyrics and technology that produces something new and different, suggesting that ideas like "higher third" and "synergy" also inhabit Aboriginal theories in other semantic forms.

Collectivist traits include a greater value ascribed by the manager to every contributor to the working group, in which expertise is respected and personal power restrained. For the manager, greater naturalness could be associated with flatter organization profiles than with the hierarchical or pyramidal. Consequently, in Hofstede's (1999) terminology, a lower power-distance would seem more natural. On other dualities of Hofstede, natural
Aboriginal management style would correlate with lower individualism, and lower uncertainty avoidance. There are also the style features of exceptional respect for the spiritual and comfort with the symbolic, both of which feature in the nature of Aboriginal management style characteristics. These will be amplified in following paragraphs.

2.5.3 Relationships of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander style, connectedness, values and identity

With the benefit of the diverse sources examined in reviewing the literature, it could be expected that many other characteristics of management style can be described by inference. Given the influences of field dependence, and as illustrated by the overlapping of concepts in Figure 11 (p.90), there would be a tendency to understand Aboriginal management concepts as inter-connected, in parallel with Wassman's (1991, 64) verbal fusion for tribe as socioterritorial entity. Furthermore, the lack of need for logical opposites would suggest comfort with uncertainty, which translates as a positive disposition in contemporary commerce, especially in the context of Asian business partnerships. Utilising a world-view that does not discriminate space from object, implies a unifying whole, in which every object is inter-connected and inter-dependent, ensuring consideration of the welfare, caring for and prudent use of resources of all types, human or otherwise, living or inert. In other words, an alliance with the natural and the sustainable.

Values form an esteemed grouping of motivational preferences pursued by nations, corporates and individuals as distinctive drivers of behaviour. The national trilogy of France: liberty, equality and fraternity, has proved to be a robust, if problematic, national identity. Similarly, the qualities implicit in the dominant Australian identifier, mateship, continue to be debated. Corporates hold many espoused values in common throughout
the global marketplace. A typical value set is said to guide the Bank of China (2011), namely: social responsibility, performance, integrity, respect, innovation and teamwork. However, the issues for Aboriginal management education, in its search for its own identity and hence, its unique values, need a critical approach. To list values is to embrace a mainly Western bias towards concepts, and to invite the question as to whether such values are espoused ideals as distinct from practised ideals.

Arising from the work of Hofstede (1999) and D'Iribarne (2009) in particular, is a recognition of the need to maintain common-sense, and to look further than empirical studies, which sometimes do not distinguish between espoused national determinants and those in use in the workplace. Hofstede's cultural dynamics are driven by values, but they need to be realised in actual work practices: "Multinational organizations are kept together by shared practices, not by shared values. Philippe D'Iribarne once remarked that international co-operation consists of doing things together, even if each partner does them for a different reason" (Hofstede, 1999, 38). D'Iribarne's method requires unearthing the dialectical struggle that operates continuously in work backgrounds. In his example from the French workforce, he reaches into the historical work-sack to draw on two emotion-laden national experiences, the ambivalent duality of resistance / acquiescence, experienced alongside the inclination to remain professional by virtue of French loyalty to metier, adding the duality of professional / unprofessional as an overlay, but introducing an additional dilemma.

Relating D'Iribarne's (2009) methodology to Aboriginal management style, it may be possible to distinguish a not dissimilar struggle of Aboriginal resistance as noted by Stanner (1974) and others. It could be argued that there is consistent evidence of
resistance to white arrogance and posturing, but the negotiated work outcome should come with avoidance of disrespect by each party and considerations of equity. It seems possible also that for the Aboriginal Australian worker, the equivalent to French *metier* and Dutch consensus may be found in Hofstede's (1997, 2001) long-termism, in the historical context of at least forty thousand years of continuous cultural survival, and two centuries of subjugation, combined with post-traumatic recovery of identity. Trained from infancy to be independent, yet communal, the Aboriginal Australian possesses a style that combines tacit pride and exterior diffidence, whereby self-promotion is inhibited and loss of face is safeguarded by others in group mutuality.

Relationships give prestige to Aboriginal humankind only in its communality with earth and all nature. Nature is part of community, and prestige is found in spirituality, rather than in materiality or countable things. Differences in behaviour, lifestyles and management styles are accessible by better knowledge of the deeper elements of Aboriginal personality. Some Western theorists, such as Senge, Scharmer & Flowers (1990, 2005), Wheatley (1992, 2005), Wheatley & Schwinn (2008), and Deming (1986) have left a legacy of approaches to Asian and Indigenous cultures that provide common ground. The challenge is to foster engagement between dominant and Indigenous management styles at deeper levels, using respected educational psychologies of reliable provenance, which can explain the elements of both cultures to one another.

Bertrand Russell's introduction to Wittgenstein's (2009) *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*, reveals the deep differences between Western and Aboriginal approaches to the natural, in these words: "That the world is my world appears in the fact that the boundaries of language (the only language I understand) indicates the boundaries of my world. The
metaphysical subject does not belong to the world, but is a boundary to the world" (2009, 18-19). Joan Kelly Hall (2002, 20) agrees that understanding a world-view requires understanding the language of the viewer. However, to Aboriginal thinkers, metaphysical subjects are not compartmentalized. They connect rather than separate. Their boundaries are non-discrete. The synthetic coinage of socioterritorial connects group and place; the duality Yirritija and Dua (Hughes, 2000) connects group and place. There is a connectedness amongst all such internal influences on Aboriginal designs, shapes and behaviours, whether in language, gesture, art, perceptions of what looks right, or management styles.

The evidence suggests that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander styles are well differentiated from those of other Australians, and that Aboriginal Australians reference the need for maintaining their own styles, and mock their kin who are seen to behave in the self-important style of white Australians. Stanner (1974, 55-56) recorded that Aboriginal humour, a wonderful gift, is their own, not ours. In his view, Aboriginal Australians take their majority counterparts gravely, but not seriously. More recently, Hirst (2010, 192-193) and Clendinnen (2005, 288) suggest that the Aboriginal style of humour has, in reality, become an integrated part of what is now regarded as Aussie humour. Observable styles are an important part of management, just as they are in other roles and professions. In the Western classical imagery of Handy (1995), Aboriginal management styles would tend to Apollonian (Table 2, p.151) and majority Australians to Dionysian. A task for further research would be to identify Dreaming or historic Aboriginal imagery of similar cultural consequence for Aboriginal management education.

2.6 Searching for tools that engage Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples in
Management education “both-ways” is part of the value system and pedagogy of Batchelor College, a dedicated institute of Aboriginal tertiary education in northern Australia. Its imagery *ganma* is dualistic, in balance, and well accepted by Aboriginal students. The search for further tools with which to assemble the essential decryptions of Aboriginal Australia's management educational heritage needs to focus on the full range of spiritual, relational and motivational features, together with all of the physical elements with which they are associated. The physical features of a flat landscape and a spiritual population formed a duality of people and country, as well as the dynamic inter-flows that gave rise to Aboriginal cultural preferences. This imagery is consistent with research evidence available on Aboriginal world-view regarding ganma and both-ways education as central concepts, like holism and place. Whilst distinctly Aboriginal Australian, these relational ideas are at the same time broadly Asian. Their world-view equivalents in non-Aboriginal theories can be found historically in depth psychology, in the main, and in Gestalt psychology. More recently they have also been adopted by humanist Abraham Maslow (1998; 1999) and contemporary management theorists, such as Wheatley (1992; 1995), Wheatley and Schwinn (2008), and Senge (1990, 2005).

Aboriginal ways of knowing and being present challenges to the hegemonic educational traditions within post-colonial societies. These challenges are not dissimilar to those that confronted Copernicus and Darwin as they attempted to re-explain the world in terms of heliocentrism and evolution. For Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education, there are clear implications for beginning with a foundation built on relationships, or one of its closest synonyms, kinship. The differences in ways of knowing
and understanding concepts between the Western world and the Aboriginal world need to be appreciated if the issues facing Aboriginal management education are to be understood. Charlesworth et al. (2005) express this as a layered idea of social, physical and metaphysical. There are overlapping layers and synonyms implied by Aboriginal holistic notions of their own constructions (e.g. Dreaming and kinship) and Aboriginal interpretations of Western constructs (e.g. system and self). It is remarkable, from the point of view of non-Aboriginal outsider research, to observe the variety of concepts that individual Aboriginal writers profile as significant. For example, Galarrwuy Yunupingu's (2007, 3) frequent reference to the importance of balance, Unaipon's (in Muecke & Shoemaker, 2001, 4), folklore and narrative, and Williams' (2007, 35) spirituality. In considering the patterns of expression of authors, the received impression is that each favourite concept closely overlaps with some or many other Aboriginal ideas that are dynamic, accessible and borderless. Whilst all these concepts are important for Aboriginal management education, they are contained, at the same time, within common and holistic boundaries of cultural universals such as the Dreaming, and the binding threads of spirituality.

Jennings (2004) emphasized that both curriculum and delivery need to meet the interests of Aboriginal communities. An essential prerequisite of Aboriginal management education is that its underpinning psychology should be consistent with motivations, symbols and interests of students. Furthermore, Aboriginal management's principles need to be both expressible and understandable, without difficulty for either students or teachers. Transposing Jennings' (2004) findings from Alaska to Australia, it could be concluded that management education will only be fully realised by a pedagogy that reflects an Australian Aboriginal world-view, and understands clearly all of the capacities
and learning inhibitions that can facilitate or frustrate Aboriginal academic success.

In opposing Tacey's (1995) thesis that Jung's (1989) archetypes are universal in humankind, Folds (2001) argues that archetypes are a Western construct and are not appropriately applied to Aboriginal Australians. However, there is strong support for the universality of archetypes from Jung (1974), Mayes (2005), Adams (1997), Morgan (2006), and many others. Indeed, the presence of the trickster Barn-Barn Barlala (the bell-bird) in Aboriginal folklore, and of the depiction of the Earth as mother, suggest that the question of universality needed to be explored in the interviews undertaken in this research, as identifying further archetypes would provide a useful basis for understanding the dynamics of Aboriginal management motivation.

In his work, Managing in Four Worlds (2000), Lessem's worlds of management are visualized as quadrants of opposing forces, the first of which is Jung's core dualities. The two axes, Intuiting-Sensing and Feeling-Thinking can each be understood as typical human dualities, which can be distributed normally on a bell curve. It is hypothesized that, when decisions are taken to act or behave, each person has a constant tendency to default to a particular point on each of the two axes. Typically therefore, a person showing pronounced Intuiting and Feeling would tend to behaviour that is both intuitive and considerate of the feelings of others. Some theorists attempt to harness dualities to explain management personalities by accessing their impressions of the character traits of Greek gods. As stated previously, Handy (1995) draws on both Apollo and Dionysus, as did Benedict (1935) and Nietzsche (1956), to list oppositional dualistic personality types. The type differences these and other theorists used to distinguish the two gods often include the dualities in Table 2:
Evidence from the literature indicates that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians demonstrate a strong preference for the collectivist over the individualist elements of motivation. It could now be suggested that, as a culture, Australians also tend to the Intuitive-Feeling preference in Jung's (1989) depth psychology, and to the cluster of tendencies associated with Dionysus.

2.6.1 Re-positioning the standing of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

An advocate of the concept of the need to critique management theory, Learmonth (2007, 109) regards it as an imperative to examine the values and orientation of standard management theories. As it is holistic, critical theory is a natural associate of Aboriginal management theory, and it can be used to critique established Western approaches. Mintzberg's (1981) adhocracy, Auletta's (2009) innovative organization theory, and Fuller & Dil's (1983) dualities and imagery are examples of Western writers identifying concepts already embedded in Aboriginal management theory. Despite these signs of limited convergence of theories, the broader evidence of Indian management researchers, Sheth and Mittal (2004) and Sharma (2004) supports view that the conceptual distance between

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2 Western Dualities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Apollo</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>classic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Asian and Western world-views remains wide. Although these two world-view disparities will continue to exist, Aboriginal management needs to recognise its focus on holism within the context in which it has to operate. In the case of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians, the clan context in the sense in which Edward Hall (1990) conceived the term, is high. In practice, this means that the Aboriginal manager, worker, teacher or student would prefer to engage in behaviours and to embrace ideas which raise the profile of community and lower the profile of the individual. However, this preference has to be realised in managing and learning environments that are not uncomfortable with competition and individualism (Maclean, 2007). Moreover, the Aboriginal Way, as expressed in its management style, faces negative attitudes that range from incredulity to ridicule, even though it is closer to the world's central tendency than the way of majority Australia.

In any move to close the gap between Aboriginal and majority Australian management styles, Aboriginal management theory needs to be recognised as having the potential to provide basic management education concepts for the institutions that supply the management leadership for Australia's future. Besides offering new ways of appreciating the art of management, Aboriginal management theory offers the equally important platform of critical review of inherent biases in many fundamental assumptions of the Western management academy. Furthermore, with the recent decline in language studies in Australia, it may provide an alternative entry point of interest to both Aboriginal and Asian world-views, by increasing the understanding of the universal importance of second language studies for Australia, especially the languages of its Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander minority and its Asian trading partners.
The issue of relevance, according to McClisky and Day (2004), has emerged as one of the biggest challenges to encouraging Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander students into science and technology, and it applies equally to all educational levels, including tertiary, across institutions, and in both public and private sectors. Issues of perceived irrelevance are commonplace in the foundational literature of Chapman et al. (1991); Bryant (1996, 2004); Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006; 2011). Ibarra (2001) raised the question of relevance in the connection between field-dependence (high context) (Figure 10, p.86) and mathematics. He argued that computer-aided pedagogies lend themselves to the teaching of mathematics in field-dependent contexts. Ibarra suggests that field sensitive pedagogies, combined with computer technologies, can attract more Aboriginal students into the study of mathematics. Reflecting mathematics and science pedagogies appropriately would require creative Aboriginal-friendly lesson designs. However, Christie (2009) notes that children are fearless on the internet, and he promotes its use by Australians as an educational tool and enhancement of identity. Mayes (2005) and Ibarra (2001) perceive a spiritual element in both education itself and all of its disciplines. Ibarra (2001, 230) maintains that multi-contextual concepts reach into the academic culture of mathematics as a discipline. For Mayes, even the physical sciences offer opportunities to engage in creative spiritual education.

2.6.2 Importance of appropriate Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander metaphor as medium of communication

A disputed area of management education is in the issue of the validity of the metaphor as a tool for understanding what management is. Central to the criticism of metaphor is that it is imprecise and therefore unscientific. One of the world authorities on the place of
metaphor, Morgan (2006), prefaced his work's purpose in Images of Organization in these terms: "To reveal through illustration the power of the metaphor in shaping organization and management and how the ultimate challenge is not to be seduced by the power or attractiveness of a single metaphor" (2006, xii). Morgan (2006) sees better value in the integration of different points of view in the generation of metaphors. His works are illuminated with natural metaphoric images, such as the overburdened ant and the spider plant. Morgan's impression of the value of metaphor is consistent in its illustrative natural imagery with the world-view of all Aboriginal peoples. The case for Aboriginal generation of metaphor is well made for ganma by Hughes (2000, 40) and Marika-Mununggiritj and Christie (1995, 59) for Yirrkala learning. Marika-Mununggiritj and Christie (1995) regard the generation of appropriate metaphor as of utmost importance for the Yirrkala Community School. They refer the choice of metaphor to Yolngu Community elders to generate images based on hunting, history, or ceremony.

In depth psychology, motivations are channeled by metaphorical entities, especially archetypes, such as wise man or father figures, and these are pan-cultural, with special relevance in Aboriginal societies, where mythical beings feature prominently. This raises the issue of how to elicit metaphorical themes in dialogues between researcher of Aboriginal motivations and interviewees, as role models often contain archetypal connections to the deepest sources of personal energy. In Morgan's (2006) view, metaphor is also central to understanding management. As he states:

My view of metaphor as a way of being and acting in the world gives it an active quality. Metaphor makes meaning. It is in this sense that I regard the process of "reading" organizational life as embracing the idea of "authoring". Observation is never neutral. It is always an active constitutive force (2006, 417-418).

Morgan (2006, 84) assumes the holistic approach of learning to learn, practised by Argyris (2008) and Senge (1990), as a delivery system for the fusion of management education
and metaphor. Like Lakoff & Johnson (1980), Morgan is virtually silent on his assumptions about the learning impacts of feeling, emotion or affect. This may illustrate only that management education tends to frame its discipline around a “normal adult” world, wherein corporate failure and personal depression are elided. However, both the management educator and student bring to their learning experiences, personal histories of trauma, as well as triumphs. Feelings for a metaphor, or a particular word choice, may precede received knowledge of it. Such processes attempt to explain management styles in field-dependent (high context) or holistic descriptors, that fit the educational dynamics of students, teachers of management, workers or managers. However, the way in which they comprehend and interact with their host organizations needs to be investigated holistically and metaphorically, according to Morgan (2006) and Lakoff and Johnson (1980).

Of Morgan's (2006) nine divisions of metaphor, the most uncomfortable fit for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians is machine. This image has historical origins in the control-oriented production line and the dominance of engineers in early management discourse. Though outmoded, it persists as a metaphor-in-use today. Words like re-engineering or a worker as a cog in the machine are still extant. In the opinion of Capra (2000, 103), their modern manifestation can be found in mass applications by fast food multi-nationals. Personal choice, even in operator-customer dialogue has been designed out of those fast food systems wherein managers think and workers do. In such organizations, dialogue cannot really flow both ways, as upward communication and change are subordinated to global uniformity.

2.6.3 Field and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education
Nisbett (2004) has observed that networks of social obligations began from Chinese living within an agricultural society, and senses of duty and responsibility were subsumed into a culture of field-dependence (high context). The contextual sameness of the field, in China's case large agricultural plains with a landscape of intensively working humanity, led to perceptual field-dependence and choice of way or tao, rather than truth. Widely practised, the choices for dependence on others, or independence from others, produced established attitudes and coherent, though extremely different, world-views. It is clear that Australian Aboriginal origins as mainly hunter-gatherers would not conform with Chinese holism, derived from extensive well watered plains of intensive farming. However, McKellar's description of Australia as “a land of sweeping plains” is in contrast to the mountainous Greek terrain, suggesting that Australia's low flat topography would be more consistent with Chinese agricultural lowlands, producing phenomenological impacts of conspicuous affinity with Aboriginal Australia, but not necessarily with its Torres Strait Islander maritime seascape.

The psychological effects inferred by Nisbett (2004) from these field contrasts are that a sweeping landscape is perceived as a whole, which produces a tendency to see objects in the world as merged into the whole landscape, and to diminish objects that reduce the holistic panorama. This tends to magnify the importance of the field of the visible world and to influence a choice for field-dependent (high context) world-view. Having no contextual background of plains, Greek scholars looked to the more immediate objects, both human and non-human. However, the 'big picture' available to the Chinese and Aboriginal Australians was absent, and also the notion of the effect of disturbing part of the scene having consequences for the whole scene. Nisbett (2004) acknowledges the contribution of Edward Hall (1990) who differentiated societies in terms of context. Those societies
within the Asian sphere are high context (field-dependent) and those within the Greek tradition are low context (field-independent). Hall explained that in high context societies much of the “language” is “silent”. That is, gesture, eye contact, interruptions and subtle changes in the experienced environment as a whole, need interpretation and understanding. An inference can be drawn that words, even those written in a contract, are of lesser moment in high context societies than the quality of relationships embedded in context. These characteristics are consistent with the world-view of contemporary Aboriginal Australians. However, the importance of Nisbett’s (2004) theory for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education is that it implies that the differences between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal world-views are:

• they are both oppositional and hegemonic, and consequently

• given identical conditions, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians may make different management decisions from other Australian managers;

• given identical conditions, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians may attribute reasons for management outcomes differently from other Australian managers.

2.6.4 Summarizing the main themes within Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

As long term business relationships have been found to rate highly for field-dependent (high context) people throughout the world, a question needing investigation is the availability of evidence establishing whether Aboriginal Australians take long term
approaches to career and project management. No assumptions about Aboriginal management styles, should be made until research results reveal the theories-in-use of practising Aboriginal managers. The contested and restricting knowledge spaces, described by Nakata (2007, 4), cannot be penetrated without capturing the contested symbolic ground, by confronting moribund metaphor with new imagery, and creating a contemporary narrative with an engaging alternative reality, in which undisclosed majority interests are revealed and unacknowledged Aboriginal strengths are re-configured as management styles-in-use.

Included in Bryant's (1996) research were findings of fluid changing of Aboriginal group leadership, which he termed "de-centralized". To illustrate this, Bryant invoked the metaphor of the Native American water carrier who does what needs to be done, when it needs to be done (Bryant, 1996, 16), conceptually similar to Toyota's Just-In-Time (JIT) production method. A concept of leadership, which is without hierarchy and invisible, confers a context of uniqueness as a discipline of Aboriginal management education in which advanced levels of collectivist and consensual management are the norm. Furthermore, tribal self-organization is described by Bryant (1996, 22) as work self-assigned to the skilled of best fit. As a consequence, both in organization and leadership style, Aboriginal management education is uniquely different. Its closest theoretical correlates are those of Jung (1969a; 1974; 1989) and the related, but similarly distinctive, theoretical position of Luhmann (1986; 1989; 1995; 2000b). However, the importance of Luhmann's work with autopoiesis, in its larger context of Aboriginal management education, is that it places Aboriginal students, and their potential for self-managing, at the highest levels of sophistication of any student cohort of management education, as long as the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander way of organizing and learning is allowed
to prevail.

The majority position of Western management education in Australia, supported by government and corporate power, positions it as assured and comfortable. A position in which the majority is encultured with a world-view at odds with its minorities enables the typical majority viewer to relax comfortably and experience Foley’s (2003) disparaging "rightness of whiteness". The way forward will require the management education preferences of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australia to be clearly stated, adding to the writings of Martin (2003; 2008a-c), Foley (2000; 2003; 2010), Pearson (1999; 2009), and other respected contributors. However, the larger task will be to engage the Australian management academy, and the Australian majority more generally, in a knowledge transfer of the potential gains of better understanding the field-dependent (high context) ontology of Aboriginal Australia, and its relevance for increasing appreciation of the management values of Asia, especially of India (Bourai, 1993) and China (Bouée, 2010).

2.7 Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education pedagogy

2.7.1 The natural as pedagogical in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

In discussing management styles, the idea of what is natural to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians is important to this research inquiry. If particular pedagogical practices and preferences consistent with effectively teaching Aboriginal management can be identified as natural to Aboriginal Australian teachers, it would clearly assist the
construction of an appropriate pedagogy. The question emerging is which are the behaviours, places, constructions, symbols, stories, and concepts like fairness, that fit well within the learning styles of Aboriginal Australians. Adopting Bouée's (2010, 148, 211) common-sense approach, what is a natural pedagogy for Aboriginal Australians could be described as a teaching style which feels natural to them. This will involve examining the significant writings and research findings regarding the question of what is natural in the literature of Aboriginal and other authors.

Hall, Hellermann & Doehler (2011, 62) and Csibra and Gergley (2011, 1149) have postulated that humans are intrinsically pedagogical. Human evolution has produced a communicative species, with an innate tendency to teach and learn new and relevant cultural information. The term for this tendency that Csibra and Gergley have used is natural pedagogy, which first appeared in the writings of Rousseau (1964). Csibra, G. & Gergely, G. (2009) maintain that their research shows that the brain is "hardwired" for young infants to expect communications to be generic and referential. This is consistent with the research evidence of both neuroscience and social sciences informing this research, in particular of McGilchrist, (2010), Maze (1983), (Lee & Brosziewski, 2009), and Australian Aboriginal researcher, Martin (2003, 2008a-c).

Management theorists transiting from the field of architecture, like Fuller (1983), Ackoff (2003) and Edmondson (2007) first conceptualize any project pictorially as image or sketch, with a framework or scaffold imaging the natural. An example of this holistic approach being applied to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander pedagogy can be seen in the conceptual and project entities within The Cape York Institute, directed by Noel Pearson (2010). Within the scaffold of identity, Pearson includes the building shapes of
economic viability, welfare reform, housing, health and alcohol management. Pearson uses the term *orbiting* to describe the trajectory of the both-ways, bi-cultural spaces in which Aboriginal students and workers find themselves. This provides a third spatial dimension in a holistic idea of the process. In orbiting there is a sense of continuous movement, a dynamic flow, changing and cycling. The 3-5 year iterations of dismay, action and forgetting that Pearson, Denigan and Gotesson (2009) have identified, Pearson countered by successful private educational ventures and the holistic activities of the Cape York Institute.

The holistic social science of Pearson, Denigan and Gotesson finds strong support in the research of natural scientists, like biologist and systems theorist, Bateson (1987; 2003) and Nobel chemistry laureate, Prigogine (1990), who articulates a guarded but consistent opinion that explains the trend to the natural and the holistic: “*Present-day research leads us farther and farther away from the opposition between man and the natural world.... (It shows) instead of rupture and opposition, the growing coherence of our knowledge of man and nature*” (1990, 4).

Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy finds a robust support basis in the works of Bateson, Prigogine and others, whose research equalises the importance of both natural and social sciences. In a more recent work, Prigogine (2003, 52) affirmed that his life’s work had been framed by putting “irreversibility and probability in their proper place as intrinsic properties of nature”. He goes on to declare that “the persistent interactions between all things are the unique reason for any change happening in the world” (2003, 54). And further (2003, 60), that the world needs a “concept of the universe that comprises thinking and biology without any contradiction with physics. We are after all
the evolutionary product of nature”. The evolution of Prigogine’s work over a lifetime shows an increasing strengthening of his belief in holistic principles; that is, the world as a whole system, an interconnectedness of all things driving all changes in the world, and embracing all of the disciplines of science. Prigogine’s position is little different from the findings of Chapman et al. (1991), on Native American management styles, or of Muecke and Shoemaker (2004) or Nakata (2004; 2007 and 2008), regarding Aboriginal Australian styles. Prigogine (1990; 2003), Fuller & Dil (1983), Edmondson (2002), Wheatley 1992), Capra (1993a-b; 1996; 2000) and Senge (1990; 2005), have woven an appreciation of the natural within their understanding of management and other sciences. The same appropriation of the natural is present in the works of Argyris (1996; 2008) and Ackoff (2003), who regard Western systemic or holistic approaches to solving management problems as under-developed. An acceptable epistemology to found an Aboriginal management education pedagogy requires a theoretical standpoint that is holistic, natural and oriented both-ways. In this sense, Prigogine (2003), Bateson (1987; 2003), physicist, Capra (1983a) and many other researchers are equally credible for both Australian Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal pedagogies.

It is important to emphasize that both-ways pedagogy does not assume that perceptual inhibitions to learning anchor the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander student to unyielding field-dependence (high context). For example, even in high context subjects like statistics, there are opportunities to perceive an alternative world contrasting, for example, correlation and causation, rather than, say, the determinism of the supernatural. Or, as Capra (1983a, 76) points out in the Tao of Physics about quantum theory, "we can never predict when and how a phenomenon is going to happen, we can only predict its probability”. For the high context Aboriginal student, such a phenomenon may
demonstrate that some mysterious, low context phenomena offer comforting exceptions to the otherwise rigid certainty of Western scientific explanations. These differences or preferences distinguish the Aboriginal field-dependent societies (high context) from their Western majorities. It is natural for Aboriginal decision-makers to prioritize relationships first, and just as natural for the Westerner to prioritize the task at hand first. Ideally, each side of the field or context divide should be educated to the behaviour of the other side, and to know why such differences exist.

Such contextual bridging is an important part of Wheatley's (1992, 128-129) conception of the connectedness between Mandelbrot's (2004) fractal formations on the one hand, and solutions to management problems on the other. Wheatley defines fractals as geometrical forms generated by computers from relatively little information, expressed in as little as three non-linear equations (1992, 128). In Wheatley's view, "fractals suggest the futility of searching for ever finer measures of discrete parts of the system" (1994, 129). As an example from the discipline of geography, Wheatley explains that the problem Mandelbrot posed to his students' measuring of the coastline of Britain can be solved only qualitatively, as the closer you zoom in on the coastline, the more there is to measure. Wheatley's advice is to reinforce the lessons of holism: “what we can know, and what is important to know, is the shape of the whole - how it develops and changes, or how it compares with another system" (1992, 129). Approximate fractals, such as the example of terrain in Figure 18 and Mandelbrot's (2004) coastline, exist in other natural formations, such as fern leaves, snow-flakes, trees and flowers. Their computer modelling relies on recursive algorithms, whose practical value in science is now well established. Like Fuller's geodesic dome, they reflect Ibarra's (2001) confidence in the possibility of low context entry for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander students into pedagogies of high
context subjects, such as physics, mathematics and chemistry, increasing relevance and holding power of institutions teaching high context disciplines.

**Figure 18 Fractal of terrain developed from noise sources**

![Fractal of terrain developed from noise sources](Image)

*Source: (C. Wellons, 2007).*

The theoretical origins of this literature can be found just as readily in the natural sciences as in the social sciences. In the realm of pedagogy, the meaning of the word *natural* describes more accurately cultures that educate in ways that enable individuals to identify themselves by expressing styles of pedagogy in ways that feel natural. This may be more accessible in cultural settings that are more evidently close to nature, as might reflect Aboriginal societies in traditional locations. Nature does not typically describe modern city environments, nor those whose educational elites are urban and scientific. However, those natural scientists referred to so far, like holists Fuller & Dil (1983), Ibarra (2001), and Capra (1993a-b; 1996; 2000), project a vision of scientific enquiry that has no boundary. They visualize a continuity of natural sciences, with the "soft" sciences of education and management on one wing, and the "hard" mathematical sciences of computing and physics on the other. Their reasoning better fits the realities of cutting-edge
science issues, such as those confronted by Mandelbrot (2004, 194), who reached the limits of quantitative measurement with fractals. Similarly, Sklar (2002, 4) reminds physicists that theories of physics do not give a true view of the world, advising physicists to refrain from asserting that their theories are correct in a straightforward sense.

The findings of Ibarra (2001) and Battiste (2002) are reflected in Figure 19. This diagram has been taken from Martha's blogs, an online Native American educational initiative, from an exercise in which Alaskan Inuit students have been asked to design a structure that would be appropriate for a large dwelling on the Arctic sea ice. The use of Fuller's geodesic dome is suggested by the online instructor, for its robust design features, and consistency with the familiar igloo shapes of typical dwellings in the Arctic circle. This solution could be regarded as relevant, in Ibarra's terms, as a creative element of pedagogy, which arises from a Western technologist, but is applicable in the Inuit culture, and perceived as natural in both Western and Aboriginal contextual hemispheres. Offering the typical Western dwelling shape, with rectangular base, regarded by Fuller as unnatural, could be perceived as less acceptable, and raise the risk of rejection on the grounds of irrelevance.

The example in Figure 19 could be seen as a practical answer to Ibarra's plea for relevance as the focus of Aboriginal education in Western settings, and particularly to the question he posed in Sub-section 2.6.1 regarding reform of the pedagogy of mathematics for the field-dependent (high context). The point being made by the educator is that the students possess the Aboriginal knowledge that the igloo is functional, practical and familiar to all, as a building form of unique cultural value. The new knowledge of the geodesic dome is created readily, on the foundation of the igloo's acceptance as given
knowledge. There are potential opportunities for further learning in the scientific explanations of Fuller & Dil (1983) about the exceptional strength of his domal structure, on the basis of its construction from triangles and mathematical precision. The result is a fusion of wisdoms of Aboriginal and Western building designs, which can synergize new knowledge in the context of both-ways education, thereby eliminating irrelevance.

Figure 19  Dwelling construction solution for Arctic circle - Inuit online education

Source: Martha’s Blogs, Module VIII, Cryosphere.

2.7.2 Visual-spatial aspects affecting Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander pedagogy

Appropriate pedagogies also need to take account of group differences that may distinguish Aboriginal student groups. For example, Kearins (1981) compared Australian adolescents and children, who were from both traditional and semi-traditional groups, to a
control group of Caucasian individuals on tests of visual-spatial memory. The findings were striking: The Aboriginal children from traditional and semi-traditional backgrounds, as well as the Aboriginal adolescents, performed significantly higher than the Caucasian samples on all measures of visual-spatial memory. Furthermore, in another series of experiments, Kearins (1986) again found that Aboriginal students performed significantly better than Caucasians on all measures of visual-spatial memory. In these experiments, children had to memorize the location of particular objects. The Aboriginal sample performed consistently higher than the Caucasians, regardless of whether the objects were natural (e.g., rocks) or man-made (e.g., eraser), and whether the objects were similar or dissimilar. These Aboriginal students used largely non-verbal approaches, usually remaining very still and silent when answering. Some Caucasians appeared to use verbal approaches, pointing to objects and whispering. For Caucasians, items that were familiar and nameable were easier than unfamiliar items, as they may have used verbal strategy.

Similar findings have been made in respect of visual-spatial superiority of Native Americans. Rasmussen, Baydala and Sherman (2004) highlighted the distinct learning patterns, styles and preferences of Aboriginal students. In reaching their conclusions that Inuit children performed significantly better than Caucasian children on a test of visual memory, Rasmussen et al. explored hemisphere dominance and field dependence (high context). In another review of the research on visual-spatial abilities of the Inuit, Kleinfeld (1973) concluded that, in general, Inuit individuals tend to perform better than Caucasians on tests of visual-spatial ability. Kearins (1981) also observed that the superior Aboriginal performance held true for traditional, semi-traditional, and even non-traditional Aboriginals. Findings, such as those of Kearins (1981), and Rasmussen, Baydala and Sherman (2004) tend to confirm that context or field influences the cognitive performance of Aboriginal
students, and that these patterns are consistent across Aboriginal cultures. Australian education does not “teach out” field-dependence or high context, and consequently post-secondary educators, such as teachers of management education, need to note that these constant differences, researched by Kearins (2000), Rasmussen, Baydala and Sherman (2004), Kleinfeld (1973) and Schneider & Pressley (1989), underpin an alternative way of perceiving the world. Consequently, this perception will dominate, whether it is in the world of school work, or in professional management. In this respect, indications of student resistance should be examined for contextual anomalies, between chosen pedagogy and foundation beliefs of the student group, whenever they occur.

2.7.3 Conceptualizing the triangle as Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander pedagogy research tool

The dynamic tension between dualities, such as within the Aboriginal *ganma* image (Figure 8, p.81), produces a third entity, creating a conceptual triangle, which can be used to frame many of the dialectical contradictions facing both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal pedagogies. In Jung’s (1989) preferences, Luhmann’s (1995) function systems, and Peirce’s (Houser & Klosel, 1992) semiotics, dualities that produce a third social axis, forming a triangulation, are a common feature. This triangular depiction has ancient origins in Plato’s discourses and the dao. Hegel (2005) extended the concept in the formation thesis – antithesis – synthesis. Hughes (2000) relates the daoist ying / yang to the dualities yirritja / dua and eaglehawk / crow. Hughes describes these pan-societal dualities as the division of phenomena into two great, opposed yet balanced categories (2000, 235). However, the inclusion of the notion of "third thing" (1998, 236) may be alternatively described as Aboriginal society as a whole, or a viable societal system. Moreover, the full
triangulation requires the observation described by Hughes, as well as the reflexive "observation of observation" introduced by social systems theorists.

Barnhardt and Kawagley (1995), an Aboriginal author, from south-western Alaska's Yupiaq (Inupiaq) nation, has provided a diagrammatic world-view (Figure 20) that incorporates both triangular and holistic elements, with a strong element on the motivational force of balance, about which he comments: "This tetrahedral framework allows for triangulation, whereby human beings can locate themselves in relation to other domains in their existence, and check to make sure that the Aboriginal values and traditions are in balance" (1995, 16).

![Kawagley's schematic of Aboriginal world-view](www.arcticcircle.uconn.edu)

Source: www.arcticcircle.uconn.edu (2012)
Kawagley's is a more complex integration of non-discrete dualities and synergistic third outcomes. In this depiction of three "grounded" entities, humanity / nature as a duality produce spirituality, spirituality / nature produce humanity, and spirituality / humanity produce nature. But each of these three entities also contains elements of the other two. The construction of the third point of synergy produces the third-dimensional and more realistic idea that is expressed in Figure 4 (p.55) by Adams (1997) as a radial. That is, the introduction of an overlaid further duality, in this case space / time, is suggested by the circular rendering of the universe and circle of life, the latter clearly indicating a world in motion, through space and time. As stated previously, Arabena's (2006; 2008) view of the place of Aboriginal Australia in the world is essentially an ecological perspective, following the theory of Laszlo (2006). This world-view of the Aboriginal Australian as universal citizen, which is similar to Luhmann's (1989) global citizen, was formed by Arabena with reference to the works of Professor Manulani Maluli-Meyer (Arabena, 2006, 41) on Aboriginal Hawaiians. Arabena favours the adoption of Maluli-Meyer's position on the transformational value of non-discrete dualities. This entails "transforming binary modes of existence into trilectic modes of connecting" (Arabena, 2006, 41). The similarities with Kawagley's perception is clearly visible in Maluli-Meyer's diagram in Figure 21, p.170.

Figure 21 Maluli-Meyer trilogy
The pedagogical values identified by Kawagley and Arabena are neither ranked nor isolated, but always systemic and relational, that is part of a whole of life ideal that connects with their perception of what is natural. Jung's pedagogical values could be described as archetypal (Mayes, 2005), that is they place great reliance on the influence of archetypes within cultures and families, just as Aboriginal societies do. Within the turbulence of the ganma duality and others like yirritja / dua reside potentially grounded theories of the student, society, and the wider world, which could form parts of Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy. The model for Jung is decision making, motivated by instinctive tendencies towards one or other choices between functions, intuiting / sensing and thinking / feeling, overlaid by relative energy flows outwards (extraverting) or inwards (intraverting) (Bayne, 2004). The higher third is a fusion of persona (how the person acts) and the self (who the whole person is). Jung's functions operate at a personal level as sub-systems of the person as a whole system. The implications for pedagogy are that Aboriginal differences innate to every individual need to be taken into account both-ways and that archetypal influences are also universal, but differentiate between the supernatural beliefs of the stories and archetypes backgrounding Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal cultures.

The importance of spirituality in the Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander culture and any prospective pedagogy is reflected in Jung's pedagogy and also Luhmann's (2000a). His non-personal functional systems offer the alternative of de-complexified decision making within a cognitive membrane, enabled as global by modern world technology, and energized by a need to communicate, or perish. Hence, Luhmann
relegated spirituality to the environment in order to de-complexify the functional systems on which his relatively closed theory depends. In responding to the question raised in Sub-section 2.3.7, as to whether this relegation means less credibility for the Aboriginal student, it is also clear that Luhmann retains relationality, an overlapping concept with spirituality, within the function systems, and still regards spirituality as of considerable importance. On the other hand, there is ample evidence available in Luhmann’s and other Western findings about human nature and systems approaches, which shows every indication of being recognizably "natural" or "relevant" for Aboriginal Australians. These approaches may present as dualities, but need thoughtful consideration of the oppositional forces in play, and their accurate definitions, to reveal the whole triangulated systems offering for further research.

Attention has been drawn in Chapter 1 to the research of McConvell, Simpson, & Caffery (2009, 13), which criticizes the reversion to English-only policy in Northern Territory schools. This mistaken decision can be framed pedagogically as a duality of Aboriginal and English languages both being taught to Aboriginal students. The research of Benet-Martinez, Leu & Lee (2002) and Brannen,Thomas & Hong (2010) indicates that the outputs of this tension can produce triangulations of enhanced Aboriginal identity and mutual respect, facilitated by fluid cultural frame shifting, as well as gains in language facility.

The features of management that characterize the most successful corporations of the digital age, also utilize the holistic elements of these theories, and include organizational designs that feature the Aboriginal universals of relationality, reflexivity and expertise orientation. The evidence indicates that Aboriginal management education can draw
deeply from these theories and management practices, especially those that can be symbolized as dualities, which have an enhanced third entity as output, forming triangular systems, with features of self-governance and relative closure. An appropriate pedagogy would not be complete without fully understanding that triangular systems and circle management styles present profound differences between two alternative management hemispheres. However these differences, raised in the question posed in Sub-section 2.3.2, are those of degrees of holism, rather than in kinds of management, for example, those of individual performance measurement (Western) compared with group performance indicators (Aboriginal).

2.7.4 The value of critical theory to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy

Critical theory lies behind the approaches of Argyris (1996, 2008) and others employing double-loop techniques. Argyris’ (2008, 47) advice for managers is firstly to face up to your own defensive theories-in-use, then to change them. Argyris’ approach to theories-in-use closely aligns with the research of D'Iribarne (2009), Hofstede (1999), Salk and Brannen (2000), Weber and Glynn (2006), all of whom could be identified as critical theorists. Collectively, these theorists have cast doubt on the validity of previously misused determinants of national culture appropriated by management researchers. It is important therefore to identify Aboriginal variables that are actually in use at the Aboriginal workplace rather than those that are influenced by political myth making, especially those espoused by the majority culture as Aboriginal values or knowledge deficits. Introducing a holistic educational design requires that Aboriginal leaders and students need to put their cases for educational equity in a whole of life context, starting from pre-
natal care and ending in longevity comparisons. In pedagogical approaches to Aboriginal cultures, the employment of a critical methodology seems essential to the achievement of whole-of-life educational outcomes. Furthermore, successful realisation of an appropriate pedagogy cannot occur without concurrent attention to improvements in social inclusion and the counter-developmental impacts of its absence. To achieve this, all aspects of the critical method need to be considered, without any limitations on issues that need to become the focus of critical questioning.

Whether to compromise or to resist assertively is a fundamental social question. Paulo Freire (2000), Giroux (2001) and others argue convincingly for a critical ideology, an attitude that is consistently alert to re-balancing lost or dispossessed power relationships with the cultural arbitrary of majority Australia. From Williams' point of view, the critical approach "intellectualizes the Aboriginal eye" (Williams, 2007, 17). However, there is also more to be done when undertaking a comprehensive review of all of the issues to be faced by disparate cultures seeking to understand bi-laterally beneficial approaches to management education. This process may begin by taking into account the research of theorists who critically examine the vexed spaces evident to Nakata (2007, 4) and between espoused theories and theories-in-use (D'Iribarne, 2009). This field of world-views of educators in conflict is well illustrated by Delpit (2006, 23), who describes the errors of misunderstanding as common to both Native American and African American student groups. She goes further than Nakata (2007) to assert that white educators assume that unarticulated resistance can be taken as acquiescence.

Critical theory focuses on achieving an in-depth understanding of the world, allowing for the perception and exposure of social and political contradictions. It also
includes taking action against the oppressive elements in life that are illuminated by in-depth understanding. This value system, originated by Freire (2000), is associated with his critical pedagogy, and aims at the alleviation of suffering of oppressed students. Its methodology is holistic, as it advocates critically appraising all of the present system, including the political elements. Holism, critical consciousness and social activism all relate to the present Aboriginal standpoint within the Australian community. Opponents of critical pedagogy sometimes apply the emotive and inaccurate traducement of Marxist (Gottfried, 2005, 9), or some other pejorative, in order to resist or defer social obligations to redress imbalances in poverty and educational opportunity. The more appropriate metaphor for critical techniques may be found in the expansion of due diligence and reliance on its processes in such diverse fields as ethical investment, criminal law, quality engineering and philanthropy. For the educator (Bohman, 1991, 19), critical theory needs re-articulation as critical social inquiry, and as a practical and normative enterprise. Critical research and critical ventilation of possible vested interests and power imbalances embedded in pedagogies can also be more positively re-framed, like due diligence, simply as good management practices.

For the Australian Aboriginal educator, critical appraisal could be made through, for example, Galarrwuy Yunupingu's (1994) balance, evaluating fit with 'both-ways' strategies or Aboriginal spiritual appropriateness, rather than Western constructs. Critical pedagogy is holistic. It is also collectivist, and some critical theorists have attempted to link it with communities, and blend it with the study of management as critical management. Paredo and Moore (2008) warn against separating Aboriginal student managers from their impoverished communities. They insist that critical management is a means of ensuring consideration of all, including the most marginalized. In this way, students and community
can jointly form a new vision of the world. Without the questioning approach of critical pedagogy there is less likelihood of a new vision being realised and more likelihood that the majority culture would continue an unresponsive stance to educational needs and cause student demotivation.

2.7.5 Demotivating elements in Aboriginal management education

Luhmann's (1995) society is broadly divided between an inner functional sphere and an outer environmental sphere. The relegation of violence, racism, spirituality and other issues to the outer sphere is an attempt to de-complexify society. A similar pragmatism is necessary in treating the issue of poverty and its demotivational impact on Aboriginal management education. It is self-evident that the greater sub-cultural poverty of Aboriginal Australians excludes more Aboriginal students from tertiary education. However, the demotivations of poverty will require national responses external to management educational institutions and therefore cannot be addressed comprehensively in this research. Instead, preference has been given to aspects of management education of common interest to Western, Asian, and Aboriginal students. This research covers what produces the demotivation of irrelevance reported by the Aboriginal side, rather than how poverty can be alleviated.

Argyris (2008, 23) introduced the ideas of differentiating D'Iribarne's (2009) espoused theories, in Luhmann's (1995) terminology, invisibilized, from theories-in-use, in Luhmann's terminology, visibilized. This was Argyris' way of critically analysing how managers made decisions. In his view, overlooking this distinction allowed errant managers to avoid reflecting on how they think in assessing their own faulty approaches. He coined the term
"double-loop learning" to describe the reflexivity needed for good managers to make improvements continually. Additionally, Argyris perceived that the act of denial of fault and projecting blame onto others is "self-sealing" (2008, 47), in other words, it produces a relatively closed system that may assure continuous managerial mediocrity, rather than continuous improvement. Expressing Argyris' management educational ideas in a more clinical register, in blaming subordinates he is referring to denial brought on by fear of failure. The organizational maladjustment that seals in the error, reflects a neurotic act which, routinely reproduced, makes for the reverse of management development, and demotivates staff at both personal and organizational levels.

Luhmann's (1995) systems offer the opportunity to examine management decision-making in clinical detail as a plausible cognitive pathway between motivational impulse and management behaviour. At its core, Luhmann's perceptions of how bad management decisions are made is close both to Argyris' (2008) and Senge's (1990) double loop systems, and equally close to Freud's (2001) or Jung's (1970) systems-in-use for the diagnosis and remediation of repression.

One of Luhmann's (1995) successors, Teubner (2006, 54), points out that modern society handles de-paradoxification as temporary concealment, invisibilization, suppression, and repression. It is consequently characterized, not by opening errors to Argyris' (2008) liberating and honest reflection, but to paralysis and a rationality of repression. However, this research attempts to connect ways in which the Aboriginal management function can utilize the insights of double-loop learning with its deeper European re-formulation, social systems theory, beneficially for both Aboriginal managers and their organizations. For the management development educator, the conjunction between Luhmann's (1995)
invisibilization and psychodynamic repression is of major importance. Invisibilization is the modern successor to Jung's (1989) shadow, described as the repository of both conscious and unconscious personal tendencies, motives, and characteristics that we have barred from consciousness, whether deliberately or not (Hart, 2008).

Hart regards the admission of the shadow as the *sine qua non* of individuation. In essence, this is closely similar to the key point in Argyris' (2008) management development, that reflexive or double-loop analysis of a faulty and demotivating management decision requires the admission by the disingenuous manager of the obscurantist side of the management decision under investigation. Jung is equally insistent on this process. Hart continues that Jung's shadow is the ground of reality, and the counterbalance to illusion and inflation, requiring steady, honest, and demanding self-discipline (Hart, 2008, 97-98).

Thus, Jung's (1990) individuation and Maslow's (1999) later variant, self-actualization, require for their realisation, not some alchemical transformation, but solid and frank analysis and hard work.

It is axiomatic that nothing can have its relations intrinsic or internal to itself (Maze, 1983, 24, and Wodak & Meyer, 2009, 142). The furthest Maze (1983, 39-40) can move in this direction is to observe that he can think of more than one thing at a time, and that one cognitive state can pay attention to another. Luhmann's (1995) cognitive account of decision-making traverses this ground in a novel way that is consistent with psychodynamics, but also plausibly elaborates a solution to this perennial problem. As well, it moves closer towards satisfying the Aboriginal demand for self-reflection (Martin, 2003) and the essentiality to management education of double-loop learning, which is central to the education systems of Argyris (2008) and Senge (1990). Within Luhmann's
(1995) function systems, decisions are made with prime dualities as reference, for example, lawful / unlawful for justice systems. Decisions are made only when problems are undecidable, and action / inaction offer as paradox. The paradox is relieved by the decision maker, as observer and observer-of-self, autopoietically (Maturana & Varela, 1980) re-conceptualizing the duality as alternative-from-observer's-viewpoint, and alternative-as-self-observed, with the original (pre-observation) alternative-as-unresolved-paradox, still conceptually available as the third entity in a notional trilogy. The decision is made, and the paradox relieved, by contingency. That is, the rejected alternative decision is invisibilized (Luhmann) or repressed (Teubner, 2006; Freud, 2001). However, for management educators like Argyris, this process of contingency describes a central issue for management pedagogy, which could, using Luhmann's processes, extend to all pedagogies, freeing managers from the demotivation of hiding the suppressed alternative decision.

2.7.6 Re-forming management education to suit Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy

In Foucault's (1977) view, discursive power constructs "truths", defines "realities" and maintains these constructions as devices which simultaneously produce and preserve power. Within such constructs are concealed assumptions of knowledge deficit. Aboriginal demotivations can be influenced by such faulty perceptions, presumptions of rightness, social exclusion, prejudice and poverty. In a holistic pedagogy, every demotivational factor demands attention. A remedy that may circumvent the inhibition of learning by the Aboriginal student troubled by perceptions of irrelevance is suggested by the innovative research of Picard (1997; 2000), and Kort & Reilly (2002), all of MIT, whose interest in the
importance of the emotional elements in teaching derives from their research on artificial
intelligence and the cognitive aspects of emotion (Picard, 1997, 35). Kort and Reilly
explain the differences between conventional teaching and their revised model. They
share the position of Shell’s et al. (2010) that emotion is not simply an important part of
learning, but a necessary condition of learning. They are critical of a current tendency for
modern pedagogy to focus on cognitive factors and to misinterpret or ignore affective
cues. By looping in metaphor, story making, orbiting, failure and recovery, and
transformation, Kort & Reilly are presenting an educational model similar to those of
Argyris (1996; 2008) and Senge (1990; 2005), with particular relevance to Aboriginal
management education. Furthermore, Kort and Reilly visualize an arching radial or “third
axis”, as they term it, to account for the emergence of wisdom from knowledge (2002, 6).

Kort and Reilly (2002) present a form of pedagogy that would be perceived as irrelevant to
Aboriginal students in Figure 22. The situation depicted in Figure 22, of conveying
information and facts, then interrogating them, has been discarded in favour of its systemic
successor at Figure 23.

**Figure 22 Linear approach to pedagogy**
Standing in contrast to the foregoing linear model is Kort and Reilly's holistic alternative, which is consistent with the research of Battiste (2002), and illustrated as Figure 23. The key concept in this model is wisdom, from which Kort and Reilly infer that anecdotes are drawn, which inform the culture. However, it could be argued that from new Aboriginal Australian anecdotes and stories, for example those of participant Frank, the collective knowledge of Aboriginal Australia increases. Hence stories, knowledge, and wisdom act as a triangle in which new anecdotes interact with the established body of cultural knowledge to generate wisdom as an outcome of their synergy.

The pedagogical model at Figure 23 has the holistic approach of a complete system. It features the metaphor of story making, using prototypical anecdotes drawn from the culture of the students, and the search for the insight of perceiving the “big picture”, creating the conditions for a “higher third” of wisdom to be realised.

Figure 23 Holistic alternative to conventional pedagogy
This image is close in profile and theory to Adams' (1997), and Pearson's (2010) orbiting. It is also consistent with the rejection of the defensiveness of unreflexive managers blaming others, and ignoring the bigger holistic picture of the double loop learning systems of Argyris and Senge.

The premises of “Aboriginal education as problem” are described widely as false and self-limiting. Nakata (2007, 4) visualizes this area as a field of "contested knowledge space", wherein Aboriginal knowledge is re-presented and re-configured as part of the corpus "about us, and is already discursively bounded, ordered and organized by others and their sets of interests" (2007, 9). In “orbiting” to the DISTAR reading system (Engelmann & Bruner, 1974) for Aboriginal students in north Queensland, Pearson (2009) has effectively acted as agent for “Aboriginal nation as owner”. Notwithstanding the valuable contributions of Batchelor Institute and the development of Aboriginal education departments within several Australian universities, the Pearson model may be preferable for Aboriginal management education, as it assumes Aboriginal ownership and avoids the contradiction of an initiative in management education that itself is managed externally. For the Australian school education system, the 2010 National Curriculum (Australian Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority, ACARA, 2010) provides statistical evidence for the advisability of ensuring better outcomes for Aboriginal Australians. Many of the required activities to realise school educational equality will be achieved on common ground with Aboriginal management education, that is with an approach founded on holism.

Evidence has been gathered from established Aboriginal management educational values
and practices, mainly those from North America, identified by Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant, (2004), and Jennings (2004); from Asia, identified by Palumbo-Liu, (1999) Vohra, (2004) and Mulla and Krishnan, (2008); and Australasia, identified by Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2009), Harkins (1994), Smith (2006), Harrison (2007), and Hughes (2004). These writers indicate that holism may be the main motivational factor, and that its world-view is externalized as collectivism rather than Western individualism. Notwithstanding these two world-view disparities, management education needs sensitivity to its context as defined by Hall (1990), whether high (field-dependent) or low (field-independent). In practice, this means that the Aboriginal manager, worker, teacher or student would prefer to engage in behaviours and to embrace ideas that raise the profile of community and lower the profile of the individual.

Curriculum can be regarded as a planning tool for formulating and providing the delivery of a program of education. Williamson and Dalal (2007) visualize an Aboriginal variant developed from the Alaska Native Knowledge Network, and informed by Australian literature including Nakata (2004). This blended solution has as its framework:
• countering the viewing of embedding Aboriginal perspectives as problematic;
• deconstructing students' own cultural environment in order to appreciate ways in which the other is framed;
• recognising that Western disciplines are hegemonic, appropriating, and dissonant with ways of knowing;
• achieving cross-cultural understandings and acquiring cultural competencies, despite the complexities of interactions at the cultural interface; and
• re-orienting curricula by engaging with alternative ways of knowing and alternative skill sets.
In the case of the last of Williamson and Dalai's (2007) final reconstruction, reorienting curricula in alternative ways is, for Ibarra (2001, 229), a much needed reform to address a loss to higher education of potential mathematics students who currently favour more field-sensitive disciplines. Ibarra claims that students whose potential mathematical achievements are high, have become repelled by the historical delivery of mathematics in low context (field-independent) pedagogies. High context, field sensitive alternatives can be introduced by replacing memorization of formulas with computer generated mathematical models accessible by all, in a trend Ibarra terms “the mathematicization of society”.

In Ibarra’s (2001, 230) words:

High-context field-sensitive concepts, such as modelling of practical applications, teach by presenting people-oriented problems, in combination with traditional low-context calculations and formulas. This is one way of creating a multi-contextual learning environment. If successful, these reforms could attract multi-contextual students to math and science disciplines.

The substantive issue, according to Ibarra, is whether mathematicians will recognize the powerful implications of multi-contextual concepts. Further, more is needed than simply introducing these concepts and methods without fully understanding why they work. Ibarra deliberates as to whether they might be used as a marketing tool to attract diverse student populations to mathematics. In these examples, Ibarra is presenting a practical solution to the most serious problem confronting tertiary Aboriginal education, high student wastage attributed to contextual dissonance. In the more common examples, the wastage is due to presenting a low context curriculum, dismissed as irrelevant by high context (field-dependent) Aboriginal students. Ibarra's example is a pedagogical issue. Some subjects are by their nature low context. Presenting such programs in a low context pedagogical style must lead to a wastage of some participants, whose cultural preference is high
Context or field elements are embedded in disciplines in a similar manner to the ways in which they are encultured in different societies. Mathematical formulae, for example, allow little interpretative choice, whereas even a simple sentence of subject, verb, object has some emotional impact, and offers enlarged perceptual alternatives. Consequently, at the level of the lesson plan, there are likely to be more pedagogical opportunities whenever a high context subject, like mathematics or statistics, is delivered to field-dependent (high context) students. This underlines a responsibility both-ways for developers of management education curricula. The light needs to be shone, not only on the preferences of participating students, but also on the degree of context of the discipline. Hence accounting and statistics, need quite different approaches to, say, management theories. Choice of pedagogical approach, rests on assessments about its holistic design features.

The system that emerges, with the construction of a pedagogy, comprises motivational elements (drivers), curriculum elements (programs) and pedagogical elements (student/teacher experiential outcomes). As an open system, it affects the culture in which it operates, and is in turn affected by it. How the curriculum is presented, the strategies of delivery, and the style by which the educator educates, are in the province of pedagogy, the powerhouse and wellspring of teaching, containing the epistemology and ontologies of all teachers and students within the educational system. For the teacher of management, this is the area in which world-views can co-develop or collide. This is because pedagogy can be conceptualized as the holistic container of all of the values, attitudes, beliefs and learnings of the educator. Japanangka Errol West (2000), an Aboriginal educationist, marked out the territory of Aboriginal Australian pedagogy in these terms:
These pedagogical principles are holistic, connected, valid, culture and values-based, thematic and experiential. They promote co-operative learning, the unified co-operation of learner and teacher in a single enterprise. They describe who teaches and when teaching occurs. Pedagogical principles recognize the role of non-verbal communication. All learning is clothed in the medium of spirituality so that notions of well-being / wellness and ethos become important in the learner’s learning” (2000, 142).

The model favoured by Williams (2007, 115) for general education is the educator-participant relationship as co-learners. However, in management education, there may be a further perspective for a low context discipline, such as general management, whereby the “educator” could be the least experienced manager of the group. In such cases, the model could be participant-driven, with educator as facilitator.

Pedagogy implies the correct way to undertake teaching strategies. Pedagogical style for the Aboriginal management teacher, whether Aboriginal-Insider or non-Aboriginal outsider, is best described as what feels comfortable for both teacher and student. Given that the student group is Aboriginal, it would be strategically correct to aim for a pedagogy that reflected and authenticated world-views. This should feel natural to the teacher and to the student. Again, a critical pedagogy can be approached as non-ideological, and viewed as simply good management, like due diligence. Despite the most professional of pedagogical standards and their positive effects, there will be a need to deal with the demotivational elements of Aboriginal management education, arising from social and economic marginalization, prejudice and unevenness of attention to the needs of a neglected area of Australian society. Prejudice and faulty pedagogy are both present in the mistaken ideology of knowledge deficit, but they can be countered by pedagogies, of custom design for Aboriginal nations, like the models of Pearson (2009), Nakata (2007b), and Kort and Reilly (2002; 2008).

2.8 Conclusion
The question of motivations and demotivations and their influences on the learning styles of students of Aboriginal management was influenced by finding a long standing neglect of investigation of Aboriginal management education, including the recurrence of perceptions of lack of relevance. Aboriginal management education is embryonic, both in respect of the world's Aboriginal peoples and Australia's. The extent of research neglect of the topic did not become apparent until well into the review of literature, at the same time increasingly vindicating the choice of subject area as an unmet need. Chapman et al. (1991) identified the educational markers of Canadian Aboriginal management as holistic, consensual and uncharismatic. A later North American study by Bryant (1996; 2004) substantially confirmed the findings of Chapman et al. (1991) and more recent Australian findings by Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006; 2009; 2011) are consistent with the North American results. Galarrwuy Yunupingu (2007), Mandawuy Yunupingu (1994) Hughes (2000) and McConaghy (2000) regard duality and connection to the land as additionally valuable markers. The essentials of Aboriginal psyche described by these researchers fit closely with depth psychologies of Jung (1989) and Mayes (2005; 2007). Furthermore, many theories in natural and social sciences, and humanistic approaches, such as Maslow (1999) and Herzberg (2009), closely resemble the dualistic preference of Aboriginal approaches.

These general observations led to a sifting of the evidence, especially of Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996), and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006; 2011), and to the division of the conceptual findings into two areas, cultural on the one hand and educational praxis on the other. Whilst it was clear that each was very important, it also became evident that, whilst much had been done on an international scale towards the better understanding of
Aboriginal cultures, the cause of the management educational problem at issue for the tertiary level, perceived irrelevance, seemed recognized but unexamined in depth. As the main reason for reported student wastage, the Aboriginal experience of irrelevance and ceasing studies were re-framed as a failure of motivation. Hence the need was established for Aboriginal motivation to become the question in focus for this research.

Although Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996), and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006; 2011) indicated a need for further inquiry, no further evidence exists of successor studies. During the pause in research, it can be safely assumed that the demand for more work in the area has increased. Writers, especially Aboriginal Australians, such as Martin (2003, 2008a-c), Pearson (2009), Williams (2007) and others have exposed the depth of need to re-present Aboriginal world-view and lifestyle preferences and to relate these to Western theorists, whose findings are consistent with Aboriginal research. The principal congruent theorists for Aboriginal management education, Jung and Luhmann, can both be identified strongly with the Aboriginal touchstone of holism.

Understanding the basic cultural differences in approach to management education draws substantially on Hall's (1990) and Nisbett's (2004) extensive research on context and field-dependence, which derives from populations that are broadly Asian, and cover all Aboriginal societies, including Australia's. Aboriginal preferences also draw on ideas held in common with theorists who elevate the notion of what they consider to be "natural" in human nature. Fuller & Dil (1983), Ackoff (2003) and Edmondson (2007) rely on architectural experience to engage with natural human motivations, and others, such as Capra (1983a-b; 2000), Prigogine (1990; 2003) and Bateson (1987), depend on work in physics, chemistry, biology and other natural sciences to make similar connections.
Within high context (field-dependent) nations such as India and China, home grown and holistic indigenist management philosophies are increasing in importance in management education curricula. As an Asian-located multi-culture, Australia is well placed to open the doors of its management philosophies to Asian and Aboriginal world-views, and to offer a more complete pedagogy of global management. Whilst available research evidence for Aboriginal management education is not plentiful, there is sufficient to enable some preliminary findings. To date, especially in Australia, there is a compelling need for more to be done. The task is likely to be facilitated by raising the level of understanding that Asian or Aboriginal world-views can underpin both Australian management education and Aboriginal management education equally as well as North American or Western European world-views. Furthermore, in harnessing the dialectical opposition of contrasting world-views, Australian management education could deliver enhanced benefits to Australia's multi-cultural student domain.

Holism has become a bridging and overlapping philosophy between Western natural scientists like Lovelock (2000), Fuller & Dil (1983), Capra (1983;1996; 2000) and Savory (1999), and management educators like Ackoff (2003), Edmonson (2007) and Christopher (2007). In the words of one of the founders of quantum theory, Erwin Schroedinger, "Western thinking is still trying to objectify everything. It is in need of a blood transfusion of Eastern thought" (Lessem & Palsule, 2000, 80-81). The challenges facing Australians are more numerous and more profound than for students in non-Aboriginal Australia, even if current access to management education were equally available. Knowing what is appropriate management behaviour in two cultures is harder, and infrastructural support is less available in Aboriginal rural and urban fringe environments, even for those Aboriginal
students well above the poverty line.

The concept of holism expresses the philosophy of telling the whole story, without which the whole truth of all steps in management processes cannot be exposed. Rasch and Wolfe (2000) find that social systems theory offers the possibility of a unified theory that may demonstrate a world that is more justly constructed, that is, a world that does not mask its own contingency in making management decisions. Luhmann's (1995), for example, is a theory built on the inescapable blind spot of observation (Rasch and Wolfe, 2000, 21). In Luhmann's (1995) theory, observation is based on a paradoxical distinction that it cannot disclose, as disclosure would prevent the operation being carried out. The invisibilizing of the contingency of the non-disclosure causes a blockage in communication. For example, Schoeneborn (2010) applied it to project organization theory and Powerpoint within a multi-national consulting firm. The findings of this empirical case study were that Powerpoint sacrificed consistency for contingency, masking doubts, mistakes or alternative paths taken (2010, 27). However, the unfolding of such blockages would deny the possibility of reducing complexity by consensus, creating the conditions for a more democratic society. This is a future that potentially fits well into societies that are both holistic and historically powerless, such as Aboriginal Australia. It additionally offers a way of dealing with its more powerful majority from a position that reinforces Aboriginal holism with additional ideological strength that needs to build upon the growth in support from the Western management's IT sector, by a credible research methodology which can be readily understood both-ways.
Chapter 3  Methodology

3.1 Introduction

It is important to re-iterate that the research objective was to examine what motivates Australians in their world of work. How these motivations may assist in finding the best ideas of managing in the Aboriginal way, and how they can be developed into theory and pedagogy, will depend substantially on the methods of data analysis used, and their acceptability to both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australian management education professionals.

Development of a research methodology about Aboriginal management education relies on the works of Creswell (1997; 2008) and Sandywell (1975; 2003), for Western contribution. This is balanced by the findings of Wilson (2008) and Martin (2003; 2008a-c), whose work on Aboriginal needs informs the investigation in both theory and research. The research process takes into account the strong beliefs of Martin and Smith (2006), that privileging Aboriginal ways of knowing, and Rogers' (1994) unconditional respect for participants, are paramount. Further evidence suggests that the case study method of Glaser & Strauss (2012), Yin (2009) or Stake (1995) is the closest fit with Aboriginal discourse. The literature presents issues for examination that have their origins in pre-history. At the heart of the matter is the essential difference between the Aboriginal and majority Australian culture, the former field-dependent (high context) and the latter field-independent (low context). This anomaly can be expressed as similar to the difference
between European and Asian values. Cultural misunderstandings are inevitable, but improvable if each side fully comprehends the position of the other.

3.2 Justification for the paradigm and methodology

In comparing Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander ideas of management with Australian Western-based theories, account needs to be taken of the historical colonial teaching predilection of approaching Aboriginal education on the basis of assuming a knowledge deficit (Harkins, 1994, 50 and Williams, 2007, 20) and imposing national standards from the top. The research approaches used in this study have therefore been designed bottom-up, by beginning with Aboriginal world-views and practices. This means that the first step taken in the analysis of the literature, was to elicit the sources of psychic energy distilled from Aboriginal writings, and secondly from research respondents' world-views identified as motivational forces within their cultures. It became clear that the methodologies to be adopted for researching Aboriginal issues required approaches which were acceptable in both Aboriginal research and in majority Australian research. The degree of difficulty of this issue is compounded in this study, as a non-Aboriginal outsider is engaging in research in which all of the participants are Aboriginal.

Harris (2001, 32) explained the difficulties faced in such research, by classifying the constraints of cultural relativism in terms of emic and etic. To Harris, emic is when “operations have, as their hallmark, elevation of the native informant to the status of ultimate judge of the observer’s descriptions and analyses”. Etic, on the other hand, is characterized by “the elevation of observers to the status of ultimate judges” (Harris, 2001). The implied need is for the cultural gap between emic and etic to be reduced in the
design and practice of the research, as far as possible. One approach would be to utilize
the strictures adopted by the indigenist movement (Niezen, 2003; Misra & Mohanty, 2002,
Blaser et al., 2004; Minde, 2008; and Martin, 2003). Indigenism advocates recognition of
need, in raising the profiles of national management styles, and in validating their
effectiveness in delivering management outcomes. However, the indigenist movement
does not ensure proportionate attention to every Aboriginal management development
need, especially in those societies that may require broad scale and well-targeted
development of Aboriginal management theory and practice.

This research begins redressing this imbalance, building on the broadly based societal
work of Chapman et al. (1991), Bryant (1996), and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006), and
numerous Australian Aboriginal sources, by a more specific framing of management
education, within a specifically Australian context, and secondly, in verifying their findings
using appropriate dialogues with selected Aboriginal interviewees. The sequence of the
methodology adopted was to justify the selected approaches and how they best fit
Aboriginal needs, then to outline the preparatory considerations and plans for the conduct
of interviews and finally to explain the special ways in which cultural differences affect
ethical protocols in the research fieldwork.

Many holistic concepts emerge from a review of the literature on research methods
including critical discourse analysis, narrative analysis and reflexivity. Critical discourse
analysis (Wodak and Meyer, 2009) is recommended as a research methodology useful to
facilitate disclosure of participants' social world and identities. The importance of reflexivity
in Australian Aboriginal research, according to Martin (2003; 2008b), is that it challenges
the researcher to acknowledge shortcomings, misunderstandings, oversights and

Aboriginal preferences for qualitative and case study approaches need to be coupled with a congruent way of analysing the data. This can be achieved by utilising Eisenhardt's (1989) techniques for building theories from case study research by providing descriptions, testing theory and generating theory. Eisenhardt's approach is said to be most appropriate in new areas of research with little extant literature, because it does not rely on previous literature or empirical evidence (Ravenswood, 2011, 681). In this research Eisenhardt's cross-case analysis was adopted so that early in the data collection new lines of thought could be routinely incorporated into subsequent interviews.

The participant-investigator dialogues were analysed after each meeting for the extent and types of motivations expressed, their quantity and quality. Attempts were made to elicit in dialogues and record elements involving Martin's (2003) reflexivity in order to align the case study approach with Aboriginal communication preferences. A further factor raised and explored was D'Iribarne's (2009) duality of espoused theory / theory-in-use, also reflected in the approaches of Argyris (2008) and Senge (1990) to management education.

Whilst critical discourse analysis can envelop the whole of methodology, in this study it is limited to a method of special importance. This is because critical discourse is holistic, as it integrates all of the major social sciences (Wodak and Meyer, 2009), and is appropriate for investigation. It is also reflexive and includes non-verbal aspects of Aboriginal communication (Foley, 2000; Williams, 2007). It is moreover, consistent with the case study and narrative approaches, as it utilizes 'critical incidents' in life narratives, those
'psychological moments' that are revelatory and invite deeper discussion. An attempt also was made to employ methods from the narrative analysis favoured by Richmond (2002), as it is closest to the idea of 'storying' advocated by Williams (2007), which captures the shared unity of the Aboriginal voice. Richmond's key of core narrative was used to evaluate each participant narrative and to search for dominant narratives common to all participants. All of the research case studies were provided spontaneously in the form of "life narratives", which makes for finding personal meaning in life stories, according to Richmond. Further, her advice to distinguish events as lived from events as told offered a useful method of incorporating the spiritual side of the presentation of cases, as it introduces a way of interpreting the variety of spiritual forces as causes of real life events of Aboriginal participants, and widens the scope for observing their approach to reviewing life reflexively.

3.2.1 Adoption of qualitative methodology

Issues of context make it necessary to adopt approaches to this research that have credibility both-ways (Herbert, 2007). Doing so, requires that the methodology and findings need to be reported in a way that equalizes understanding both-ways. In keeping with an world-view, a qualitative approach is favoured because of the issue of perceived relevance, consideration of the comfortable involvement of participants, and sharing of interpretations of research findings. Whilst Chapman et al. (1991); Bryant, (1996; 2004), and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006; 2011) did not classify their face to face interviews with their Aboriginal participants as structured or unstructured, all these studies were clearly qualitative. In their analysis of verbal data, they looked for themes that characterize preferred behaviours, which are then described under discrete headings, like collectivism.
They emphasized the importance of avoiding questions that call for speaking on behalf of other participants. The nearest equivalent Western methodology to the descriptors of technique of the these studies is the case study method.

### 3.2.2 Preference for Aboriginal-Insider approaches

Williams (2007) has reminded researchers that Aboriginal Australia is "an oral society" where "yarning" is the carrier of Aboriginal epistemology. This means that the communications of the Aboriginal student will rely less on written learning, and more on experience and careful observation. One example he gives is the tacit imparting of knowledge from the place of a sacred site (2007, 61). Foley (2000, 19) had previously made the similar observation, that "You cannot rely on verbal behaviour as evidence to determine culture outcomes". Foley (2000, 20) strongly supports the generous investment of time in observations of behaviours, such as the application of authority, in order not to err on the side of the cultural standards of the observer, nor to garner evidence that unwittingly produces culturally inaccurate generalizations of the observed by ignoring the rich variety of individual tribal and post-colonial experiences in the Aboriginal groups being researched.

### 3.2.3 Williams' Dialogic Exchange

Dialogic Exchange operates from the perspective of the Aboriginal-Insider. Its participant-oriented approach is realised through rigorous attention to the behavioural expectations of culture, including research ownership and nuanced methods of communication that fully appreciate world-view differences.
The aim of Williams' (2007, 115) methodology is to give ascendancy to Aboriginal cultures throughout their post-colonial worlds. Post-colonial could be described as correspondingly post-traumatic. The typical participant of a study was therefore assumed to be more likely to be transiting a healing process, progressing towards being made whole by developing identity. It is important in Dialogic Exchange that the researcher allows time and talk to happen in a naturally Aboriginal style (Williams, 2007, 157), until it has become clear that the participant has assumed a position of ownership of the act of providing dialogic information. This ownership is not only personal, but may also be held in common with other family or extended family members, including elders. Ownership of the extended family as stakeholders of the research cannot be realised within strict Western time frames.

Similarly, Williams (2007, 116) recognizes that allocating participants to categories such as urban or tribal are problematic. The very idea of categorising participants needs to be challenged, lest it become a hidden barrier to opening the “Telling” phase of the Williams methodology, which precedes Dialogic Exchange, the final and most valued level of communication style between researcher and participant. Therefore, techniques need to be adopted, that allow the participant power to externalize feelings, experiences and attitudes. Ideally the vehicle for expression would take the form of personal narratives, which validate cultural symbols and ontologies. As previously discussed, the tool by which these concepts may explain Aboriginal management style and theory is most likely to be metaphor.

3.2.4 Choice of case study method
One way of maximising Aboriginal participant expression was by employing Williams (2007) Dialogic Exchange, using as a vehicle the Case Study Method of Stake (1995), Yin (2009) or Glaser & Strauss (2012). Swanborn (2010, 25-26) has argued that case study is appropriate under particular circumstances:

- when the impetus for our research project lies in some broad, familiarizing, questions about a social process;
- when there is a general absence of knowledge about the process;
- when researching people’s thoughts, values, expectations, motives, opinions, experiences, attitudes, behaviours; and
- when we are interested in the differences between people’s responses to questions on these eight issues.

All of Swanborn’s (2010) conditions are evident in the proposed study, especially in regard to the previously mentioned neglect of this area of research and consequently the absence of any breadth of knowledge about the process.

Patton (2002, 447) singles out the case study method as holistic, and this equates with Aboriginal motivational orientation to "whole of life" approaches. Stake (1995, 133-135) regards the case study method as being suited to highly personal data, situational research, unique circumstances and "in depth" studies. Again, these characteristics align with Aboriginal needs. The conditions summarized for successful case study presented by Yin (2009, 1) also apply:

- how and why questions are being posed;
- the investigator has little control over events; and
the focus is on a contemporary phenomenon, within a real life context. Further fine tuning is added with the employment of Williams' (2007) Dialogic Exchange, and Martin's (2003) reflexivity, in order to align the case study approach with communication preferences.

3.2.5 Reflexivity and Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander research

Archer (2000,110) defines reflexivity as "the magic ingredient by which persons are created as self-conscious, self-controlling and autobiographically aware beings". In her strong support of indigenist approaches to research, Martin (2003; 2008a; 2008b; 2008c), a forthright critic of past errors made in Aboriginal studies, insists on reflexivity as a research imperative. Her fellow Aboriginal academic, Herbert (2005, 2), prefers the term self-reflection, with Green and Baldry (2008, 396) using the phrase “core and common ways of being”. Systems theorists, Sandywell (1975, 2003), Wheatley (1992; 2005) and Luhmann (1986; 1989; 1995; 2000b), (Luhmann & Schorr, 2000), also argue strongly for its inclusion universally, although Wheatley and Luhmann use an alternative but closely synonymous term, self-reference.

Martin's (2003; 2008b) broader canvas depicts an Aboriginal research design that celebrates a relational ontology and flexibility. By this means, respect has been accorded in understanding that research is not a priority in times of crisis, grieving, celebration, ritual or maintenance of relations amongst (Aboriginal) Entities.

Further benefits of a reflexive and relational approach accrue in the form of:

- affording space to decolonize Western research methodologies;
ensuring relatedness of self and Entities to research work;
claiming shortcomings and re-claiming lives; and
making changes, but retaining Identity (Martin, 2003, 212).

Whilst Martin's judicious counsel relates to research, her words are place-conscious, supported by the evidence of non-Aboriginal Australian researchers, Memmott and Long (2002), and Malpas (2006), and holistic.

3.2.6 Narrative methods and discourse analysis applied to research evidence

The works of Chapman et al.1991; Bryant, 1996, 2004; Sveiby & Skuthorpe, 2006 & 2011, are silent on particular methodologies, such as case study or qualitative techniques. Williams' (2007) dialogic exchange expresses the view that Aboriginal methodologies do not fit comfortably into the nomenclature and practice of conventional Western social sciences, but require specifically Aboriginal approaches. However, Sveiby & Skuthorpe's (2011) study of leadership in Australian Aboriginal society involves the analysis of many Dreamtime narratives of the Nhunggabarra band and their translation into principles, that form a philosophy of Aboriginal leadership. This research could be understood as taking these principles, and collating them with those elicited by Chapman et al.1991; Bryant, 1996, 2004; Sveiby & Skuthorpe, 2006 & 2011, and other authors, to generate case study evidence from representative urban Aboriginal participants about their motivations.

The critical discourse analysis of Wodak and Meyer (2009) appeared most compatible with the needs indicated by Williams (2007). Some areas of commonality, according to Wodak
and Meyer (2009, 7) were that critical discourse analysis stipulates that researchers should avoid giving the impression of being part of a power structure in which they may be perceived by the participant as occupying a more powerful position. Further, using self-reflexive techniques, researchers should emancipate themselves from delusions of dominance, including that created by the competitive environment of the knowledge-based economies in which the research is undertaken (Wodak and Meyer, 2009, 22). Again, critical discourse analysis favours bottom-up explanations and "the dialectical relationships between semiosis and other elements of social practice" (2009, 27). One of the analytical techniques advised by Wodak and Meyer (2009, 51) was that the analyst should continue to analyse new materials until it is observed that arguments begin to repeat themselves, which should be regarded as theoretical saturation. This was evidenced in conversations recorded with the seventh and eighth participants, which tended to reinforce the themes set by the previous interviewees.

3.3 Research procedures

3.3.1 Selection of participants

The advice of Rubin and Rubin (2005, 70) influenced the choice of participants:

You do not have to talk to a lot of people, but you have to talk to people who have had the appropriate experience, are knowledgeable, and are able to explain to you what they know. You need to select interviewees who collectively present an overall view of your topic, while at the same time choosing them with sufficiently different backgrounds to provide convincing evidence for the theory you are trying to build.

Advertisements explaining the research were placed on the noticeboards of AES (Employment Strategy), Eora TAFE, Darlington and the University of Sydney. The selections of participants were made on the basis of gender equality, four male and four female, self-identification as Aboriginal, willingness to discuss motivations, maturity (age group 30-60), work experience, and verbal fluency. Two participants, Una and Michael,
who held positions equivalent to community elders, recommended half of the other participants Frank, Steven, Natalie and Kathy. All participants, except Steven (recovering from jail time) were experienced managers. Una and Emily working in corporates, Frank, Noel and Natalie, who were self-employed, elders Michael and Kathy with past and present successes in community organizations.

The research assumptions were that participants had sufficient experiences to provide anecdotal stories of significant events that have shaped the management of their lives and occupations. These may have affected them positively or negatively, and may still influence their approach to the workplace, or their intentions about the future. Such whole of life personal stories include cultural or influential figures, whom they regard as archetypes, role models, spiritual entities, heroes from sport or legendary tales, characters from books, drama or performing arts. Although the invitations were circulated only within the Darlington and Redfern suburbs of Sydney, most participants had country origins. The result supported the view that “urban Aboriginal people have experiences similar to their rural and remote counterparts” (Baldry, Green and Thorpe, 2006, 372).

Interviews of one hour were arranged for each participant, for two sessions, separated by intervals averaging one month. Data has been distilled from unstructured discourse, especially those responses found to be metaphorical or archetypal. In addition, evidence beyond strictly verbal responses has been taken into account. These responses were classified individually into one of two groups of motivational factors, the first personal or individual, illustrated in Figure 24 (p.203) and the second environmental. The two groups are divided between individual / functional and collective / environmental, following Luhmann’s (1995) model of modern world society in which social systems operate in one
of two spheres. The first is an operational sphere where decisions are made in clustered functional systems, like law, education, and finance. The second is an environmental sphere where decisions of greater complexity are made, such as between spirituality and materialism.

**Figure 24  Personal, individual and functional motivations**

*Source: Edrawsoft.com*

The second grouping comprises motivational forces found in the environment of the system of functionally contained motivations, as illustrated in Figure 25.

*Source: Edrawsoft.com*
The stipulations placed on involvement as a participant gave rise to two consequences, first it included volunteers self-identifying as exclusively Aboriginal, and also those who could be characterised as flexibly bi-cultural, that is able to switch cultures and perform comfortably in either cultural mode (Benet-Martinez, Leu, Lee and Morris, 2002, Brannen and Doz, 2010). Secondly, it ensured that respondents were individuals with achievements of which they were proud, and who would be regarded as exceptional in both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal societies. Further, by ensuring strong Aboriginal identity, it also developed a high level of connectedness with the aims of the research, and a willingness
to co-operate by reflexively reviewing lives and work experiences and clearly articulating
their narratives.

3.3.2 Summary of research phase activities

In all contacts with the participants, it was made clear that they owned the research and
that the researcher's role could be explained in eleven steps:

1. Arrange time and place of interview with volunteer, by phone, email, SMS. Discuss
   intention to sound record interview at proposed meeting.
2. Prepare sound recording machines for meeting.
3. Greet interviewee, remind that recording is intended, and pass over CSU
   instructions for signature after reading and responding to any questions.
4. Explain the notion of researcher as learner to interviewee.
5. Read verbatim from prepared dialogue sheet on Duality, Balance, or other
   motivational element under scrutiny.
6. Wait for response, and answer with affirming statement, rather than a direct
   question.
7. Explain that additional confidentiality will be ensured by using a pseudonym and
   discuss acceptable name with interviewee.
8. After interview, transcribe sound recording and mail the text to the interviewee by
   email or postal service, requesting any need for change to text.
9. Review text with interviewee at next meeting, before moving on to new material.
10. Prepare thesis wording relating to interview in draft format and send to interviewee
    for checking and approval.
11. Finally, send copy of draft thesis to interviewee checking that interviewee's section
in thesis is considered accurate.

### 3.3.3 Content of interviews

Each of the interviewees was introduced to the research by the researcher-participant information sessions by phone and in person prior to commencement of interviews. They were promised confidentiality via anonymized texts over which they would have editorial control.

Unstructured interviews were employed, following the advice of Marvasti (2004, 20), and Bailey (1994, 194), whose views jointly are congruent with the 'unconditional positive regard' of Rogers (1994, 283). Rogers' attitude to clients appears to be the closest Western equivalent to Martin's (2003, 210) references to relatedness and what Williams (2007, 108) terms "culturally embedded methodology". In practice, this would mean that reduction in structure would be accompanied by unconditional positive regard for both male and female Aboriginal participants.

Figure 26, p.207, summarizes the process planned for the final steps in documenting the research process. Each participant was advised of these intended steps prior to the interviews, and assured that they would receive draft copies of any text which concerned their own contribution to the process, or any interpretation of it by the researcher.
It was deemed important to avoid the impression of hierarchy in the roles of interviewer and participant, following the advice of Williams (2007, 32).

The interview can be threatening to the Aboriginal participant. It customarily assumes a position of interviewer as leader and interviewee as subordinate or inferior. Similarly other items from the common lexicon of research need to be approached critically, adopting an attitude of observer from the inside. Words such as recruited, selected or ranking connote researcher as superior and participant as inferior and should therefore be avoided.

The descriptions of interviewer’s contributions to dialogue, which follow, were aimed at eliciting a parallel dialogic response from the participant, by analogy, rather than by interrogation. The yarning prompt for interpersonal dialogue was provided from two sources:

Source: Edrawsoft.com
(i) quotations on the same motivation from respected researchers, that were read to the participant, and
(ii) the life experiences of the investigator, which were drawn on when appropriate to complement the conversational offerings of the participant.

Each participant was given sequentially three texts in draft form:

(1) transcript of interview,
(2) transcript of analysis of interview and
(3) copy of thesis,

and invited to comment.

Follow up by phone after receipt of each of the three texts was made to ensure that no reservations were held prior to publication.

3.3.4 Use of Dialogic Exchange statements in motivations

The following quotations are typical of the observations of prominent Aboriginal writers and commentators on the concepts being investigated for motivational relevance. The quotations therefore offer an alternative to the questionnaire method of posing a question in the style of Western interrogators. For Dialogic Exchange Williams recommends open-ended questions (2007, 122) and yarning (2007, 227). The quotations were selected with these ideas in mind, so as to give minimum offence to the Aboriginal interviewees, for whom blunt and direct questions may not have been acceptable.

The quotations substitute for questions about:

Duality
Balance
3.3.4.1 Duality

"What is the source of the dualities that we observe in the world? Whence comes dialectics - the interplay and transformation of such oppositions? Why are so many phenomena bifurcated, polarized"?

Source: Pearson, N. (1999, 75-76)

"This next response doesn't shy away from reality. To begin with, that dual identity issue is something I straddle every day. I guess I can only confirm that what is said here is an accurate assessment based on my own experience. Colonialism has affected all of us in one-way or another. The reality is people have to survive in two societies. You have to have dual identities. I saw the ‘two-way philosophy’ breakdown; students at...tried to implement it but came up against non-Aboriginal resistance, which led to burnout and frustration".


"When I think back to my earliest ideas of duality, it first appeared in my school and church instructions in religion, when I was told that the Bible teaches us that, at times, we have to choose between God and Caesar, in other words, in Australia, between our religion and the Australian or State governments. At the same time, my parents were telling me to be..."
good boy, not a bad boy. This was another early duality – good / bad. However, these two dualities tended to blend together, as I saw it, God was more important than the government, and doing what your parents wanted was doing what God wanted.

I have been told that NSW Aboriginal communities have a well-known duality, Eagle and Crow, and there are other dualities in different Australian places, but I'm not sure what they are . . . .

Source: Investigator experience

3.3.4.2 Balance

"Keep the notion of balance in mind. A dynamic balance such as we see in nature . . . . . . .
talk of Ganma brings another image to my mind. A deep pool of brackish water, fresh water and salt water mixed. The pool is a balance between two different natural patterns, the pattern of the tidal flow, salt water moving in through the mangrove channels, and the pattern of the fresh water streams varying in their flow across the wet and dry seasons . . .
Balance between different points of view is possible. That's what our Yolngu life is all about. Balancing difference between Yirritja and Dhuwa, between women and men and so on. Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australians can value and protect their differences while still finding ways to work at balance".

As early as I can remember, my parents told me I had to get my life in balance. My mother insisted on a balanced diet and my father, who was an active sportsman, wanted me to balance study and sport. Some would say, we have the balance just right in Australia,
between work and leisure, rights and responsibilities, wealth and poverty. Others might say we have much to do before we can feel ok about the way things are......

Source: Investigator experience

3.3.4.3 Place

"In terms of pedagogy, first and foremost we emphasized the importance of the physical setting of teaching .... Pedagogy would be to teach on the land .... We need Dreaming setting for teaching .... You can't get a better place to teach kids than the bush, it puts them in their own element".


"In the explanation, the country was shaped by people, in the Western one by nature. An (Aboriginal) place can be partly or wholly created by acting special types of behaviour at a particular piece of environment".


As a child, I lived in country town, in a small white house, in the last street, at the foot of a mountain. I was allowed to wander and played hunter with my slingshot. Then my Dad was transferred to Sydney and we lived in a flat in a crowded suburb. This was a shock to my system, as I missed the bush birds. The city pigeons were not a good substitute. You may have some experience of a special place from your childhood or where you go to recharge your batteries. Maybe you have lots of them ....

Source: Investigator experience
3.3.4.4 Spirituality

"I cannot overstate how focal our spirituality is to us; it is our life guide".


"So what are these (Aboriginal) values? Well, from the viewpoint of my lens I see our core social value as collectivism, our core cultural value as spirituality and our core political value as autonomy".


"Once I was invited to an AA meeting as a guest and I listened to the narratives of the fall and recovery of several alcoholic men. These men reported two things lifting them out of personal disaster, the collective support of other members of AA, and a power outside themselves. Since the AA meeting, I have believed that these strengths represent a broader spirituality that is available to humankind, regardless of race, culture or religion. My understanding is that Aboriginal spirituality affects lives more deeply than it does in the broader Australian community. You may remember a life-changing event in your past. A special moment, with a spiritual message, possibly with positive results, or disappointment, leaving a spiritual deficit....."

Source: Investigator experience

Arising from the review of the literature, there were two mutually associated issues of importance to both Aboriginal researchers and non-Aboriginal researchers; were reflexivity and theory-in-use (as distinct from espoused theory). But these are not strictly mainstream motivational factors. However, they were deemed to be important enough to record, when
they emerged in dialogues or alternatively to introduce them in the following texts:

3.3.4.5 Reflexivity

" A prominent Australian Aboriginal academic, Martin (2003) explained that reflexivity is an important part of the way of researching. In Martin's (2003) words "reflexivity challenges us to claim shortcomings, misunderstandings, oversights and mistakes, to re-claim our lives and make strong changes to our current realities". This is an important reminder for me about the way I carry out my research, and how I communicate in all of my meetings. In the event that I am misunderstood, it is up to me to find a better way of putting my words together, rather than assuming that my listener is at fault.

"Another example of reflexivity is found in the difference, if any, between what we say we do and what we actually do in practice. This is part of the idea of theory-in-use......"

Source: Investigator experience

3.3.4.6 Theory-in-use

In each of the interviews an attempt was made to examine the experience of participants in distinguishing theory-in-use from espoused theory in the workplace. This was included as it is central to Argyris' (2008) double loop learning and an important aspect of reflexively examining management decisions. The preamble to dialogue was introduced using variations of the following text:

In the workplace, it is not unusual for managers to blame a staff member for the errors of
management. This places the burden of poor performance on someone who is not responsible for the error. The worker's morale weakens, the manager's reputation suffers, and the fault in the system remains unfixed. When asked, the manager may deny blaming workers, but the staff knows that the excuse is espoused theory, not theory-in-use.

A better manager will not act defensively. There will be a reflexive pause, whilst the problem is considered, and a solution is found, often with the help of some or all staff. It becomes a collective solution, owned by all.

You may have come across this circumstance from time to time. Typically, a manager will proclaim fairness to all (espoused) but you know what is really in use is not the so called Aussie fair go....

Source: Investigator experience

The dialogues prompted by these texts between researcher and participant were recorded with their permission and transcribed to computer files. In turn, these files were copy-typed and formed the basis for the analysis discussed below and in Chapter 4.

3.4 Preparing for analysis of data

3.4.1 Introduction

In anticipating the need to employ a method of developing elements of a theory of Aboriginal management education the processes suggested by Eisenhardt (1989) were utilized. Eisenhardt reviewed all of her literature findings to distil the best ways in which the evidence of case studies might provide data for building theory. Her eight step method, and corresponding relationships with the methodology adopted for this research and its
outcomes, are illustrated at Figure 27. Each of the eight steps is formatted as follows:

**Figure 27  Building theory from case study research**

- **Getting started**

- **Definition of research question & apriori constructs**
  
  " Whilst the research question was broad, the constructs within the ambit of motivational influences became clear from literature, and maintained their focus throughout the interviews."

- **Selecting cases**

- **Neither theory nor hypothesis; specified population theoretical sampling**
  
  "The respondents invited to interview proved to be articulate and dedicated to preserving their Indigenous identity. All selectees could be described as satisfying Eisenhardt's stipulation of *theoretically useful.*"

- **Crafting instruments and protocols**

- **Multiple data collection methods**
  
  "The choice of instruments was dominated by the innovatory nature of Williams' Dialogic Exchange, with its specific design intention of use in this and future approaches to Indigenous Australian social research."

- **Entering the field**

- **Overlap data collection and analysis; flexible methods**
  
  "From the first interview onwards, adaptations had to be made to hypotheses, such as that identity could be merged with other entities. The emergence of the nexus between balance and identity proved decisive."
3.4.2 Providing for evaluation of dialectical themes

In the analysis of the research data it would not have been holistic to treat the researcher
or participant as separated from human cultures and emotions, or unaffected by the relationships between them, or with others. However, the dynamic of greatest interest in this research is the process that can be identified as dialectical, that is the tension between opposites such as individual / societal. In this regard, Aboriginal symbolic content was examined in the context of Figure 4 (p.55). Adams’ radial view of the psyche, with his four additional dualisms, and Morgan’s (2006) metaphorical possibilities. What Adams (1997, 46) is presenting is a collective unconscious that is not only archetypal (natural, trans-historical, trans-cultural, trans-ethnic), but also stereotypical (historical, cultural, ethnic). This results in a division of the collective unconscious into both cultural conscious and cultural unconscious. In practical terms, this is a useful way of approaching the data analysis stage of the research. It counterpoints the importance of the well understood image of stereotypes. It also details a novel method of understanding how the differential influences of nature and culture determine the ways in which Aboriginal and other Australian managers may process archetypes, using techniques typical of humankind but with fitting personal imagery.

Adams’ representation of a more complex reality for comprehending motivational drivers has much in common with theories-in-use arguments put by Argyris (2008, 47) and D’Iribarne (2009). Adams’ applies the methodology employed by depth researchers, utilising duality to admit stereotype, an energising opposite to archetype, and to remind the researcher that both have to be further examined for their positive and negative elements, and to what extent they are also personal or collective.

Other theorists attempt to harness dualisms to explain management personalities by accessing their impressions of the character traits of Greek gods. Handy (1995) draws on
both Adams' (1997) research approach of a radial output from dualistic opposites and Greek mythology. Adams' (1997) exposes in Figure 4 (p.55) the difficulty of depicting the emergence of a radial higher third in only two dimensions. Ideally, the imagining of radial would be of a bell in three dimensions, in other words, a real bell, or its 3D avatar, which would be both spinning and orbiting, as described by Kort and Reilly (2002) and Pearson (2010).

In researching field-dependent (high context) or Aboriginal societies, the inclination to developmental growth through a middle way can be viewed alternatively as inviting students to understand each conflict or opposing view to be resolved by imagining the statistical metaphor of the bell curve. This image assists in examining archetypes and metaphors, the verbal extensions of archetypes. The radial grid of an archetype, metaphor or concept can first be considered in relation to its opposite. It can also be studied in terms of its personal / collective, unconscious / conscious or negative / positive possibilities. It should be noted that Adams' (1997) analysis, in utilising the oppositional negative / positive is not simply duplicating the primary opposition of archetype / stereotype. He is rather moving to a deeper level, by observing that an archetype can be perceived in both honorific or defamatory terms, and so can stereotype.

3.4.3 Preparation for impacts of contested meanings in dialogues with participants

In preparing for dialogic conversations with participants phrasing assumed to be incompatible with Aboriginal ontology was avoided. Utilizing the filter of the "critical discourse" method, ambiguous Western terms, like "freedom" and "choice" were regarded as having different contextual implications for the researcher and participants.
Similarly, care was taken whenever a word drawn from Nakata’s (2007b, 217) “contested knowledge spaces” was used. McGloin (2009) regards this as an emotive glossary negotiated constantly by Aboriginal Australians, but not by the majority culture. In the interviews for this research, the most common of these contested word choices were "invaded" or "settled". Using a word like "freedom" thoughtlessly, or avoiding the word "invasion", could mark the researcher from an Indigenous perspective as either a denialist or lacking knowledge.

Smith and Ward summarize Merlan's position on understanding as grasping what things mean. It is knowing how to interpret and respond to things, not about giving things definitive representations as independent realities (2000,11). This distinction was used in respect to framing interview questions about definition, in relational terms, and in comprehending the profound difference between how the non-Aboriginal researcher and Aboriginal participant conceptualize place.

Aboriginal authors differed in their views of which component of their culture occupies a central position. For example, Martin (2003) emphasises reflexivity and Williams (2007) spirituality. The expectation set for dialogic responses at interview was therefore that there may be differences amongst participants on this issue. It was therefore unsurprising that participants also had different views. Participant Una emphasised identity and Steven spirituality. In the Queensland Government (1999) booklet of ethical procedures quoted below the central issue is land. The underlying message from Aboriginal Australia is that systemic approaches regard all conceptual elements as vital, just as all members of a circle management group (Figures 7, p.60 and 28, p.227) are vital for the optimal
3.5 Ethical considerations in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander research

In its booklet, protocols for the negotiation and consultation with Aboriginal people, the Queensland Government (1999) framed its policy for ethical procedures to be followed by its staff servicing the State's Aboriginal clients in appropriately holistic terms: “Traditionally religion, culture, law, society, economy and the land are inextricably linked and Aboriginal people today see issues holistically. Land is often said to be the essence of Aboriginal spirituality” (1999, 5).

These words direct the researcher's attention in a completely different direction, or indeed into a different dimension, in addressing the definition of the term ethics, and how it is realised in research with Aboriginal peoples. Expressed in terms of field practice by Canadian, Marlene Castellano (2004), ethics need to be framed in cultures in terms of perceptions of reality and right behaviour, and how these may clash with prevailing norms of Western research (2004, 98). This dislocation of perceptions is felt at its widest in the conception of personhood. In Western terms the human person stands head and shoulders above other entities and has rights that reflect this superiority. Castellano (2004, 103) informs Western researchers that the difference in societies is that the boundaries of the person's spirituality and materialism are easily crossed, as are the boundaries between humans, animals, plants and natural elements. In this sense, rights equal to those of the individual human may extend to all of the constituents of society. Added to this is the priority given to what people do, over what people say in Aboriginal cultures. For the researcher, this means that behaving in a way that does not clash with Aboriginal ways of
doing is both good and ethical.

If we begin with the premise that a participating Aboriginal community should own the research, then clearly this aspect has to be covered at the earliest. In the case of this research, an appropriate owner was found, as a first step, in the Aboriginal Employment Strategy, in company with its staff and Aboriginal residents of the nearby community of Sydney's inner western suburbs of Darlington, Redfern, Surry Hills, Waterloo, and Alexandria. Secondly, three participants with the status of elder were engaged within the group, and their advice was followed assiduously.

As a consequence, some of the constraints of Western research praxis for dealing with human subjects had to be varied when there was a clear downside risk of following the Australian "medical model" of professional to client relationships. For example, restrictions regarding inter-personal relationships would almost certainly be self-defeating, as it is expected in Aboriginal communities that trust will be built up slowly on the basis of growing personal relationships. Furthermore, the end of the research cannot mean the sudden end of any relationship that an participant wishes to continue, as this would compromise both the research and the good-will needed to foster further research by relationship building with the community.

In practical terms, the role of the Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC) was made clear to each interviewee, as soon as the volunteer had indicated a wish to proceed with the interview.

Steps followed in assuring Informed Consent for each interviewee:
• The purposes of the research were discussed, together with the expected duration of the interviewee's participation. The time between the interviews and a detailed description of the process were also covered.

• Foreseeable risks or discomforts to the interviewee were considered.

• Confidentiality was discussed and measures to address it were addressed. In all cases a pseudonym was agreed upon. It was also agreed that biographical details, such as place names, would be anonymized.

• Confidentiality of records of interview and reporting was assured.

• The social benefits to the community and education, especially in management, were discussed.

• It was explained that participation is voluntary, and that the interviewee may discontinue at any time without penalty.

• In passing over the one-page information sheet from the Ethics Committee to the participants, participants' attention was drawn to penultimate paragraph about access to the Committee in the event of any issue that troubled the interviewee. As indicated in the preceding pages the Protocol number issued by Charles Sturt University approving this research was 2011/126”.

The expectations for the design of the methodology of this research were that it would observe the guidelines of the Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC) and the National Statement on ethical conduct in Human Research, especially as they relate to
research involving Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders, whilst respecting the rights of participants to have their world-views affirmed through the appropriate behaviour of the researcher. Further, the research questions needed to be fully answered, and the outputs of the research should both benefit Aboriginal Australians and provide the foundations for an Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy.

3.6 Conclusion

Explanations of research processes to be employed in the current study of Aboriginal management education, need to be derived from appropriate, and preferably recent, studies of Aboriginal management educational literature and well planned research practices within a particular Aboriginal society, in this case a composite inner-city grouping close to central Sydney.

Whilst the most recent comprehensive studies from North America were undertaken almost two decades ago, they are mutually validating and offer leads to the appropriateness of research techniques used in this research, which impacts the potential for further researching of Australian Aboriginal management education. Research methodologies that give prestige to Aboriginal Australian ways of knowing have been offered by Martin (2003; 2008a), and others, and these have been adopted for the current research. Complementary studies, by Adams (1997), Kort and Reilly (2002; 2008), Morgan (1993; 2006), Luhmann (1995) and others, whose research is well understood and respected world-wide, have been combined with studies undertaken from an Australian Aboriginal-Insider standpoint, and have influenced interviewing techniques in particular, and research design more generally. The choice of the case study method of Glaser &
Strauss (2012), Yin (2009) and Stake (1995) has been affected by considerations of best fit with Aboriginal-Insider needs.

It seemed essential, if this research into Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander motivations was to ensure optimum validity, to utilize a methodology that is of Aboriginal-Insider origin, and to couple this with a related qualitative methodology, in this example, the Case Study techniques of Glaser & Strauss (2012), Stake (1995) and Yin (2009). The research dialogues, based on the available literature, and the evidence of articulate Aboriginal participants, used appropriate metaphorical and archetypal influences of personal association with the interviewees.

With the benefit of the publications of Charles Sturt University’s Human Research Ethics Committee, which approved this research (Protocol Number: 2011/126), its associated professional groups, and the advice of community elders in the research, it appears that each of the key areas of expectation were met. Most participants made some adjustment to texts to correct errors, mainly regarding biographical details or spelling of tribal names, but not in regard to cultural issues, which appear to have been interpreted satisfactorily. Answers to the key research question were provided comprehensively, when the analysis of participant responses was considered in the light of the review of the literature. The outputs towards a theory of Aboriginal management education have proven abundantly available as well.
Chapter 4  Findings and analysis of data

4.1 Introduction

Three diagrams (Figures 21, p.162, 22, p.171, and 23, p.173) presented in Chapter 3 showed the way in which the main motivational factors, drawn from the literature and confirmed by responses from interviewees, can be illustrated. This conceptualization of motivations raises an apparent contradiction between the descriptions in earlier chapters of motivations as intrinsic and universal to all humankind, and the "special" motivations identified in this research for the Aboriginal peoples of the world.

Relief from the paradox can be found in the social separations between high context (field-dependent) cultures from their equivalent low context (field-independent) cultures, in which this research and its methodology originate. The predominant separator is the Aboriginal universal of holism. Its opposing duality, possibly coinable as unholism, carries the connotations of ' unholy' or even ' unhealthy', if resort is had to the etymology of the word holy and its relationship to good health. To the Aboriginal person, Western individualism is viewed skeptically, as it may be perceived as a threat to the psychological health of the community, and consequently its solidarity.

4.2 Evidence of participants in interview process
4.2.1 Personal motivations of participant Frank

Frank's life began in the world of the Kamilaroi nation in a town at the confluence of two rivers in north-western NSW. Whilst his childhood was rich in education, it proved unsuccessful in mainstream education, as his employment opportunities were limited by illiteracy. Later he moved to Wiradjuri country with his mother, to a larger town in the western part of the State. His life was, as a consequence, unremarkable until at the age of forty, when he moved to Sydney and began his transition to urban life. Frank saw opportunity in adult education, beginning studies in English which progressed to his true calling of professional short story writer of Dreamtime folk-tales, appropriate to either Aboriginal or non-Aboriginal childhood reading. He has survived a life-threatening illness to resume his writing, and active life within one of Sydney's urban Aboriginal communities.

4.2.1.1 Evidence of holism in Frank's outlook and motivations

There is little doubt that Frank's life has so far been one marked out by long term strategies (a holistic indicator), personal exertion, and enduring persistence. Progressing from illiteracy to literary success took planning, vision and determination. This is the more remarkable in the event that Frank's career began at a time in life in which some of the skills associated with professional writing, such as keyboard speed and computer competency, usually take longer, and require more effort and resilience to criticism. Frank connected a lyrical galactic holism in his vision of the heavens and their earthly associations in the following way:

If you look at the Milky Way you will see it's the shape of the emus and they're laying eggs. I have one egg at home and it's painted beautifully for me I'd never seen an egg done like
that before. An emu can satisfy a whole tribe for eggs.

4.2.1.2 Evidence of duality in Frank's attitudes and motivations

Frank is conscious of the dualities associated with differences between major Aboriginal divisions, like seaboard or water-associated clans and their land counterparts, the latter being Frank's own tribal-side totem. He has been in many conversations with colleagues of water moieties to find out more about the meanings of words of identical pronunciations, but with radically differing meanings.

Because of his earliest recollections of life in a town on the confluence of two rivers, his recognition of the implications of the Ganma image of merging of waters was strong and significant. In his own words: “At home we have two rivers that meet; the Namoi and the Barwon. And that's what Walgett means in the Kamilaroi language, the meeting of two rivers”. He associated the re-vivification of the Murray in the recent flood induced clearance of the river mouth as a motivational force of direct relevance to his own childhood experiences.

4.2.1.3 Evidence of balance in Frank's attitudes and motivations

There are some clear examples in Frank's life that strongly indicate motivation to re-balance. He recounts his progress as a young man convinced of his potential strengths as a rugby league footballer, but denied playing opportunity in his district team. Frank reacted with Gandhian strength of character, by reporting ready to play before each game and simply bench-sitting in readiness. After being ignored several times, opportunity came when team injuries and drop-outs compelled the coach to approve Frank's taking the field.
Within a short time, his place on the team became unassailable.

His physical collapse some years ago moved from life-support to recovery by way of months of physiotherapy, in which he learned to walk again, and to resume a professional career that is both fulfilling and successful. Characteristically of many in his generation of post-mature Aboriginal Australians in urban settings, much of his time is devoted to presentations on culturally relevant issues dedicated to community support and the growth of Aboriginal knowledge.

4.2.1.4 Identity as a factor in Frank's motivations

Frank's tolerant demeanour indicates a personal acceptance of majority Australians, combined with a good understanding of the strengths offered by Western reductionist science in the guise of the first-class medical technology, that literally saved his life. He is therefore committed to development of both-ways Aboriginal ontology. He realises fully his potential as an important contributor to Australian childhood education by means of stories, which capture the imagination of children of all ethnic backgrounds. Nevertheless, his social milieu appears to be enriched daily by his Aboriginal identity, as he explores more deeply tribal narratives that relate to his work.

4.2.1.5 Individual and power factors in Frank's motivations

Frank's written works empower his identity of Australian Aboriginality in a general sense. At the more personal level, his own biography would be remarkable in any cultural setting. His modest way of expression appears to normalize some of the exceptional themes that
enliven popular literature, for example, personal transformation, extraordinary persistence, resilience, steadiness of purpose, and career success. Viewed in hindsight, Frank’s life could be a model of self-motivated personal empowerment (Abu-Saad & Champagne, 2006), the story of a writer of narratives and legends of the Dreamtime, whose own life has the potential to become the substance of legend in its own right.

4.2.2 Culturally driven motivations in Frank’s evidence

4.2.2.1 Motivational indicators of place in Frank’s evidence

Birthplace and knowledge associated with surrounding bushland and riparian environment were important in Frank’s childhood and early learning experiences. He developed traditional bush skills and delighted in day-long treks, learning from his Uncles, gathering emu eggs, catching fish, and distributing them to the Aboriginal residents of his home town, gaining respect from them in the process. His childhood allowed him to experience the hunter-gatherer life style and to understand traditional ecology, for example always leaving two eggs in emu nests so as not to cause the bird to suffer or to restrict its breeding potential. These places in the north-west of the State are still "home" to him and his favourite place to re-create his spiritual side.

4.2.2.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Frank's life

Frank attributes his recovery from critical care to a guardian spirit (in the Western sense: a benevolent angel), in the form of an Aboriginal warrior from the Kamilaroi nation, who appeared in the ward when his recovery was unlikely in the opinion of attending doctors. In
Frank's words "he was pure (the essence of Aboriginality), with a red head-band, and beautiful eyes, with skin that was black and pure; he beckoned me to come back home to the land". Four days later Frank was taken off the critical list and on the way to recovery. Within Frank's ancestry there is a traditional sense of humour, for which he is grateful and feels for this reason spiritually gifted by Uncles who cherished humour and used it as a means of enjoyment and coping.

4.2.2.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Frank's motivations

Besides drawing strength from relationships with his nearest kin, Frank pays tribute as well to an African lady, whom he got to know during his time of recovery, and a Cherokee Indian paramedic. Both acted as coach and mentor during his long recovery, and he makes it clear that their Aboriginality was a connection of common bond. All of the providers of identity models and associations Frank mentioned during interviews had the common feature of Aboriginality, mainly from his Kamilaroi kin, but also in moieties of Australian origin, or in hospital, from respected friendships formed by contingency of need with two Aboriginal colleagues from other nations. Frank had the additional advantage that his mainstay of personal support during his early years was an Uncle of his immediate family, who was an elder accorded great respect by both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australians. Like Frank's, his Uncle's life was a model of community service and quest for reconciliation.

4.2.2.4 Narrative influences in Frank's motivations

Frank's narrative in the widest sense gives him a stake in the future of his favourite genre,
the Dreamtime story, and is correspondingly empowering, as his work takes on new ways of reaching wider audiences. His Dreamtime stories are humorous, engaging, and full of hope. The template of Australian unity placed before Frank in the narrative of his revered Uncle, was internalized as Frank's own world-view, an identification, in Freudian terms. In essence, this is a world-view that differs from that of the typical and less complicated setting of Australia on the one hand and majority Australia on the other. It is rather, Australia on the one hand and majority Australia (inclusive of Aboriginal nations) on the other. In this way the tension of difference is preserved, but the reality is in view at the same time.

4.2.2.5 Collectivist and power influences in Frank's motivations

It is clear that Frank's Uncle, an Aboriginal identity who constantly advocated a both-ways approach, was an influence that facilitated Frank's spiritually settled way of managing his moves to the Western districts, and later to urban Sydney. He is currently working on a video presentation of some of his works, and appears to be developing in pace with the technology on offer. It could be assumed that these new media will multiply the exposure of all Australian children to his works and be accepted with the same enthusiasm as his written works.

4.2.3 Summary of Frank's three research phases

4.2.3.1 Experiential evidence in Frank's discourse

In his near-death experience and recovery, Frank traversed a sequence in his life cycle
that was fraught but deserving of the title, epiphany. One element of this, his experience of
the appearance of a figure that featured the essence of Aboriginality, in particular Kamilaroi
Aboriginality, was unparalleled in his life, and therefore of major consequence. Depth
psychologists would interpret this event as a vision of and conversation with an archetype,
or primal image through which motivations are channelled. The precise nature of the
image increases its authenticity in Aboriginal ontology. This event alone would qualify as a
motivational driver of significance as Frank faces each day of his life.

However, it takes more than one exceptional experiential event to drive a life. Considering
Frank's childhood, the many sequences of experiences of learning from Uncles,
reinforcement of successful bush skills, and community approval, in combination with the
apparent rewards from persistence, in facing daunting life challenges successfully, all
came into play prior to Frank's illness. The archetypal presence later in life provided
additional, though profound, reinforcement.

4.2.3.2 Meaning of Frank's life experiences

Introspection about the meaning of life can take various trajectories, from steady
reinforcement to decline and despair. Frank demonstrates steady accretion over his
lifetime of a sense of purpose in life. Aboriginal lives well-lived need to be seen as an
experienced sense of contribution to community, not as a Western check list of
achievements and awards. In other words, community respect is key to a model Aboriginal
life lived wisely, and in this respect, Frank's is second to none. In his descriptions of it,
Frank's life has a deep and growing received sense of community appreciation of his
continuing development, and could be seen as exemplar of what it means to be truly
Aboriginal in modern Australia.

4.2.3.3 Analysis of findings about Frank’s motivations

There can be little doubt that Frank has demonstrated the long-termism that characterizes holistic approaches to life. In his case, this was set down for him in childhood in a way that, in terms of prospective mental health, could be viewed as ideal. He led a life as an child that would satisfy most of the conditions that Rousseau (1964) set out in his idealist vision of the holistically raised Western child, Emile. There are distinct similarities in these two cases. Rousseau's need for holistic development of Emile, necessitated a closed system approach, in which the child is strengthened by education in the natural. Emile's education was designed to develop a protective carapace against the degeneration of (Western) man.

For Frank, Rousseau's (1964) degeneration took the form of the junk food to which he became habituated upon taking up residence in Sydney. After several decades of healthy living on a diet rich in bush tucker, his health declined quickly, eating the readily available and popular food choices still damaging Aboriginal communities. Hospital diagnosis directly attributed Frank's physical collapse to dietary causes.

Whilst Frank's holism and need for balance, in his case educational balance, clearly influenced his transition to city living, and his motivation to seek his own version of self-actualization, he carried forward a limited access to knowledge about the dangers of a bad diet. It could be concluded that, although Frank was highly motivated to bring Western education into his holistic sphere, earlier deficits in his totally inadequate Western
education provided in his primary schooling, resulted in life threatening outcomes that all but destroyed his heritage within the Aboriginal community, including the unrealised body of work completed since his brush with death.

4.2.4 Personal motivations of participant Una

Una is of Kamilaroi ancestry and grew up in a north-western town in NSW, moving to the city later in life. Una did not have the same difficulties as many Aboriginal students with formal education, and acquired a position in the public sector. Violence in her marriage caused separation, and the need to care for three children as a single mother. Her abilities as a manager were recognized, and she was at the time of interview working as a general manager of an insurance group with a national presence. She had become troubled in an earlier position in human services, which involved dealing with issues of poverty and its negative effects on the Australian community and especially on Aboriginal Australians. She witnessed many examples of generational welfare dependence and became convinced that better ways could be found if the right insurance scheme could be devised. She is highly motivated to 'close the gap'.

Una remains in touch with her relatives in the north-west, and has thought through many of the issues currently vexing people and their understanding of identity. She is convinced that much needs to be done, but that the ultimate goal of equality with majority Australia is unattainable.
4.2.4.1 Evidence of holism in Una's outlook and motivations

When I raised the issue of circle management and showed an illustration of how it was practised in the Grameen Bank by the women of Bangladesh, Una immediately responded. Figure 28 (p.235) was shown to Una.

**Figure 28  Circle management - borrowers from Grameen Bank**

Source: Grameen Foundation - Creating a world without poverty (2012)

Una stated that she was aware of the benefits of this form of meeting in her personal management style, and had adopted it to run her own management meetings successfully. Circle management provides a working example of a holistic principle where each opinion is sought and valued. Una reported that it is also a good way of working out both detailed and strategic matters for her supervised staff.
4.2.4.2 Evidence of duality in Una's attitudes and motivations

Una was well aware of the dualities of the Aboriginals of NSW and the division between Eagle and Crow moieties. In Una's opinion:

Aboriginal people need to walk or work in two worlds. I think, being a fair-skinned Aboriginal person, people's reaction to me may not be the same as to a dark-skinned Aboriginal person. But it depends on the environment you're in and the people you're around. Certainly there is a difference walking in two worlds as such.

She was also aware that this is an issue that changes with environmental or contextual circumstances. Pearson's (2009) exposition of the need to find out more about the effects on behaviour of dualities gained Una's ready agreement. She commented further that materialism and spirituality form an uneasy duality in Australia, as they summarize the essence of the tension that continues to separate Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australia.

4.2.4.3 Evidence of balance in Una's attitudes and motivations

Walking in two worlds is a constant in Una's life, as she projects an ambiguous portrait to the unintroduced observer. She could equally present herself as Australian majority or Aboriginal and be accepted as either modality. In this way, she is truly bi-cultural, but has clearly dedicated her life to the Aboriginal side, in her pursuit of redressing the balance for her excluded culture. Moving Aboriginal adults from welfare to work is one of her strong objectives in the re-balancing she strives for. In the way Una approaches the world professionally and personally, it could be inferred that her definition of what it is to be Aboriginal in Australia would include "a person who seeks balance for Aboriginal people in all areas where they are deprived and their identity compromised". Contained within this
idea is a firm belief in the value of Aboriginal culture, which is worth striving for, given that
the fluidly bi-cultural individual could follow the majority pathway in a life of relative ease.

4.2.4.4 Identity as a factor in Una's motivations

To Una, identity is a major area of motivational energy for Aboriginal Australians. This
opinion was generated from Una's personal experience, of her majority Australian
appearance. In a Federal Court case against a Melbourne tabloid during the period of
Una's interviews, the difficulties for Aboriginal Australians' lacking distinctly Aboriginal
features exposed the difficulty for so called "white Aboriginals", who were alleged to profit
from their knowingly false claims to Aboriginal ancestry. With great clarity, Una pointed out
that measuring Aboriginal Australians as half, quarter and similarly false qualifications had
been used to discredit Aboriginal Australians historically. Una asserted that it is culturing
only that nurtures Aboriginality, and that appearance counts for very little. In the event, the
outcome of the case was equivocal, as the judgment correctly took the position put by
Una, but press coverage largely swamped the result in a deluge of defence of the freedom
of speech claimed stridently for Australian journalists, emphasising the problems aired by
Una at interview. Una's dedicated re-visiting of cultural events in the Kamilaroi traditional
areas, continues to re-inforce her Aboriginal identity. Just prior to the first meeting, she had
attended a ceremony celebrating the art and music of her people and was clearly affected
by the experience. The role models in Una's life were drawn largely from close relatives,
who had become educated at tertiary level, but continued to assert their Aboriginality. The
strength of her connection with identity is revealed in these words: "Well I think that your
identity is critical, because if you don't know who you are, it is hard to define your
relationship with others and the kinship attached to that. In our modern society a lot of our
(Aboriginal) identity is being lost”.

4.2.4.5 Individual and power factors in Una’s motivations

The problems of the powerlessness wrought by poverty in Australia was an area of concern to Una. She contemplated this in the broadest sense of the suffering caused to all Australians who were marginalized generationally. In Una’s case, the formation of this perception was generated by an observer, who is personally placed well above average in the management hierarchy, even if she were being judged from within an exclusively non-Aboriginal enclave. Her conclusion that the gap will never be closed therefore carries more weight than might be expected from a neophyte careerist, with less experience of the reality of the present power imbalances between the Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal worlds of work.

4.2.5 Culturally driven motivations in Una’s evidence

4.2.5.1 Motivational indicators of place in Una's evidence

Una’s regular returning to the places important to the Kamilaroi people is good evidence for the motivation of place in her life. She made two references to the pride she felt in coming from the area of north-western NSW where she was raised. Una made an unprompted comment on the connection she felt between place and education, when she stated "practical learnings are best taught in the environment they relate to". She also equated the attraction of place to Aboriginal dedication to the "the land and mother earth". Furthermore, Una believes that, for Aboriginal students, place and location had to be
given special attention, as spirits of place unknown to non-Aboriginal society could prevent student concentration in some circumstances.

4.2.5.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Una's life

In her descriptions about her work, Una reported her drive as a "passion". Upon further discussion, she made it clear that her passion derived from a deep need for assisting her Aboriginal clients to make up the gap they currently experience in careers, health and many areas of engagement with the community of majority Australia. She made several references also to the self-reliance that was so important in her view for Aboriginal Australians to develop, if they were not to fall into the abyss of an endless cycle of joblessness and welfare dependency. The need to re-balance status and achievement of the Aboriginal community was evidently the driving force behind her professional attitudes.

4.2.5.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Una's motivations

One recurring element in Una's discourse related to the counter-relational aspect of non-Aboriginal Australians, which divides Australian Aboriginality into mathematical proportions, for example, full, half, quarter. This reductionism she regarded as abhorrent. Una called it categorising and pigeonholing. This fits with Waters' (2004) rejection of Cartesian logical partitioning, and it evidently is equally a barrier to integrative tendencies in Australia, if Una's strongly argued criticism is widespread. The Aboriginal tendency is to embrace kin who observe traditional ways, which includes respect and social equality through enculturation, not measurement. This is the way that Una continues to follow, unimpressed by the alternative world-view of majority Australia.
4.2.5.4 Narrative influences in Una's motivations

In assessing the full narrative of past and future, Una has concluded that the goal of equality is a bridge too far, but she is still fully committed to the task of redressing the imbalances of opportunity between Aboriginal and majority Australia. She refers to the "ripple" effect of lack of education and health standards as of major importance, and a situation that continues to perplex her. Una's is a heroic position, to battle on in an unwinnable contest in which the odds are against you, and it is commendable in these circumstances that she continues to encourage Aboriginal staff to pursue IT training and Aboriginal management education to reach goals to the limit of their abilities.

4.2.5.5 Collectivist and power influences in Una's motivations

Una's adoption of the Grameen Bank's meeting style for her own staff communications conferences indicates an internalization of the principles of circle management. Furthermore, she is able to draw from the collective spirit of her declared Aboriginal identity to enable her career success in either Aboriginal or majority Australian corporations.

4.2.6 Summary of Una's three research phases

4.2.6.1 Experiential evidence in Una's discourse

Regularly visiting Aboriginal events that are authentic and situated place-appropriately
in Kamilaroi country is one way Una keeps her spirituality intact. In her meeting with 
female elders producing aboriginal artefacts, Una was at once experiencing home and 
culture concurrently. Una is sustained by the land and mother earth, but values those 
events that have natural settings, and which exactly reflect Aboriginality.

4.2.6.2 The meaning of Una's life experiences

Thoughtful reflection on issues such as what Aboriginality is, its past and its future, 
characterize Una's style of making meaning of her life as an Aboriginal woman working in 
a non-Aboriginal milieu. She is very situation-conscious regarding what she considers best 
for Aboriginal Australians, and she regards the living context of the community as 
paramount. She emphasizes the importance of considering individual differences and the 
inter-connectedness of all of the issues presenting Aboriginal Australians with major 
challenges.

4.2.6.3 Analysis of findings about Una's motivations

There is a tendency to idealism tempered by grounded reality checks behind Una's 
considerable drive for her own personal goals. Whilst there was little evidence overtly of 
ambition to move up the line in management, Una's career history and trajectory make it 
clear that she readily accepts responsibility and works with industrious determination. 
Moreover her progress indicates long term commitments, energized by closing the gap 
between her own people and majority Australia; in other words, a quest for identity by way 
of restoring the balance resulting from loss and suffering of Aboriginal Australians.
4.2.7 The personal motivations of participant Noel

Noel's father is from the Anaiwan clan of NSW, and his partner is from the Tiwi Island nation off the coast of North Australia. His children attend the local public school and their education is important to Noel and also to his partner. However, the diversity of Aboriginal cultures in their immediate ancestry, especially the division between Noel's land based clan, and his partner's water identity, create issues of debate and negotiation within the marriage.

After spending some time in jail, Noel had a personal transformation upon release. It was at this point that he decided that he would seek a new direction via education, and enrolled in Eora College, a TAFE specialising in Aboriginal education. He became a successful Aboriginal artist and teacher of art, and travels regularly between Sydney and regional Aboriginal homelands, including Uluru, seeking scenery and subjects to paint.

4.2.7.1 Evidence of holism in Noel's outlook and motivations

Noel's professional calling as artist enabled a fluent dialogue on the various figures shown at the interview to explain the motivational concepts under investigation. In particular, he commented that Figure 11 (p.90) was excellent for explaining the holistic concepts that constitute Aboriginal ways of observing the world, particularly the overlap and blending of ideas.

Both teacher and learner in his own perception, Noel provided evidence of considering the
whole system of learning. One further example of the holism he practises came from a remark he made about his own teaching style: "I always ask them (my students), do you have any input before moving on to any new subject".

4.2.7.2 Evidence of duality in Noel's attitudes and motivations

We talked at length about dualities. Noel had heard of Ying-Yang and recognized the common features of Ganma to his own knowledge of Aboriginal dualities. Ganma was especially significant to him as his partner is Tiwi, and therefore a saltwater moiety woman. Noel's is a fresh water, or land moiety. This leads to some working through of cultural education at home to accord an agreeable distribution of the knowledge of the moieties of both parents as a form of limited multi-culture. In Noel's own words: “My life is often lived in two worlds, between city living and painting far from Sydney. My children live close to the local school, but my wife and I need to educate them at home in the ways of their (Aboriginal) culture”.

4.2.7.3 Evidence of balance in Noel's attitudes and motivations

To some extent, the decisions and behaviour of Noel and his partner in dealing with the educational differences between Tiwi (sea) and Anaiwan (land) moieties to their children, provides evidence for an acknowledgement of the need for balance. Noel also remarked on the re-balancing of feelings he had when he had spent some time painting at sites such as Uluru, and felt the absence from his own homelands, requiring him to re-visit this State to relieve the pent up need to return to the sources of his spiritual well-being in New South Wales.
4.2.7.4 Identity as a factor in Noel's motivations

As the eldest of a large family, Noel fits naturally into leadership roles, but still draws on the strength he acquired as a child from the teachings of his mother’s brother, Uncle Ben, and his Aunties and other Uncles. More recently, when he has had to establish what amounts to a small business with art as the product, he received generous assistance from an Aboriginal elder (Aunty Barbara), who has established herself as a successful businesswoman, and who has had made herself available to Aboriginal people of the Sydney region as mentor. As Noel explains it: “My identity is most important to me. I have to talk to my wife about how to include her Tiwi (Sea) world view with my own clan's land based knowledge when we teach our children”.

4.2.7.5 Individual and power factors in Noel's motivations

Noel's is a biography of determination to break a cycle of misfortune through the system of formal education, made available to Aboriginal Australians by Eora TAFE, Tranby Aboriginal College, and other specialist tertiary opportunities in the Sydney region. There can be no doubt, from the evidence provided by Noel and others, that such educational agencies offer empowerment for those who have determination and appropriate resources. When commenting on his own leadership, Noel's self-assessment is that he is a reluctant leader, but will take leadership roles when there is a consensus amongst an Aboriginal group that they want him to. Typically, this happens when he is in regional settings, and he is seen as the only one of the group, who has the skills to question non-Aboriginal informants. In his own words about his leadership, "sometimes it just falls in
your lap and you just take it on board, especially when you look over your shoulder and
they say, you do it”.

4.2.8 Culturally driven motivations of participant Noel

4.2.8.1 Motivational indicators of place in Noel's evidence

Noel and his family, like most urban Aboriginal Australians, whilst respecting the tribal roots
of traditional ownership like Sydney's Cadigal nation, see their home place, or places, far
from the city. For this reason, Noel and his partner often visit the traditional homelands of
each parent, involving travelling to southern NSW and interstate alternately. This creates
an enriched vision of the cultural and formal education mix made available to Noel's
children, and especially reinforces their notion of the importance of place. Thus a large
investment is regularly made to ensure connections with diverse traditional homelands.

4.2.8.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Noel's life

Whilst Noel is a frequent visitor to Uluru, and is conscientiously respectful of the traditional
owners, the Anangu, he is emphatic that his spiritual affinity is with those two tribal regions
of NSW with which he was constantly in touch as a child. This indicates that Aboriginal
spirituality is strongly place-associated, and may be persistent through life, even when
Aboriginal people live away from their homelands almost permanently.

4.2.8.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Noel's motivations
Noel spends considerable time and effort, supported by his partner, in assisting in passing on Aboriginal knowledge to his five children. As distinct from traditional clan education, where observation of law is within prescribed moiety relationships, urbanization is clearly evolving more complexity in deciding what to teach, in the cultural sense, and how to teach it, as it may bring together two Aboriginal parents who, on traditional lands, would never meet. However, the evidence from Noel is that this task is not being put aside as "too hard", but rather that a thoughtful compromise is being carefully constructed and applied.

4.2.8.4 Narrative influences in Noel's motivations

Noel's storytelling is largely mediated by his visual conceptions of the Aboriginal world in his landscape paintings. The breadth of his travels, prior to his settling down in Sydney, covered much of Australia, and included qualifications attained at Batchelor College in the Northern Territory. His peripatetic movements to other regions, especially in the vicinity of Uluru, indicate that this may be a lifetime patterning of his storying of the Aboriginal world. It foreshadows something approaching a new synergy in which modern air transportation and information technology will produce hybrids in which Aboriginality will be externalized in multi-tribal and pan-Aboriginal ways for the better understanding of all Australians (Gopinath, 1998, 149). This ganma-like fusion finds resonance in the streams of social work being developed as “a hybrid, unique social work praxis for Australia” (Green and Baldry, 2008, 390).

4.2.8.5 Collectivist and power influences in Noel's motivations

Noel is very circumspect about adhering to both the spirit and application of
law. Before entering a new clan territory, he meets an elder of the clan to explain the purpose of his visit and his intentions about the places he intends to use for his painting sites. Without the approval of the elder, Noel will not proceed with his project. Similarly, he does not use the names of deceased for some years after their passing. This seems to be equivalent to the religious notion of orthodoxy, and it is likely that as a practice, it is a desirable behaviour, if there is to be respect shown by majority Australians for ways that have quasi-religious significance. Showing respect is to some extent acceding to calls for equalization of power. An example of Western disrespect is paraphrased for majority Australia in Martin's (2008a) injunction, "knock before you enter".

4.2.9 Summary of Noel's three research phases

4.2.9.1 Experiential evidence in Noel's discourse

Noel's experience of the world is intimately connected with an artistic perspective of the beauty of landscapes, in particular, landscapes of natural vistas of Aboriginal tribal lands. This presents clear differences of approach from many Western artists, who are presenting say, portraits or still life, which are culturally non-specific, and derive from mainly European traditions. Noel's works can be assessed both as products, whose sales provide for his family, and as experiential windows into a variety of Aboriginal worlds, and therefore consistently rewarding.

4.2.9.2 Meaning of Noel's life experiences

The evidence of this research suggests that collectively, the participants experience a
sense of loss by leaving homelands and taking up city living. Mitigation of the loss seems essential if life is to be re-constructed meaningfully. Like other participants, Noel appears to have made a transition that captures the best of both worlds, or in Noel's case, many worlds. He has the prestige of a narrative of epiphany, from incarceration to career success, and is able to immerse himself in Aboriginal culture within an art form that has ancient connections with the world of the Aboriginal Australians.

4.2.9.3 Analysis of findings about Noel's motivations

Evidence provided by Noel, included examples of the failure of the Australian justice systems to deal adequately and fairly with Aboriginal Australians. His complaints are supported by the United Nations report on the state of the world's Aboriginal Peoples (2009, 206), which reported that the incarceration rates of Aboriginal citizens reached 9.6 times higher than non-Aboriginal Australians in 2001 and the rate was still accelerating. In addition, Australia's rate of Aboriginal incarceration was the world's highest. Separation from traditional settings is for Aboriginal Australians a potentially life-threatening experience, as city living removes them from support systems, especially in Noel's case, as his clan representation in Sydney is small. Jailing often exacerbates the problem. Moving forward constructively to new beginnings takes both good fortune and dedication. In Noel's case, the good fortune came when an unsolicited offer was made for one of his early paintings. But establishing a small business enterprise takes much effort and skill. The business mentoring of Aunty Barbara clearly helped. However, Noel has demonstrated great persistence and the capacity to recover from reverses that would incapacitate many.
4.2.10 Personal motivations of participant Michael

Of Kamilaroi descent, Michael was born and spent his early years in a large community in north-western NSW, receiving a wealth of cultural education in Aboriginal law and tradition. His outstanding school results attracted the offer of education by a prominent regional Christian boarding college. Michael's status as the first Aboriginal child to enter the school provided him with both rewards and punishments, as he was nicknamed Jacky-Jacky, the dismissive generic then applied to all Aboriginal males. Equivalent racial pejoratives of the time, like Pommy for the English, and Taffy for the Welsh, carried less offence or loss of face. Jacky-Jacky carried the further connotations of ridicule and diminution. His response to this indignity was to excel at all sports offered by the school, and to gain prowess and recognition for his versatility and athleticism. After the 1967 referendum and the subsequent progressive legislation of the Whitlam government in land rights and Aboriginal development opportunities, Michael moved to Sydney and took an active role in Aboriginal affairs and causes. As part of a group of like-minded young activists, Michael's status in the Sydney Aboriginal communities grew as he accepted roles of increasing responsibility, gaining respect and increased status. The visible signs of his stature include acceptance as Uncle Michael (elder) accorded by many younger members of his community, and more recently the award of honorary Doctorate from a prestigious Aboriginal Education institute where he continues to lecture and educate.

4.2.10.1 Evidence of holism in Michael's outlook and motivations

Interpreting Michael's words "we are forced (by the dominant culture) to this situation
(inequality), for a long time to come", carries the implication that Aboriginal resistance will continue until the division between the dominating and the dominated cultures is removed. In other words, activism must continue until both sides accept one another as equals. In further elaboration, Michael added that he would regard the Intervention as unholistic, as it is a further example of domination. Those who were the objects of Intervention had no choice, nor say, in the decision to intervene, and it involved the peremptory removal of previously held rights. In Michael's view, equality (and holism) will not be achieved until the dominated side (Aboriginal) is consulted with before executive decisions are made that affect its membership. To paraphrase a fundamental of the democratic process from Article II of the Constitution of the USA, not before the Aboriginal side is vested with the power to give advice, and not until after the Aboriginal side has given its consent.

4.2.10.2 Evidence of duality in Michael's attitudes and motivations

Taking a longer historical perspective, Michael regards the 1967 referendum as the end of one era and the beginning of another. However, he points out that the so called "culture wars" and cultural loss began long before 1967. The referendum equalized the citizenship of the two cultures, but otherwise did not reform. The year 1967 meant that the draconian laws of the first two centuries of co-habitation, when native law, in effect, was deemed illegal by the dominant culture, now became consigned to history. Appraising the components of time and culture in Michael's discourse, an enveloping duality can be seen, culture then (pre-1967) and culture now (post-1967). It should be pointed out that the Aboriginal view of time is far less linear than majority Australia's view of time. In the opinion of one non-Aboriginal researcher, Crisp (2010), the difference can be conceptualized as time-all-at-once (Aboriginal) compared to its linear counterpart of one-
thing-after-another time. At the psychological level, this means that experientially the wounds endured under colonialism prior to 1967, occupy the mind much more vividly, and with a closer continuum between present and past, than say the losses of the world wars for non-Aboriginal Australians. For this reason, reconciliation as a cause will always be of greater presence and urgency to the Aboriginal activists than to non-Aboriginals advocating on their behalf. It could be expected also that the operating dualities around cultural milestones, like 1788 and 1967, will exercise correspondingly greater energies, which will continue to impel Aboriginal activists to redress the imbalances of untold truths and denials of justice.

4.2.10.3 Evidence of balance in Michael's attitudes and motivations

Issues of imbalance feature largely in Michael's dialogues. Stories of champions who are compelled to represent a weaker side adorn narratives from David and Goliath to the present day. Michael took the fight up to the majority in his sporting triumphs as a schoolboy, and he continues steadfastly to strive to raise the living standards of his local Aboriginal community, and to embrace Aboriginal causes nationally, by restoring the balance of opportunity and equality for all socially disadvantaged Australians. Nevertheless, Michael is conscious of the enormity of the task facing younger Aboriginal Australians, whom he sees as losing traditional connections and behaviours during the past decade. In this respect, he agrees with McGilchrist's (2011) observation of an increase in left-brain dominance in the West, and a corresponding increase in the force of causes that might be generalized as neoliberal.

4.2.10.4 Identity as a factor in Michael's motivations
During his high school education, Michael recalls "there were (racially based) clashes in my life every day". This was no doubt experience that contrasted with the relatively peaceful environment of his classmates. Whilst there were probably noble intentions underlying the gift of Michael's scholarship, his educational experience was very different from that of his colleagues. His was in reality an education in survival, of constantly having to defend the ego; in Michael's case, his identity as Aboriginal. Majority Australians sometimes look back on their schooldays during this period, in which the punishment of schoolboys was often corporal, as "tough but fair". In Michael's case, the assessment would be more appropriately "tough and unfair".

4.2.10.5 Individual and power factors in Michael's motivations

Whilst the educational aspirations of Michael's schooling may not have been met, his method of coping showed an adaptability and self-reliance that were largely successful. By reflexive consideration of how to turn the tide of offence to defence, he virtually made himself proficient in the weapons of the 'enemy', in this case sporting gear and dedication to training. By re-creating himself as a sporting hero, he was able to provide a powerful shield to carry him through his schooling, confident of his strengths, but knowing how tough his future life may have to be.

4.2.11 Culturally driven motivations in Michael's evidence

4.2.11.1 Motivational indicators of place in Michael's evidence
Associations with his birthplace are clearly important to Michael and his family, who are still represented in the homelands of the Kamilaroi and Wiradjuri. However, his status as community elder has developed in a 'virtual' community, where membership comprises many clan origins. He experienced special joy in returning home on his student vacations from college to his kin and places in north-western NSW, but his active community life in Sydney and beyond has meant that issues of place are not as prominent as for other participants in this research.

4.2.11.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Michael's life

The most traumatic change in Michael's life occurred when he took up his scholarship in his junior high school years. In his own words this event led to a "clash of spiritualities", Christian and Aboriginal. The attitude in Michael's school at the time was the self-privileging of Christian doctrine over all others. Combined with a missionary zeal to convert all, this set one spirituality against another, often with disastrous results. Aboriginal spirituality is holist and therefore tolerant of difference, but coercive approaches by the non-Aboriginal are unwelcome, and it is unsurprising that Michael's Aboriginal spirituality is in no way affected by his many years of Christian education. As Michael explains: “I've never allowed my Aboriginal spirituality to be interfered with by any form of oppression because I'd always go home to my elders, my Dad's and grandfather's sisters”.

4.2.11.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Michael's motivations

In his regular departures from boarding school to return to his extended family roots, there was a decisive experiential difference between the two social environments. In the
Western environment, Michael was often the victim, and much later, the hero. In the Western environment he was defensive and guarded. At home he was relaxed, totally accepted, and comfortable with the knowledge growing from the iterations of good (Aboriginal) behaviour practised and taught by his many Aunties, Michael's connectivity being matrilineal. As a consequence, the relational setting with loved elders who were also kin, established warm and supportive social foundations for Michael in later life.

4.2.11.4 Narrative influences in Michael's motivations

Michael's is a narrative of survival under duress, achieved without rancour or deep humiliation, as his home life had built a cultural platform from which to take on the world, even though it was at times hostile, and there were many frustrations, none more so than now. If it were possible to summarise broadly Michael's message from his own motivations, for the benefit of his people, it might be uttered in the words of Martin Luther King's "Our lives begin to end, the day we become silent about the things that matter".

4.2.11.5 Collectivist and power influences in Michael's motivations

Power, for Michael, is a two-way process. In his terms, the process of equalization can occur, only if the energy to continue the struggle is maintained, and the dominant side is prevailed upon to give up its false narratives. Using Michael's own words, he would like to "see the country come to grips with its past". Michael lives in hope of a change to the habitual error of appointing Aboriginal leaders from the top. He maintains: "Not one of the so-called black leaders in the country has ever been accepted by the people".
4.2.12 Summary of experiences, meaning and analyses

4.2.12.1 Experiential evidence in Michael's discourse

The distinction in Michael's early life between the joyful experiences of home nurture, almost exclusively by female members of the family, and his frequent movements to and from the exclusively male enclave of the boys' boarding school, could not have exposed greater contrast. Home was holistic, tolerant, loving and co-operative. School was individualistic, bigoted, tough and competitive. The result however, made Michael's choices in later life simple, but unwavering. His attachment to Aboriginal ideology and behaviour grew, whereas his connectedness with the majority culture remained minimal. He has experienced many sincere promises, but also the persistent disappointments of infrequent delivery.

4.2.12.2 Meaning of Michael's life experiences

The question sometimes posed, about those who struggle constantly and energetically with little to show for their life's work, is "why bother"? But this is not an Aboriginal question. However, it has meaning for the Australian majority, as there is a strong cultural belief that "I have the right to give up", in other words, it is a matter of a basic right of individual freedom to think and act unilaterally. Not so in the Aboriginal world. Meaning is never made by externalising the self from the group, only by acting on behalf of the group. This is at the heart of Aboriginal satisfaction in life, and why Michael's belief in eventual success carries so much weight.
4.2.12.3 Analysis of findings about Michael's motivations

Michael's belief, and its majority antithesis, can be constructed as follows: For the Aboriginal group, in the long run, victory will be with those left, who still identify as Aboriginal, as they will continue to have the energy provided by the group. As long as the group survives, the energy to fire the struggle for equality is likely to continue, as opting out offers no group approval or respect. Aboriginal time-all-at-once enables iterative re-visualization of historical injustices in the present, with involvement assuring honour and respect that increases with age. On the other hand, the antithetical majority resistance to equality confers on its adherents the 'freedom' to opt in or out, and to retire from the struggle, as linear time constructs post-mature life as of lesser value, where prestige declines as age increases. As a consequence, the oppositional group falls short on cohesion, focus and rationality. The strength of Michael's position finds robust support from Wilson's (2012, 243) iron rule of genetic social evolution, which asserts that "groups of altruists beat groups of selfish individuals". The task for the Aboriginal group is therefore quite clear. It needs only to continue its strenuous effort to remain Aboriginal, and never to compromise its identity. As Michael and fellow activists learned long ago, there really is no alternative, if the Aboriginal narrative of injustices perpetrated by majority Australia is to be heard, and equality is to be achieved.

4.2.13 Personal motivations of Kathy

A resident in an inner-city urban Aboriginal community, Kathy has achieved the respected
status of Aunty or elder. The distinctive contribution she has made, in addition to an active involvement in community affairs, is in the area of Aboriginal knowledge, in particular of her band of origin, the Wiradjuri, of western NSW. In the historical monograph by Coe (1989), Kathy has contributed a foreword to the first work on the Aboriginal warrior, Windradyne, who featured strongly in the resistance by the Wiradjuri to colonial oppression. Kathy’s words summarize the theme of the monograph as part of a continuing strategy, which is to dispel the myth of Aboriginal acquiescence in the appropriation of Aboriginal tribal homelands by British colonial forces, and to argue unequivocally that resistance began two centuries ago, and continues to the present day. In Kathy’s historical accounting of events, although the past is rendered tumultuously by competing narratives of the invader and the invaded, the future is clear. Kathy wrote about the voice of truth that will reproduce the lost harmony of a former age, when Aboriginal heroes sought and fought for justice and paid with their lives (Coe, 1989).

4.2.13.1 Evidence of holism in Kathy’s outlook and motivations

The quotation from Wyndradyne provides an idealistic and holistic projection of the future, in contrast with the divisive and violent past, against which Wyndradyne rebelled. Whilst thankfully the context in which Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australians co-exist in uneasy association is no longer systemically genocidal, it is still an unending struggle of resistance, as Kathy explains it. In her comments on Aboriginal leadership, Kathy views this area as an issue that involves all Aboriginal people in the concerned group. The one-Aboriginal leader style of autocratic leadership in Western society is unacceptable. In Kathy's words, "it's a solution that all have to play a part in, not one individual".
4.2.13.2 Evidence of duality in Kathy’s attitudes and motivations

One duality that prompted several comments from Kathy concerned the asymmetrical power relationships between a world-wide self-privileging of the male patriarchy over the divine feminine. To Kathy, Mary Magdalene is an archetype of the female side of the duality, with hegemonic male power, its opposite. Another similarly inappropriate Western duality, she adds, is to be found in the way the West currently operates, with old (and unwise) men holding and exercising power, but focussing on the young, and not the whole of society, which the people need. This means, to Kathy, that large segments of Western populations are ignored or marginalized, notably women and the aged. In addition, she is appalled by the creep of commercialism into the ranks of the very young and innocent, especially younger girls.

4.2.13.3 Evidence of balance in Kathy’s attitudes and motivations

Kathy regards Western society as fundamentally unbalanced, and even "psychotic". One feature of this is its continual perception of Aboriginal society as a problem. This implies that Aboriginal people have to be controlled, or dealt with, rather than engaged with. If they were perceived simply as "interesting" the connotation would be more likely to promote engagement.

In her perception of Western society as psychotic, Kathy finds strong echoes from observers in the present, like McGilchrist (2011) and from the past, like Jung (1989). It is relevant that Jung believed strongly that the psychosis Kathy has identified was the
inevitable result of de-mythologising throughout the modern world, with the advance of rationalism and science. Chalquist (2008) describes Jung’s position in terms of psychic complexes and inner pain becoming symptomatic when modern humankind "exiled the spirits of nature" (2007, 76). In Jung's (1989) account can be seen the likelihood that the West, in its attempts to debunk or disenchant Aboriginal myths, is at once, profoundly offending Aboriginal society, and undermining the mental health of its own. Kathy's world-view is long term and historical. She supports McGilchrist's (2011) view of the West as left brain dominant. She regards this as part of the malaise feeding into societal unbalance, and as a consequence, seriously inhibiting the Aboriginal cause.

4.2.13.4 Identity as a factor in Kathy’s motivations

To the non-Aboriginal outsider, Kathy’s stage of life would be described as that of active grandmother, engaged largely in the nurture of grandchildren. However, there are included in her role and identity, specific additional obligations. As an elder, she is expected to be available for community counsel, and for the passing on to others identifying as Aboriginal, ontology and epistemology. Of this latter obligation, more will be added in the summary of all participant responses. In terms of the concept of identity, this means that both nuclear familial and cultural roles are better defined than in the broader Australian society, whose members might need to seek the advice of the formally qualified, but may be less certain about what the 'good grandmother' might do to structure her life beyond child care. There is no credentialism in Aboriginal society and no hierarchy, so that Kathy's identity could be described as taking on a more personal form of 'circle management', where she provides counsel to all equally.
4.2.13.5 Individual and power factors in Kathy's motivations

There is a contradiction in power structures within the totality of the social milieu in which Kathy functions. On the one hand, she is transiting a life stage in the Aboriginal society, which venerates those wearing the invisible mantle of elder, so that in her local environment, she is probably in a position of exceptional 'power'. Here, the English language is at a loss to convey meaning, as another way of describing her position would be to say that her present position is, at the same time, one of exceptional 'humility'. What is more clear, however, is that despite the status conferred upon her within the locality of places she presently inhabits, and by her Aboriginal co-inhabitants, in the broader society she is regarded as part of the landscape of the 'problem' of those Aboriginals who articulate unmet needs for understanding and truth.

4.2.14 Collective motivations of Kathy

4.2.14.1 Motivational indicators of place in Kathy's evidence

In distinguishing between the provisioning of urban space as parklands, for recreational amenity in urban non-Aboriginal Australia, Kathy points out that this is not replicating place in the same way as Aboriginal society conceives the term. The Aboriginal version of constructed space or place would cover non-urbanized, dedicated, expanses of land of special relevance to the Aboriginal nation that once had, or continue to have, sacred connections with the expanse of territories set aside for correct and more spiritual purposes, than simply recreation. To recall Martin's (2008a) metaphorical "Knock before you enter", the dedicated place, say land or estuary, could be imagined as a "dwelling"
comprising both Aboriginal Australians and spiritual entities, which co-habit in waters, trees and landforms of significance. But just as the visitor does not 'barge into' your house, it might reasonably be expected that some respect is due to the elders charged with the task of guardians of place, and their consent requested prior to entry.

4.2.14.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Kathy's life

One of the strengths of the Aboriginal position, according to Kathy, is that philosophy, mythology and history are not separated into discrete disciplines, as they are in the Western world-views. To the Western mind, the creator as Rainbow Serpent would not be the narrative of a history text, but the history wars have shown us that Western history varies substantially with the political stance of the historian, and the "war on terror" demonstrated that fundamentalism on either side produces adherents for whom the contested creation stories of "holy books" are literally true. What is more important than any debate on which account is more plausible, is to look at the differences in terms of the alternative cognitive styles between non-Aboriginal Australians and urban citizens. Kathy's life, with its cognitive referents of undiscriminated ontology, epistemology, mythology, history, past, present and future, allows continuous flows of thought, uninhibited by doubts and false dichotomies, such as am I being emotional or too rational. The occupational genre of generalist could also be used to describe the spiritual side of Aboriginality, which does not limit itself to the cognitive separations of Western natural or social sciences, or any one of their discrete, academic disciplines.

4.2.14.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Kathy's motivations
This may be expressed better using Kathy's words verbatim:

To be rich in our culture is for many people to come and seek your advice. It means you're a trusted advisor, you give good counsel. And that's how we manage our world, and how people sort you out. In our culture I'm very wealthy. In the wider system I'm very poor. It's a strange juxtaposition, but that's how it is.

With these words, Kathy is explaining the holism of the Aboriginal system, its daily rewards derived from Aboriginal respectful social relationships, and the expanded nature of kinship, of great importance in the extended family, but equally to any person of Aboriginal identity who is in need of advice, and accepted in the broader culture of Aboriginality now evident in urban Australia.

4.2.14.4 Narrative influences in Kathy's motivations

The juxtaposition of two cultures, which Kathy speaks of, could be regarded as a central narrative of her life story. From the Aboriginal side, this looks quite different to the view from the majority Australian side. From the evidence of interviews, the essential issue at play is one of priority. For the majority, the misunderstandings between the two groups is of little consequence, but to the Aboriginal communities, and especially for elders like Kathy, the misunderstandings are a compelling problem, compounded by the apparently unending cycle of promises made for the long term and only ever partially fulfilled. Worse still, she lists several initiatives begun by Aboriginal Australia, which have been taken over by Governments and rendered ineffective as a result. As an example, Kathy cited the history of CDEP (Community Development Employment Projects):

A classical example was the CDEPs. That was developed by the community rather than government. But as soon as the government got hold of it, it turned it into a different animal. It came from the community themselves, but the government used it to disguise its unemployment rates.

4.2.14.5 Collectivist and power influences in Kathy's motivations
Whilst Kathy sees a general lack of progress in the troubled duality of government and Aboriginality, she perceives as even more problematic, the plight of white Australia. By "cutting off their own spirituality", in Kathy 's terms, "they have abandoned their belief in a connection beyond the grave - that's a sad thing". In this area, in other words, Kathy is seeing no growth in Aboriginal empowerment, but alas she also observes a steady and long term deterioration in the empowerment of majority Australians. In this observation, the value systems of the two societies are clearly in view. Australia, at the height of its world economic performance, and after twenty years of continuous "growth", are from Kathy 's vantage point, in a pitiable decline in spirituality, as it is the spirit that generates power, not the dollar.

4.2.15 Summary of Kathy 's experiences, meaning and analyses

4.2.15.1 Experiential evidence in Kathy 's discourse

In explaining her position on life, Kathy emphasized that her experiences were realised through the group, not through her individuality. To experience success as an Aboriginal person, the genesis of the motivational idea must be found within an Aboriginal world-view. Furthermore, Kathy posits this as non-negotiable with the majority Australian world, in which capitalist ends demand individualist means, and these are anathema to Aboriginal Australians.

4.2.15.2 Meaning of Kathy 's life experiences
Twenty-five years ago Kathy wrote the foreword to Coe’s Windradyne monograph. This concluded that "the voice of Windradyne will be heard one day, when we have achieved the tasks begun by Windradyne, and once again there will be harmony" (Coe, 1989). We are left, in this passage, with a message of hope, the traditional ending of a Shakespearean tragedy, in which great carnage is survived by a feeling that the world will nevertheless go on. However, little has happened according to interview evidence, that would have brought further solace to Kathy with the passage of time. For example, for those Australians who have embraced secularity in growing numbers, Kathy can feel only pity, as they do not have the same faith as they once possessed, in life after death.

4.2.15.3 Analysis of findings about Kathy’s motivations

Kathy’s account of Aboriginal world-views reminded me of Teilhard de Chardin’s (1976) basic formulation for humankind as spiritual beings having human experiences, so I asked Kathy about another of Teilhard’s perceptions that have strong Aboriginal resonance, the idea of the withinness of all things. She confirmed that this was an observation by Teilhard of his experience of cultures other than his French Catholic origins, that life forms are everywhere, and it is the over-privileging of humans by the West that is at the root of the problem. For the failure to take up and extend Teilhard’s philosophy to the benefit of Aboriginals everywhere, Kathy held the Church responsible, as in her view the Church routinely silences thinkers with holistic or progressive ideas, when they threaten the power of its autocratic patriarchy to control what is knowledge, and what is not. The Church, however, is not atypical of those Western institutions that Kathy regards as conserving the privileges of the few, whilst ignoring the basic needs of the many. She deplores the sacrifice of social justice in recent decades on the altar of the economy, in which social good is
determined by profit and loss and continuous growth.

Economist, Butlin (1993) argued strongly that Australian Aboriginal economies were robust and sophisticated, especially in the provision of services and intangibles, and that previous histories (before 1993) had omitted to account for two major influences on the destruction of the Australian Aboriginal economy: racism and communicable diseases. He pointed out that Aboriginal health was clearly superior to that of the settlers at the time of their arrival, but plummeted within a few decades, when Aboriginals were immobilized and forced into unemployment or unskilled labour. Kathy cited racism as still a continuing problem for Aboriginal Australians, and she emphasized the need for equality in their education and health. If, as Butlin claims, racism and imported diseases deprived surviving Aboriginals of meaningful work and excluded them from Australian society, and further, that education, training, learning and re-learning were originally a basic end of Aboriginal economic activity, the case for restorative justice in the fields of health, and education in all disciplines, should be clear.

4.2.16 Personal motivations of Steven

Steven's family finds its genealogical roots in the bands of the Wiradjuri and Kamilaroi. His upbringing was urban, but strongly supported by a deeply Aboriginal knowledge base, derived from the cultural expertise of both of his parents. He is particularly well read and deeply spiritual. In describing himself, Steven drew my attention to a poem he had kept with him during his incarceration. It was written by Oriah, an interpreter of the wisdom of the First Peoples of Northern Ontario. Oriah is a writer in the shamanic tradition for finding
spiritual sustenance. The following example of Oriah’s poetry shows that her thoughts are positive and in touch with the natural, and that they provide an entry point into Steven's central personal characteristic, his thoughtful spirituality:

*I want to know*

*if you can be with joy*

*mine or your own*

*if you can dance with wildness and let the ecstasy fill you*

*to the tips of your fingers and toes*

*without cautioning us*

*to be careful*

*to be realistic*

*to remember the limitations*

*of being human (Oriah, 2012).*

4.2.16.1 Evidence of holism in Steven's outlook and motivations

Historically the Aboriginal communities of Australia have experienced social and political exclusion, especially before 1967. Holism implies inclusion, and in Steven's case, the personal philosophy he has adopted takes the form of a convergence of mainstream cultural flows that could unite the most holistic features of Western and Aboriginal philosophies, and incorporate the energy-conserving ideas of Nikola Tesla, one of Steven's admired Western scientists. Tesla's icon and favourite shape was the sphere, coincidentally the symbol of holism.

In essence, Steven's ideas also mirror the findings of this research as a whole: in brief,
that the works of theorists and practitioners of both natural and social sciences, both Aboriginal and Western, can be merged to design a theory of value, in this case, for Aboriginal management education.

What Steven is proposing is a reversal of the so far unstoppable progress of exclusion. His vision places Aboriginal society at the centre of the holistic sphere of Australian society, and ceases its current trajectory as a smaller and separated body orbiting the sphere of the majority culture.

4.2.16.2 Evidence of duality in Steven's attitudes and motivations

Steven supports the dualities proposed by Jung (1970) as an appropriate explanation of the functioning of Aboriginal dualities, like Eaglehawk and Crow. He was aware of Jung's visits to the Hopi elder, Mountain Lake, and to many African and Indian Aboriginal bands, and his writings about the Australian Aboriginal people. Like Jung, another of Steven's sources, Carmen Boulter & Haze (2012) have turned to ancient history to understand the knowledge base and methodology required to build pyramids, raising questions about whether current time-lines accepted for ancient Egypt are accurate. Professor Boulter's enquiries range widely across many disciplines of both the natural and social sciences. The duality working in the background and energizing such enquiries is the modern predilection to regard modernity as advanced, and the ancient world as backward. Arising from this dilemma is the further question of how much current invention is re-invention. This is a very important area of enquiry in this research, as the literature suggests that many of the most 'modern' of management practices were not produced by the brilliant
insights of young Westerners, but more likely from unacknowledged appropriations of ancient but profoundly effective ideas like Aboriginal cultures’ circle management, and non-discrete opposites. This injustice was acknowledged in the United Nations publication, State of the world’s Indigenous Peoples (2009, 70).

4.2.16.3 Evidence of balance in Steven’s attitudes and motivations

Steven was especially critical of the perversity of the criminal justice system, which he perceives to be geared towards cruelty for its own sake, by deliberately depriving prisoners of access to the natural: “There was deep psychology in prison, not seeing the stars and the moon. Prison is retribution. There is no chance to liberate, to seek redemption through punishment. Retribution begets more retribution”.

What Steven argued is, in effect, that by not looking back, but being driven by short term horizons, Western thinking is not wisely balanced, in the absence of evidence of its reflexively spanning past-present-future, as the West is short-weighting the past and particularly the ancient past. Steven agrees with McGilchrist (2011) that part of the problem of balance facing the Aboriginal world is the increasing tendency of political debate and public policy towards right-wing beliefs and reduced social well-being.

4.2.16.4 Identity as a factor in Steven’s motivations

By extending his world-view, to the ancient as well as the modern, to natural sciences as well as social sciences, and by embracing global influences as well as local, Steven has embarked on a journey to a larger and diversely populated sense of personal identity,
without denying connection to the land: “When we say *we* or *us* this is not making divisions between full blood or not, it is a matter of consciousness and psyche and that’s very, very ancient. When we go to the bush and give recognition by affirming that this is happening, it gives us profound power”.

4.2.16.5 Individual and power factors in Steven’s motivations

Throughout Steven’s narrative is the expressed doubt that, in the case of peoples from any country, the rewards offered in the majority society are disproportionate to the effort needed by Aboriginal citizens to achieve equality. He raised the case of Anne Waters, the first Aboriginal North American philosopher in the Western tradition, pointing out that she was not well known, compared to other philosophers we discussed. This sense of powerlessness is not overstated. Recent evidence from Harvard’s Professor Bruce Western (2012) is that Australian Aboriginal rates of imprisonment of those who have not reached high school graduation level are now the equal of similarly unqualified African Americans, about 70 percent experiencing custodial sentences. Australian rates of incarceration of all Aboriginal Australians to Australians other than is now 13 : 1 and rising (Williams-Mozley, 2009). In his report of these statistics for the Australian National Council of Drugs, Williams-Mozley attributed the discrepancy in part to the over-policing of Aboriginal Australians. This is consistent with the evidence of participants interviewed for this research, who claimed that they are shadowed in shopping centres by security guards and by State police.

*4.2.17 Culturally driven motivations in Steven’s evidence*
4.2.17.1 Motivational indicators of place in Steven’s evidence

There is a strong connection between "your country" and your spirit, according to Steven. This does not impose serious difficulties in respect of Steven's urban living, as he is closely in touch with the traditional areas of both Wiradjuri and Kamilaroi bands and with his relatives in both these homelands. However, as previously mentioned, the importance of this connection means that re-connection of those Aboriginal city dwellers without clear knowledge of their own country of origin needs attention, if the alienating effect of the self-assessment of being neither white nor black is to be avoided.

4.2.17.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Steven's life

Spirituality could be described as Steven's central concern and introspection, assuming that his primary needs of family care, housing and self-maintenance have been met. Spirituality and reflexivity are closely related, and in evaluating spirituality, the evidence of Davies (1991) needs consideration, especially his finding that experience is mainly a form of thought, which brings spirituality, also a form of thought, into bold relief as a sound objective for empirical research.

4.2.17.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Steven's motivations

The closeness of relationship and kinship to Aboriginal spirituality could be expressed dynamically as the spiritual is accessed via the group, but to Steven and the other interviewees, as raised in Chapter 3, the group includes supra-human entities, such as the earth, trees and animals endowed with a certain "personhood", which extends both
relationality and kinship, and even the definition of what it is to be truly human.

4.2.17.4 Narrative influences in Steven's motivations

One of the common features of the philosophers of interest to Steven is their marginality: they are outsiders whose truth is too profound for more powerful observers: in the case of Meister Eckhart (1981), the Catholic Church and in the case of Waters (2004), the male, non-Aboriginal readership of Western philosophy. Collectively, the narratives of such philosophers suffer the same tribulations as Aboriginal Australians, like Steven, who have impressive knowledge of both cultures, but are marginalized as unqualified, or warehoused in prisons if they step over legal boundaries.

4.2.17.5 Collectivist and power influences in Steven's motivations

The way forward for Steven is by means of self-education, as he is well aware that education is a socio-economic accelerant, whichever culture forms the individual identity. The concept of power is Western, and its synonym may be influence. In this regard, Steven indicated that his influence will come from his acquisition of wisdom and the extent to which his Aboriginal friends and extended family turn to him for counsel in their own struggles for equality.

4.2.18 Summary of Steven's experiences, meaning and analyses

4.2.18.1 Experiential evidence in Steven's discourse
Steven's experience of Australia is that it is a trickster, who has perpetrated a grand larceny against Aboriginal culture, treating its original people as uncivilized, which they were not, and viewing its land as uninhabited, which it was not. The term, *terra nullius*, could be said to have provided a construct, opaque enough to justify the confiscation of a continent. Steven has now taken issue with the confiscation of ideas, of intellectual property, of Australian Aboriginal science and inventions, both social and material. Australia's treatment of this area, in Steven's view, has parallels with *terra nullius*, as it implies that it was nobody's knowledge, or *nemo scientia* if we were tricky enough to again construct an opaque cover for the theft.

4.2.18.2 Meaning of Steven's life experiences

A second poem, which Steven used to survive his period of imprisonment was Max Ehrman's Disiderata, two stanzas of which follow in Greenberg's collection:

*You are a child of the universe,*

*no less than the trees and the stars;*

*you have a right to be here.*

*And whether or not it is clear to you,*

*no doubt the universe is unfolding as it should.*

*Go placidly amid the noise and haste,*

*and remember what peace there may be in silence.*

*As far as possible without surrender*

*be on good terms with all persons* (Greenberg, 2010).
There is much in this poem that reflects Steven's view of what it is to be Aboriginal. For example, if a Western aphorism could be found to bridge our two cultures, Steven would consider "Do unto others as you would they do to you" to be appropriate. Secondly, there is value in silence. Thoughtless words and slogans used as conversation fillers can be barriers to communication. Thirdly, we are all made from the stuff of the stars; it is our spirit that is eternal and valuable, not things, which only serve to distract us from meaningful communication with one another.

4.2.18.3 Analysis of findings about Steven's motivations

Steven's evidence places him within a diverse and expansive field of ideas with global connections, in which ancient history and philosophy are united in the present by modern technology and concerns about the efficient production of energy and sustainability. The question that emerges in the background to Steven's concerns is: can the assumption be made that there were long forgotten technologies available to the ancients in Egypt and Australia that may have changed the course of history. If this case can be supported, the plunder of Australia as Earth Mother for fossil fuels and metals and its desecration by nuclear testing, may have been avoidable.

4.2.19 Personal motivations of Natalie

In the broader Australian community, the usual way of opening conversations is by way of enquiry about what work you do, or your sporting team affiliations. With those who
assisted in this research as interviewees, most early responses after meeting were around band identity, with a modest reticence regarding achievements or self-justification. Natalie's early comments were about positioning herself as a learner about Aboriginal culture. However, it soon became apparent that Natalie's knowledge of her mother's Wiradjuri culture was exceptional, bearing in mind that she had been raised in an inner suburb of Sydney. In common with other interviewee's, Natalie was quick to acknowledge the contribution of both her parents in their passing on of cultural learning to her and her siblings. In this way, she gained a good understanding of her father's Kamilaroi band knowledge as well.

The immersion that Natalie has experienced in Wiradjuri culture has happened particularly during the past seven years, in a personal and spiritual undertaking to understand and record the life of one of her Uncles, in this case her grandmother's brother. For this task, Natalie chose the medium of the television documentary, and her effort was rewarded by the recent production and screening of her work by SBS Television.

4.2.19.1 Evidence of holism in Natalie's outlook and motivations

There was a sense of liberation in Natalie's description of her dedicated work on the TV documentary of her Uncle, as she was given freedom to complete this major project largely without editorial interference. That is, the task was carried out holistically from concept to release as telecast. In contrast, Natalie cited examples where government involvement and failure to delegate or preserve Aboriginal initiatives had led to failure. As another example of successful Aboriginal management completed holistically, Natalie cited school attendance improvement following the breakfast programs for
children of the Narraweena Primary School. Before the introduction of the program, malnourished Aboriginal children were not going to school.

4.2.19.2 Evidence of duality in Natalie's attitudes and motivations

A troubling duality raised by Natalie was what appears to be a growing schism between urban Aboriginal children, who received traditionally cultural knowledge from conscientious Aboriginal parenting, and those less fortunate children of Aboriginal descent who were not afforded the same cultural education, and sometimes do not understand their own Aboriginality. This is apparently considered a much more serious loss than, say the loss of Hungarian culture in the milieu of multi-cultural Australia, as Aboriginal Australians regard the infusion of tribal knowledge as a rite of passage. In this respect, failure of an Aboriginal parent to hand down received tribal knowledge is akin to non-Aboriginal Australians of one of the Abrahamic faiths failing to pass on the most profoundly believed religious principles, such as belief in God.

4.2.19.3 Evidence of balance in Natalie's attitudes and motivations

The unexplained death of Natalie's Uncle at the age of 27 in remote South Australia had plunged her family into a sense of loss and despair. The passage of time of some 50 years had never brought healing or fading from memory, especially for his beloved sister, Natalie's grandmother. It should be remembered that revered ancestral figures still inhabit the minds of Australians in their daily lives and also in dreams. The guardianship of the family by the deceased, and their active advisory role in the present, make their spirits continuously active within their immediate family. Therefore, unexplained death establishes
a duality of known / unknown; that is, the known life of Uncle Hilton, as fun-loving, kindly, and faithfully connected to all his New South Wales siblings, on the one hand, and his unknown life and unexplained death far from home, on the other. The stress of decades of disquiet slowly reduced during Natalie's challenging TV work, and brought sufficient new knowledge from both forensic research and spiritual guidance to satisfy expectations that all had been done within the realm of the possible. In motivational terms, this endeavour could be said to have restored balance, and reduced the major tension in the duality of the known and the unknown, mitigating much of the dis-ease of all family members living and deceased.

4.2.19.4 Identity as a factor in Natalie's motivations

In Natalie's description, she laments that poverty leads to adversity for many young children who lack dedicated parental education in culture: “Identity is knowing ….. they do not know where their parents came from, their particular heritage, whereas knowing as I do the Kamilaroi and Wiradjuri cultures, and these languages are now being revived, it is simply that I had people around me who knew the language was of benefit”.

She pointed to the misfortune of many of the younger Aboriginal children, growing up in modern Australia, who do not know their totems, as they do not have people around them who know and can pass on Aboriginal knowledge. This raised a question that appeared in another research interview: whether learning Aboriginal culture can be delayed, but still be gained in a good educational environment, such as Tranby College. Whilst this may be possible, Natalie's view makes it clear that identity can be gray-scaled by neglect, creating a growing imbalance and demand for further education.
4.2.19.5 Individual and power factors in Natalie’s motivations

Power through the group could best describe Natalie’s position. Her role models could not be classified as powerful figures, but rather those who took a moral stance of resistance to oppression, such as Angela Davis. Within Australia, Natalie nominated Pearl Gibbs, one of the pioneer Aboriginal activists of the twentieth century, especially in her attempts to relieve Aboriginal Australians from their suffering during the Great Depression. Another inspiration came from Vic Simms, an Aboriginal multi-talented artist, who is still active as poet and singer. His example is of determination to maintain his own Aboriginal dignity under duress, even during his incarceration. Similarly, there is no evidence that Natalie’s success with her TV documentary has deflected her from her Aboriginal subject matter, as her career direction may be varied to include writing, but not to turn her attention to more individualistic but commercial-driven alternatives. In respect of the passing on via inter-personal education of children by parents and the mass media, Natalie’s attitude is optimistic: “When they grow up to be young men and women their knowledge of culture and dreamtime stories there will be a different sense of respect. You could break down institutionalized racism”.

4.2.20 Culturally driven motivations in Natalie’s evidence

4.2.20.1 Motivational indicators of place in Natalie’s evidence

In contemplating the problem of children being raised without sufficient parental knowledge to prepare them for lives as Aboriginal Australians, Natalie mentioned that the
Wiradjuri nation is constituted of very caring people, who regularly accept those youngsters, who had in their twentieth century ancestry, the losses of knowledge arising from the removal of one or more ancestors in the Stolen Generation. This indicates the possibility that place can be adopted as well as determined by birth. Natalie also pointed out that, if place is an ambient factor in the upbringing of an Aboriginal child, it assists in "the practice of our rituals on a day by day basis". However, she admitted that such separations of place could be likened to the shredding of a string, rather than keeping it intact. Natalie also observed that to the extent that Aboriginal Australians are affected by colonialization, they are less complete in their knowledge of place than those who lived prior to the British occupation.

Part of the service Natalie performed for her family during her dedicated research for her TV documentary was to bring home her Uncle's human remains and to facilitate their traditional burial in the sacred ground of the Wiradjuri. With this physical effort was achieved the spiritual outcome befitting a cherished son of the Wiradjuri, who had met with misfortune far from home - his eternal rest in the place reserved for him by his ancestors.

4.2.20.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Natalie's life

In describing the death of Natalie's Uncle as misfortune, I am using a word that implies chance, a random and uncaused event. However, this choice of words would probably not be made by a Wiradjuri writer, who may reject it as Western and unspiritual, and offer a description that cast the event as caused, the work of negative spiritual influences, arising possibly from the breach of some sacred imperative, and the hostile reaction of an offended deity, like the dark spirit, Wunda.
4.2.20.3 The importance of relationality and kinship in Natalie’s motivations

One of the cultural universals of Aboriginality can be found in the concept of "the generalist", in modern management parlance "the multi-tasker". One frequent example from this research was found in the deep appreciation by the child of the educational efforts of parents in communicating their knowledge of Aboriginal culture. From the evidence of interviews, the level of bonding or attachment between parent and child is considerably greater than could be expected in the case of its majority Australian comparison. This effect was exceptional in Natalie, and provided the energy she needed to overcome many obstacles to complete the historical research for her documentary over seven years from concept to completion.

In this contest between generalist and expert, it could be argued that the lifetime behavioural outcomes and qualitative effects of the investment of personal exertion by Natalie’s Aboriginal parents as generalist-educators, greatly outweighed the impersonal investment by non-Aboriginal parents, and educating via teachers as specialist-educators. This may be one reason for the continuing difficulty of adverse findings about Aboriginal students’ attendance rates, in education at any level, where the favoured approach is teacher-as-expert, and why the curriculum may be dismissed as "irrelevant". Simply stated, for the learner, parental wisdom will inevitably prevail over teacher expertise.

4.2.20.4 Narrative influences in Natalie’s motivations

The medium of narrative is, in Natalie's case, already available in her TV documentary. It is
a story of extraordinary motivation to find the truth about the final hours of a missing relative and thereby to bring solace to his closest kin. The good news it brings is that most of the objectives of her quest were met, in the reuniting of the mortal remains of Natalie's uncle within the soul of the family at a place of his ancestors. However, much of the story remains hidden from view, not because it is unknowable, but rather because of the deliberate withholding by a Crown agency of an extant document about the circumstances of Natalie's Uncle's death.

The viewer of Natalie’s documentary is left with an impression that the situation of Aboriginal people in Australia should be deeply disturbing, but the forces of resistance to change remain steadfastly anchored to monumental unfairness. For parliamentary papers of the greatest sensitivity there is a "thirty year rule", when historians and the general public are reminded that for the majority, there is democracy. On the other hand, for a suffering Aboriginal family, there is no such freedom. There is not even a "thirty year rule". Seven years is a longer period than World War II, but the war effort seemed worth it. Natalie has to be satisfied with an outcome that remains unresolved, troubled by new questions unearthed by her research. But she and her family show no signs of surrendering her cause. On her shoulders and those of her family, the very survival of a people depends, and they seem unlikely to fold under the most recent evidence that they do not yet belong.

4.2.20.5 Collectivist and power influences in Natalie's motivations

Of major importance to Natalie, are the many examples of collectivist power drawn from local community initiatives begun by Aboriginal Australians, such as a bus service that
picks up community members and transports them daily to community centres in her suburb. There is clearly a principle at stake in these preferences. If self-help programs are generated from within Aboriginal communities, Aboriginal communities will assume Aboriginal ownership of them and make them work.

Another aspect of empowerment for Natalie is exemplified in her TV documentary; it derives from the basic idea that education is knowledge. If Aboriginal stories like her Uncle's biography are widely reported and known, the educational knowledge gap confounding non-Aboriginal Australia's thinking about its Aboriginal minority in slogans and stereotypes will be reduced.

4.2.21 Summary of Natalie's experiences, meaning and analyses

4.2.21.1 Experiential evidence in Natalie's discourse

In her discourse about relatives of her father's Kamilaroi side of the family, Natalie recounted the life of her great Aunty Liza, left widowed by her soldier spouse during World War II. She became a nanny to a white family on a rural property in north-west NSW and cared especially for two children of the family. At her Aunty's funeral, the mourners were approached by the now adult son of the family, telling them simply "she was our mother". Like other examples of this kind, notably Winston Churchill's, the facts are that greater attachments sometimes form between the surrogate mother and children, than between the birth mother and children. In the example of Aunty Liza, her affectionate love was unbounded; the children of her employers received unconditional love and care. To Natalie, the recent movie, The Help, could be used to illustrate the bonding that was
involved, and could be the subject of her own Australian feature film later on. This experience, in combination with her viewing of The Help, meant for Natalie that there was ample evidence that such cross-racial love was commonplace, and moving, in both story and dramatic effect. However, she felt that Australia's slowness to expose such relationships as those between her Aunty and the children under her care could not happen yet in Australia, which was not ready to acknowledge such intense ties between the Aboriginal help and their loving white children. Natalie's conclusion is that the United States has moved further along the road of conciliation with its black minority than Australia has, principally because of its longer historical exposure to the idea of black nannies.

4.2.21.2 Meaning of Natalie's life experiences

If we define meaning in life as a sense of purpose, Natalie's sense of meaning is clear, and she is able to look forward hopefully to utilizing her acknowledged skills of planning, organizing and delivering another video presentation of cultural exploration, relevant to both majority Australia and to their better understanding of what it means to be part of the Aboriginal minority, but also with awareness of the diverse multi-culture that thrives in near physical proximity.

It falls to the activist group of people, almost without exception, to find a way of life that enables healthy survival and educational equality, but equally to explain their world-view to others. Natalie has found the video medium by which this expression can be projected. However, for the many who have not developed her skills, the pathway will be one of utilising community resources to find strategies that work for them.
4.2.21.3 Analysis of findings about Natalie's motivations

Natalie's life so far has been enhanced by intellectual gifts and cultural education by articulate parents. It is encouraging for the future of Aboriginal Australia that this can be achieved in physical locations that, in appearance, are emphatically Western, urban and non-Aboriginal. It seems that absence from the ideal places of clan origin can be substituted by visitations, and by establishing "virtual" communities, which could in the global sense be called "indigenist", by blending the commonalities of tribal origins, and in some cases, by adopting culturally 'lost' children into tolerant tribal homelands and customs, like those of the Wiradjuri. Whilst some of the features of Natalie's life are less than ideal, for example, the obfuscation of the "white" side in her TV research, other features offer the platform for wider success, especially location close to apparently excellent Aboriginal education, access to the Internet, and the nearby locations of experts in video, such as producers, directors, and photographers.

4.2.22 Personal motivations of Emily

Emily's biography carries an atypical chronological template, as the formation of her Aboriginal identity happened in two phases. These could be classified as strong and stronger, rather than weak and strong. Emily's heritage, maternal Wiradjuri and paternal Yorta Yorta, meant that she experienced her Aboriginality early and decisively, but her NSW State education cast her as 'outsider' and trained her for employment within the majority culture. Her early career within the mainstream had conventional office work as its
core activity and was very successful, especially when accounting innovations were required of her. However, a transformational change occurred with her undertaking of a tertiary educational program at Tranby College, and its curriculum of Aboriginal subject choices, as an educational gap was filled, which provided her with a new foundation of knowledge, self-awareness and career direction.

4.2.22.1 Evidence of holism in Emily's outlook and motivations

Her personal orientation both-ways, casts Emily as pragmatic in her negotiations with majority Australia. Her Australian societal whole is Aboriginal Australian on the one hand, with majority Australia, including Aboriginal Australia, on the other. This tendency could be described as a holism that contains complexity, but is without strong bias to the Aboriginal side.

4.2.22.2 Evidence of duality in Emily's attitudes and motivations

A unique feature of Emily's background is that her elder Aunties established a Sydney presence sixty years ago, so that for her 1967 is not such a milestone event, as her extended family associations with Aboriginal urban living precede the referendum period. Her dualities are in other life experiences than historically based timelines. For example, at Tranby College, she had been shown faulty (Cartesian) dualities and given the contrasting symmetry of circle leadership, which she described as "making so much sense". These comments reinforce the findings of the research that tertiary educational experiences are at their most effective if presentations affirm cultural world-views; that present non-discrete dualities as culture-friendly.
4.2.22.3 Evidence of balance in Emily's attitudes and motivations.

Emily explained that one of the aims of the State Land Councils is to achieve balance through the wealth of the land and to use the proceeds to fund the remediation of health deficiencies, and thereby close the health gap. She also sees a need to re-balance life expectancy and employment opportunities, especially in engineering trades, in which Aboriginal Australians have been traditionally under-represented. However, she has noted some progress; for example, a reduction in the cases of Aboriginal Australians who receive "no education at all". Emily's education at Tranby included some of the symbols of balance that were discussed at interview. For example:

You've got a group, and the relationship between the group and the individual, like kinship, is the driving force and identity comes out of those two things. But if you look at the Christian/Greek idea of the trilogy faith, hope and charity, the trilogy is not well balanced, whereas the Trintity (depiction at Figure 15, p.118) is a great way of looking at the differences.

4.2.22.4 Identity as a factor in Emily's motivations

The life-changing experience that Emily had at Tranby College was profound. It enriched her sense of identity, moving her from career choices, found totally in mainly clerical and accounting mainstream positions, to a lifetime commitment to a career that furthers the socio-cultural gains of Aboriginal Australians.

Prior to Tranby College, Emily had been educated in State educational settings where she was the only Aboriginal student. At Tranby, all students were Aboriginal, and from diverse tribal backgrounds. This enabled a rich tapestry of experiences, and gains in knowledge, including how her peer group processed Aboriginal culture and issues of
identity. For the first time, she felt enabled to speak her mind more confidently and openly, whereas earlier, at her public high school, she had remained silent. In contrast, with her confidence raised by Aboriginal educators at Tranby, she explained "I was always at the front, putting up my hand". Her subsequent career success as a cultural ambassador for Aboriginal Australians is testimony to the value of all-Aboriginal approaches to education, such as Batchelor College. Emily recalled that she helped to develop a collection of teaching resources for infant Aboriginal schoolchildren, which has direct relevance as an example of both identity and meaningful pedagogy: "We'd find out what sort of books we would get for the kids. And there's one called A for Aunty, and it's written by an Aboriginal woman; it is A for Aunty, B for Boomerang, C for Coolamon. Besides teaching alphabet, it's instilling pride and a different way of learning".

4.2.22.5 Individual and power factors in Emily's motivations

Whilst she is very conscious of the imbalances of opportunity afforded to Aboriginal Australians, compared with the Australian majority, Emily points out that one of the best ways of gaining the attention of non-Aboriginal Australians is to explain the attitudes, behaviours and conventions of those who identify as Aboriginal, in order to increase the troubling lack of knowledge of majority Australia about the essential differences of worldview of the two groups. In her case, she has noticed how frequently this is called for in everyday interactions with other Australians. Furthermore, she is aware that this is an issue for all of those in her Aboriginal peer group, who also believe they have the additional social weight of always being prepared for these informational dialogues in which curious Australians search for answers to fundamental questions about Australian life.
4.2.23 Collective motivations of Emily

4.2.23.1 Motivational indicators of place in Emily's evidence

There is a strong connection with place that Emily associates with Wiradjuri country as a
generality, but she is conscious of a missing element, as there is no particular site,
dwelling or "family seat" that is available to her as her place. This is a reminder, that
lengthy separations of Sydney-based Aboriginal inhabitants from their ancestral
homelands is problematic. Sixty years could mean four generations of increasing social
distance from Cowra, Emily's family's spiritual home. The difference between those
students at Tranby who were residents of the city only for their tertiary training, and Emily's
permanent urban identity, was clearly felt during that time and could be considered a
personal loss, even if it were not widely known to others.

4.2.23.2 Spirituality as a motivational driver in Emily's life

Denial of the fullest experience of place could have a negative impact on spirituality.
However, there is a strength of purpose in the decades of Emily's life since graduating
from Tranby that could not be maintained without spiritual resources. One of the sources of
spiritual energy on which she presently draws can be associated with Emily's profession
as cultural educator of both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal audiences, including those
visiting from overseas. To do her job, Emily must keep in touch with her spiritual side and
frequently revise and update her knowledge of Australian Aboriginal culture in its entirety.
After a working session in her professional role, shortly before interview for this research,
Emily was approached by a member of the audience who complimented her expressed feelings about place and "what our (Aboriginal) spirituality means", according to Emily. This unsolicited comment from an observer tends to support the impression that her separation from Wiradjuri places has not detrimentally affected Emily's Aboriginal knowledge, nor her spirituality.

4.2.23.3 Importance of relationality and kinship in Emily's motivations.

As described by Emily, there is a one-to-one relationship between kinship and trust: the closer the ties of kin, the higher the level of trust. However, her visitations to Aboriginal communities in her own working life have demonstrated that errors have been made by the non-Aboriginal knowledge deficit about building trust with Aboriginal communities, before beginning any intensive work with them. As Emily observed, given that this is a fundamental of how to approach issues of management in Aboriginal communities, it is hardly surprising that the speed of the Intervention and its martial overtones proved problematic. The Interventionist forces had no kinship connections with the target groups that were to receive their attention. Observing the care with which two Aboriginal parties of differing bands approach such matters, it can be seen that a counter-productive result would almost certainly be an outcome of non-Aboriginal to Aboriginal approaches, without close observation of the conventions of kinship, and giving consideration to the Aboriginal expectations of approaches imposed on those of unlike kin.

Emily described her own management style as encouraging of teamwork (a relational style), with a reflexive approach to determining what has gone wrong, if her team management has not met particular objectives. She associates her own style with the
example of Argyris' (2008) avoidance of blaming or scapegoating.

4.2.23.4 Narrative influences in Emily's motivations

Knowledge of kinship connections, and Aboriginal kin from two differing tribal origins have provided a strong Aboriginal cultural identity for Emily since childhood. However, in Emily's case, this does not come from Dreamtime stories at bedtime or from Aunties, but rather from a sense of "black pride" instilled by both parents. This early absence of lyrical tales or fitting cultural narratives in early childhood seems to have been substituted by the counter-cultural narratives of the realities of the history of Aboriginal peoples provided at Tranby College, and what could account for the apparent transformational effects of Emily's education there. The transit from the state of limited knowledge of Aboriginality afforded by NSW Education Department and the dearth of parental story-telling, due simply to lack of parental knowledge, may hold the key to Emily's rapid holistic growth. The depth of knowledge provided by Tranby College filled the gap quickly and decisively, although to Emily, this was not experienced as transformational, but rather as gradualized. However, by the end of this phase, Emily had been provided with such a complete and holistic framework of Aboriginal society and her place in it, that it has proved the decisive driver for her professional working life ever since.

4.2.23.5 Collectivist and power influences in Emily's motivations

Emily's is a biography of the empowering effects of Aboriginal tertiary education, assuming it follows the Tranby model of collective sharing of new knowledge and past experiences, within totally Aboriginal classes. This constructed experience sharing quickly made up for
what were apparently years of neglect of the issue of Aboriginal cultural heritage in NSW government schools, which catered only for transmission of the majority culture. For Emily, this was not simply a late equalising of cultural knowledge, but the platform for advanced cultural knowledge, now necessary if she is to carry out her role of cultural advisor completely. One incident that Emily recounted pointed to the learning potential of stepping outside the framework of majority Australian and Aboriginal Australian. In Emily's words: “I was embarrassed when I met a Chinese delegation and one of the Chinese men gave me a business card. I just took it and put it in my pocket. Since, I found out you have to look at it, turn it over, and then put it away. I think it probably offended the man”.

4.2.24 Summary of Emily's experiences, meaning and analyses

4.2.24.1 Experiential evidence in Emily's discourse

In Emily's narrative, episodes of loss are balanced by anecdotes of first-class achievements. Emily's re-education at Tranby provided both inspirational contacts with teachers and peers through which her world-view changed dramatically. Co-incidentally, her self-knowledge informed her that her competency within the majority urban framework may have been garnered at the expense of her lack of experience within the Wiradjuri homelands. However, her personal responses to this dilemma provided her with a new breadth of vision that seems to have resolved into a remarkable blending by which she has become effective in both worlds and fulfilled in both career and personal life.

4.2.24.2 Meaning of Emily's life experiences
It is clear that Emily could have been just as 'successful' in life, from a majority Australian perspective, had she simply continued with her non-Aboriginal professional career as an office worker, especially since she appears equally gifted in both verbal and numerical skills, and is unusually resourceful. However, the skills that Emily now brings to both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal cultures fulfil a great national need for better educational interlocutors who are effective both-ways.

Judging mainly from her demeanour and tolerant disposition, Emily has found deep meaning in all aspects of her life and occupies a professional position in which the fruits of her labour can be recognized in the responses she obtains from appreciative audiences, as well as by her own top management.

4.2.24.3 Analysis of findings about Emily's motivations

One of the enigmas in reviewing a life in any culture is to distinguish the things that are determined, from those that are achieved voluntarily and exceptionally. Emily's decision to begin her re-education at Tranby could be cast as embracing the unknown, and accidentally stumbling upon the riches of culture in the curricula and the personal associations that Tranby enabled. However, the biographical record would suggest that Emily was already exceptional before she enrolled at Tranby. That is, her sense of pride in her own individuality as Aboriginal, may have operated in the daily motivational energies that charged her burgeoning career in the offices of majority Australia. Certainly she had often felt the loss of connection with her cherished culture, and this carried the dissatisfactions of a perceived bisected identity, of not being quite Australian (majority) and yet not quite Aboriginal. As an established quick learner in the non-Aboriginal world, it
seems more likely that finding Tranby, and Emily's generalized sense of loss of traditional knowledge, presented a symbiotic attraction.

The conclusion that best fits in this circumstance is the one that is more in touch with high context societies, that is, there is an uncertainty. It is not one or the other, but rather both at once. In Emily's life, the need to re-balance knowledge and identity found its symbiotic other side, in the supply of ideas at Tranby. Of course, these ideas may have been provided at a later time by other means. However, the significance of Emily's transformational learning may be found more in its fortuitous crossing of the orbit of the star of need with the orbit of the star of ability at the precise moment of "readiness" that created the slingshot effect of synergy. This co-incidence maximized her energy and clarified her career choice. Such "good timing", is in Jungian (2006) terms, a synchronicity; an unlikely convergence of events generating from an enigmatic duality of, on the one hand, the improbable, and on the other the inevitable.

4.3 Findings arising from thematic participant responses

For the majority Australian, researching from outside the social membrane of Aboriginal Australia, it is difficult to convey the full meaning of the many communications from eight members of one of the modern urban communities of Aboriginal Australia, unless four concealed hazards are exposed for a clearer view. The first is that an accident of history is partly responsible for the vast differences in lifestyles, world-views and perceptions of what is fair. Unrealised by the colonists, and still only partly evident to their descendants, is that Western ways of knowing and perceiving could not be more different than their Aboriginal counterpart. The second has been extensively covered in previous chapters, in explaining
that the West is low context (field-independent) and individualistic, and that the culture of the Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders, like Asian cultures, is high context (field-dependent) and collectivist. To this can be added a third degree of difficulty, as cultures are tribal, with distinctive clan behavioural characteristics. Fourthly, the Australian culture contains many more tribal homelands than areas of comparable size, say First Nation North Americans. All of these Australian homeland groups had distinct languages, and partially differing world-views, for example between seaboard or inland dwellers. These differences produce compounding complexities, which may explain why the task of understanding one another that faced the First Fleet and the Aboriginal Australians could not have been more difficult, and why the reasons for that difficulty still persist today. Nevertheless, there are recurrent themes that can be identified from the responses during interviews, which add rich experiential data to the evidence provided by previous Aboriginal researchers in this field, especially in respect of differences that may characterize the motivational and cognitive influences on how Aboriginal Australians reach management decisions.

Taking a collective view of the meta-narrative of all participants, and using the historical method favoured by discourse analysts, Wodak and Meyer (2009), it is apparent that there is a striking similarity between Aboriginal Australians now and what is known of the colonial Australians of two centuries ago. Then, settlers saw themselves at risk and vulnerable to unseen Aboriginal antagonists, whom they misunderstood, disrespected and feared. The same tensions, vulnerability, disrespect, and fears are at the heart of Aboriginal culture now, even in urban settings. What remains unchanged, and still demands addressing with determination, is the apathy and apparently closed-mindedness of majority Australia towards understanding the world-view of Aboriginal Australians. With
sufficient good will to cast off prejudices and self-privileging, a new openness to the synergistic promise of inter-cultural dialogue may yet realise what a contribution could be made if the Australian majority were to move upward to a new level of listening and learning.

The grid at Figure 29 (p.295) reflects some of the theoretical design of Luhmann (1995), which speculates that modern society seeks to reduce complexity by decision making in functional systems, like the legal system and the educational system. Aboriginal management systems are unhierarchical and leaderless to all appearances, and this prompts the assumption that Aboriginal functional systems are relatively closed. Luhmann (1995) has made clear that spirituality is not found in the functional systems, but in the environment external to them. Nevertheless, they require the same dialectical energy, if a decision is made between spirituality and its opposite, materialism. There are some statements within the transcripts of interview, which form themes that are positive, and optimistic, and others that are negative or pessimistic. This division is desirable if a successful management pedagogy is to be developed, which avoids pitfalls by exposing potentially damaging flaws, of either personal or societal origin. These themes can be better understood if they are conceptualized in the form of the grid and text at Figure 29.
The decision to include the symbiotic with the societal follows Luhmann's (1995) placement of the dualities of greater complexity in the environment external to the functional systems. Specifically Luhmann (1995) has mentioned spirituality and racism as complex and located in the external environment. The function systems and their decision making process, for example decisions about legality and illegality in the system of law, are not symbiotic, as their opposites do not "find each other" but are dictated by the imperative that decisions have to be made if the systems are to self-maintain. Evidence from the interviews indicates that symbiosis has been imported into the environmental process, which shows examples of the co-incidence of variables coming together at certain times, apparently unforeseen in life narratives. For example, in the evidence of Emily, knowledge and sense of place fortuitously found cognitive inputs available at Tranby College, creating the synergy of transformation. However, symbiotic processes do not
differ from functional processes in terms of energy generation, as both depend on the
dynamics of non-discrete opposites, so both functional and symbiotic opposites should be
formulated as dialectical.

4.4 Conclusion

Part of the problem of the deterioration in race relations over recent decades perceived by
interviewees, is that mass media, rather than person to person social interaction,
increasingly informs majority Australia about its Aboriginal minorities. The modern news
cycle, which depends on visions of disorder, attention grabbing headlines, and over-
simplified analysis, does not analyse difficult social issues in depth. The Aboriginal
response has been to establish and support its own alternative newspapers and radio
stations. No doubt this does much for Aboriginal to Aboriginal information flows, but little
to advance the important issue of greater understanding amongst viewers and readers
within the majority culture.

Furthermore, this separation of the two media streams means that narratives of the
Aboriginal side only rarely emerge in mainstream media. But as this research illustrates,
the narratives of Aboriginal lives are equally as interesting as non-Aboriginal lives, and are
valuable for the mutual understanding of the ways in which the Aboriginal side thinks,
behaves and achieves. One example to be found in Natalie's narrative of her family's
suffering following the death of her Uncle, is the higher value placed on lost knowledge
than in the majority culture. This can be sourcing to the management circle philosophy that
every member's contribution is of equal value. The grief felt with the death of Hilton and
the loss of his knowledge is an issue that Edward O.Wilson (2012, 214) recognizes in his
acclaimed account of modern humankind, in which inner life is why "each person is unique and precious. When one dies, an entire library of both experience and imaginings is extinguished".

Just as the evaluations of this research offer prolific ideas about alternative ways in which society is conceptualized, it has just as much to offer its majority culture regarding alternative ways of management and learning, especially in the field of motivational aspects of management education. In the first place, it confirms that all of the motivations identified in the literature are validated by the endorsement of the participant group. Of uppermost importance to all of the interviewees is the enduring struggle to rebalance inter-societal equality by dedicating much of their lives to Aboriginal group endeavours, rather than to competing for greater personal power and earning capacity.

During the process of interviewing, many theorists valued by both Aboriginal writers and the participants were discussed. There was a noticeable internal consistency amongst the philosophies and biographies of authors valued by the participants. All were to some extent marginalized figures: for example, Eckhart (1981) and Teilhard de Chardin (1976) had been disowned by the Church, while Tesla upset the scientific establishment and died in poverty. Common to most interviewees was an admiration for Mahatma Gandhi, who had been derided by Western leaders, and assassinated. Another consistency was the total absence of any majority Australian as a role model.

These preferences confirm the need to approach the management education of Australians along pathways constructed in the Aboriginal world. This does not mean, however, that all Western theorists should be disregarded, as most participants had heard
of Jung (1989) and valued his known interest in the world's Aboriginal populations. Luhmann's (1995) conception of a world society inter-connected by mass media and bypassing national boundaries also seems consistent with the expressed view of participants. Steven's world-view had already embraced a global philosophy, which placed Australian Aboriginality at the centre of a world ontology, rather than on its periphery. More than half of the participants had formed close personal ties with Aboriginal role models of overseas origin. Contrasting this with the absence of role models of non-Aboriginal Australian origin, the impression left is of a clear preference for a borderless society with indigenist overseas alliances, such as African American or Native North American, to counter the majority Australian predilection to exclusion and disheartening disconnection between promises and their fulfilment.
Chapter 5 Findings and implications

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter it is proposed to address the findings and implications under the following headings:

5.1 Introduction
5.2 How the analysis of discourse with the participants explains the validity of the motivations identified from the literature review to support an Aboriginal management pedagogy.
5.3 Whether the theories, social systems, psychodynamics, ecological, reflexivity, and others are appropriate to interface Australian Aboriginal both-ways management pedagogy with its majority Australian equivalent.
5.4 Implications for policy and procedures.
5.5 Conclusion.

Key questions to be addressed in this chapter are the following:

1. Is the research evidence of the case studies of eight Aboriginal participants consistent with the assumptions made about their motivational drivers?

2. Can archetypes, dualities and other factors be used to mediate explanations of Aboriginal and Western motivations?

3. Do Aboriginal ideas of how to manage have anything to offer Australian corporates?
4. What are the inter-connections of the major theories, their strengths and shortcomings?

5. Above all, do the theories-in-use in this research accurately reflect the importance of motivations, demotivations, and neuroscience as drivers of Aboriginal management education?

Consequently, the following findings are presented in sections which attempt to answer these major questions in order, with answers to specific questions arising from participants' responses dealt with first, followed by the validation of theories.

The divisions between Aboriginal and majority Australians may be illustrated by their different ways of processing the title, "contribution to knowledge". The operating duality is epistemology (majority Australian) and experience (Aboriginal Australian). The majority looks for knowledge towards the written words in books, schools and universities. The Aboriginal way, however, is to prefer knowledge gained from experiences (Baumvoll, 2008, 46), for example of practical, hands-on training, orally and personally instructed, rather than academic education as conceived in the Western tradition of a hierarchy of learning institutions, where achievements are accredited by experts after deciding who is to pass or fail. Moreover, Aboriginal knowledge, according to Battiste (2002) and Barnhardt and Kawagley (2005), has suffered from the colonising effects of trivialization, in contrast with Western concealed appropriation of non-European knowledge, that troubled participant, Steven, and educational self-privileging. In the process, the valuable elements of knowledge, and the multi-cultural borrowings of Western education have both been invisibilized. As a result, the meaning of the term, contribution to knowledge, has to be read in terms of the culture of the observer, but ideally with due consideration of each side...
of the perception of its alter, respectively Aboriginal or majority Australian.

Notwithstanding these differences in readership, this research is conceived as a resource for those who might become stakeholders in the future development of Aboriginal management education theory and practice. It is a pedagogy derived from the research evidence of Aboriginal participants, based on an integrated collection of Aboriginal theories that are familial and consistent with what is known of Aboriginal motivations. It could aid the preparation of Aboriginal Australian management students, by providing approaches in which their own values and styles are preserved, and integrated into management school pedagogy. The question of how the key motivations of Aboriginal Australians influence their education in management therefore had to be re-constituted at its formulation, as if it were being considered by all Aboriginal Australians, represented collectively by the research participants speaking about it articulately, albeit in a non-Aboriginal language.

The following Figure 30 illustrates the main theoretical origins of theorists’ support for Aboriginal management styles:

**Figure 30 Western theories supporting Aboriginal management styles**
5.2 Findings about participant discourse and motivations

5.2.1 Findings about key Aboriginal motivations to seek naturalism, dualities, balance and identity over the long term.

5.2.1.1 Naturalism and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence

It is clear from previous research in this area, and the evidence gained from the oral inputs of participants in this research, that Aboriginal Australians regard their lifestyles and management styles as more natural than the ways and attitudes of majority Australia. The importance of what is natural was evident in all of the dialogues with participants of this research: For example:

- Una defined natural as what exactly reflects Aboriginality. She saw Aboriginal poverty as a mode of living brought about by the marginalization of Aboriginal society, inspiring her life quest to close the equity gap with majority Australia. By introducing circle management, she adopted what she regarded as a technique more natural to the Aboriginal members of her staff conferences.
- Frank had reached strongly held conclusions regarding the superiority of the diet of his youth, a cuisine available only to the hunter-gatherer, in contrast with the fast foods of Sydney.
- Noel’s lifestyle included regular visits with his children to the Tiwi Islands, keeping kinship with his wife’s culture and southern New South Wales, with his own culture,
as a counter to the “un-natural” aspect of his inner city living, with its lack of spiritual balance.

- Michael saw many of the failures of reconciliation as failures of the majority to grasp what was natural to Aboriginal society. In particular, he cited the failure of Government to consult Aboriginal elders widely before appointments to high office. Also, he regarded Government “capture” of Aboriginal social initiatives by alternate funding and withdrawal of support as contrary to the natural long-term approach of Aboriginal societies. However, it may be that compromise is inevitable, particularly in New South Wales, where the identification of elders is highly problematic in certain areas.

- Kathy empathized with the more natural Aboriginal parklands in contrast with the contrived green spaces of the city. Kathy distinguished such unnatural urban parks from the natural parks held in trust by Aboriginal custodians.

- Steven held the view that it was natural for Aboriginal Australians to know their history and to value Aboriginal contributions to world culture. This contrasted with majority Australia’s and the Western world’s determination to claim credit for achievements.

- Natalie pointed out that, for the Aboriginal Australian, it is natural to experience a personhood of all things. Her project to honour her Uncle Hilton was both a re-balancing of lost history and a re-authoring, or naturalizing, of Hilton’s biography, with a close nexus between place and spirit.

- Emily raised the natural in her education received at Tranby, about dualities in cultures, reporting that dualities and their status as natural fit comfortably with her own life experiences.
5.2.1.2 Duality and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence

Like collectivism and individualism, the duality of nature and society is a fundamental of societies. This remained unacknowledged until due recognition of its importance was accorded by the ecological movement of the late twentieth century. Similarly, the Aboriginal nature of many of the "innovations" in management of the twenty-first century, as described in this chapter, await the respect of due diligence and belated recognition as Aboriginal epistemology. Dualities as philosophical explanations began in antiquity and find their most recent iteration in social systems theory.

It is advisable for Aboriginal ontology and management theory, to employ the non-discrete, non-Cartesian, dualities favoured by Waters (2004), Pearson (2009), and Arabena (2006, 2008). Energizing paradox arising from the dualities can be illustrated in the methodology chosen in this research, by accessing key Aboriginal concepts needing deeper understanding. This cannot be done without positing an opposite to the idea under review.

The research participants experienced dualities in the following evidence relating to their oral testimonies.

- Una saw the two entities, Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal Australia, as distinctly separated, with little hope of reconciliation. At the same time, she strongly advocated against giving up the struggle for reconciliation.
- In contrast, Frank’s perception of the duality of majority Australian / Aboriginal Australian was expressed in subtle terms, revealing a non-binary and less divisive perspective. His view is that the Aboriginal nations of Australia are part of majority Australia and therefore the duality is Aboriginal Australia on the one hand and
Australia containing its Aboriginal citizens on the other.

- Noel’s life experiences regularly involve accommodating dualities. His heritage is anchored to the land, whereas his wife’s is seaboard, requiring a need to balance both perceptions in the education of his children. He reports a tension between home (southern New South Wales) and away (Uluru), requiring a return to country to satisfy the tensions of the duality.

- Michael’s dualities included tensions between historical epochs, for example, pre-1967 / post-1967 and power asymmetry, the weakness of the Aboriginal, especially as a child, and the strength of the dominant culture, a source of ongoing tension, still unresolved.

- Kathy held that the predominant duality is spiritual / temporal, a tension she regarded as growing in seriousness, as the Western world embraced global economics, including outsourcing, and exploiting Aboriginal workers overseas.

- Steven, who had survived a period of imprisonment, perceived a duality of fair / unfair. The lack of balance in the way the legal system operated deprived Aboriginal citizens, with valuable Aboriginal traditions, including a system of justice, of equality before their law.

- Natalie expressed concern at the dualistic tension operating between majority Australian culture and Aboriginal culture. She has seen a growth in the numbers of displaced children, who are denied access to their cultural heritage due to poverty and powerlessness.

- Emily’s life places Aboriginal education at the fulcrum of her life experiences. She regards the experiences and development of Aboriginal people within their own education system as vital. Her key duality is Aboriginal education on the one hand, and majority education on the other. Her resolution is to be found in enabling all
young Aboriginal people educational alternatives catering to their own cultural needs.

5.2.1.3 Balance and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence

Balance was examined co-extensively with evidence gathered from Aboriginal research participants' examples of behaviours they rate as relatively unbalanced. The thread of strong connectedness with kin, homelands and all things, means that majority Australian unbalancing, impacts negatively on Aboriginal identity and respect for the natural.

- Una reported unbalance arising from the Aboriginal city dweller's tendency to experience weak associations with place. She mentioned grand shopping malls and their contrast with food and other supplies obtained closer to nature.
- Frank pointed to the unbalancing of nature in the degradation of soils and rivers.
- Noel referred to the natural vistas he paints of tribal lands as a way of balancing the intensive urbanization surrounding him and his family in the inner city of Sydney.
- Michael's early life was perceived as a major imbalance between home and school, the former rich in warmth and culture and the latter as an assault on all of the things he held in high esteem.
- Kathy has experienced a growing deterioration in balance between Aboriginal spirituality, which remains strong and consistent and the loss of spiritual balance in the wider Australian society.
- Steven also mentioned ecological degradation and sought solace in the poet Oriah’s works as in balance with the natural world.
- Natalie facilitated a natural Wiradjuri closure of her Uncle Hilton’s journey in a
sacred burial ceremony performed by respected elders. Her life has been taken up with a lengthy project to re-balance the previously scant knowledge of her family about the life of her Uncle.

- Emily observed that dualities and balance were now internalized in her way of comprehending and reconciling the contrasting world-views of majority Australia and her Aboriginal culture.

Ensuring balance and natural behaviours is akin to underwriting the relevance that all nations strive for. No contribution to knowledge could be afforded, without the assurance that all parts of any proposed pedagogy should validate the consistent aspirations of Aboriginal researchers and participants in any research.

5.2.1.4 Identity and its motivational indications in participants’ evidence

The importance of the search by Aboriginal Australians for a sense of identity is framed as the first descriptor of the nature of Aboriginality, and as the universal introductory subject when Aboriginal Australians meet. Re-balancing two unequal societies and the identities of their constituents were the significant drivers of Una’s professional work. In some descriptions, identity is an exploration of points of relationality held in common, when Aboriginal Australians engage in opening dialogue, including the sub-identities of place, kin and relationships to all things. Williams (2007) explains that the dynamics of Aboriginal identity are energized by the duality social / cultural, to generate a complete trilogy with the political (2007, 7-8). There is a strong sense of struggle to maintain identity in an environment of contested identities. This is more prominent in urban settings, in which Aboriginal Australians face expectations from their majority counterparts that they will
forsake their Aboriginal identity and embrace Westernization (Williams, 2007, 6). The offending stereotype cited by Williams (2007, 4) is the Aboriginal Australian as relic of the past. In other words, there is a misplaced expectation that preservation of Aboriginal identity offends against the cachet of modernity.

There was strong evidence that finding and maintaining an Aboriginal identity was central to the life-styles of all research participants.

- Una’s life constantly re-asserts the importance of Aboriginal identity. She chose a career path that provided ways to engage in the struggle for identity and to equalize opportunity.
- Frank achieved his sense of identity professionally by his success as a writer of dreamtime stories and in reflexively keeping in touch with his own personal history and pride in ancestry.
- Noel modestly described his situational leadership in which his facility for biculturality afforded him the honour of speaking for other Aboriginal colleagues on a learning path to engage with the wider Australian culture. He contributed to the identity of colleagues by adhering to Aboriginal custom of respect due to elders in each homeland he visits professionally.
- Michael’s status as elder is in itself evidence of attainment of identity, and its authenticity to Aboriginal observers in the Redfern community. His roots pre-date the Redfern community and the 1967 referendum. After a lifetime of activism, his sense of identity is well defined and serves as role model for the community.
- Kathy, also a community elder, added additional finesse to Aboriginal identity by stressing that her band, Wiradjuri, is noted for traditions in the matrilineal line of nurture of other Aboriginal groups, including displaced children in the Redfern
community.

- Steven had sought to add to his Australian Aboriginal identity by widely reading the contributions of Native American authors. In Steven's view, non-Australian Aboriginal authors and selected Western writers can also contribute to the development of Australian Aboriginal identity.

- Natalie's identity is strongly anchored in the travails of family and community life and the honouring of band traditions. Her documentary making is a way of explaining Aboriginal identity to majority Australia.

- Emily could not have found her complete identity within the State education system, as it presented her to her fellow students as "the Aboriginal girl" and offered no curriculum other than majority Australian. Real growth of identity came with her education at Tranby, when there was a fellowship with others of special needs and opportunities provided for self-development.

Embodied in Aboriginal identity is a lifetime commitment to issues arising from a longer term approach to life, which is spiritually connected to an after-life. The question of the behavioural effects on management styles of a long term orientation was raised in Sub-section 2.6.4. The evidence provided by Frank and Natalie indicates that achievement in career management and project management is strongly influenced by long term approaches. In Frank's narrative, in Sub-section 4.2.1.1 and Natalie's in Sub-section 4.2.20.3, there are remarkable themes of the strength of motivation delivered over periods of seven years (Natalie) and twenty years (Frank) on a documentary project and professional writing. Similarly strong motivations to lifetime dedication to Aboriginal advancement is evident in the biographies of Michael and Kathy.
5.2.2 Findings arising from thematic participant responses

5.2.2.1 Holistic and positive themes

It could not be stated that any of the participants indicated unholistic intentions or short term attitudes. This may be to some extent attributable to their range of ages, approximately 30-60 years old. However, there was clear evidence of long term approaches to life, of connection with the meaningful, and clarity of direction in all cases. Also, there was a constant sense of holism constrained by the unfair allocation of resources and opportunities by the Australian majority, which dictated career responses aligned with the survivability of Aboriginal society. In this regard, more energy and effort was dedicated to maintaining identity in order to blend personal and career interests with those of the whole Aboriginal community.

5.2.2.2 Holistic and negative themes

In several interviews it became clear that participants were self-identifying their own life-stages in discussing parallel events in the lives of family members, especially in Natalie's account of her Uncle Hilton's life, which ended tragically at age 27. There was clearly a worry within the family that a truncated life meant that the unique knowledge of the deceased had not been passed down to sons or daughters, and that the wisdom acquired by Hilton had remained unaccessed. There were further implications that the mystery of Hilton's death spiritually clouded the family, owing to the perceived "unholy" failure to apprehend Hilton's knowledge prior to his passing. Natalie's journey restored balance and "naturalized" the disturbing consequences of lost narratives, which happened with the re-
establishment with place, and Aboriginal adherence to tradition achieved by exhumation and re-burial by Wiradjuri elders administering sacred rites. This loss of knowledge may have been felt more profoundly than in the majority culture, as oral traditions accord more authenticity to spoken words by "storying" in Aboriginal education than Western traditions of reliance on written eulogy or biography.

In 1977, Sir Karl Popper and Sir John Eccles co-authored a work of great significance, as they were both renowned for their scholarship, on the philosophy of the mind (Popper) and neuroscience (Eccles). Their book, *The self and its brain*, closely reflects the sense of loss experienced by Natalie and her family, and utilizes similar reasoning for valuing every human life, in reporting that "every time a man dies, a whole universe is destroyed". Furthermore, they (humankind) are irreplaceable and ends in themselves (Popper & Eccles, 2006, 3).

5.2.2.3 Dualistic and positive themes

All participants recognized the importance of dualistic elements in the ontology of Aboriginal Australians, and in two cases, Frank and Noel were able to extend the metaphor to introduce the dualities of the differences in perspectives and languages between seaboard and inland tribal indicators. In both these cases, there was acknowledgment of the potential misunderstanding and need for negotiation in communicating between themselves and those of the opposite moiety. Linkages with the Ganma image, and its recent physical expression in the meetings of flood and seawater at the Murray estuary, were held to be consistent with pre-existing Aboriginal beliefs, including the energizing and re-creational effects on flora and fauna.
5.2.2.4 Dualistic and negative themes

In social terms, the dualistic images drew more problematic examples from participants' life experiences. In Una's case, it was the challenges of living and working in two worlds. She proceeded to explain the conflicts between the materialism of majority Australia and the spiritual nature of the Aboriginal world-view. For Kathy, the misunderstandings arising from this fundamental duality were being exacerbated by majority Australia's own loss of spirituality in recent decades, thereby creating a widening gap in social distance between the two societies.

5.2.2.5 Positive themes of balance and identity

The most encouraging areas of inquiry were evident in the apparently pragmatic way in which "hybrid" identities were being constructed in the urban Aboriginal communities. There was a sense of need for co-operation amongst all Australians of Aboriginal origin, whereby youth who had lost a sense of identity and direction through personal misfortune could be re-associated with a welcoming band, such as the Wiradjuri, and re-establish a meaningful life in touch with Wiradjuri elders. Similarly, Noel and his wife, brought together symbiotically by their Aboriginality, formed a union unavailable to traditional tribal Aboriginal bands, as their ancestry was associated with places on the opposite sides of the Australian continent, and in the case of the Tiwi Islands, separated by a sea journey. These two examples of Aboriginal youngsters losing ancestral connections, and mature adults forming families with mixed tribal connections, give some indication of the changes with which the modern Aboriginal world has to cope and conciliate. However, the
driving force of re-balancing to preserve Aboriginal identity could be described as the single most important dynamic observed in both literature and the evidence of interviews.

5.2.2.6 Negative themes of balance and identity

The construction of "hybrid" identities amongst Aboriginal Australians of various tribal origins raises a further question of whether blended identities are attainable between urbanized Aboriginals and majority Australians. The evidence gathered in this study would suggest the paradoxical; that they can in Emily's example, and they cannot in Michael's example. However, this does not necessarily mean conflict. On the contrary, both positions are predictable and necessary for the survival of the Aboriginal culture as a whole. The difference is not unlike the religious splits between orthodox and liberal wings. The orthodox is essential for connections with the traditional, and the liberal for changes in touch with the wider Australian society. However, the balance to be attained has to be in the tolerance between both sides of the Aboriginal groupings, so that a further balance can be established jointly with the wider Australian community.

5.2.2.7 Positive themes of individual and collective power

It is important to re-iterate that in all interviews there was a consensus that individual power was available to Aboriginal Australians only through the power of the collective. This was not just the lip service of espoused theory, but the conscientious practice of theory-in-use in all cases. One of Noel's examples was his visit to tribal elders stating his work intentions prior to beginning a new painting assignment. Another was the practice of longer term visitation with tribal units by Emily to gain acceptance and trust prior to
commencing her assignments. These two examples are of "orthodox" practices carried out by "liberal" participants, which provide evidence that the element of respectful adherence to custom is observed by all.

The participants were, in the main, positive about some aspects of the growth of pan-Aboriginal power that they had noticed in recent years. First was the major increase in the rate of graduation of Aboriginal students in prestigious Western professions, notably medicine (Brennan, 2014). Second was the increasing availability in urban Australia of culture-friendly educational opportunities.

5.2.2.8 Negative themes of individual and collective power

From a macro reading, between the Government on the one hand and Aboriginal Australia on the other, there was evidence of distrust, based on much empirical evidence of failures of initiatives, especially those begun by the Aboriginal side and taken over by government as a going concern. There was also a sense of resigned disappointment at the political opportunism of successive governments' promising much but delivering little. This might at first be seen as no more than the same disillusionment that majority Australians have experienced in the past two decades of political spin and unmet promises. However, during the period of the interviews 2011-2012, it became apparent that the Intervention, considered unacceptable to the participants in its first iteration, was to be continued for another decade without any serious consultation with Aboriginal stakeholders. This re-ignited an apparently long-standing frustration that governments hand down decisions without seeking the advice of Aboriginal people. Included in this sense of disempowerment is the tendency in recent years of governments to appoint Aboriginal leaders, rather than to
seek the counsel of Aboriginal elders. Taken together, these two trends seem to entrench despair rather than hope.

5.2.3 **Summary statement of positive and negative research themes**

5.2.3.1 Personal power, reflexivity and identity

All participants were in agreement that the Aboriginal versions of concepts raised in interviews were closely inter-connected, overlapping, and part of a larger holistic system. At the same time, the system would not function if one of the concepts were removed. In this regard, place assumed a pivotal anchor, as its images are more accessible, and without it spirituality would be incomplete. A distinction was clearly articulated between the contrived urban parklands dedicated to recreation, and places of spiritual significance to Aboriginal Australians. It was also clear that educational experiences were enhanced by location in places of spiritual or clan significance.

One theme that recurred in most interviews is a reluctance to compete for positions of leadership or of power. This Western tendency to perceive competition as a desirable means of acquiring power is a dishonourable course to the Aboriginal onlooker, as it is not conducive to group solidarity. This creates difficulties for the acceptance by Aboriginal populations of the practices of governments which devolve power over them simply by appointing favoured individuals, no matter how qualified they are. Concepts like power, qualifications, credentials and leadership are defined differently in Aboriginal societies. There are forms of Western democracy, like Swiss cantonal government, that enshrine the right of decision making at the level of the individual. This would come closer to the
Aboriginal way, but would not necessarily stop the imposition of the increasingly centralized majority Australian will on Aboriginals against their expressed wishes.

This is not to suggest that Aboriginal Australians should discontinue striving for the preservation of their own identity, as in the long run, it may prove to be the most valued constituent of a revised majority Australian identity. Aboriginal self-descriptions drawn from responses to interviews show a strength of opinion, similar to reliance on identity, that the Aboriginal way is more natural in the sense that it is closer to the earth, as it values sustainability and responsibility for the land. In previous chapters, it has been indicated that Aboriginal housing, both in Australia and overseas, shows affinity with the natural shapes, which Fuller (Edmondson, 2007) would classify as natural, especially in its preference for triangle and curve over the right-angle of modern Western architecture.

Moreover, Aboriginal human relationships are tied to the land, and to all things animate and inanimate, by spirituality and ritual. Artistic reflections of Aboriginal culture in dance and paintings also pay homage to the beneficent legacy received from ancestors. Hence, the relational tie between peoples (past, present and future) and land, acts as a channel for continuous respect, sustenance and closer connectedness with the natural. Any inventory of contribution to Aboriginal management knowledge or education theory would therefore be incomplete without the inclusion of notions of the natural, and its unqualified acknowledgment.

There was a sense of increasing hope and despair being experienced concurrently as tangible educational improvements were discussed alongside the emergence of a generation of lost children, and fringe-dwellers who have only vague knowledge of their
Aboriginality, but who experience the daily marginalization of poverty. On the positive side, it was clear that ways of approaching this problem were emerging from within the Aboriginal community, in the idea of adoptive clans re-constituting a shattered identity in one of the kinship groups now clustered in the inner-city suburbs of Sydney.

Reflexivity was practised regularly both at the personal and societal levels, and its usefulness well understood. The importance placed by Martin on this aspect of Aboriginality was fully affirmed, as most interviewees explained that the scope of their frequent reflective practices included the realm of their known ancestors, on whom they depended for guidance in day-to-day living. In self-reviewing personal biographies of life's challenges and milestones, participants were aware of decisions that led to favourable outcomes, and that were life affirming. At the cross-cultural level, however, the reviews were less positive, as daily press reports during the research period of 2011-2012 often provided disturbing reading. For example, the shooting in King's Cross of two Aboriginal teenagers by NSW police, and the epilogue that no report on the incident would be released, owing to police case overload. There was also a general conclusion that in the past twenty years, race relations had steadily deteriorated. Racism was defined differently by the participant group from that of the majority Australian position, where it is seen as the exception rather than the rule. As economic historian Butlin (1993) wrote, racism was one of two reasons why Aboriginal society was violated so early and so comprehensively. However, the evidence of this study suggests that it is still the daily experience of urbanized Aboriginal city dwellers. As participant Emily insisted, Aboriginal women do not worry about sexism, when there is so much racism. It is not a Western custom to respect the vanquished, but rather to find them defective as a way of justifying conquest. However, this study suggests that observing the way Aboriginal Australians manage today, and how
they preserved their culture for so long, should invite a closer and more respectful
evaluation of their place in Australian society.

The evidence of responses provided by interview participants is that Aboriginal Australians
appear to experience loss of identity as a contested zone, where the scales of justice are
constantly unbalanced in favour of majority Australians. A paradox may be found in
considering that majority Australians, especially with increasing immigration inflows and
nationwide financial exclusions, probably have a less developed and more threatened
identity than Aboriginal Australians, who cannot experience what it is like to have the
blended and blanded majority Australian identity, as it is unobservable to them.

5.2.3.2 Findings about the affects of demotivational Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander
pedagogy, marginalization, and post-trauma

In this research, the positive ideas and values of scientists of both Aboriginal and Western
traditions have been presented. The synergy of Jung (1989) and Fuller & Dil (1983) that
produces human growth in educational interventions has, in its antecedents, assumptions
of teaching excellence. In addition to the compound gains potential to synergistic learning
outcomes, the research literature suggests that for Aboriginal learning to occur readily, it
needs to be consistent with the foundation knowledge and beliefs of Aboriginal students.

However, there is consistent evidence that the affects of demotivational pedagogy were
strong in all of the participants in this research. It could be concluded that when the
Aboriginal student is required to attend a New South Wales state school, or unexceptional
private school, the result is generally unsatisfactory. This should be self-evident, as the
pedagogy is not both-ways, and is therefore of questionable relevance to the Aboriginal student. For this reason, participants Frank, Natalie and Emily, who should have been elevated to the status of “gifted” were marginalized and graduated from the state school system without distinction.

For Aboriginal Australians, it could be expected that there would be significant discomfort in coping with the majority modality of individualism. However, the literature suggests that there are deeper burdens of discomfort in other elements within Australian society. These relate to systemic marginalization. They are expressed in the narratives of research participants: Frank experienced rejection of his attempts to join a majority Australian sporting team; Emily complained of security staff targeting only those of Aboriginal appearance; Michael expressed his abhorrence of dismissive childhood nicknames, like Jacky-Jacky.

5.2.3.3 Prejudice, stereo-typing and faulty attribution

To a large extent the school experiences of the participants of the research were disappointingly poor because of a pedagogy seen to be prejudiced and stereotyping by participants, as it preached democracy, but only for the majority. This was certainly the case of Michael (4.2.10.4), who explained the tumultuous environment of his school: “there were clashes (with classmates over race) in my life every day”. Similarly, Emily found her metropolitan public school indifferent to her needs as the only Aboriginal girl in class. Her success in Aboriginal tertiary settings was just the opposite: “Coming from an all-white school to an all-black class boosted my confidence. I was always at the front, putting my hand up, whereas at (public) school I didn't do any of that”. Frank fared the
worst of all the interviewees, as he left his public high school in northern New South Wales functionally illiterate. Of his transition to professional writer, he says: “Reading and writing was my hardest. I hadn't done that till I got to Sydney. I was forty years old when I did it at the Eora Centre”. Ironically the biggest consumer of his writings is the NSW Education Department. Furthermore, as the Aboriginal minority is according to Scott (1998), uniquely bound, amongst all Australian minorities, to retain and preserve its cultural heritage, the tension between learning one culture or the other is not likely to be relieved in the foreseeable future.

Like school education, the practices of management education in a nation of diverse multiculture tends to raise the likelihood of errors of misunderstanding. However, in some ways the problems of faulty communication may be simplified by assigning the managed to larger cultural groupings. Nisbett (2004) suggests that East Asian peoples have many similarities in the characteristics of their thought processes, belief systems and cognition that differ markedly from Europeans. One tendency of field-independent societies, like the Australian majority culture, is to narrow explanations of causes of behaviour to objects or individuals in the form of positive or negative labels, such as good and evil, and to disregard social causes more clearly evident to observers within the field-dependent (high context), but broader social panorama perceived preferentially by Asian societies. The landing in Sydney Cove of the first fleet of 1788 can be understood as the arrival of a group of field-independent (low context) settlers in a nation of field-dependent (high context) clans. In other words, it was the “settling” of a group steeped in the traditions of hierarchy and authority of the field-independent (low context), within a relatively unstructured and accommodating (field-dependent or high context notions) homeland of native peoples. Captain Phillip's mission was to establish a penal colony; a punitive exile
of a nation’s own citizens, usually for minor offences, literally to the ends of the earth. In itself, this event portended the clash of cultures that was to follow. The technologies characterizing field-independence (low context) enabled the British success. Their mission, excising the wicked from the motherland, also field-independent (low context) in intent, unwittingly occupied sacred places. With the wisdom of hindsight, it is not difficult to understand how the perception of the objectified native observers would be that the newcomers were disrespectful and threatening, and later that they had been invaded and dispossessed.

5.2.3.4 Impacts of poverty on Aboriginal management pedagogy

Participants, like Emily, Michael and Una, who provided the evidence for this research were confident spokespersons for their culture, and had life histories that would be regarded as successful in majority Australian terms. Whilst issues of poverty did not impact them frequently, they provided examples, such as the need for the Redfern Aboriginal community’s nurture of displaced urban Aboriginal children, indicating that the impacts of poverty are psychologically near. Moreover, the participants did not associate success with Western prosperity or wealth, but with the prestige of attaining Aboriginal knowledge and being authentically Aboriginal. None of the role models or archetypes mentioned by participants had distinguished themselves materially, but all were selfless and spiritual.

This creates a significant difference between the ways in which motivations to address poverty are constructed by the Australian majority and its Aboriginal sub-culture. Expressed in Western terms, poverty may be reduced by accumulating assets, which can purchase the fullest enjoyment of the goods and services affordable to an affluent member
of the Australian society. Therefore poverty and material success form the opposing poles of a defining duality. For the Aboriginal Australian, however, poverty can be viewed, not as an absence of tangible assets or consumables, but as the loss of capacity to engage fully in a meaningful (though urban) Aboriginal lifestyle. As an example from Natalie’s evidence, exclusion from white society, a form of enforced poverty, led to Uncle Hilton’s premature death at 27, truncating an Aboriginal life and thereby the heritage of Uncle Hilton’s knowledge and wisdom. Hence, an alternative duality needs to be recognized for the Aboriginal Australian, juxtaposing poverty on the one hand and sufficiency to realise full Aboriginality on the other.

Pearson’s practical answer to the question raised in Sub-section 2.1.4 about redressing the poverty gap is that we do not need to fix all social and economic problems to close the achievement gap. Nevertheless, the gap is still dauntingly wide, and activist responses are appropriate, including Pearson’s successful introduction of the DISTAR reading system (Engelmann & Bruner, 1974) for Aboriginal students in north Queensland. For these and other reasons related to unequal opportunity, the introduction of a holistic educational design requires that Aboriginal leaders and students need to put their cases for educational equity in a whole of life context, starting from pre-natal care and ending in longevity comparisons. In pedagogical approaches to Aboriginal cultures, the employment of a critical methodology seems essential to the achievement of whole of life educational outcomes. Furthermore, successful realisation of an appropriate pedagogy cannot occur without concurrent attention to improvements in social inclusion and the counter-developmental impacts of poverty.

5.2.3.5 Addressing assumptions about knowledge deficit
Warning against the perils of the cultural deficit model for bi-cultural education, Martin (2008a, 68-70) advocates adopting an anti-deficit and multi-literacies stance for all Aboriginal education. In Martin’s view, the deficit model's mistaken assumptions are that the Aboriginal student has a learning deficit, and that Westerners have the ability to judge the deficit. However, she concludes that if the system endorses what the Aboriginal student has to offer, better outcomes are possible. This was certainly the case with participant Emily, who flourished only after her Aboriginal knowledge was respected. In other words, there is an obligation in any professional pedagogy to establish the extent of existing knowledge, rather than pre-judging a deficit condition. Assumptions of the deficiency of Aboriginal knowledge are deeply embedded at all levels in contemporary society, according to Christie (2009). However, he states that the deficit model of Aboriginal knowledge is now being strongly opposed. Nakata (2007, 156) adds a further dimension to this problem as something more than cultural deficit, by layering it with a further class bias. He observes that traditional middle class practices ascribe Aboriginal knowledge deficit to lower classes, with middle class values as normative. In a holistic pedagogy, every demotivational factor demands attention. Planning a way out of the demotivating environment of the deficit model needs pedagogical instruments that fit the models of holism and naturalism, such as those outlined in Sub-section 5.2.1.

In any discussion of Aboriginal education, the post-colonial effects of exclusion, trauma and poverty cast a long shadow. Adoption of Pearson's (2011) approach is recommended; addressing educational initiatives and issues of poverty and trauma jointly and holistically. Understanding the way attribution works within and between field-dependent and field-independent societies may begin a process of reducing prejudice and faulty presumptions,
such as the knowledge-deficit of Aboriginal societies. In this way, increasing community knowledge of how Aboriginal motivations work may lead to more effective reduction of perceptions of irrelevance and educational demotivation. In answering the implied question posed in Sub-section 2.6.3 regarding whether Aboriginal managers are likely to attribute causes for management results differently from non-Aboriginal Australian managers, the foregoing array of impediments can been seen in no other terms than environmentally caused. The attribution of unfairness and discrimination tended to dominate research discourse with all participants. The commercial dream of the level playing field, where markets operate with fairness and freedom, is not readily realisable to the non-Aboriginal small businessperson, and appears substantially harder for Aboriginal start-ups. It is clear, therefore, that Luhmann’s (1995) “codes of entry” to society need to be made available more extensively in Australia to its Aboriginal citizens, before reliable comparative judgments about attribution of cause in management results can be made.

5.3 Appropriateness of social systems, psychodynamic, and other theories for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy

The need for a congruent theory of Aboriginal management education was anticipated in the January, 2011 issue of the Journal of Management Education. This reflects a growing awareness of the absence of interest or effort in research and publications in this area for at least twenty years. The Journal of Management Education articles are theoretical rather than empirical, but they provide evidence of support for the recent optimism of Aboriginal researchers. The first and most important of the Principles for Responsible Management Education (2011) is to develop the capabilities of students to be future generators of sustainable value for business and society at large, and to work for an inclusive and
sustainable global economy. With this principle in focus, Fitzgibbons and Humphries (2011, 3) provide a new perspective on Aboriginal management education. The authors note an increased scrutiny targeting a deeper understanding of connections to endemic poverty, institutional violence, and environmental degradation. They make a clear call to a world in need of the "amplification of the voice of Aboriginal peoples" (2011, 4), as both valued contributors and deserving beneficiaries. This research seeks to amplify the voice of the Aboriginal peoples of Australia in particular, by providing a new and deeper understanding of the legitimacy of their management style preferences, and the equivalence of their motivations and drive for meaningful lives and respected occupations, within the broader Australian management education processes, and equitable delivery within the broader culture.

The co-incidence of the article published in the Journal of Management Education in 2011, indicates the readiness of the world of management education to embrace a theory of Aboriginal management education as a new contribution to knowledge. The theories presented in this research are built on well-established knowledge drawn from apparently oppositional contexts, depending on their origins as Western (low context) or Eastern (high context). Jointly they rely on the beneficial tensions between non-discrete dualities to explain motivations. The theories presented also give considerable attention to and respect for the Aboriginal universal of spirituality, which participants Una and Kathy in this research regard as in a state of deterioration in majority Australia.

The term pedagogy generally refers to strategies of instruction, or philosophies of instruction. Pedagogy is sometimes viewed as the correct use of teaching strategies. It carries the Greek notion of striving for and leading out the ideals, philosophy and practice
of education. In the current research, it is concerned mainly with adult education at the post-secondary level, in particular of Australia's students.

5.3.1 Characteristics of theories recommended for an Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management pedagogy

Working constantly in the background of the bi-culturally gifted participants, Una, Frank and Emily, is first the culturally deeper driver of field influences, in the case of Aboriginal Australians, the learned tendency to field-dependence (high context). Secondly, there are the motivational influences, and thirdly the relative dominance of the left or right neural hemispheres (McGilchrist, 2010). Lewin (1935), the founder of field theory, is an important contributor to those theories that facilitate the understanding of Aboriginal and multi-cultures, particularly his influence on the works of Hall (1990) and Nisbett (2004), whose complementary ideas of societal context and field-dependence of Aboriginal cultures inform the concept of opposing world-views of field, represented as contested duality, by figure and ground. Lewin, whose roots are both gestaltist and psychodynamic, is also the founding figure in the systems psychodynamic practices of the Tavistock Institute. Hall (1990), Nisbett (2004), Combs & Snygg (1959) and others offer, with Lewin (1935), the most plausible descriptions of the distinctions in life-styles, and associated management styles, between Asian and Western cultures. These distinctions accentuate the magnitude of perceptual differences underlying their formation, and presage formidable challenges to management educators. Impediments of field and context have proved a heavy obstruction to Aboriginal advancement, but the legacy of Descartes (2008) has been found to be equally problematic.
The theories also needed to be credible in the context of modern management trajectories, and, in particular, with those of contemporary Australian Aboriginal researchers, who have observed universal Aboriginal style patterns within that population of Australia, identifying as Aboriginal; for example, Martin's (2003) stipulation regarding reflexivity, and Pearson's (2009) speculations about dualities. The appropriate theories should seek, above all, to address the concerns of Aboriginal researchers, and especially to counter the Cartesian error of discrete dualities (Waters, 2004), historically anathema to Aboriginal societies, and to step back from the contested arena of culture, to the common grounds of neuroscience and motivation.

Acceptable theories also have to be critically appraised for hidden loadings of majoritarian moral content, and the wishful thinking of Enlightenment ontology. Luhmann's (1995) theory, for example, seeks to simplify understandings of modern society by reducing the complexities of moral judgments, and by satisfying the rigorous scientific approaches employed by researchers in many professional fields. All chosen theorists support the general proposition that both motivations and cognitions are within the province of the mind / body system, and can be modelled as less complex (Luhmann), less voluntarist (Jung and Luhmann) and less moral (Luhmann and Freud). Two broadly-based theoretical positions, psychodynamic and social systems theories, appear jointly to fit all of the essential requirements, and to offer, in addition, some advantages over the current spectrum of management education theories and trends, which could be characterized broadly as mainstream North American. In the wider world context, the main requirements of chosen theories are that they balanced collectivist, equally with individual management styles, they were holistic, and that they carry the minimum of voluntarist ideas of the dominant culture. In other words, they needed to be theories designed without teleological
intention. This is an important condition, as the historically bad fit between Aboriginal culture and Australian majority culture needs to be avoided, by selecting theories based on assumptions that are non-judgmental. Only in this way does it seem to be possible to examine Australian and Aboriginal cultures as equals. The task undertaken could therefore be rendered in its simplest terms as: identifying the theories that are bi-culturally accessible and acceptable, and to comment on how they could be carried forward in the form of a pedagogy that works both-ways.

Understanding the difficulties of educating both-ways depends on looking beyond the place of culture as a starting point of understanding the theories acceptable to both sides of the cultural equation. Whilst neuroscience and motivations are common to Aboriginal and majority Australian students, the cultural differences begin in the broad divisions separating Asian from Western worlds, shaping differences of field-dependence (high context) and field independence (low context). Explained thoroughly by Nisbett (2004) and Hall (1990), field approaches provide a better understanding of the motivational drivers arising from the dialectical positioning of opposites in the form of non-discrete dualities, which juxtapose tensions leading to decisions and insights in a fusion that can be greater than the sum of its parts. The resulting third entity, in the form of a conceptual triangle, can be seen as both symbol and solution to depicting the source of Aboriginal energy. The theories nominated to comprehend Aboriginal motivations fully are psychodynamic, social systems, and their hybrid associate, systems psychodynamic theory, all having the potential to form the basis of Aboriginal pedagogy. However, the connections with the relatively closed system of Aboriginal circle management, tend to make the combination of psychodynamic and social systems theories an easier fit with both-ways education.
5.3.2 Integrating social systems and psychodynamic theories with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

Social systems and psychodynamic theories form the primary combination upon which to construct a synergistic solution to the main research question of how the key motivations of Aboriginal Australians may help develop a management education pedagogy. The suitability of the combined theories became clear with the realisation that the motivations they espoused were holistic, global, and free of intentionality. Similarly culture-free were the works of the main researchers on this issue in the modern era, namely Chapman et al. (1991); Bryant (1996; 2004); Sveiby & Skuthorpe, (2006; 2011). As described by Bryant, Aboriginal management can operate with formations in which hierarchy is invisibilized, but closer observation reveals expertise emerging and engaging seamlessly without orders or power structures, as in the analogy of leadership of a flight of birds. In this research, Michael, an Aboriginal leader in majority Australian eyes, was at pains to deny pretensions to leadership, in favour of a modest claim to be a team member within an equally deserving fraternal group. There is a deep understanding of the unspoken rules of managing efficiently and ensuring good morale, for example, by not speaking for others (Bryant, Sveiby & Skuthorpe), and allowing all to participate. Bryant, Chapman, Sveiby & Skuthorpe describe a way of managing which is self-organizing and relatively autopoetic. It positions Aboriginal management experience as broader than its majority environment, as Aboriginal managers need to know both Western, hierarchical, top-down management style, as well as their own band style. Hence, there exists already in Aboriginal cultures a metaphorical model of Luhmann’s (1995) self-directing management construction, derived from the autopoiesis of Maturana and Varela (1980), in which closed biological systems
are self-reproducing.

The research evidence of the participants was consistent with the findings of Chapman et al. (1991); Bryant (1996; 2004); Sveiby & Skuthorpe, (2006; 201). The motivational forces revealed, show a consistency with holism, as depicted in psychodynamics and social systems theory. For Aboriginal societies negotiating the globalized world of modern management these theories offer congruent connections with both-ways approaches and borderless extension into the management environment of the future, foreshadowed by the successful management initiatives occasioned by some of the major corporations of the digital age.

5.3.2.1 Relating Aboriginal management education with social systems theory

As previously stated, the first premise of Luhmann's (1995) unique theory is that society is communication. This is because humans do not communicate, only communications communicate. It is necessary at this point to refute the view of some critics that in this respect, social systems theory is non-human, or even anti-human. Luhmann's is a theory that brings communications to the fore as cognition, and fades the dimension of humanity into the background as a constituent in an increasingly complex world environment. In this sense, it is post-humanist, as it attempts to avoid some of the definitional vagueness and sentimentalism of Maslow (1998; 1999) and other humanists, and replace them with a model that is an empirically based observation about what actually happens in human communication (Lee & Brosziewski, 2009). In addition, it uses the biological cell of Maturana and Varela (1980) as metaphor to reify double-loop and self-reference ideas by moving from previous cybernetic paradigms like Bateson's (1987) to a system of society in
which functions like finance and education operate within virtual membranes. This allows them to perform as relatively closed function systems, with the capacity to exchange information with other function systems. Luhmann's notion of motivation is radically different to the explanations of neuro-scientists like McGilchrist (2010), and psychodynamic theorists such as Freud (2001), Jung (1989) and Maze (1983), in whose definitions motivation is uniformly physiological. Luhmann (1995) considers motivation only as a condition of success in communication (Moeller, 2006, 27). It is important, therefore, to regard all of Luhmann's framework as cognitive, even though his terminology favours words, which are sometimes used broadly in psychologies external to social systems theory, but with different meanings. For example, he equates culture to a memory within the psychic system that presents an oscillating present as an outcome of the past, whose origins are self-made in contemporary society. This definition offers Aboriginal cultures a better vantage point than the alternative offered in such Western definitions of culture as "observed uniformities", but contradicted by Nakata (2007) as contested in Aboriginal societies.

A further common ground made available by social systems theory between Aboriginal management education and majority Australian management education is that culture is re-presented as global, subsuming both majority national cultures and minority subcultures. This idea is expressive of the pan-cultural nature of social systems theories, which are also decentralized and evolutionary, but non-teleological, anti-hierarchical, non-idealistic, non-moralistic, and by definition, outside of the ambit of cause and effect (Baecker, 2001, 63). This does not mean that Luhmann's (1995) theory excludes social activism to redress the lack of societal balance so evident in Aboriginal Australia. In his work, Political theory in the welfare state, Luhmann makes clear that his theory is possible only in a
democratic, welfare state, operating for the entire population, within the functional sub-

technique of politics.

The realization of the principle of inclusion in the functional domain of politics ultimately

leaves to the welfare state. The welfare state is the realization of political inclusion.

Consequently this involves ... the securing and continuous improvement of the minimal


In this way, Luhmann (1995) distances himself from opposing government intervention in

the market, and should avoid the "neoliberal" epithet sometimes mistakenly accorded to

him. Luhmann's is a theory that utilizes globalization to virtualize a society enabled by the

internet and mass media. In the period since his final research, however, the welfare state

has yielded much of its territory to the "competition state" (Maclean, 2007). Globalization

has also facilitated the shifting of focus away from student-centred responses and

vocational tertiary education, and towards market oriented approaches (Maclean, 2007, 3).

Thus, the student's preference for practical training evidenced by the findings from this

research, may become more attainable, but the reducing size of the safety-net of the

welfare state may compromise its capacity to include all Aboriginal students equally.

5.3.2.2 Contribution of social systems theory to Aboriginal management education

A vital issue of management is the commonly practised art of decision making. This is

arguably the most important activity of management, although perceived in Luhmann's

version as somewhat "sleight of hand". Thus, on both sides of the psychic process of a

management decision, lie the same, hidden commonalities. The antecedents of the

sequencing of decision components are neuro-biological / motivational, and the invisible

final operation in the sequence is contingency. In respect of the lack of authenticity of the

decision-making process, Andersen (2001) offers the observation that if a decision can be

reached through absolute deduction, calculation, or augmentation, it leads to a final
closure or fixation of contingency, without simultaneously potentializing alternatives ... “so called rational decisions are not decisions at all” (2001, 10). The difference in decision making styles between Aboriginal and Australian majority cultures, as described by participants Michael and Noel, is that the levelling of credit for Aboriginal decision making further conceals the outcome by group responsibility and anonymous leadership.

Seidl & Hendry (2002, 8) explain that social system theory excludes psychological elements, and includes the system of organizations. It is therefore, as Seidl & Becker (2005b) have demonstrated, a more practical tool for management educators. For example, social systems theory argues that in a social or organizational system, any decision that masks contingency, such as "I chose person A", cannot be regarded as authentic, unless it visibilizes reflection about process (contingency) to some extent, such as "I chose person A, but not person B". This conceptualization offers more detailed pathways for management educators than previous offerings on reflexive reviews of management decisions by Argyris (2008) and Senge (1990). Borch (2011) identified blind spots in Luhmann's (1995) conceptualizing, some which appear to ignore areas of importance to Aboriginal cultures, such as spatiality or place. Borch's (2011,138) clarification is that some places inspire, whereas others do the opposite. Importantly for Aboriginal Australian findings, Borch is convinced that place should be added to consciousness as one of the basic couplings in Luhmann's theory. However, the research of Gill (2005) would suggest that inspirational places can exist in Aboriginal Australia, even when they are disguised as pastoral enterprises. There exists sufficient condition for place motivation if the land under management is historically part of the stewardship of the tribal responsibilities of the current owner-managers. When Aboriginal ways of managing are considered in the light of the management practices that were thought radical when Brin,
Page (Auletta, 2009) and others introduced them, their advantages accrue from their common ideas of preference for expertise over hierarchy, their inclusiveness, and their respect for all engaged within the working group.

Another field not covered by Luhmann (1995) is the place of affect in decision making, also important if Waters' (2004) critical observations about the need for the damage to Aboriginal societies by Cartesian dualities is to be addressed. Again, Borch (2011, 139) regards affect as an omission in need of inclusion in Luhmann's (1995) work, and this is consistent with the findings of neuroscientists, McGilchrist (2010), McManus (2003) and Eagleman (2011), and other researchers of affective states, Goleman (1995), and Picard (1997). As Luhmann's (1995) followers previously listed have had little more than a decade to address his omissions, it could be expected that further remediations will follow. In the sense that the Australian majority culture leans to the side of hierarchy and individualism, and that executive reputations, especially of top management, are carefully constructed and defended, it is more likely that the exposure of contingencies could be resisted with greater vigour than in the more collective organizations of Aboriginal minorities. For example, the similarly field-dependent (high context) and emerging Chinese managers have a special place and regard for the vicissitudes of fortune in management. Bouée (2010, 65-66) draws attention to the acknowledged place of luck in the modern Chinese management model. In Australian business, the identification of a "lucky guess" would discount the illusion of achievement, and enhancement of resumé necessary for career success. Such critical reviews of the "self" are implied in the works of Argyris (2008) and Teubner (2012), and are likely to be more accessible when there is an environment of greater attachment to the group, and mutual respect amongst members within the group, as in Asian and Aboriginal cultures. It can be seen that in reflection about social systems
theory's compatibility with the Aboriginal way of managing, the theory is good as far as it goes. Whilst the question of perceived difference with Aboriginal management style, raised in Chapter 1, appears to be answered by examples of the complete compatibility of both work cultures, two features of Aboriginal style, regarding affect and place, appear to be missing. Whilst affect is clearly being addressed by Luhmann's successors, the importance of place could become an important consideration yet to be recognized by mainstream Western management, and could be regarded as a useful area of further research.

5.3.2.3 Contribution of systems theories to managing Aboriginal demotivation

Law and religious morality in Western field-independent (low context) societies raise the profile of the responsibility of the individual over the group, or collective, attempting to present issues of crime and sin clearly and in writing, to ensure that in contemporary civil societies, individual morale and hope for the future are maintained. Issues of right and wrong are consequently held to be subject to free will, and there is less attribution to environmental causes (Nisbett, 2004). Further, there is in Western societies a reluctance to prefer deterministic accounts of human behaviour, such as psychodynamic theories (Maze, 1983), and theories that minimize morality in order to manage complexity, such as Luhmann's (1995) social systems theories. This creates special problems for Aboriginal societies, or other minorities, as the accused is often perceived by the majority as the agent of his own undoing, such as the first group of AIDS sufferers and the experiences of incarceration of participants Steven and Noel. In Chapter 2 the question arose of the differences between Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal societies, in the way they attribute reasons for why things go wrong. In particular, do Aboriginal Australians tend to blame
individual frailty or environmental influences? The evidence of interviews is heavily weighted to the environment, including spiritual influences, sometimes positive, at other times negative. Pearson's (2009, 19) Groundhog Day every three to five years, namely a recurring cycle of public revelation, government intervention and failure, policy review and new commitment, was recast by research participants, Michael, Kathy and Natalie as Aboriginal community initiative, government support of project, government appropriation, project failure. However, Pearson's educational initiatives, derived from Engelmann and Bruner (1974), guarantee Aboriginal students that they will not be blamed for individual failure; the responsibility will be carried by the school system. Aboriginal societies need therefore to analyse rigorously the hidden assumptions within theories and research evidence underpinning any Western study of their society, especially the usage of loaded terms, such as agency (Archer, 2000), empowerment (Abu-Saad & Champagne, 2006), or self-determination (Hughes, 2000). Psychodynamic theories offer part of the toolkit of theoretical explanation, but need the augmentation of contemporary theories involving social systems for the conceptual construction of Aboriginal models to be realised completely.

5.3.2.4 Implications of psychodynamic theories for Aboriginal motivation and pedagogy

The earliest of these theoretical standpoints, the psychodynamic or depth grouping, has its origins in the works of Freud (2001) and his successors, whose theories were largely determinist, instinctively driven and non-teleological. In psychodynamic accounts, drives must be specified by their source, rather than by their "aims" or universal basic goals, which conceal moral and wishful thinking. Two further common flaws are failure to grasp that every experience of reality is a subjective experience (Lee & Brosziewski, 2009, 45);
and that much of the language used for action and feeling is systematically misleading (Maze, 1983, 37). This is not, however, a standpoint that denies the complex cognitive processes that intervene between drives and behaviours, such as those postulated by Luhmann (1995). Aboriginal ontology, however, needs a spiritual basis, and therefore is reciprocally relatable to the psychodynamic theorist, Jung (1989), especially in his use of dualities, to explain universal oppositional preferences, such as thinking / feeling and intuiting / sensing, by which Jung characterizes preferred ways of making decisions. This enables observations about management style to address the central concern of Aboriginal theorist Waters (2004). That is, her decisive rejection of the discrete dualities of Descartes (2008) as the chief cause of Aboriginal suffering, and her embrace of non-discrete dualities. Non-discrete dualities follow the research pathway set by German theorist Hegel (2005) (Figure 30, p.301), and inform the works of more recent European holistic and systems theorists, like Jung (1989), Luhmann (1995), Hofstede (1997; 2001), and D'Iribarne (2009).

Applications of the integrated theory, called systems psychodynamics, have been used in both management (Dowd, 2007) and educational settings (James, Connolly, Dunning & Elliott, 2006), who applied it to study educational attainment in effective but underprivileged schools. The question of whether systems psychodynamic theory could offer benefits to the theoretical framework of this research was posed in Sub-section 2.1.4. One distinction of best performing schools found by James et al (2006, 60) was an absence of evidence of defensive behaviours of the blaming kind described by Argyris (2008), or the concealed contingency of Freud's (2001) repression, or Luhmann's (1995) invisibilized alternatives to decisions. Research such as James' et al (2006), opted for those social systems theories that utilize only open systems. The primary reason for turning, in this
research, to Luhmann and others, and following their research direction, relates to their
capacity to comprehend the relatively closed systems of traditional organizations of
Aboriginal peoples around band circles and absence of hierarchy, and consequently to
increase perceptions of syllabus relevance.

Figure 30 (p.301) illustrates that the branch leading to Luhmann's social systems theory is
over and above systems psychodynamics, is an additional opportunity to examine
Aboriginal organizations as relatively closed systems, of the type reported by Bryant et al.
(1996), and how they may relate to the most advanced organization designs depicted at
Figure 32 (p.344), as exemplified in modern IT corporations. This does not suggest that
systems psychodynamics would be less compatible with Aboriginal management styles,
but that they may be less able to accommodate the autopoesis of clan circle models of
Aboriginal management and spirituality.

As a consequence, there is a need to comprehend fully the range of innovatory, but
relatively closed and less hierarchical organization designs of contemporary corporations
of the digital age, which draw on the power of expertise rather than the authority of
position. On the other hand, some of their techniques, such as archetypal explanations of
the motivational aspects of management, the application of action theory, and other
features, offer valuable pathways, consistent with all other Aboriginal-friendly theories
discussed in this research. In particular, every participant in this research evidenced
remarkably strong archetypal influences, almost exclusively drawn from parental, or other
nuclear and extended family role models, confirming the expectation raised in Sub-section
2.3.7, that there are universal archetypal entities evidenced in the Aboriginal psyche.

However, more research needs to be undertaken on archetypes as a source of motivation.
5.3.3 Ecology and bi-culturality affecting Aboriginal pedagogy

5.3.3.1 Findings about ecological world-views framing Aboriginal societies

The research of Australian Aboriginal academic, Arabena (2006), favours the wider scoping of Aboriginal societies as part of a world ecological system, proposed by Ervin Laszlo (2006), as the image of a new civilization (Laszlo, 2006, 43). Like Luhmann (1995), Laszlo was a student of Talcott Parsons,(1971) but favours a world-view of a universe as a self-organizing ecological system. However, Arabena (2006; 2008) reveals an Aboriginal Australian perspective, which is both systems based and naturalistic. The fifth of her major recommendations for Australian Aboriginal futures presented to AIATSIS (Arabena, 2008, 4) is titled Investing in a systems view of the world. This also suggests that social systems theory, though focussed on world society, rather than the universe, would be consistent with Arabena's perceived needs of Aboriginal Australians as holistic and systemic.

Within the participant group there was a strong undercurrent of international affiliations in the responses of Frank, Kathy, Steven and Michael. This went beyond identitification with other Aboriginal societies to include a re-positioning of Australian Aboriginal society as central rather than peripheral within a developing world ecology. In other words, a perception that the Australian Aboriginal world was impacting strongly on the world as an ecological system.

The natural as pedagogical in Aboriginal education, first raised as a question in Sub-
section 2.7.1, appears understandable when the demotivating evidence of damaged ecosystems speaks for itself. However, what is not commonly observed, and often vigorously resisted, is the invisibilized modernity of Aboriginal approaches. For example, Bluhdorn (2000, 58-59) argues that ecological (Aboriginal) thought is modern in any epoch: "Ecological thought ... is concerned with problems emerging from the dualism of nature and society, which is a typically modernist construction".

5.3.3.2 Adding value to career development through the acquisition of bi-culturality

The question of the impacts of adoption by either side of the Australian / Aboriginal bi-culture of its alternative culture was raised in Sub-section 2.3.7. It became evident, from discourse analysis of research interviews that three interviewees were differently aligned with their Aboriginality from the other five. The difference could be described as monocultural (5 participants) and bi-cultural (3 participants, namely Una, Frank and Emily). Bi-cultural groupings have been the subject of recent studies by Brannen, Thomas & Hong (2010), Brannen and Doz (2010), and Benet-Martinez, Leu and Lee (2002). According to these authors, bi-culturals internalize more than one set of cultural schemata, but are often unaware of the importance of the knowledge and skills they possess. This was certainly the case of research participants, Una and Emily, who felt the sense of achievement in spanning two world-views, but were unaware of the career implications of their remarkable skills. Brannen’s research with Thomas, Hong and Doz (2010) suggests also that multinational employers are unaware of the importance of the potential of Aboriginal recruits to undertake challenging assignments involving bi-cultural skills in which alternate cultural frames may be accessed at will, depending on context. Brannen, Thomas & Hong (2010, 10) go further to suggest that a fusion can occur from the duality of the opposing cultural
frames, producing a synergy of ability that cannot be accounted for by the sum of its parts.

The place of the zone of bi-culturality can be positioned from the perspective of the complete research template, in Figure 31.

**Figure 31 Social synergy of bi-culturality**

![Figure 31 Social synergy of bi-culturality](Source: Commercial stock photo from Google Images)

5.3.4 *Findings relating Aboriginal management concepts to innovations in digital age corporations*

The question raised as to whether Aboriginal management styles are simply too different to be integrated with Western management practices (Chapter 1.4) was answered emphatically in the negative when some of the characteristic philosophies and distinguishing techniques of the corporate giants of the computer industry were examined...
in greater detail. For example, Michael's levelling of the status of all community members ensured maximum capacity to self-organize for the members of his community. Aboriginal styles fit well with Luhmann's (1995) relatively closed system viewpoint. Systems of self-reproduction and self-organizing can be identified also in some of the most innovative of the world corporations of computer technology. Nonaka and Kenney (1991, 75-76), for example, describe how Steve Jobs (Elliot & Simon, 2011) selected the first operational group for production of the Apple Macintosh. The "Mac Team" was allowed to crystallize the problem and solution simultaneously. Their group structuring was left to the team to design and manage. In effect, the Mac Team was self-organizing, in the same way as the traditional Aboriginal circle group of management. Similarly, Jobs used an analogue of Luhmann's (1995) systems theory to introduce problem and solution, not as dichotomy, but as unity and duality. Later, Jobs would visualize his firm as producer of a whole product, with open function systems all working concurrently, a non-linear, non-sequential, approach in which design, engineering, marketing and distribution departments use "deep collaboration" and "concurrent engineering" (Isaacson, 2011, 362).

Mintzberg's (1981) adhocracy could also be seen as an unwitting defence of Aboriginal clan circle management, as his solution to managing in crisis was to allow functional experts to dethrone those with delegated authority. This is analogous to Luhmann's (1995) thesis accounting for the spontaneous reaction to complexity of a social system forming into functional elements, like Education and Politics. Again, Google's Brin and Page (Auletta, 2009) have, in the past decade, created their corporation, by institutionalizing their preference for expertise over hierarchy. This apparent leaderlessness was recalled by participants Kathy and Michael in their discussion of community organizers developing collective solutions to establish car pools for local Aboriginal infants. Autocratic
management style and Aboriginal clan circles, utilized by participant Una, could be depicted as a management duality. D'Iribarne (2009) and Mintzberg (1981) take equivocal positions on the point of balance between the two, which they see as situational. That is, either extreme can be appropriate to different management circumstances. However, the default position of modern firms in Australia, at times of external threat, is to downsize, a response more like autocracy than adhocracy, and lacking in efficacy. Littler & Dawkins (2001, 82) report a negative shift in trust and commitment in downsized Australian banks. Luhmann pointed to a breakdown in trust as a major contributor to management system complexity (Luhmann, 1979). Lack of trust between Aboriginal and majority Australian societies was a feature of participant Steven's complaints of stolen knowledge. Addressing this would in Luhmann's terms reduce the complexity of these competing social systems.

Fuller & Dil's (1983) definition of the geodesic form is strikingly simple: the most economical relationship between any two events. Similarly, Google's sociogram could be described as the simplest way of representing communications amongst all employees. Fuller's dualisms for the physical world parallel Aboriginal dualities in the social world. For Fuller, the vectors (dualities) are angle and length, magnitude and direction, tension and integrity. For the Aboriginal Australians who participated in this research, the central dualities are individualism and collectivism, spiritual and temporal, place (spiritually connected) and displace. In Figure 32 (p.344) in contrast to the conventional thumbnail organization chart for Microsoft, the charts for Google and Facebook bear a striking resemblance to Fuller's geodesic dome, illustrated in Figure 17 (p.142), and in Figure 19 (p.166).
As discussed in Chapter 1, Mintzberg (1981), Luhmann (1995), Jobs (Elliot & Simon, 2011), Brin and Page (Auletta, 2009), appear to embrace the paradoxical, non-linear, elevation of spontaneous functional expertise, that is, an Aboriginal way, suggesting that management ideology needs to be given equal opportunity to evolve. With that opportunity, it is possible that the paradoxes and challenges generated by an Australian Aboriginal management educational pedagogy could underpin a critical re-appraisal of all Australian management education. Hence Aboriginal and Western organizations may be observed to perform differently, in the sense that the Aboriginal way is more like a closed system with invisible authority, the Western system visibilizing authority and hierarchy.
5.3.5 Towards a theory of Aboriginal management education

In considering what constitutes valid and reliable evidence of preferred ways of describing students of Aboriginal management and their special needs, it has been previously asserted that Western tendencies show a systemic Cartesian bias towards the separation of ideas from their field or context, including those purported to be right or wrong; in other words, ideas are presented as binary or discrete. However, as Sklar (2002, 4) has commented, claiming certainty for theories is not consistent with even the most mathematical of sciences. In Western concentration on only part of a field or picture, claims of certainty are more often found in those arguments that originate in the populist, mediated, unscientific realm, masking moral or power positioning that seldom takes account of the "big picture" of holism. It could be argued therefore, that the literature of importance to Aboriginal management education is research reporting that could be ascribed to either social science or natural science, as there is ample evidence of their convergence in explaining the Aboriginal way. What has to be avoided is writing or commentary from any source that pleads validity and capacity to inform, but hides ideological motives.

Aspects of the spiritual have been more traditionally aligned with education, rather than with management. Spiritual is the second of the Australian Aboriginal Japanangka Pedagogies of Errol West (2000), and is a foundational idea of the Dreaming. The common thread of spirituality between Jung (1989) and Luhmann (1995), raised in Chapter 2, gave rise to their joint importance to this research in carrying adequately the valuable construct of Aboriginal spirituality and the dynamics of trilogies. Spirituality backgrounds Luhmann’s world-view, as an entity having an auspicious place in every
societal environment as part of the mystique of communication, and it is separate from his functional systems, which need freedom from the complexity of spirituality, culture and racism to operate more autopoetically. As a result, it could be argued that Luhmann’s spirituality acquires a status, similar to Jung’s spirituality, in which earlier notions of a deity are realised in the modern world. Furthermore, Luhmann and Jung depend equally for their dynamics on trilogies to explain the tensions arising when decisions have to be made and societal balance maintained.

Sunderland (2007) warns against the advance of a Judeo-Christian mono-morality based on multi-culturalism within the framework of a broader but erroneous Australian perception of Aboriginal spirituality. However, history has shown that most attempts to intrude into the depths of Australian Aboriginal spirituality have been resisted successfully. Both-ways pedagogy respects both cultures, and aspires to settle the contemporary disequilibrium in Aboriginal management education caused by the lack of knowledge displayed by the broader Australian culture of the potential strengths of Aboriginal spirituality, languages and suitable pedagogies. The model for comparing Australian Aboriginal management education may be available in modern India, where Hindu (Vedic) spirituality informs many new approaches to Indian management education (Vohra, 2004).

For Aboriginal management education, the tendency for the "spilling over" of conceptual and behavioural boundaries (Figure 11, p.90), as between dancing and law, has broad-reaching educational implications. This occurs in the context of the competing Western preference for more precise boundary setting, which results in expending much energy delineating, framing and defining ideas, concepts and disciplines. However, the Aboriginal participants in this research, when asked how Aboriginal concepts differ from their non-
Aboriginal counterparts, supported without exception the diffused and overlapping borders depicted in Figure 11 (p.90).

5.3.5.1 Locating Aboriginal management education within current management education theories

Aboriginal society, its behavioural style and its management education are bound together by the relational nature of Aboriginal ontology. Consistency with its relational content could not be maintained without associating any theory of Aboriginal management with Bateson's (1987) dictum linking good theory with relationality. As a consequence, an Aboriginal theory of management education will reflect the overlap of concepts in Figure 11 (p.90), especially those concepts that provide opportunities for systemic connections with the works of both Aboriginal and Western theorists and their principal ideas, such as the centrality for Luhmann of communication, and the influence on society he ascribes to broadcast mass media. Participant Kathy was most critical of the manipulative tactics of the news cycle on the Redfern Aboriginal community, although recognising that the media and especially television represented an important element in presenting Aboriginal society favourably. Luhmann's dynamic systems are societal rather than personal. They cover sweeping sub-systems of society such as the economy, the law, religion and politics. Nevertheless, they perform as dualities energized by paradox. For example, Luhmann's binary coding for the law is legal / illegal (1995, 375). According to Luhmann (1990), the binary system of government / opposition excludes third values. It is precisely this exclusion that creates the (excluded) third value, in this case "the public". In the teaching of management, it is feasible to regard teacher/s-student/s-communication, in any configuration, as either an open learning system, or for collectivist Aboriginal societies,
potentially a version of Luhmann’s self-referential or autopoietical self-creating and self-sustaining organization, which can be at the same time a learning system, and part of a wider system or systems. The notion of autopoiesis, in Luhmann’s presentation of it as a determinant of a social system, has special relevance for Aboriginal management education.

As previously discussed, Luhmann’s answer to Decartes’ (2008) mind-body duality is to posit a third social segment, communication, to form his fundamental trilogy. In Luhmann’s reasoning, none of the three segments can be excluded if the notion of "human being" is to be understood. At the same time, the individual human being cannot exist independently, according to Luhmann’s systems theory. It takes "communication" to form a conduit to another human being and linkage to the social system. In other words, humans do not directly communicate, as their depth of thoughts and feelings cannot be fully verbalized. Humans do what they can do, and that is to communicate, not with one another, but with the "communication" offering.

5.3.5.2 Identifying appropriate media for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

The model of education within society proposed by Luhmann is consistent with the systems approach to learning and managing found by Chapman et al.(1991); Bryant (1996; 2004); and Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006; 201). As illustrated in the following examples, it can be more widely used as a platform for reviewing Western management. In reaching his conclusion, Schoeneborn extended Luhmann’s theory that management decisions mask and deny alternatives. Powerpoint invisibilized contingency, thereby
weakening the consulting firm's corporate memory, by not leaving an "audit trail" of how the decision was made. This form of paradox was the subject of Bluhdorn's (2000, 140) revisiting of Luhmann's critique of ecological management, that every attempt within the system to make the unity of the system the object of a system operation encounters a paradox, because this operation must exclude and include itself. Besides having disputed credibility in Western settings, Powerpoint is widely disliked in China (Bouée, 2010,149), and may prove unacceptable in other field-dependent (high context) societies. Christie (2009) has remarked about the ease with which Aboriginal youth takes up the internet and digital technology, which was confirmed by participants Natalie, Frank, Emily and Una, whose professions demanded computer literacy, but Bouée's research suggests that caution is advisable with some innovations.

The cases of Powerpoint and strategy, indicate that the fearful clash of cultures view of Western and Asian civilizations is more accurately described as opportunity for critical re-appraisal of Western certainties. The United States educational and management instrument of personality, MBTI (Myers-Briggs Type Indicator) (Bayne, 2004) has been adopted enthusiastically by Japan, China and India, as it employs the non-discrete dualities of Jung, and assumes that all motivations derive from universal human preferences in behaviour. Comfort with the uncertainties of non-discrete opposites and synergy are central to Aboriginal, Indian and Chinese management styles. In China, a central trilogy is that the duality of spirit and land synergizes as energy (Bouée, 2010, 131). Spirituality, especially the models of Daoism and Mahatma Gandhi, runs deeply in the management philosophy and practices in each of these three societies and, according to Bouée (2010, 186) must be accommodated in the West, if it is to succeed in its business relationships with Asia (Bouée, 2010, 186). The archetypal influence of Mahatma Gandhi
was strong in most of the participants, and he was volunteered spontaneously by Steven, Una and Kathy as a role model.

5.3.5.3 Implications for dualities in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education

Building a theory of Aboriginal management education on motivational dualities and their bi-lateral constituency relies on well-established ideas from both Western and Aboriginal cultural traditions. Theories, even some of the grander ones, have postulated dualities as core concepts. For Marx (1999), they were capital and labour, for Freud (2001), hysterics and obsessives. Beyond the social sciences, physicist Einstein conceived light in terms of waves and particles. His colleagues developed fission theory via matter and radiation. Dualities have been used liberally by European management theorists, D’íribarne (2009), with assertion / acquiescence, and Hofstede (2001) with power / distance. Hofstede’s reliance on individualism / collectivism is of no lesser importance to his theory than it is to theorists of Aboriginal cultures, such as Hughes (2000) and Mandawuy Yunupingu (1994). Participant Una was conscious that her use of the principles of circle management formed a duality with autocratic management styles. Dualities of the ying-yang model, such as individualism and collectivism, are essentially self-energizing motivational systems, which may produce qualitatively higher forms of knowledge. In the context of this study, they exist as part of more general systems of Aboriginal management education, that may be either relatively open systems or relatively closed.

Like its Asian counterpart ying-yang, Ganma has much to say without use of words. Both imply differences, release of energy and possible conflict. However, in management terms,
it is preferable to translate what is observed as an opportunity for growth, rather than as obstruction. Typically the causal event in making prior research errors has been to interpret Aboriginal status 'through a glass darkly'. It has been important therefore to choose the literature of researchers whose credentials for observing both-ways are consistently reliable. The theoretical solution to interpreting conflict in Ganma or ying-yang can be visualized at Figures 7 (p.60) and 8 (p.75), with the movement towards Waters' (2004) objective for non-discrete opposites of one remaining itself, but also part of the other. Hence, the central mission for Aboriginal management could be summarised in Waters' (2004) perspective as becoming part of the broader academy of Australian management education, whilst not losing its own valuable identity and management style.

5.3.5.4 Status of Aboriginal management education pedagogy

Friere's (2000) critical pedagogy, an important source for Aboriginal approaches, provides a context for adult education. In Sub-section 2.7.3, it was pointed out that critical pedagogy demands that there are no limitations on the nature of critical questions. This is an important condition attached to participant Steven's research evidence, in Sub-section 4.2.16.2, stating that Western invention masks the re-invention of knowledge gained from existing Aboriginal epistemology.

Comparing the management achievements arising from innovations found in ways of organizing and communicating within the most prestigious corporations of the modern era, with the management practices of the ancient societies that were the focus of this research, participant Steven's claims have merit. What are presented as radical new strategies by Apple's self-organizing Mac Team (Elliot & Simon, 2011) and Google's
(Auletta, 2009) preference for expertise over hierarchy, are plausibly attributable to ideas that have their origins in the Aboriginal world, but without acknowledgement. Critical pedagogy has been represented as a version of transformation through learning. However, transformational pedagogy does not form part of this research, as it carries redemptive overtones, inappropriate for a culture already rich in its own spirituality, and invisibly energized by the synergy of non-discrete dualities.

The question raised about corporate values of the Bank of China, such as respect and teamwork in Sub-section 2.5.3, could present difficulties for any Aboriginal pedagogy, as espoused corporate values are often contradicted in practice, and suffer the perception of broken promises, a constant irritant for two of the elder participants in this research, Michael and Kathy. In the Aboriginal world, there are no grand theories, nor hierarchies of needs, only systems that integrate spirituality with daily life. Indeed spirituality was constantly referenced by all participants as a salutary alternative to Western ways, by regularly triangulating culturally appropriate behavioural choices, such as which streets to find the best way home.

5.4 Implications for policy and practice

From the evidence available in this research it is clear that theories and practices of management find their expression in the workplace and lifetime activities of humankind through the prisms of national cultures. Secondly, more powerful or wealthy national cultures exert greater influence over the design and development of national pedagogies, including the pedagogy of management, than their dependent sub-cultures. This has placed Aboriginal cultures at a particular disadvantage, as it is assumed that colonizing
cultures must have exhibited better management skills than the colonized by virtue of their martial, commercial, and material successes. This narrative is shown in the research to be an illusory and self-privileging way of interpreting management education in the modern world, and unlikely to survive the rise of two significant challengers to Western orthodoxy, the field-dependent (high context) cultures of China and India. Bouée (2010) has already shown that Chinese graduates in management from top business schools in the United States of America quickly jettison much of their Western learning upon returning to the practice of management in China. In Bouée’s view (2010,127), in the longer term, American management techniques will be retro-fitted to a Chinese philosophy of management. In this scenario, the duality of American / Chinese management rivalry will produce a synergy of hybrid vigour.

These changes in wealth and power of the leading industrial and commercial nations must lead to revised ways of evaluating the strength of theories that assume that individualistic or unholistic ideas are the preferred templates for the future. Two of the impacts which should be felt in Australia are a re-evaluation of Aboriginal management ideas, and a review of the extent to which national management pedagogies reflect the growth and cultural norms of Australian student populations of Aboriginal or Asian descent.

5.4.1 Reducing respect gap between Western and Aboriginal management education.

One of the consequences of self-privileging is that the observer cannot relate to the observed on equal terms. In this inter-relationship, lack of power and resources is a visible sign of lack of success, and therefore of deficient cultural values, externalized in
management or education that is relegated as intrinsically inferior. As discussed in Chapter 2, this asymmetrical equation assumes that, to advance, the Aboriginal aspirant has to become bi-cultural, that is the Aboriginal manager must be able to survive in both worlds, and to know both intimately. On the other hand, the non-Aboriginal Australian is not expected to know the Aboriginal world-view, nor to study any culture or language outside of the domain of a Eurocentric modality.

To assert that knowledge of another culture must increase respect is to some extent an aspirational idea, but respect requires some effort to know the other. It seems unlikely that the present stalemate of requirement of bi-cultural flexibility for one, and no requirement for the other, will be addressed in the short term. The best vehicle for such a profound change is the Australian school education system. A cultural shift of the majority Australian school system towards understanding the Aboriginal and Asian field-dependent (high context) world-views will have clear public policy indications for the review of many subject areas of both the school and university curricula, including management education.

5.4.2 The place of non-discrete dualities and their symbolism

Non-discrete dualities capture much of the attention of Aboriginal philosophers, both in North America (Waters; 2004) and Australia (Pearson; 2009). With their conceptual extension to a third factor, in a process that Fuller & Dil (1983) termed synergy, these dualities can be depicted symbiotically as triangles, and may represent the enhancement of product that characterizes the Aboriginal way in which motivational energy and aspirations are produced in the human psyche. To understand the Asian way is to realise that the Cartesian error of discrete opposites is to appear simplistically over-confident and
philosophically confused, and to re-present an unacceptable view of the world that has been the fundamental cause of cultural misunderstanding (Waters, 2004).

For education in general and management education in particular, this would indicate a need for policies that avoid the over-simplifications that tempt management educators, such as the “trickle-down” metaphor, associated with organization charts, or the “dichotomania” coined by neuroscientist Kinsbourne (1979) (Sub-section 2.2.1) to deride the falsehoods depicting brain functions as neatly delineated to either left or right hemispheres.

5.4.3 The sophistication of invisibilizing Aboriginal power and authority

Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006) have commented on the faulty attribution exhibited by Watkin Tench in his interpretation of the invisibilized authority of wisdom and experience displayed by Aboriginals soon after the arrival of the First Fleet. By their failure to display the trappings and postures of authority, the Aboriginal people of Sydney were deemed by Tench to show no respect for authority, as he witnessed no deference, nor displays of power. This phenomenon was taken up more deeply by Greenleaf (1977), using the model of Herman Hesse’s novel, Journey to the East, in which a modest servant’s removal from the team results in calamitous collapse of leadership and morale. In other words, it is not hierarchy or written assertion of authority, nor its manifestation in observable behaviour, that are paramount, but rather a spiritual presence in the person that makes authority real. These ideas have wider policy implications in management education, which invite re-appraisal of fundamental questions about the nature of leadership, authority, and ultimately the nature of management. A policy of promoting further research into Aboriginal
leadership styles could present new ideas that may be readily transferable into mainstream management education.

At first view, circle management, as illustrated in Figures 7 (p.60) and 28 (p.227), carries none of the trappings of hierarchy. There is no head of the table, no monarchical seating, and no elevation of one participant to a higher level than any other. Ground level is clearly meant to have every member situate and behave in a “down to earth” manner. In reality, however, it is clear that the life and circle membership experiences and individual expertise of some participants must inevitably differentiate one from the other. The point is that none is made to appear to be less important as a person, nor in value of personal contribution.

This raises another fundamental difference between and Western ways of managing. Circle management can be seen as invisibilizing both authority and expertise, but further invisibilizing both competency and incompetency. For future policy makers, this poses a basic question of tension between what appears to be “good for the company” and what is “good for the society”. Is habitual marginalizing, as discussed in Sub-section 5.2.3.2, with its inefficacy, social exclusions, and attendant disruptions to family fortunes and personal lives the most productive step, or are the constructive national recruitment initiatives like Generation One and the Aboriginal Employment Strategy preferable?

5.4.4 Fluid frame shifting between Aboriginal and majority cultures

The research revealed that three of the eight participants (Una, Frank and Emily) had reached a developmental stage of ease in social and occupational settings within both Australian and Aboriginal cultures equally, which enabled choice of both career direction...
and personal identification between Aboriginal and majority Australian environments exclusively or serially (Sub-section 5.3, p.313 and Figure 29, p.295). Their preference eventually to work exclusively within Aboriginal social and work environments was influenced strongly by a motivation to balance the scale of career success and respect in favour of Aboriginal society. Restoration of balance was found to be the main motivational driver for all participants in this research, that is the drive to re-balance all function systems, including health, education, law and politics, thereby equalising Aboriginal society with its Australian majority culture.

The research of Benet-Martinez, Leu & Lee (2002) and Brannen, Thomas & Hong (2010), finds that bi-cultural employees represent a growing and unexplored demographic, which will be of increasing benefit in multi-cultural nations like Australia. Brannen, Thomas & Hong (2010, 10) raise the possibility of the sum of two cultural backgrounds producing a synergy greater than the sum of its parts; in other words, a reified, or higher order blended cultural identity. These findings suggest that cultural diversity exists within individuals as well as within organizations, and points to a growing appreciation of the value to Australian organizations of participants, such as Una, Frank and Emily. Aboriginal exponents of capacity to frame shift fluidly need to be recognised as an asset base requiring further research, with a view to career development in corporates with significant multi-cultural engagement.

5.4.5 Spirituality and place in Aboriginal management education for the 21st century

Both the literature and research findings associate Aboriginal Australians closer in management style with their field-dependent (high context) non-Western neighbours than
with their fellow Australians, who constitute the national majority viewpoint both culturally and ideologically. Whilst most differences in the rival epistemologies can be scaled as differences in degree, basically between individualism and collectivism, two elements are largely missing from the Australian majority’s list of priorities, namely spirituality and place.

Participant Kathy mourned the departure of spirituality from Australian societal norms, and she viewed place as a lost concept in the spread of urbanization. However, the stirrings of restoration of the sanctity of place are possibly to be found in the enthusiasm of Australian youth for historic battlefields, particularly Kokoda and Gallipoli. These ceremonial moments of collective reflection on national losses have clear parallels with the travails of Aboriginal peoples, who have lost sacred sites to urban developments, and loved ones to premature death. There was strong endorsement by the participants in this research of the views expressed in the literature supporting place as a primary motivation for Indigenous people. However, further research based on a larger and more tribally-diverse group of Aboriginal respondents is required.

5.4.6 Avoiding lost motivation to be educated by ensuring a culturally apposite Aboriginal pedagogy

Much evidence is now available to indicate that prospective Aboriginal management students, with the will to engage in educational programs, may withdraw early from courses that do not meet their test of relevance or lack cultural credibility. Both the literature and evidence of participants in this research underline the importance of educating through the Aboriginal culture when it is clear that the prospective student has internalized an Aboriginal identity. For the education of those internalizing the Aboriginal
culture, this means also that it is unwise to use other than Aboriginal symbols and cultural metaphors, and to engage with students by preferring Aboriginal languages.

The evidence of participants favours the development of management education dedicated to Aboriginal needs. Participant Emily’s evidence suggests that engagement in specialised Aboriginal educational programs can enhance Aboriginal identity, foster re-engagement with further education, and act as a renaissance of learning or personal epiphany. For Australian policy, this would mean a lengthy period of attention to Aboriginal business studies curricula, with the objective of bridging the gap with Simon Fraser, Idaho State and other North American universities with a track record in bespoke Aboriginal business degrees.

5.5 Conclusion

Creating and maintaining the perception of relevance is fundamental to the success of Aboriginal management education. This view can be rendered as the significance of avoiding perceptions of irrelevance, consistently reported by students of Aboriginal management education world-wide, raising the issue of the place of relevance in the suite of motivations that energize Aboriginal Australians. The importance of this research includes identifying Aboriginal motivations, how they are expressed, and the manner in which they play out in Aboriginal management styles and pedagogies. It is clear from the evidence gathered that holistic and systemic tendencies underpin Aboriginal management styles, and affect the essentials of those theories that blend consistently with the nature of Aboriginality, its ontology and pedagogies. It is important that the chosen group of theories enables Aboriginal ideas to be translated lucidly to non-Aboriginal students of
management, who may benefit from the currently unseen possibilities of the situational employment of Aboriginal management philosophy and the rewards of its application, as demonstrated by the most successful corporations of the digital age.

Previous research into Aboriginal management education in Australia has not attempted to differentiate between educational instruments, such as Aboriginal syllabus and pedagogies on the one hand, and Aboriginal motivations on the other. This research suggests that motivational forces can be found within universal Aboriginal field-dependent (high context) world-views of holism, dualities and balance. These phenomena of potential energy can be engaged in holistic and related ways of perceiving and knowing. The motivational power of archetypes, concepts and symbols can be differentiated and organized to flow thematically through both curricula and pedagogical constructs to form a natural sequencing of motivations addressing management tasks, which together impinge on the nature of the wisest pedagogies to be adopted by management educators.

The potential value of an Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander theory of education can be inferred from the affinity of Aboriginal systems of learning with modern theories, such as Luhmann's (1995) autopoiesis, and the holistic approaches of corporate practitioners of management, such as Brin and Page (Auletta, 2009).

Some unanticipated, albeit significant findings occurred in the research process, including:

* Raising of the status of the centrality of balance, and its close association with Aboriginal identity (Una and Kathy);*
Values, such as the sanctity of individual lives, derived from Aboriginal tribal traditions and knowledge, may translate seamlessly into value systems derived from Western philosophy and science (Natalie).

The likelihood that the pedagogical objective, to facilitate Aboriginal management education, can best be met within a tertiary institution dedicated to Aboriginal education, because such institutions have a deep association with Aboriginal culture and identity (Emily):

Advanced bi-culturality, the learned capacity to switch cultural frames and codes with ease, already exists in some Aboriginal Australians. This is an unrecognized human resource, exhibited by participants (Una, Frank and Emily), and has potentially great benefit to Australian corporations. This suggests the need for bi-culturality to be at the forefront in the development of Aboriginal management education.

Whilst Western role models are rare amongst Aboriginal Australians, selected Western philosophers (vide Sub-section 4.2.15, Kathy and 4.2.17, Steven) and scientists (vide Sub-section 4.2.3, Frank and 4.2.17, Steven) may be adopted to facilitate both-ways pedagogy, and may transcend the impacts of cultural loss raised as a question in Section 1.4 and by Folds in Sub-section 1.4, 2.4.4.1 and Sections 1.4 & 2.6.

Demotivations, principally the continuing deteriorations engendered by prejudice, poverty and social exclusion, inhibit Aboriginal Australians at the personal level, making the emergence of balanced and motivated Aboriginal management students less likely than could be expected of majority Australians. A further demotivation, or inhibition to learning,
was identified, namely the disproportionate energy being drawn from achieving
Australians, typified by the participant group enabling this research. This arose from the
evidence of continual demands placed on them to assert and defend their Aboriginal
identity, and by advocating for and assisting in the social inclusion of the disadvantaged
members of their own extended family groupings. This expenditure of energy will not yield
benefits unless equal energy is spent by majority Australia in facilitating the lifting of the
burdens of poverty, ill-health and educational disadvantage from those Aboriginal
Australians disabled by adverse circumstances.

Aboriginal ontology and world-view are illustrated in Figure 11 (p.90) as being
conceptually overlapping. Discussions with participants about the concepts used in Figure
11 (p.90), have met with consistent support and recognition as in harmony with Aboriginal
Australian world-views, behaviours, and aspirations. Further research may be needed to
identify all important dualities of Aboriginal epistemology, especially those concerned with
the appropriate non-discrete dualities required to express the developmental gains fused
into an enhanced and triangulated third factor, to which psychodynamic and social
systems theories could be linked. Additionally, both nuclear and extended family archetypes
were deeply woven into all participant case studies, and can be regarded as significantly
motivational.

The works of Kearins (1981), Harkins (1994), Butlin (1993), Green and Baldry (2008),
Sveiby & Skuthorpe (2006; 2011) and many others demonstrate that the greatest barriers
to advancement of the cause of Aboriginal education in management are the prejudices of
racial and colonialist superiority harboured by majority Australians. All indications from the
literature and this research point only to environmental adversity, that is socio-economic
disadvantage, as the distinctive causal area inhibiting equality in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander management education futures. As discussed in Chapters 1 and 2, a way forward could be found by raising the priority of cultural studies in pre-tertiary education, especially the studies of the cultures and languages of Aboriginal nations.


Bell, D. (1998). Ngarrindjeri Wurrwarrin: a world that is, was, and will be. Melbourne: Spinifex Press.


Chen, A. (2001). A theoretical conceptualization for motivation research in physical education; an integrated perspective. Paper written for the National Association for physical education in higher education.


Broadcasting Commission.


D’Arbon, T., Frawley, J. & Richardson, N. (2007). Linking worlds: a project to research
educators as leaders in remote community school settings.


Graham, A. (Creator). Kudrow, L. (Producer), Who do you think you are? (Television


Gunstone, A. 2006. The failure of reconciliation to address racist and ignorant attitudes in the wider community towards Aboriginal peoples. Racisms in the New World Order: Realities of Culture, Colour and Identity Conference, University of the Sunshine Coast, Coolum, 8-9 December 2005, 143-152.


Harris, S. (1979). *It's coming yet... an Aboriginal treaty within Australia between Australians*. Adelaide: Griffin Press.


Harrison, B. (2001). *Collaborative programs in Aboriginal communities. From fieldwork to practice*. Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press.


London.


IATSIS (2011). *Guidelines for ethical research in Australian studies.* Australian Institute for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies.


Knox, K. J. (2002). Designing and developing service organizations – a journey of consciousness. Doctoral dissertation, University of Western Sydney, Richmond, Australia.


Laszlo, E. 2006. Chaos point, the world at the crossroads. London: Hampton Roads


Melbourne: Miegunyah Press.


